



## **CISA CYBERSECURITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE DECEMBER 10, 2021, MEETING SUMMARY**

### **OPEN SESSION**

#### **Call to Order and Opening Remarks**

Ms. Megan Tsuyi, Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency (CISA) Cybersecurity Advisory Committee Designated Federal Officer, called the meeting to order. She provided a short summary of the *Federal Advisory Committee Act* rules governing the meeting and then turned the meeting over to the Honorable Jen Easterly, Director, CISA.

Director Easterly welcomed the attendees and introduced the Committee's new Chair, Mr. Tom Fanning, Southern Company, and Vice Chair, Mr. Ron Green, Mastercard. Mr. Fanning and Mr. Green then gave brief opening remarks. Mr. Fanning noted that it is both a moment of strategic risk and a moment of strategic opportunity for the United States and emphasized the need for the private sector and the government to work together to protect the Nation's interests. Mr. Ron Green added that the Committee creates an opportunity for a closer partnership between the private sector, industry, and academia.

Director Easterly then welcomed the Honorable John K. Tien, Deputy Secretary, Department of Homeland Security (DHS), to provide a keynote address.

#### **Keynote Address**

Deputy Secretary Tien applauded the diversity of viewpoints on the Committee and noted the importance of sharing wisdom, expertise, and insight from each area represented. He expressed his hope that the Committee will be able to help identify the gaps and vulnerabilities the United States currently faces and also provide solutions. He said that DHS is eager to hear the Committee's recommendations and that the members should challenge Director Easterly and all of DHS to take action on addressing the Nation's cybersecurity issues.

Director Easterly thanked Deputy Secretary Tien and introduced the Honorable Chris Inglis, National Cyber Director, to provide remarks.

#### **Fortifying the Nation's Cybersecurity Posture**

Director Inglis opened by stating that the United States needs to take the offensive in cyberspace and reframe what is believed to be possible and appropriate in terms of improving the resilience of the Nation's digital infrastructure. He added that, to address the current cyber threats, Government and industry need to do more than share information. He said that the Nation has an opportunity to develop a collective defense across Government, industry, and academia so that any attacker has to defeat the combined capabilities of all three adding that he is pleased with the work that CISA is doing in this regard. He charged the group to be proactive in showing that each member has something to add to the collaboration.

#### **CISA's Big Challenges and Issues Tasking**

Director Easterly stated that CISA has two important roles: 1) be the operational lead for federal cybersecurity; and 2) be the National Coordinator for Critical Infrastructure, Resilience and Security. She said that, of the two, she wants to focus on the critical infrastructure piece because the vast majority of critical infrastructure is

owned and operated by the private sector. To do this, she wants the Committee to provide input on how to move CISA from a focus on public-private partnerships to true operational collaboration.

Director Easterly noted that there are three efforts at CISA that she is particularly excited about. The first is the Joint Cyber Defense Collaborative (JCDC), which brings together the private sector along with the full power of Federal law enforcement, the Defense Department, and the Intelligence Community to address the cybersecurity threat in a proactive manner. The second effort is the CISA Cybersecurity Advisory Committee, which brings together strategic thinkers with a huge amount of expertise and experience and has the potential to magnify CISA's work collaboration and innovation and service to the nation. The third effort is the ongoing process of reshaping CISA's workforce through the Cyber Talent Management System.

Mr. Eric Goldstein, Assistant Director for Cybersecurity, CISA, discussed the need for greater visibility into the nation's critical infrastructure, noting that access to that information would allow CISA and other agencies to quickly develop actionable measures and actionable guidance that network defenders across the country can use to protect themselves before more intrusions occur. He emphasized that CISA cannot do this alone, and so the JCDC is building platforms where analysts from CISA as well as partners from Government and the private sector, potentially including cybersecurity companies, can work together to identify and collectively address threats across all of the networks they have visibility into.

Mr. Goldstein said that CISA plays a critical role in finding and fixing vulnerabilities, but that the only long-term solution is for the technology industry to adopt a more security-focused culture. He concluded by posing several questions to the Committee on how to address these issues: How can CISA shift the culture of technology more toward a security-focused model? How can CISA ensure that security features are easier to use and on by default? How can CISA and industry minimize the consequences of the use of technology in national critical functions?

Ms. Kiersten Todt, Chief of Staff, CISA, discussed CISA's efforts to build a strong cyber workforce, and how CISA can facilitate and drive that process. She noted that the agency is working to build relationships with non-traditional and underserved communities through partnerships with NPower, Girls Who Code, and the Cyber Warrior Foundation. Ms. Todt added that cyber is an interdisciplinary issue and the cyber workforce needs the skills of not just mathematicians, engineers and scientists, but also sociologists, psychologists, historians, politicians, and economists.

Director Easterly then turned to the first planned focus areas for the CISA Cybersecurity Advisory Committee: ***Transforming the Cyber Workforce***. She asked the members to provide their input. Ms. Lori Beer, JPMorgan Chase, said that employee retention is just as critical as creating a pipeline for entry level talent. She suggested that the Agency find a way to work with industry to provide corridors for employees to move back and forth between Government and industry. Ms. Nicole Wong, NWong Strategies, said two issues that stop candidates from working for the Government is its hierarchical nature and slow delivery process. She said this can frustrate cybersecurity specialists who are used to working with their company's leadership and moving fast to implement new ideas and solutions. Mr. Green said that MasterCard has a Cyber Talent Initiative that has MasterCard employees take positions in Government agencies for two-year terms to develop skills and knowledge that MasterCard cannot provide. He said this might be a model CISA could leverage. Mr. Ted Schlein, Kleiner Perkins Caufield & Byers, added that student loan relief would also be a big incentive to get candidates to join CISA and stay with the agency.

Director Easterly then moved to the topic ***Turning the Corner on Cyber Hygiene*** and asked Mr. George Stathakopoulos to give his thoughts. Mr. Stathakopoulos stated that it's almost impossible to ensure security across an entire supply chain as many small suppliers simply don't have the resources to address the issue. He said that, especially for small businesses, CISA needs to create a step-by-step guide to ensure these companies can provide at least the minimum level of security. Mr. Bobby Chesney, University of Texas, added that providing tax breaks to companies that work to improve cyber best-practices would also help. Ms. Suzanne Spaulding, Center for Strategic and International Studies, said that a long-term strategy would need to be education. Specifically, teaching civics so that children learn at a young age how their actions will impact others. Ms. Nicole Perlroth, Cybersecurity Journalist, added that using storytelling to explain how using multi-factor authentication

could have prevented major cyber-attacks could prove useful in this regard. Mr. Alex Stamos, Krebs Stamos Group, said that cloud providers should be required to include security features in their most basic sales packages. He noted that charging an additional fee to enable security creates a disincentive for customers to adopt these features. Mr. Green noted that mandates alone will not work, and that people need to be able to see the value of improving security. He suggested creating a cyber scorecard to grade companies on the cyber hygiene.

Director Easterly then asked Mr. Jeff Moss, DEF CON Communications, to discuss the topic of ***Igniting the Hacker Community***. Mr. Moss said that internet problems are global problems and addressing them will require global participation and a community response. He added that CISA should work to redefine the language around cybersecurity to make it clear how mutually beneficial it is. Mr. Moss noted health language works really well: If you're fighting against cancer, you're not fighting only for America. You're fighting against a global problem. He said that kind of inclusive language would get a lot more traction from the academic community. He added that hackers and academics need to provide an easy means for Government and policymakers to talk to them and receive feedback. Ms. Perlroth added that action is also important. She said it's important for CISA to think about its initial partnerships and ask: "Can CISA partner with the civil society community? Can CISA's efforts primarily support human rights defenders?" Ms. Marene Allison, Johnson & Johnson, noted that the Food and Drug Administration's process for working with the research community by creating a means for an open dialogue might provide CISA a model. Mr. Chris DeRusha, U.S. Chief Information Security Officer, Office of Management and Budget, added that CISA should consider reaching out to small groups like the Cyber Civilian Corps. Ms. Easterly said she would create a Technical Advisory Council as a subcommittee to address these issues.

On the topic of ***Protecting Critical Infrastructure from Misinformation & Disinformation***, Dr. Kate Starbird, University of Washington, noted that the level of disinformation being spread across information systems has been increasing dramatically in recent years. She noted that it was used in 2020 to undermine the U.S. election system and that it has also made it difficult for Governments to address crisis events like the COVID-19 pandemic. She said that the solution to addressing this is to teach people to care about whether what they're sharing is true or false. Mr. Chesney noted that it might be very difficult to get people to unlearn bad behavior like that as, after a while, it becomes an entrenched cognitive bias. He suggested that working with the various social media platforms to address the problem might be the best approach. Mr. Stamos and Ms. Allison noted that Government agencies are very bad at using their authority and platforms to push back against disinformation. Ms. Allison suggested that CISA create a playbook for agencies to use in responding to the spread of disinformation.

Director Easterly then turned to the topic of ***Building Resilience & Reducing Systemic Risk to Critical Infrastructure***. Mr. Fanning stated that one of the biggest impediments to industry and Government working together to address systemic risk is identifying the truly critical elements in critical infrastructure. He said CISA can help develop solutions, but that industry will need to take the lead in working with the Government to address the problem. Mr. Fanning noted that there are a number of models that CISA and industry could build on, such as the Analysis and Resilience Center for Systemic Risk developed by the Finance and Energy sectors. He closed by stating that, because industry controls the vast majority of critical infrastructure in the United States, the end goal should be for the Government to provide industry the tools to defend themselves.

Director Easterly recommended the following subcommittee assignments:

- **Transforming the Cyber Workforce**
  - Mr. Green, Mastercard (Lead)
  - Ms. Lori Beer, JPMorgan Chase
  - Ms. Nicole Perlroth, Cybersecurity Journalist
  - Dr. Pat Gallagher, University of Pittsburgh
  - Ms. Nicole Wong, NWong Strategies
  - Ms. Kiersten Todt, CISA

- **Turning the Corner on Cyber Hygiene**
  - Mr. George Stathakopoulos, Apple (Lead)
  - Mr. Steve Schmidt, AWS
  - Ms. Chris Young, Microsoft
  - Mr. Alex Stamos, Krebs Stamos Group
  - Mr. Ted Schlein, Kleiner Perkins
  - Ms. Nuala O'Connor, Walmart
  - Mr. Eric Goldstein, CISA
- **Igniting the Hacker Community (Technical Advisory Council)**
  - Mr. Jeff Moss, DEF Con Communications (Lead)
  - Mr. Kevin Mandia, Mandiant
  - Ms. Wong
  - Mr. Goldstein
  - Mr. Chris DeRusha, NCD/OMB
- **Protecting Critical Infrastructure from Misinformation & Disinformation**
  - Dr. Kate Starbird, University of Washington (Lead)
  - Ms. Suzanne Spaulding, Center for Strategic & International Studies
  - Mr. Matthew Prince, Cloudflare
  - Ms. Alicia Tate-Nadeau, State of Illinois
  - Ms. Vijaya Gadde, Twitter
  - Ms. Kim Wyman, CISA
  - Mr. Geoff Hale, CISA
- **Building Resilience & Reducing Systemic Risk to Critical Infrastructure**
  - Mr. Fanning (Lead)
  - Ms. Marene Allison, Johnson & Johnson
  - Mr. Bobby Chesney, University of Texas
  - Ms. Beer
  - Mr. Bob Kolasky, CISA
- **Strategic Communications**
  - Ms. Howe, Tenable (Chair)
  - Mayor Steve Adler, City of Austin
  - Mr. Schlein
  - Ms. Perlroth
  - Ms. Jen Easterly, CISA
  - Ms. Todt

## Public Comment Period

Mr. Patrick Gaul, National Technology Security Coalition, provided the following comment for the record:

Good afternoon. This is Patrick Gaul. And as the Executive Director of the National Technology Security Coalition or the NTSC, the organization that spearheaded the creation of the Advisory Committee, and very proud and excited to see it operational. I'm eager to see the Advisory Committee demonstrate its value to Director Easterly, CISA, and the nation. I'm also proud that NTSC board members Marene Allison and Ron Green, are members of the Advisory Committee. Marene and Ron are preeminent in the field and I know their contributions will be vital. I'd also like to congratulate JPMorgan Chase and Microsoft, for their membership on the Advisory Committee, as they both have a board presence with the NTSC as well. As the only national organization representing the Chief Information Security Officer or CISO, we are eager to make our voices heard. CISOs work hard every day on the front lines, to combat cyber threats and maintain our collective national security. I believe there's no one who understands

cybersecurity better than those that practice it every day and who are also in the front of implementing national policy and regulatory requirements. In most large companies today the CISO role has become a member of the C-suite and the member trusted to protect the interests of the company and the customers. We look forward to watching the committee engage the cyber challenges ahead of us. We also sincerely hope, as the committee expands, more CISOs will have an opportunity to serve. And of course, the NTSC stands ready to support the committee. Thank you for allowing me to speak.

### **Closing Remarks and Adjournment**

Director Easterly thanked the Committee members and other meeting participants for their input during the meeting. She also thanked the CISA and MITRE teams for supporting the meeting. She then gave each member an opportunity to ask any final questions. The Committee's Chair, Mr. Fanning, and Vice Chair, Mr. Green, both provided closing remarks noting that the Committee was off to a great start and that they looked forward to working on the issues discussed during the meeting. Director Inglis also thanked the Director and the participants, adding that he believed the Committee can make a serious dent in addressing the Nation's cybersecurity threats. Director Easterly adjourned the meeting.

## APPENDIX

## OPEN SESSION PARTICIPANT LIST

**CSAC Members**

Mr. Steve Adler  
 Ms. Marene Allison  
 Ms. Lori Beer  
 Mr. Robert Chesney  
 Mr. Thomas Fanning  
 Mr. Ron Green  
 Ms. Niloofar Razi Howe  
 Mr. Kevin Mandia  
 Mr. Jeff Moss  
 Ms. Nuala O'Connor  
 Ms. Nicole Perlroth  
 Mr. Ted Schlein  
 Mr. Stephen Schmidt  
 Ms. Suzanne Spaulding  
 Mr. Alex Stamos  
 Dr. Kate Starbird  
 Mr. George Stathakopoulos  
 Ms. Alicia Tate-Nadeau  
 Ms. Nicole Wong

**Organization**

City of Austin, Texas  
 Johnson & Johnson  
 JPMorgan Chase  
 University of Texas  
 Southern Company  
 Mastercard  
 Tenable  
 Mandiant  
 DEF CON Communications  
 Walmart  
 Cybersecurity Journalist  
 Kleiner Perkins Caufield & Byers  
 Amazon Web Services  
 Center for Strategic and International Studies  
 Krebs Stamos Group  
 University of Washington  
 Apple  
 Illinois Emergency Management Agency  
 NWong Strategies

**Government Participants**

The Hon. Jen Easterly  
 The Hon. Chris Inglis  
 The Hon. John K. Tien  
 Ms. Alaina Clark  
 Mr. Chris DeRusha  
 Ms. Osasu Dorsey  
 Ms. Victoria Dillon  
 Mr. Jonathan Dunn  
 Mr. Eric Goldstein  
 Mr. Robert Kolasky  
 Mr. Brent Logan  
 Mr. Jason Mayer  
 Ms. Kaitlin Seale  
 Mr. Mark Stidd  
 Ms. Kiersten Todt  
 Ms. Megan Tsuyi  
 Ms. Kim Wyman

**Organization**

Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency (CISA)  
 Office of the National Cyber Director (ONCD)  
 Department of Homeland Security (DHS)  
 CISA  
 Office of Management and Budget  
 ONCD  
 CISA  
 CISA  
 CISA  
 CISA  
 CISA  
 DHS  
 CISA  
 CISA  
 CISA  
 CISA  
 CISA

**Other Attendees**

Mr. Steve King

**Contractor Support**

Ms. Laura Karnas  
 Mr. Barry Skidmore  
 Ms. Quynh Tran  
 Ms. Jennifer Peters

**Dial-In Participants**

Mr. Payton Alexander  
 Mr. Lee Allen  
 Ms. Denise Anderson  
 Ms. Elizabeth Andrion  
 Mr. Billy Anglin  
 Ms. Felicia Archer  
 Ms. Mariam Baksh  
 Ms. Christina Berger  
 Mr. Musadiq Bidar  
 Mr. Christopher Bidwell  
 Mr. Calvin Biesecker  
 Ms. Ashley Billings  
 Mr. Charles Blackmore  
 Mr. Peter Bloniarz  
 Mr. Per Brekke  
 Ms. Cynthia Brumfield  
 Mr. Brandon Buchanan  
 Ms. Mary Byrd  
 Ms. Courtney Callejas  
 Ms. Genevieve Carnes  
 Mr. Christopher Castelli  
 Mr. Michael Chandaris  
 Ms. Alicia Chavy  
 Ms. Lodrina Cherne  
 Ms. Ruth Clemens  
 Mr. George Coleman  
 Ms. Kathryn Condello  
 Ms. Audrey Connors  
 Mr. Justin Cooksey  
 Ms. Bria Cousins  
 Ms. Ann Cutler  
 Ms. Jumoke Dada  
 Mr. Raymond Decerchio

**Organization**

MITRE

**Organization**

Booz Allen Hamilton  
 Insight  
 Insight  
 Nexight Group

**Organization**

Wiley Rein LLP  
 TSA  
 Health ISAC  
 Charter Communications  
 Sylint  
 TSA  
 Nextgov  
 CISA SED  
 CBS News  
 Airports Council International  
 Defense Daily  
 CNN  
 US Coast Guard  
 Office of Governor New York  
 Embassy of Norway  
 CSO Online  
 American Bus Association  
 TSA  
 US House of Representatives  
 Association of American Railroads  
 Booz Allen Hamilton  
 TSA  
 Beacon Global Strategies  
 Cybereason  
 CISA  
 TSA  
 Lumen  
 Charter Communications  
 Department of Energy  
 CNBC  
 CISA  
 R Street Institute  
 FAA

**Dial-In Participants**

Ms. Grace Dille  
 Mr. Cameron Dixon  
 Mr. Justin Doubleday  
 Ms. Nzinga Dyson  
 Mr. Obum Egolum  
 Ms. Sharon Eshelman  
 Ms. Katie Ewers  
 Mr. Derrick Fail  
 Ms. Michelle Feldstein  
 Mr. Erik Fredrickson  
 Ms. Sara Freidman  
 Ms. Vijaya Gadde  
 Mr. Rory Gallagher  
 Mr. Michael Garcia  
 Mr. Patrick Gaul  
 Mr. Gregory Gavins  
 Ms. Olivia Gazis  
 Mr. Eric Geller  
 Ms. Heather Gerard  
 Ms. Leah Glaccum  
 Ms. Tara Hairston  
 Ms. Judith Harroun Lord  
 Mr. Juan Hayes  
 Ms. Katie Hazlett  
 Mr. Andrew Hildick Smith  
 Mr. Maurice Ed Hudson  
 Mr. Michael Jacobs  
 Mr. Eamon Javers  
 Mr. Bob Joachim  
 Mr. Lamar Johnson  
 Mr. Derek Johnson  
 Ms. Anne Johnson  
 Ms. Jillian Joyce  
 Mr. Albert Kammler  
 Ms. Michealann Krause  
 Ms. Norma Krayem  
 Mr. Pradeep Kumar  
 Mr. Jason Lamote  
 Ms. Laura Laybourn  
 Ms. Christina Lee  
 Mr. Mark Lemmond

**Organization**

Meri Talk  
 CISA  
 Federal News Network  
 Lewis Burke Associates LLC  
 Capital One Financial  
 Lewisburke Associates  
 McKesson Corporation  
 NOAA  
 CISA OSPP  
 Alaska Communications  
 Inside Cybersecurity  
 Twitter  
 N/A  
 Senate Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs  
 National Technology Security Coalition  
 Senate Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs  
 CBS News  
 POLITICO  
 OASA ALT Army  
 Defense Business Board  
 Alliance for Automotive Innovation  
 TSA  
 TSA  
 Commonwealth Strategic Partner  
 Water ISAC  
 CISA CSD  
 TSA  
 CNBC  
 House Committee on Appropriations  
 MeriTalk  
 SC Media  
 CISA CSD Contractor  
 Committee on Homeland Security  
 Van Scoyoc Associates  
 Check Point Software Technologies  
 Van Scoyoc Associates  
 Tata Consultancy Services  
 DHS Office of Legislative  
 CISA NRMC  
 Beacon Global Strategies  
 US Department of Energy



**Dial-In Participants**

Mr. Harry Lesser  
 Mr. Devin Lynch  
 Mr. Rafi Martina  
 Ms. Tina Martinez  
 Mr. Scott McConnell  
 Mr. George McElwee  
 Mr. Tim McGiff  
 Mr. Michael McWilliams  
 Ms. Ceydi Mendoza  
 Ms. Maggie Miller  
 Ms. Celinda Moening  
 Ms. Valerie Mongello  
 Mr. Drew Morin  
 Ms. Stacy O'Mara  
 Mr. James Orgill  
 Ms. Cheri Pascoe  
 Ms. Andrea Peterson  
 Ms. Nancy Pomerleau  
 Mr. Matthew Prince  
 Mr. Donald Andy Purdy  
 Ms. Kayla Renner  
 Mr. Chris Riotta  
 Mr. Michael Rosado  
 Mr. Chris Rose  
 Mr. Edward Rothgery  
 Mr. Michael Ryan  
 Ms. Farida Salama  
 Ms. Geneva Sands  
 Mr. Fred Schwien  
 Mr. Tony Sibert  
 Mr. Eric Snyderman  
 Ms. Janet St. John  
 Ms. Donna Steward  
 Mr. Peter Su  
 Mr. David Sucherman  
 Mr. James Tollerson  
 Mr. Costis Toregas  
 Mr. Wesley Trimble  
 Ms. Kimberly Underwood  
 Mr. Christian Vasquez  
 Mr. Joe Viens

**Organization**

OASA ALT Army  
 SecurityScorecard  
 Senate Select Committee on Intelligence  
 CISA SED  
 CISA  
 Commonwealth Strategic Partner  
 Venable LLP  
 Defense Innovation Board  
 DHS TSA  
 The Hill  
 N/A  
 CISA  
 Tmobile  
 Mandiant  
 Identification Technology Part  
 NIST  
 The Record  
 CISA SED  
 Cloudflare  
 Huawei Technologies USA  
 Monument Advocacy  
 FCW  
 Syntelligen Analytic Solutions  
 CISA  
 NSA  
 US Coast Guard  
 TSA  
 CNN  
 Boeing  
 CosmGroup LLC  
 CISA CSD  
 Assoc of American Railroads  
 Hi Trust Alliance  
 Senate Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs  
 CNBC  
 Norfolk Southern  
 Montgomery County MD and GW U  
 Commonwealth Strategic Partner  
 AFCEA International  
 E&E News  
 Charter Communications

**Dial-In Participants**

Ms. Andrea Vittorio  
Ms. Bridgette Walsh  
Mr. Jonathan Walton  
Mr. Michael Widomski  
Mr. David Wood  
Ms. Orlie Natalie Yaniv  
Mr. Darnell Young  
Ms. Bridget Zamperini

**Organization**

Bloomberg News  
Financial Services ISAC  
TSA  
CISA  
CISA  
Gigamon  
TSA  
Federal Transit Administration

**CERTIFICATION**

I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing minutes are accurate and complete.

**Tom Fanning** (approved on 18 December 2021)

Mr. Tom Fanning  
CISA Cybersecurity Advisory Committee Chair