
Minutes

Board of Natural Resources Meeting

June 4, 2024

Webinar, Omak City Hall, Omak, Washington

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

The Honorable Hilary Franz, Washington State Commissioner of Public Lands

The Honorable Chris Reykdal, Superintendent of Public Instruction

Dan Brown, Director, School of Environmental and Forest Sciences,

University of Washington

The Honorable Lisa Janicki, Commissioner, Skagit County

Jim Cahill, Designee for the Honorable Jay Inslee, Washington State Governor

Wendy Powers, Dean, College of Agricultural, Human, and Natural Resource Sciences,
Washington State University

CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Lisa Janicki called the meeting to order at 9:15 a.m.

Board members provided self-introduction. A meeting quorum was confirmed.

CHANGES TO AGENDA

Vice Chair Janicki adjusted the agenda moving Timber Sales to 11 a.m.

WEBINAR/SAFETY BRIEFING

Kelli Pinchak, Board Coordinator, outlined how to view and participate in the combined webinar and in-person meeting.

Dr. Dan Brown joined the meeting at 9:20 a.m.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES – May 14, 2024 - Action

MOTION: Mr. Cahill moved to approve the minutes as presented.

SECOND: Dean Powers seconded the motion.

ACTION: The motion carried unanimously.

1
2 **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

3 **Randy Johnson, Commissioner, Clallam County**, spoke in support of the pending River
4 Road direct transfer proposal. He thanked staff and Clallam County staff for working
5 together over the last year to make the project possible. Water is a scarce resource,
6 particularly in the North Peninsula. The property enables the county to develop an off-
7 channel reservoir to provide water during the summer for fish, farmers, and people. The
8 county is currently in the design phase of the project. The appraisal process for the property
9 was difficult because of many issues to include a dumpsite on the property. He supports the
10 project and urged the Board to approve the transfer.

11
12 **Joshua Wright** referred to the Natural Climate Solutions (NCS) funding allocated by the
13 Legislature to protect forests in four regions. One region is the Stillaguamish watershed in
14 Snohomish County. The proposed Stilly Revisited timber sale includes some areas
15 originating in the 1850s according to the Department's assessment. Some areas of the timber
16 sale are prime candidates for protection under NCS because of stand age and complexity of
17 the landscape located near the Oso Landslide that includes many old growth trees. The Board
18 should defer the sale to enable an assessment of the area by Snohomish County
19 Commissioners as potential NCS parcels because the area includes many steep slopes.
20 DNR's report indicates it was not possible to predict slope movements with certainty. Since
21 there are limited areas of the forest in the Stillaguamish watershed that would qualify for NCS
22 funding, the Board should pause the sale to enable the county to assess and potentially
23 nominate the area.

24
25 **Sheryl Ahlblad** said she owns property in three counties with timber sales planned in each
26 county. More than 1,000 acres will be cut and sprayed with Roundup within the next five
27 months. Nearly all speakers are opposed to logging legacy forests with the exception of
28 several speakers. The Board should be listening to the majority of citizens who are requesting
29 preservation of legacy forests. Last month, the Board approved six timber sales, which is
30 unacceptable. She questioned why it was not possible to work together to omit the acreage
31 containing older forests because there is no defense for logging older forests. The decision to
32 target those rare forest ecosystems specifically for commercial logging despite the objectives
33 of the Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP) and DNR's own policies and procedures undermines
34 the efforts to reduce the risk of wildfires and climate change. Only after the 10% to 15%
35 target is achieved, structurally complex forests should not be considered. The Department has
36 fallen short of its goal and the Board should protect the remaining seven percent. In the next
37 five to ten years, no older legacy forests will exist. A moratorium should be enforced.

38
39 **Kyle Krakow** said he hiked through the Stilly Revisited timber sale unit and spoke to local
40 residents who live near the proposed clearcut. Many are outraged by DNR's plans to destroy
41 the rare gem of a forest in their backyard. It does not help that the site is down river from the
42 2014 Oso Landslide in the same watershed on even steeper ground. The Oso Landslide
43 Memorial features 43 cedars planted at the entrance, one for each victim. Unlike the old
44 growth cedars on DNR's timber sale, those trees are small and a reminder of just how brief a
45 decade actually is. While talking with those who lost loved ones and seeing the scar left
46 behind, it is clear the trauma has not faded. The stories of survival and resilience are

1 remarkable. The land remembers and the people remember. Meanwhile, DNR chooses to
2 forget. The Department is in the business of forgetting. With each legacy forest logged, DNR
3 erases entire generations of rich ecological history. The Board bears responsibility for what
4 happens to Washington's oldest forests and for the disasters that might unfold as a result.
5 Continually signing off on reckless timber sales, such as Stilly Revisited, the Board will in
6 time be remembered if not prosecuted as climate criminals. The Board has the option to act
7 differently by rejecting the Stilly Revisited timber sale.
8

9 **Jim Oliver** said he looks forward to participating in the tour over the next several days. He
10 noted several prominent themes in the meetings over the last 15 months from gratitude across
11 the state for DNR's efforts to protect homes and infrastructure from wildfires, gratitude from
12 the timber lobby for DNR's clearcuts across the state and a strong desire for more clearcuts
13 before they become illegal, and the thousands of Washingtonians pleading, demanding, and
14 imploring the Board to protect legacy forests before they no longer exist. He is not the first
15 speaker to point out the risks of clearcutting Stilly Revisited, the largest timber sale by
16 volume offered this year endangering dozens of old growth trees and placing residential
17 neighborhoods at risk of landslides five miles downstream from Oso. The ten-foot wide
18 centuries old red cedar that marks the boundary of Unit 3 surrounded by mature hemlocks and
19 silver firs are not contained within the old growth polygon DNR added at the last minute to
20 diffuse concerns about the sale. The tree and other old growth trees that are marked as leave
21 trees will be at severe risk of landslides, wind, disease, drought, and other difficulties of being
22 left standing alone in the middle of a 150-acre clearcut. No one believes the area if clearcut
23 would recover and be a healthy forest in 150 years. He asked for the cancellation of the
24 clearcut.
25

26 **Steven Burke, Commissioner, Clallam County**, reported he also serves as the Executive
27 Director of the Shore Metropolitan Park District. He thanked the Board and Sarah Ogden
28 who serves at the Trust Outreach Specialist. Since 2009, it is the first time communications
29 have occurred with DNR. He is appreciative of the efforts and thanked staff for
30 communicating with the county. He noted the financial issues the county encumbers when
31 timber sales are removed from auction. The budget for the Park District includes timber sales
32 revenue up to 10%. Timber revenue is an important financial issue for taxing districts.
33

34 **Laura Wilkeson, Hampton Lumber**, said the company is a fourth generation family-owned
35 business with timberlands across Western Washington and sawmills in the communities of
36 Morton, Randle, and Darrington. Hampton Lumber is an active purchaser of timber sales
37 from the Omak region for the Darrington mill. The company supports sales from the
38 Northeast Region not only to support local communities, beneficiaries, and Western
39 Washington operations, but because the sales contribute to overall forest health of the region.
40 Revenue generated from the timber sales program at large enables DNR to do important work
41 on both sides of the Cascades. To ensure the work continues and local communities,
42 contractors, and beneficiaries can benefit, the company strongly encourages DNR to offer a
43 multitude of timber sales and for the Board to approve them as presented. Deferring timber
44 sales of all types means less revenue for DNR to complete necessary forest management and
45 meet its fiduciary responsibilities. It is hopeful the Board can move past this unfortunate
46 trend and continue to trust in DNR staff's ability to manage forests sustainably and for the

1 best interests of Washingtonians. Hampton Lumber also appreciates the relationships it has
2 with all DNR staff, especially staff in this region, as the company is limited to delivering logs
3 to Darrington in the Northwest Region when the north Cascades Highway is only open from
4 May to November. Company staff appreciates DNR's willingness to work with the company
5 to address issues as they arise. She looks forward to participating in the tour to learn more
6 about the critical work DNR is pursuing for the region.
7

8 **Health Heikkila** addressed a comment pertaining to the NCS budget proviso. The
9 Snohomish County Council was asked to submit two parcels including the Stilly Revisited
10 parcel and another parcel in a letter to the Legislature. The County Council failed to include
11 them. The language within the budget proviso precludes the inclusion of parcels when a
12 forest practices application has been initiated, which applies to the Stilly Revisited proposed
13 sale. He addressed several inaccurate statements during the Board's meetings. The most
14 egregious is the claim that DNR does not need to harvest its mature acreage and can maintain
15 timber volumes and revenues by harvesting young plantation forests. Not only is this not true,
16 it is the opposite of sustainable forestry and it conflicts with DNR's fiduciary obligations. It
17 is also at odds with the advocacy efforts of some environmental groups to lengthen rotation
18 ages to increase carbon sequestration. Withdrawing timber sales is having a significant
19 impact on junior taxing districts. He cited several school districts that are experiencing
20 financial impacts. The Board's action follows the plan and staff members are following the
21 HCP, marbled murrelet strategy, and the SHC. It is important the Board enables DNR to
22 follow the sustainable forest plans.
23

24 **Ed Bowen, resident of Clallam County**, commented on the arrearage of 53 mmbf that will
25 not be achieved during the current SHC. He urged the Board to address the new decadal SHC
26 and how the Department plans to account for the shortfall in timber volume. He spoke to his
27 opposition of the Trust Land Transfer Program process in the county. The proposal is for
28 Common School Trust for the South Ozette Lake parcel in Clallam County, located in his
29 neighborhood. He opposes the transfer and made it clear during the limited public comment
30 process especially when there is active silvicultural underway within the parcel. Analysis is
31 lacking to justify why the application would be acceptable. Since the proposal is for Common
32 School Trust, he expects the Superintendent of Public Instruction to reach out to the
33 community affected instead of raising his property taxes by a school district that does not send
34 a representative to the Trust Land Transfer Program team meetings in Clallam County.
35

36 **Matt Comisky, American Forest Resource Council**, stressed the importance of timber
37 volume east and west of the Cascades. The loss of revenue is creating real impacts. Based on
38 his recent conversations with representatives from the Timberland Regional Library, the
39 impacts caused by the loss of revenue in Thurston, Grays Harbor, and Pacific counties
40 because of delayed timber sales will result in the reduction of library services. Ongoing
41 efforts to recruit infrastructure in the north central Cascades is facing a major hurdle because
42 of the lack of volume. The Nature Conservancy realizes the importance of maintaining
43 existing infrastructure because timber volume is critical for both and for forest health
44 treatments. Additionally, mills are seeking timber from Eastern Washington because of the
45 constricted supply in Western Washington. If the Department wants to reach climate goals
46 and complete forest health treatments it is necessary to have a healthy and robust forest

1 products industry, which requires timber volume. He encouraged the Board to support the
2 hardworking professional staff by approving all timber sales and following the Board's
3 fiduciary obligation to beneficiaries.
4

5 **Connie Beauvais, Commissioner, Port of Port Angeles,** spoke in support of the Pistol Pete
6 Sorts timber sale. She thanked staff for their care in developing the sales package, which
7 initially included 240 acres. After setting aside 91 acres under the Forest Practices Rule for
8 potentially unstable slopes, riparian areas, wetland management zones, and identified and
9 protected old growth, the remaining amount to be sustainably harvested is 149 acres. In 2023
10 dollars, the harvest is expected to provide \$1.1 million in revenue to Clallam County taxing
11 districts. Each dollar generated through the sustainability of public working forests is vitally
12 important to public services taxing districts provide. The Port of Port Angeles has applied for
13 grants to help the county move into the future with clean, green transportation and economic
14 development projects. Working on projects requiring only a 10 percent match will make
15 \$16,500 from the Pistol Pete Sorts timber sale worth nine times that amount. Olympic
16 Medical Hospital must dip into reserves each month to meet expenditures. Approximately
17 \$47,000 from the timber sale will help the hospital meet its bottom line. North Olympic
18 Library is working on a new library and over \$43,000 from the sale would be put to good use.
19 Fire District 3 is seeking to place an operations and maintenance levy and a lid lift levy before
20 its constituents in the near term. Over \$200,000 from the timber sale will help Fire District 3.
21 It is important to keep public forests working and county services sustainable and healthy by
22 approving the sale as presented.
23

24 **Paul Butler, resident of Thurston County,** said he is small forest landowner.
25 Superintendent Reykdal was absent at the last meeting and he understands Superintendent
26 Reykdal sent an email to Commissioner Franz and the Board concerning timber sales
27 containing older forests on the May agenda for consideration. During a review of the meeting
28 recording, he found it odd that there was no mention of the correspondence or the absence of
29 Superintendent Reykdal. He supports a viable timber industry and the management of
30 existing DNR plantations to generate revenue for trust beneficiaries. He is convinced that
31 converting what little remains of older state forests into more plantation acreage is not in the
32 best interests of citizens of Washington especially in the absence of an older forests policy.
33 As a regular attendee to Board meetings since March 2021, there has been a state Supreme
34 Court decision that expands DNR's management options and an increasing groundswell of
35 public support for protecting older forests. Staff claims it takes one to three years to set up a
36 timber sale. However, setting up sales in existing plantations would take significantly less
37 time than in older forests. It is not a failure of the quality of work by foresters; it is a failure
38 of managers who decide to select older forest stands disproportionately for harvest without a
39 coherent older forest policy. The Board should insist on the development of a policy before
40 another acre of older forest is put up for auction.
41

42 **Ed Chadd, resident of Clallam County,** said he resonates with the last two speakers because
43 DNR should develop a policy on mature forests to avoid this situation today. A policy would
44 have prevented foresters spending time working up sales on older forests and the policy
45 would have provided a steady pipeline of trees and revenue to taxing districts, which is
46 lacking today. It has been pointed out many times that DNR should have developed a policy

1 on older forests according to the conservation plan. The Department is now contending with
2 a lawsuit, which could have been avoided. In the future, it is important to address the issues
3 to avoid legal actions. He cited a letter he sent to the Board in conjunction with several
4 colleagues about the need to develop the older forest policy.
5

6 **Mariska Kecskes** said she is speaking on behalf of the Washington Chapter of Sierra Club.
7 She urged the Board not to move forward with the Stilly Revisited timber sale. As conveyed
8 by many, the sale poses a risk particularly around erosion and landslides. The sale represents
9 both the benefit and the obligation by the Board to manage lands holistically for multiple
10 values and stakeholders. It does not necessarily mean an all or nothing decision with respect
11 to timberlands because some lands could be managed for timber and some lands should not be
12 managed for timber particularly when ecosystem services are of more value or lands that are
13 financially risky because of potential landslides that often outweigh the financial gain of a
14 sale. She urged the Board to vote against the timber sale and continue to be engaged with the
15 full suite of ecosystem services of mature forests by weighing costs and benefits fully.
16

17 **Lee Tischer, Commissioner, Wahkiakum County**, spoke in support of the Lickety Split
18 Sorts timber sale. Timber revenue is essential for the small county. Nearly 40% of the
19 county's expense budget is from timber revenue. The county is struggling to make ends meet
20 because of the rising cost of providing services to the public. To meet current expense needs,
21 the county borrowed from other county funds. Should the timber sale not materialize and
22 Wahkiakum County does not receive the revenue, the consequences could be severe. The
23 county may be forced to lay off staff worsening the existing shortage of personnel in county
24 offices. The county, unlike its larger counterparts, faces unique challenges, as the county's
25 tax base is small and lacks large industries. The county struggles to identify revenue to keep
26 up with all mandates required of counties by the state and federal government. The recent
27 closure of the third largest supplier has only added to the county's financial problems.
28 Wahkiakum County has some of the best soil and climate for growing trees in the state.
29 Many acres of productive timberland encumbered by marbled murrelet have restricted
30 revenue to the county for years. The county cannot withstand more land being removed from
31 production with the current revenue formula the county relies on to keep the doors open to the
32 courthouse.
33

34 **Nina Sarmiento** advocated for pausing the approval of higher priority legacy forest timber
35 sales particularly the Stilly Revisited timber sale. Few forests remain in Western Washington
36 on state land that have not been logged or turned into monocrop plantations that contain the
37 structural complexity and biodiversity that is needed for the largest stretch of temperate rain
38 forest in the world, stretching up the coast to Alaska. Those forests, such as Stilly Revisited
39 are the carbon workhorses sequestering more carbon than any other forest type when left to
40 mature to old growth. Any study that says otherwise fails to account for the carbon stored in
41 the soil. Each step in those types of forests is over the bodies of over 16,000 invertebrates and
42 each square meter of soil contains as many as two million creatures. The underground world
43 is a carbon storage system upheld by tree roots. After a variable retention harvest, those
44 connections are severed and carbon leaks from the soil slowly for decades and all the
45 microbiology of invertebrates and fungi bacteria die. The soil must start over again after
46 thousands and thousands of years of being built up. It is unacceptable to ignore the research

1 and continue current logging practices calling them sustainable and healthy. The Carbon and
2 Forest Management Work Group is doing very important work and taking the time to learn
3 and understand the concepts and it is only logical for them to complete their work before any
4 legacy sales are approved for harvest. Trees in Stilly Revisited are as old as the late 1850s,
5 the time when white ancestors began the conquest over the land and its people. Giant cedars
6 are at risk of being lost forever. The Board can make the change.
7

8 **Robert Mitchell** read an excerpt describing the Pacific Northwest in 1901 by John Muir, a
9 naturalist, writer, and advocate of U.S. forest conservation.
10

11 **Alexia Allen** said she lives in Woodinville, Washington. North of her small farm are acres of
12 state land. She is uncertain about the fate of the acres and would like to learn about the plans
13 for the site. She has lived in the area for 20 years and manages a small wood lot that meets
14 many of her family's basic needs. She appreciates the uses and all the gifts of a forest. Her
15 small farm relies on clean water flowing from the forest. A time is coming when clean water
16 from the forest is just as much or more valuable than the board feet contained within the
17 forest. As a farmer and an educator, she often takes children into the forest and is able to
18 observe their reactions when they hear birds sing. During her management of the forest, she
19 has learned much about different regenerative techniques that can maintain a forest structure
20 while still providing revenue and meeting the needs of the community. The forest is located
21 between Hooven Bog, a federally protected wetland, and Crystal Lake. As an ecologist and a
22 long-time resident, she appreciates the value of a large connected area of forest just north of
23 her property and the many factors at play and is grateful for the Board's time and
24 consideration.
25

26 **Dr. Julie Ratner** testified in opposition of the proposed timber sales and all future auctions of
27 mature forest parcels. Trees are the most cost-effective immediate solution for preventing
28 heat domes and out-of-control wildfires. Deforestation has played a significant role in
29 contributing to global warming. Forests are best suited to prevent future adverse climate
30 changes if they are allowed to grow and mature. She asked what would be necessary before
31 the Board cares that clearcutting impacts weather and farm production. Step up with a
32 backbone and stop the madness. Monthly sales approved by the Board are not sustainable for
33 the industry and the Board is leading the industry to a monopoly. Decisions each month to
34 auction timber are reckless and shortsighted. The parcels are cherry-picked for harvesting
35 mature trees for greed. The value of a tree is not in terms of board feet but biological. The
36 number one priority is to protect trees to alleviate extreme weather of droughts, storms, and
37 wildfire, and to store maximum carbon. Science and economics prove short harvest cycles
38 and the current rate of clearcutting are not sustainable. Trees are young infants at the age of
39 100 years. There is plenty of timber for DNR revenue.
40

41 **Linnea Comstock** challenged the Board to uphold its duty to harvest DNR lands sustainably
42 to include Common School Land Trust and the State Forest Land Trust (county-based
43 administered lands). In February 2024, the Board voted to defer Units 4 and 5 of the Cabbage
44 Patch timber sale directly affecting many Thurston County junior taxing districts. According
45 to a letter sent to the Thurston County Board of County Commissioners on March 5, 2024,
46 DNR offered to collaborate with Thurston County with a deadline of October 2, 2024 to

1 respond including notice to the Commission of the requirement that the funding not collected
2 from the harvest would be made whole. The Board should not have postponed the sale as the
3 Board has deprived junior taxing districts of revenues they need. One specific example is the
4 Olympia School District, which over the last several months has considered closing two
5 schools. According to Elisa Perkins with Substack an article published on May 30, 2024
6 indicates \$596,128.00 has been withheld from the Olympia School District because of the
7 choice to withdraw Cabbage Patch from auction according to public records requests cited in
8 her article. The Thurston County Board of County Commissioners and the cities of Olympia,
9 Lacey, and Tumwater do not have the right to speak for fire districts, school districts, and
10 other junior taxing districts that they do not administer. In total, approximately \$11 million is
11 being withheld from junior taxing districts in Thurston County due to auction deferment. She
12 encouraged the Board to move forward with authorizing auction sales including Cabbage
13 Patch and Carrot timber sales.
14

15 **Brel Froebe, Center for Responsible Forestry**, urged the Board to delay the Stilly Revisited
16 timber sale. The Carbon and Forest Management Work Group is currently engaged in work
17 to model carbon and economic impacts of conservation for carbon dense, structurally complex
18 forests. The work group, as well as DNR advocated for Maturation II forests to be modeled
19 for conservation. It makes no sense to log the last few acres of Maturation II forests on the
20 landscape. Stilly Revisited is unique and parts have never been logged. It is the type of forest
21 Dr. Jerry Franklin advocates for conservation at the federal level. If there was a candidate for
22 a forest to be conserved, Stilly Revisited would be one of those forests. The Board should
23 delay the sale to enable the work group to have the time to deliver its recommendations.
24

25 **Matt Leise, Sierra Pacific Industries, Shelton Division**, said timber sold from DNR
26 managed lands in Eastern Washington supplies forest products facilities both in the east and
27 west sides of the state including Sierra Pacific's Burlington Division. Purchasers rely on the
28 volume to keep mills operating. Many DNR and private landowner projects in Eastern
29 Washington such as field reduction treatments and forest health treatments would not be
30 viable without a healthy forest products industry. Projects to be visited on the tour are only a
31 few examples of the high quality work completed by DNR staff. Throughout his career he
32 has witnessed the dedication and expertise of DNR field staff in their responsible management
33 of trust lands. The timber sale planning and layout process is highly complex and considers
34 values such as water quality, wildlife habitat, slope stability, and a shifting mosaic of forest
35 structures and age classes. They do the work within a rigorous framework of federal and state
36 environmental laws and the policies approved by the Board. After months and often years,
37 efforts result in the sale of timber to provide revenue to trust beneficiaries, family wage jobs,
38 and sustainable and renewal carbon-friendly wood products. Unfortunately, many of their
39 efforts have not come to fruition as the projects languish while waiting for Board approval.
40 As the end of the fiscal year is nearing, DNR has not achieved its timber sale volume targets
41 as set forth in the SHC approved by the Board. He encouraged the Board to demonstrate its
42 support for DNR staff and fulfill its responsibility to the trust beneficiaries by approving all
43 timber sales that have completed agency review.
44

45 **Lee First** commented that every month she listens to representatives from the forest products
46 industry comment on how wonderful Washington's working forests are in sequestering

1 carbon. She questioned the metric tons per acre a 30-year old tree plantation sequesters.
2 Studies by scientists J.M. Kimble and Southwick reflect that old growth Douglas fir forests in
3 Oregon's coast range sequester 1,127 metric tons of carbon per acre or more than any other
4 type of vegetation anywhere in the world. Allowing Washington forests to continue growing
5 could store an astonishing amount of carbon. So, who is to be believed? She asked that
6 meetings include some presenters to share information on the carbon sequestration value of
7 saving older carbon dense, structurally complex forests. Last month, the Board approved the
8 auction of six legacy forest units. The action was shortsighted. This month, Stilly Revisited
9 is in the queue. The unit is 152 acres of legacy forest including old growth on very steep
10 slopes closer to the river than the site of the Oso Landslide. She questioned the issue with
11 gates and why people are required to walk so far to visit the units. People who harvest salal -
12 and mushrooms are able to obtain permits and gate keys. She asked whether she could secure
13 a permit and a gate key. She often takes students from Oakville High School to visit the
14 legacy forest of Misty, a unit that is on the chopping block within the next several months. It
15 is the only forest with big trees anywhere near the school.

16
17 **Court Stanley** said he represents Washington State Association of Counties on forestry
18 issues. He was a professional forester working for private forest landowners for over 45
19 years. During his career, he has watched and participated in the evolution of forestland
20 management and witnessed the spotted owl wars and the devastating effects on rural
21 communities, decline in rotation age on private land from 80 to 100 years to 35 to 40 years,
22 and positive impacts of protecting riparian management zones from zero feet on a fish stream
23 to over 100 feet on each side. Over the last 25 years, the state has had the most protective
24 Forest Practices Rules in the nation on private forestlands. He is proud of the stewardship by
25 the companies he was involved with in protecting clean water, fish, and wildlife. Conversely,
26 DNR voluntarily sets aside more forests for the protection of fish, wildlife, and recreation
27 than required of private land. DNR also maintains a longer rotation age that provides habitat
28 structure that does not occur on most private land as well as supplying a dwindling amount of
29 timber for specialty mills. Citizens live in the best region in the world to grow and harvest
30 trees and produce the best building materials. Yet, he is confused and concerned about the
31 efforts to stop harvesting working forests and the effects those decisions are having on forest
32 health, schools, hospitals, libraries, and rural communities.

33
34 **Regan Nickels** reported she is the Superintendent of the Sequim School District. She
35 appreciates the opportunity to address the Board regarding the proposed Pistol Pete timber
36 sale and efforts to organize the timber sale programs and educate on responsible forest
37 management practices. It is critically important to hear from junior taxing districts on the
38 importance of timber sale revenue in relation to each organization's forward momentum and
39 community goals expected to be executed. Port Commissioner Beauvais shared many of the
40 goals during her testimony. School districts across the state are facing stressful and
41 significant budgeting limitations. In the Sequim School District's case, funding woes
42 required a cut of \$2.5 million or 5% of the school district budget. She advocated for the
43 approval of the Pistol Pete timber sale in Clallam County. The Sequim School District would
44 receive much needed revenue at a level of \$194,000. Timber revenues would ease the school
45 district's financial burden of capital projects for unmet deferred maintenance. Historically,
46 the school district has dedicated previous timber sale revenues to basic projects, such as

1 HVAC repairs. The school district is planning to align revenues with capital projects with
2 safety and security and the growing backlog of deferred maintenance requiring asset repair.
3 Those expenses are foundational costs. The dependence of school districts on available
4 revenue streams on a predictable schedule is critical.
5

6 **Jake Hambidge** reported he represents Canyon Lumber Company located in Everett,
7 Washington. The small family-owned sawmill has been in operation for over 100 years.
8 Throughout that time, the company provided jobs for people to build and raise families as
9 well as contributing to the local economy. He urged the Board to approve the proposed
10 timber sales. The sales were carefully developed by staff. Canyon employs approximately 50
11 individuals and specializes in cutting Douglas fir timbers for architectural beams. The beams
12 are used in residential and commercial building applications. Due to the size and need and the
13 ring count to meet the select structural grade requirements, the sawmill processes logs
14 between 70 to 85 years old. The plan is to continue building on the history established within
15 the area for future generations. However, the company is concerned about the impact of
16 withdrawing more DNR working forests will have on the company's ability to operate. With
17 less timber available in the sustainable wood basket in the Northwest Region, the company
18 must truck logs over greater distances resulting in more emissions from trucking raw material
19 than sourcing locally or using alternative products such as steel. The company also thanks
20 DNR for the careful approach to ensure responsible forest management while also providing
21 sustainable resources to local companies. The forest management practices that Washington
22 DNR follows are among the most conservative in the world.
23

24 **Noah Glaude, North Olympic Library System, Port Angeles**, shared information on the
25 timber revenue the library system receives from DNR trust lands. The library utilizes over
26 \$2.5 million in timber revenue to help fund the \$7.5 million Sequim Library Expansion and
27 Renovation project. However, more funding is needed. The new library will include critical
28 infrastructure improvements and more space for collections and meetings with increased
29 accessibility. Energy use will be nearly net zero with solar and battery backup system serving
30 as a community hub during inclement weather or during emergency events. The library hired
31 a local contractor for the construction of the project. In Port Angeles, the library system
32 applied for a \$313,000 grant with timber revenue serving as a match to meet grant
33 requirements. The grant will replace failing sections of the parking lot at the library and
34 provide accessible parking spaces and sidewalks leading to the library to adhere to ADA
35 requirements. At the Forks Library, the heat pump will be replaced at a cost of \$24,000
36 funded by timber revenue. The library serves as a shelter during heat and cold events.
37 Covering these expenses would be difficult without timber revenue. He thanked DNR for
38 sustainably managing trust lands.
39

40 **David New, resident of Bellingham**, said his family owns a small parcel of forestland in
41 Snohomish County. Approximately 15 years ago and prior to becoming a small forest
42 steward, he was of the opinion that the best way to manage forests was to let nature take its
43 course. Since then, his eyes have been opened and he understands that forests require active
44 management including harvesting for long-term forest health. He has witnessed staff at work
45 and that the harvest standards exceed those of any other company/agency in the world. A
46 recent item in the news stated that during the next ten years, a million new housing units will

1 be required in the state. He questioned the source of the materials to build those units.
2 Everyone should agree that the most sustainable action to take is to use as much lumber as
3 possible. The United States is a net importer of wood products. Approximately 40% of wood
4 consumed in the country is from Canada, South America, and the Far East. All those sources
5 have lower environmental harvest standards than Washington State. Any local harvest that is
6 foregone or timber unit removed from forest rotations means more lumber will need to be
7 supplied from other counties at greater worldwide environmental ramifications. Local
8 harvests supplying local mills create local jobs to produce local lumber to reduce the amount
9 of imported lumber, which is better for the rural environment and local economy. Structural
10 timber in the form of Douglas fir grows better in Western Washington than any other place on
11 earth. It is important everyone embraces that fact.

12
13 **Jim Stoffer** referred to previous speakers advocating for timber sales for maintaining funding
14 for schools, fire departments, and roads. He asked the Board to approve the Pistol Pete timber
15 sale. The revenue advisory committee in Clallam County is working well with all junior
16 districts involved in the discussions.

17
18 **WAC AMENDMENT FINAL APPROVAL - Action**
19 **WAC 332-10-041**

20 **Todd Welker, Deputy Supervisor for State Uplands**

21 Mr. Welker referred to previous briefings on the proposed WAC amendment. The basis of
22 the amendment is to adjust Board meeting dates when a holiday falls on the first Monday of
23 each month. In those circumstances, the Board's Tuesday meeting following the holiday
24 would be scheduled to Wednesday to accommodate members who travel to meetings.
25 Additionally, some provisions were revised by the Board's legal counsel to reflect updates for
26 remote participation by members using different electronic devices.

27
28 The proposed amendment was open for public comment to meet WAC amendment rules. The
29 public comment period closed on May 21, 2024. No comments were received. Staff is
30 requesting approval of the WAC Amendment. Following the filing of the amendment, the
31 provisions would become effective in 30 days.

32
33 Vice Chair Janicki asked about the provision in the WAC that enabled the Board to move its
34 May meeting because of the lack of a meeting quorum.

35
36 Tami Kellogg, Executive Assistant, explained that the WAC includes a provision for the
37 Board to convene a meeting to another day if a quorum would not be attained. Because of
38 sufficient time for the date change for the May meeting, staff was able to send a letter
39 notifying the Code Reviser's Office to publish the new date in the State Register.

- 40
41 **MOTION:** Dr. Brown moved to approve WAC Amendment 332-10-041 as presented.
42
43 **SECOND:** Mr. Cahill seconded the motion.
44
45 **ACTION:** The motion carried unanimously.
46

1 **LAND TRANSACTION – Action**

2 **River Road Direct Transfer; 02-098949, Resolution 1633**

1634

3 **Robin Hammill, Assistant Division Manager, Strategic Planning Office**

4 Ms. Hammill reported the property is located in Clallam County south of Sequim and
5 Highway 101 adjacent to the Dungeness River. The property is Common School Trust and is
6 zoned Commercial Forest. The property of approximately 404.01 acres is located outside of
7 the urban growth boundary of the City of Sequim. The property is encumbered by county
8 roads, BPA power line, and irrigation ditches. The site includes an old unauthorized dump.

9
10 The direct transfer will benefit a future Dungeness Off-Channel Reservoir and county park.
11 Initial funding for the transfer was included in the 2018 Capital Budget for property
12 acquisition and staff time. Funding to date exceeds \$15 million between six state grants and
13 Congressional funding to move the project forward. The site will include a future park
14 featuring hiking, biking, and water access.

15
16 The proposed transfer facilitates repositioning of an isolated trust asset to lands better suited
17 for long-term revenue production. Proceeds will be used to purchase replacement land for the
18 Common School Trust. The property was appraised at \$1,240,100 at \$3,069 per acre.

19
20 The delay of the proposal is attributed partly because of ramifications of the unauthorized
21 dump and grant funding from three state agencies. The costs of the appraisal and
22 administrative costs were funded by Clallam County through a grant.

corrected at 7/12/2024 meeting

23
24 MOTION: Mr. Cahill moved to approve Resolution ~~1633~~ 1634, River Road Direct Transfer 02-
25 098949.

26
27 SECOND: Dean Powers seconded the motion.

28
29 ACTION: The motion carried unanimously.

30 **RECESS**

31 Vice Chair Janicki recessed the meeting from 10:45 a.m. to 11:05 a.m. for a break.

32
33
34 *Commissioner Franz joined the meeting following the break.*

35
36 **TIMBER SALES - Action**

37 **Auction Results for May 2024, FY2024 Update, & Proposed Timber Sales for July 2024**
38 **Padraic Callahan, Acting Division Manager, Product Sales and Leasing Division**

39 Mr. Callahan presented the results of May timber sales. Four sales were offered totaling 11.8
40 mmbf for \$2.7 million for an average of \$231 per mbf with an average of 2.25 bidders per
41 sale.

42
43 Superintendent Reykdal reiterated his request to receive an analysis of the anticipated annual
44 sales and projected or offered dollar value versus the net amount. As volume has not been
45 achieved for a variety of reasons, revenue however has exceeded the budget forecast.

1 Mr. Callahan reviewed the update for FY2024. A public comment referred to 53 mmbf in the
2 fourth quarter. That amount has not been auctioned and is scheduled for auction later in the
3 month.

4
5 For FY 2025, the Department is forecasting 658 mmbf of timber with 595 mmbf from
6 Western Washington and 63 mmbf from Eastern Washington.

7
8 Mr. Callahan presented five sales for July 2024 of approximately 20.1 mmbf at an appraised
9 minimum value of \$6.7 million or \$335 per mbf.

10
11 Of the three-westside sales, field staff reviewed 503 proposed acres. Following delineation of
12 riparian, wetland management zones, and other sensitive areas, 343 acres remained for
13 proposed harvest representing 68% of the acreage with 160 acres assigned to conservation
14 status.

15
16 The Pistol Pete Sorts timber sale in Clallam County includes 10 variable retention harvest
17 units, one variable density-thinning unit, and 4 right-of-way units in the Cedar McDonald
18 watershed administrative unit. Staff evaluated 240 gross acres. Following the elimination of
19 conservation areas, the unit totaled 149 harvest acres. Notable protected features include
20 Forest Practices rule-identified landforms/potentially unstable slopes, riparian, wetland
21 management zones, and remnant old growth for protection.

22
23 Mr. Callahan reviewed the Stilly Revisited comprised of six variable retention harvest units.
24 Staff originally evaluated 200 gross acres and with conservation efforts for old growth
25 mitigation, riparian management zones, and leave tree areas, the harvest area is 152 acres.
26 Notable Protected features include Forest Practices rule-identified landforms, riparian
27 management zones, and remnant old growth for protection. Expert and tribal partner reviews
28 included a licensed engineering geologist evaluation, on-site evaluation by Timber, Fish, and
29 Wildlife Cooperators, Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife representatives,
30 Department of Ecology representatives, and representatives from the Stillaguamish and
31 Tulalip Tribes. All parties involved in the evaluation found no issues for moving the proposal
32 forward.

33
34 Mr. Callahan referred to public comments pertaining to the Oso landslide. Unit 6 of the
35 proposed harvest area is located on the backside of the ridge and drains away from any
36 neighboring communities. Although there are some active private Forest Practices
37 applications on the ridge, they do not involve DNR managed lands.

38
39 The Lickety Split Sorts timber sale is located in Wahkiakum County. Staff initially evaluated
40 63 acres with a final harvest area of 42 acres conserving 21 acres or 33% of the total harvest
41 area.

42
43 Notable protected features include streams, associated riparian management zones, and some
44 potential unstable slopes within the riparian areas. The unit was thinned in the past.

45
46 Mr. Callahan reviewed a pie chart depicting the revenue by trust generated by the timber

1 sales.

2
3 Mr. Callahan invited questions about the proposed sales.

4
5 Superintendent Reykdal requested information on any issues associated with the
6 Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) review and recent comments pertaining to the Stilly
7 Revisited timber sale. Mr. Callahan qualified his response based not being a licensed
8 engineering geologist indicating that feedback from the geologist reported the conditions of
9 Oso were different than the conditions on the Stilly Revisited timber site. A portion of the
10 harvest area is located on a relic bedrock landslide, which is very different than a glacial deep-
11 seated landslide in terms of slope stability concerns. The entire sales area was likely burned
12 in the mid 1800s and the extensive evaluation for the presence of old growth meeting policy
13 led to the identification of the 25.4-acre old growth polygon. The remainder of the stand
14 originated after the burn disturbance event with some scattered individual remnant trees
15 targeted for leave tree retention.

16
17 Mr. Callahan explained that some areas were identified and excluded from the harvest area of
18 all the timber sales. Geologists spent much time on the sites walking and examining all the
19 locations that should be reviewed based on locations identified through modeling and other
20 information. Through the extensive field trip visits, the geologists were able to identify slopes
21 that displayed signs of potential instability or verified physical characteristics as an identified
22 landform for exclusion from the proposed harvest area. One feature retained in the harvest
23 area was determined not to be an identified landform.

24
25 *Dr. Brown disconnected from the meeting at approximately 11:30 a.m.*

26
27 Superintendent Reykdal commented that the goal of older forests is over a long timeframe to
28 achieve the 10% to 15% older growth target. He asked how the Department evaluates forests
29 qualified to meet the target today are identified for harvesting versus depending on the aging
30 of trees over the next forty years to qualify as older trees to meet the target. Mr. Callahan
31 responded that it speaks to implementing the 10% to 15% goal in the HCP. Through
32 implementation of the HCP, staff has identified conservation areas on the landscape. Those
33 areas are significant. When the Board adopted the long-term murrelet strategy, the decision
34 identified where those conservation areas would be located on the landscape over the long-
35 term in conjunction with the northern spotted owl areas and other sensitive areas. Through
36 the agreement with the federal government approving the strategy, conservation areas were
37 identified on the landscape for the long-term to provide the most benefit for the species. All
38 areas outside of those areas should be available for harvest as long as the area meets all
39 policies and procedures. Staff considers the overall guidance to identify conservation areas
40 and then identifies places not in conservation status to determine whether a viable activity is
41 possible. Through the evaluation of the harvest area footprint, staff identifies additional
42 conservation areas.

43
44 Commissioner Franz noted that at the May meeting, staff presented information on the
45 modeling of the 10% to 15%. Other considerations are forest health and the risks they could
46 pose to include those areas if unhealthy. The presentation covered how the older growth

1 allocation (10%-15%) was identified throughout the landscape. The approach is considered
2 conservative. There was also agreement for staff to schedule a full presentation to the Board
3 to answer questions similar to Superintendent Reykdal's questions.
4

5 Duane Emmons, Assistant Deputy Supervisor, State Uplands, said the objective is not just to
6 retain 10% to 15% of older forests on the landscape. The intent of the HCP and the Policy for
7 Sustainable Forests is to produce and protect habitat for those species covered in the HCP by
8 protecting and developing habitat to achieve 10% to 15% across the entire land base over
9 time. The idea isn't to have habitat where it is not benefitting any species but rather to
10 develop habitat where it will be the most beneficial to the species, which is why the Board
11 agreed to set aside large contiguous blocks of habitat in Wahkiakum, Clallam, and Whatcom
12 counties to protect larger areas to develop habitat. Throughout the life of the HCP, 10% to
13 15% of older forests would actually entail 400,000 acres of older forests and old growth in
14 both upland and riparian areas throughout Western Washington.
15

16 Vice Chair Janicki asked how staff evaluates the overall health of the system by removing
17 some of the old hemlocks. Mr. Emmons explained that in areas of various types of forest
18 health issues such as hemlocks with dwarf mistletoe or areas of rot, retaining the stand would
19 not likely result in developing a healthy stand that would remain healthy over the long term.
20 Those types of stands would continue to weaken, leading to increased fire risk as evidenced
21 by an historic burn in the 1800s. Addressing some of the forest health issues aids in
22 protecting the watershed. The area is not needed to meet the 10% to 15% objective as it is in
23 an area experiencing forest health issues that would benefit from harvesting and reforestation
24 with a mix of species to generate financial benefit and improve habitat over the long-term.
25

26 MOTION: Dean Powers moved to approve the proposed July timber sales.
27

28 MOTION: Commissioner Franz seconded the motion.
29

30 MOTION: Superintendent Reykdal moved to exclude the Stilly Revisited timber sale from
31 the proposed timber sales. *The motion died due to the lack of a second.*
32

33 Superintendent Reykdal noted that he supports the sales package except for the Stilly
34 Revisited timber sale.
35

36 ACTION: Motion carried (4/1). Superintendent Reykdal voted against.
37

38 Vice Chair Janicki thanked the City of Omak for providing the meeting space.
39

40 Commissioner Franz commented on the partnership with the City of Omak and the Omak
41 Airport and the ability for DNR to invest mutually in wildfire resources that is needed within
42 the community.
43

44 ADJOURNMENT

45 Vice Chair Janicki adjourned the meeting at 11:38 a.m.
46

Approved this 2nd day of July, 2024

Approved via Webinar
Hilary S. Franz, Washington State Commissioner of Public Lands

Jim Cahill
Jim Cahill, Designee for Governor Jay Inslee

Chris Reykdal
Chris Reykdal, Superintendent of Public Instruction

Lisa Janicki
Lisa Janicki, Commissioner, Skagit County

Absent
Dr. Wendy Powers, Dean, College of Agricultural, Human, and Natural Resource Sciences,
Washington State University

Clare Ryan
Clare Ryan, Interim Director, School of Environmental and Forest Sciences,
University of Washington

Attest:

Tami Kellogg
Tami Kellogg, Board Coordinator