



September 23-27, 2019

Moscow, Russia



The XXIII INCOSAI Outcomes Report

Table of contents

INCOSAI Statistics	4
INCOSAI Program (list of events)	5
Voting	7
Social Program	9
INCOSAI Highlights	10
Goal Committee Meetings	10
Professional Standards Committee (PSC)	10
Capacity Building Committee (CBC)	10
Knowledge Sharing Committee (KSC)	11
INTOSAI Governing Board Meetings	12
72nd Governing Board Meeting	12
73rd Governing Board Meeting	13
Inauguration Ceremony	14
General Plenary Sessions	14
Theme Plenary Sessions	16
Theme I «Information Technology for the Development of Public Administration»	16
Theme II «The Role of the Supreme Audit Institutions in the Achievement of National Priorities and Goals»	18
Plenary Session on the Discussion and Approval of the Moscow Declaration	19

INCOSAI Side Events	22
Discussion Formats	22
Discussion Panels with Participation of External Experts	22
Open Discussions on INTOSAI Issues	24
Other Side Events	27
Auditing the Implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals	27
Supreme Audit Institution Role concerning the Fight against Corruption	27
Gender Equality Discussion	27
SAIs with Jurisdictional Functions	28
Moscow Declaration	29

INCOSAI Statistics

- Representatives from 169 countries, or 87% of the INTOSAI full members attended the XXIII INCOSAI. 127 delegations were lead by heads of Supreme Audit Institutions (SAIs).
- 665 foreign guests participated.
- 104 special guests and external experts as well as the heads of 18 control and accounting bodies of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation attended the events.
- The total number of participants was 787.
- There were 21 events with the social program covering 4 days within the framework of the Congress.
- Simultaneous translation was provided into the five official INTOSAI languages (English, French, German, Spanish, and Arabic), as well as into five additional languages (Russian, Chinese, Japanese, Portuguese, and Vietnamese). Services of 23 interpreters and 4 translators were provided at all the main events of the Congress.
- The Congress culminated in the adoption of the Moscow Declaration supported by 98.9% of the heads of national delegations participating in the INCOSAI.

INCOSAI Program (list of events)

September 23, Monday

Professional Standards Committee Meeting

Capacity Building Committee Meeting

Knowledge Sharing Committee Meeting

72nd Meeting of the Governing Board

September 24, Tuesday

72nd Meeting of the Governing Board

Open Discussions on INTOSAI issues

September 25, Wednesday

Discussion Panel with participation of external experts

PANEL 1: Macro audit: strategic challenges to the global economy and international development

Discussion Panel with participation of external experts

PANEL 2 : Sustainable development in the age of Great Disruption: what solutions can technology and public management tools provide the governments with

Inauguration Ceremony

- Address by Mr. V. Putin, the President of the Russian Federation
- Address on behalf of the Chairman of the Federation Council of the Russian Federation by Mr. S. Ryabukhin, Chairman of the Committee on Budget and Financial Markets
- Address by Mr. A. Zhukov, the First Deputy Chairman of the State Duma of the Russian Federation
- Address by Mr. S. Sobyenin, the Mayor of Moscow
- Address by Ms. M. Kraker, INTOSAI Secretary General, President of the Austrian Court of Audit
- Address by Dr. H. Al-Amimi, Chairman of the UAE SAI, outgoing Chair of INTOSAI
- Hand-over of duties of INTOSAI Chair
- Address by the new Chair of INTOSAI Mr. A. Kudrin, Chairman of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation

Opening session:

- Welcome address of the new Chair of INTOSAI (Russia)
- Approval of Rules of Procedure and Agenda.
- Elections of the Congress Vice-Chair (Kazakhstan)

First General Plenary Session

1. Report of the Chair of INTOSAI (Russia)
2. Report of the Standing Supervisory Committee on Emerging Issues (UAE)
3. Report of the INTOSAI Secretary General (Austria)
4. Report of the Chair of the Policy, Finance and Administration Committee. INTOSAI-Donor Cooperation (Saudi Arabia)
5. Reports of regional organizations:
 - 5a AFROSAI (Cameroon)
 - 5b ARABOSAI (Tunisia)
 - 5c ASOSAI (China)
 - 5d CAROSAI (Jamaica)
 - 5e EUROSAI (Spain)
 - 5f OLACEFS (Chile)
 - 5g PASAI (New Zealand)
6. Report of the Chair of the Professional Standards Committee (Brazil)
7. Report of the Chair of the Capacity Building Committee (South Africa)
8. Report of the Chair of the Knowledge Sharing Committee (India)
9. INTOSAI/SAI and SDGs (General Secretariat)
10. INTOSAI Auditors' Report (Ghana and Lithuania)

September 26, Thursday

Theme Plenary Sessions

Theme I «Information technologies for the development of public administration» (China, Canada)

Theme II «The role of the Supreme Audit Institutions in the achievement of national priorities and goals» (Russia, Italy)

September 27, Friday

Closing Theme Plenary Session

Plenary Session on the discussion and approval of the Moscow Declaration

Second General Plenary Session

1. INTOSAI Development Initiative Report (Norway)
2. Report of the International Journal of Government Auditing (USA)
3. Election of the Governing Board members (General Secretariat)
4. Election of Auditors (General Secretariat)
5. INCOSAI XXIV (Russia, Brazil)
6. INTOSAI stakeholders
 - 6a UN
 - 6b World Bank
 - 6c Institute of Internal Auditors (North America)
7. Farewell to the outgoing Chair of INTOSAI (General Secretariat)
8. Farewell to the outgoing members of the Governing Board (General Secretariat)

73rd Governing Board meeting (Russia, General Secretariat)

Other events:

1. Auditing the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (GS INTOSAI, working languages are all official INTOSAI languages)
2. Supreme Audit Institution Role concerning the Fight against Corruption (UAE, working language is English)
3. Gender Equality Discussion (INTOSAI Development Initiative, working language is English)

Voting

The XXIII INCOSAI was equipped with an electronic voting system. Special software had been developed for this purpose. The head of each delegation received a tablet with a pre-installed computer program, which made the voting process quick, clear, and open. Participants in the event could watch the voting process. All information was displayed on the screens in the hall in real-time.

As a result, now we have accurate voting statistics.

Nº	Motions	Answer options (%)	
		Yes	No
First General Plenary Session			
1.1	Endorses the Rules of Procedure and the Agenda of the XXIII INCOSAI	100	0
1.2	Elects the SAI of Kazakhstan as Vice-Chair of the XXIII INCOSAI	96	4
1.3	Takes note of the Report of the INTOSAI Chairman	96.6	3.4
1.4	Takes note of the Report of the SCEI	97.8	2.2
1.5	Takes note of the Report of the Secretary General	93.5	6.5
1.6	Takes note of the Report of the Policy, Finance and Administration Committee and on the Activities within the INTOSAI Donor Cooperation	97.7	2.3
1.7	Takes note of the Reports of the seven INTOSAI Regional Organizations	98.4	1.6
1.8	Takes note of the Report of the PSC	100	0
1.9	Takes note of the Report of the CBC	98.4	1.6
1.10	Takes note of the Report of the KSC	100	0
1.11	Takes note of the Report of the Secretary General on INTOSAI/SAI and SDGs	100	0
1.12	Takes note of the Report of the INTOSAI Auditors	100	0

Moscow Declaration Session			
	Endorses the Moscow Declaration	98.9	1.1
Second General Plenary Session			
2.1	Takes note of the Report of the INTOSAI Development Initiative (IDI)	98.2	1.8
2.2	Takes note of the Report of the INTOSAI International Journal of Government Auditing	99	1
2.3	Endorses the following SAIs as members of the Governing Board of INTOSAI	98.2	1.8
2.4	Elects SAIs of Jamaica and Lithuania as external auditors of INTOSAI for the audit period 2020-2022	98.2	1.8
2.5	Endorses the SAI of Brazil as host of INCOSAI XXIV in 2022	100	0

Social Program

- On September 25, 2019, a guided tour to the Kolomenskoye Museum Reserve was organized for the accompanying persons of members of national delegations.
- On September 26, 2019, after the official program, members of the INTOSAI Governing Board and the leadership of the Regional Organizations EUROSAI and ASOSAI, where Russia is a member, were given a guided tour to the Grand Kremlin Palace.
- On September 26, 2019, in the evening, all XXIII INCOSAI participants went to the Bolshoi Theater to see the Swan Lake ballet.
- On September 27, 2019, an official reception was held at the State Kremlin Palace in honor of the INCOSAI participants. Aleksei Arkhipovsky, a balalaika virtuoso, and the Moscow State Academic Dance Theater «Gzhel» performed before the audience.
- On September 28, 2019, a sightseeing tour of the Moscow Kremlin was organized for those interested.

INCOSAI Highlights

Committees' Meetings

The purpose of the meeting of INTOSAI PSC, CBC, KSC before the Congress is the opportunity for all members of the committees to participate and summarize the outcomes of the previous three-year period.

Professional Standards Committee (PSC)

New Structure of the INTOSAI Framework of Professional Pronouncements was introduced:

- INTOSAI-P (core documents),
- ISSAI (basic principles for conducting all types of public audit),
- GUID (guides for conducting various types of audits),
- COMP (competency standards).

It was noted that 26 INTOSAI professional pronouncements were being revised. An updated version of the website issai.org was presented.

A new 2022 Strategic Development Plan of the INTOSAI Framework of Professional Pronouncements takes effect in 2020, outlining the main priorities in the development of INTOSAI documents.

Capacity Building Committee (CBC)

The Committee projects were reviewed at the meeting and further work plans were presented.

1. On cooperative audits (headed by the SAI of Peru). By 2020, it is planned: to develop a communications strategy; continue to exchange experience among experts at the regional level; translate all materials on joint audits (under the Committee) into the five official languages of INTOSAI. It is expected that practical guidelines on the methodology of joint audits will be developed annually.

2. On the IntoSAINT (headed by the SAI of Mexico). In 2019, there have been 19 new moderators from CAROSAI and 11 from PASAI working on the introduction of a self-assessment system. Currently, the project has more than 200 certified moderators from 70 countries. A self-assessment system has been implemented in the SAIs of Australia, New Zealand, Samoa, the Cayman Islands, Cook Islands, and Jamaica. From October to December, a self-assessment of integrity is being conducted in the SAI of Suriname and a training for moderators in the SAI of Senegal.

3. On Peer Reviews (headed by the SAI of Slovakia). By 2022, the Peer Review Guidelines will have been updated (ISSAI 5600).

4. On Auditing in Complex and Challenging Contexts (headed by the SAI of Sweden). In 2020–2022, the information on best practices will be made more accessible, expand cooperation formats for the exchange of experience between SAIs working in complex and challenging contexts, and promote donor participation.

5. On the Development of Guides and Occasional Papers (headed by the SAI of Kenya). In 2018–2019, the guide on «Strengthening the Role of SAIs» was developed (the document is available in Arabic, French, and Spanish). The following articles were published: «Sustainable organizational change is good practice in partnership» and «Management in SAIs - based on the experience of the SAI of the UK». After 2020, the manual on «Human Resource Management in SAIs» is being updated.

6. On Auditor Professionalization (headed by the SAI of South Africa). The guide «Ways for professional development» was prepared. The plans include the development of an auditor competence roadmap.

Knowledge Sharing Committee (KSC)

The Committee Chair, Mr. Rajiv Mehrishi (the SAI of India), made a report on the Committee outcomes for three years (2017–2019). The Committee includes 12 working groups. The range of areas considered by each group varies from auditing public debt, environment and digitalization to financial modernization, anti-corruption and government policies and programs evaluation. The Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation leads two working groups, i.e. the Working Group on Public Procurement and the Working Group on Key National Indicators.

The working groups mainly deal with exchange of best practices and development of appropriate methodological documents (standards and guidelines) aimed at improving audits.

The result of the activities of the Working Group on Key National Indicators was the development and approval of guidelines for auditing the development and use of key national indicators. Also, in 2019 trends towards a broader mandate of SAIs, in particular for conducting comprehensive analyses of national projects and auditing the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals, resulted in the group's mandate being expanded and the group being renamed into the Working Group on the SDGs and key sustainable development indicators.

The Working Group on Public Procurement Audit is developing guidelines on public procurement audit.

The establishment of a new working group to study the impact of science and technology on the audit process was endorsed. It is assumed that the group will study issues such as artificial intelligence, blockchain technology, cybersecurity, analytical data, machine learning,

5G technologies, as well as facilitate their active introduction into the daily activities of SAIs during the audit.

A report has been presented on the launch of the INTOSAI Internet portal, with both detailed information on the activities of each working group and an option for rapid exchange of views between all interested parties. In addition, the new portal will allow for real-time collaborative creation and revision of documents, thus significantly improving their quality and reduce the time needed for approval.

Speaking about further development plans for 2020–2022, Mr. Mehrishi mentioned a new product line in development; revision of existing standards and guidelines that had lost their relevance; strengthened collaboration with regional organizations, major committees, the INTOSAI General Secretariat, and the academic community; the launch of research projects; further exchange of experience and best practices. In addition, performance indicators are going to be introduced to assess the achievement of goals of the committee.

INTOSAI Governing Board Meetings

72nd Governing Board Meeting



The 72nd Governing Board Meeting was held shortly before XXIII INCOSAI, on September 23–24, 2019, presided by the SAI of the UAE, the Chair of INTOSAI.

- The General Secretariat of INTOSAI, the SAIs of the UAE, Russia, Brazil, South Africa, Saudi Arabia, USA, Norway, India, Tunisia, Cameroon, China, New Zealand, Jamaica, Spain, and Chile made their reports. A discussion session was held on the application of ISSAI.
- The Russian side reported on the preparation to XXIII INCOSAI as well as on the Memorandum of Understanding between INTOSAI and the OECD.
- Members of the Governing Board approved the proposal to submit for the consideration of the INCOSAI the issue of electing the SAI of Lithuania and Jamaica as external auditors for 2019–2021. The SAI of Brazil was elected as the host of the XXIV INCOSAI in 2022.
- A farewell ceremony to the outgoing members of the Governing Board (the SAIs of Pakistan, Gabon, and Egypt) was held.

73rd Governing Board Meeting



The Meeting was held on September 27, 2019, by the new INTOSAI Chair, Chairman of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation, with the participation of new members of the Governing Board, i.e. the SAIs of Algeria, Namibia, and Thailand.

- Reports were made by representatives of the SAI of Brazil and by the General Secretariat. The SAI of Russia reported on the prospects of its chairmanship in INTOSAI in a period of 2019–2022.

Inauguration Ceremony



- On September 25, 2019, the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation became the Chair of the International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions. Over the next three years, it will shape the agenda of the international audit community.
- President of Russia Mr. Vladimir Putin, Mayor of Moscow Mr. Sergey Sobyenin, representatives of the Russian Federal Assembly Chambers Mr. Sergey Ryabukhin and Mr. Alexander Zhukov, INTOSAI Secretary General and President of the Austrian Court of Audit Ms. Margit Kraker, and President of the State Audit Office of the UAE Dr. Harib Said Al Amimi, congratulated the Accounts Chamber on its chairmanship.
- ‘We see the foundation for our development in a constant dialogue aimed at sharing experiences and best practices. Russia is counting on active cooperation with all the member countries of the organization,’ Chairman of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation Mr. Aleksei Kudrin said.

General Plenary Sessions

Two General Plenary Sessions were held at the XXIII INCOSAI (September 25 and 27, 2019). The agenda of the sessions traditionally includes reports of:

- INTOSAI Chair;
- Secretary General;
- Goal Committees Chairs;
- Representatives of regional organizations;
- INTOSAI auditors;

- Representative of the INTOSAI Development Initiative (IDI);
- Representative of the International Journal of Government Auditing;
- Representative of the UN;
- Representative of the World Bank;
- Representative of the Institute of Internal Auditors.

Key resolutions of the Plenary Sessions:

- The amendments to the INTOSAI Statutes were endorsed;
- The INTOSAI triennial budget for 2020–2022 and indexation of membership dues at 7.67% were adopted;
- The INTOSAI Strategic Development Plan for 2020–2022 was adopted;
- The standards INTOSAI-P 10 (Mexico Declaration on SAI Independence) and INTOSAI-P 50 (Principles of Jurisdictional Activities of SAIs) were approved;
- A Guide to the audit of information systems (GUID 5100) and a guide to the audit of the development and use of key national indicators (GUID 5290) were approved;
- New members of the Governing Board were elected:
 - The SAI of Brazil as the First Vice-Chair of the Governing Board for 2020–2022, host of the Congress in 2022 and member of the Governing Board until 2031,
 - The SAI of Saudi Arabia as the Chair of the Policy, Finance and Administration Committee and Second Vice-Chair of the Governing Board,
 - The SAI of the USA as Head of the INTOSAI International Journal of Government Auditing until 2025,
 - The SAI of Norway as Head of the INTOSAI Development Initiative until 2025,
 - The SAI of Algeria as representative of AFROSAI until 2025,

- The SAI of Namibia as representative of AFROSAI until 2025,
- The SAI of Japan as representative of ASOSAI until 2025,
- The SAI of Thailand as representative of ASOSAI until 2025,
- The SAI of Poland as representative of EUROSAI until 2025,
- The SAI of Portugal as representative of EUROSAI until 2025.
- The SAI of Jamaica and Lithuania were elected as INTOSAI external auditors.

Theme Plenary Sessions

Theme I «Information Technologies for the Development of Public Administration»

The Plenary session on Theme I was held on September 26, 2019. It was moderated by the Chairman of the SAI of Kuwait.

The history of the development of the Discussion Paper on Theme I was presented, starting with a questionnaire considering such subjects as data for better public administration, aspects of big data audit, the role of big data analysis in fulfilling government obligations, difficulties of using information technologies in public administration. During the presentation, a vote was held on the question «Do you agree that more efficient use of information technology will improve public administration capabilities?». More than 90% of the audience agreed with this statement.

For example, in Mexico, information technologies are actively used in the analysis of the budget and other financial information. Replying to the question «Do you think that big data is a basic strategic resource in public administration?» 96% of respondents said yes.

Regarding the use of information technology, the key problem associated with the lack of data exchange with other state authorities was identified. Therefore, now they are working towards the transition to e-government, a single source of data. The question «To what extent are information technologies used in your SAIs?» was voted on, and 52% responded that IT is applied in almost every department. In 29% of cases, IT is applied only to accounting and administrative work. 19% responded they work on the basis of e-government technologies.

During the session, the Comptroller General of the United States underscored three key aspects:

1. The world of information technologies enhances government transparency and accountability;
2. The information technologies in the efficiency and effectiveness of public administration IT systems affect the welfare of citizens;
3. The impact of IT systems on audit quality.



In the UAE, there is a centralized database and special techniques are used to minimize manual work. The risks of using IT systems in the work of SAIs were also discussed.

The representative of the SAI of Indonesia addressed the development of public administration through the use of IT systems and told about the national policy for the establishment of an e-government. The audience was asked «What is the best practice for the government to adopt to ensure data quality?». During the discussion, the speakers arrived at the conclusion that governments usually requested data through ministries and then passed them on to statistical offices. But such bureaus do not have the ability to verify the accuracy of the data obtained, so it is important to create a special unit for this purpose.

A representative of the World Bank told about an initiative called GovTech used to increase the efficiency of public administration. This system is designed to coordinate the openness of financial transactions; ensuring the security of information systems during electronic payments.

Theme II «The Role of the Supreme Audit Institutions in the Achievement of National Priorities and Goals»

Regarding the Discussion paper on Theme II the question of how at the national level each SAI can maintain its relevance, respond to the needs of stakeholders, and contribute to the achievement of national priorities and goals, helping to increase the effectiveness, accountability, and transparency of public administration was raised.

The Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation was the Chair of the Theme II and the main speaker. Reports on this issue were also presented by:

- The SAI of the USA: «The Role of Supreme Audit Institutions (SAIs) in Achieving National Priorities and Goals»;
- The SAI of South Africa: «Remaining Relevant, Responding to the Needs of Stakeholders, Adding Value in the Achievement of National Priorities and Goals»;
- The SAI of Finland: «Experimental Mindset and Advanced Auditors' Skills»;
- INTOSAI Development Initiative (IDI): «SDGs and Inclusiveness»;
- The SAI of Costa Rica - «Communications».

The discussion was summed up by the Vice-Chair of Theme II, the SAI of Italy.

The SAIs of France and Hungary also commented on the issue.



In addition to the major points addressed during the discussion, participants were asked to answer a number of questions through electronic voting.

- «What are the most significant risks and obstacles associated with advisory services provided by SAIs?» The most common answer was «Loss of independence due to conflict of interest.»
- «The main challenges that SAIs face in monitoring the implementation of national goals and the SDGs» The most common answer was «Data quality and access issues.»
- «Which competencies are most important for tomorrow’s auditors?» The most common answer was «Strategic thinking and forecasting.»
- When it came to stakeholder engagement, the most common answers were legislative / judicial authorities and citizens.

During the session, participants had the opportunity to ask their questions using an electronic device. Issues related to the audit of national goals and the SDGs, as well as maintaining the independence of the SAI in its new role as a strategic partner of the state were addressed.

Plenary Session on the Discussion and Approval of the Moscow Declaration

The Plenary Sessions on Theme I and Theme II of the Congress resulted in a session on the discussion and approval of the Moscow Declaration comprising the principles formulated in the discussion papers.



It provides 10 directions for SAI development with a view to increase the potential and its relevance for citizens.

Among these areas, the following can be underscored:

- SAI's contribution to the system of accountability for the outcomes of national development and the implementation of sustainable development goals,
- Using a strategic approach in public audit,
- Providing more recommendations based on SAI audit findings,
- Data openness,
- Data analytics development,
- Encouraging a culture of experimental thinking,
- Systemic risk management in public administration,
- Building the competencies of auditors and inspectors,
- Promoting the principle of inclusiveness,
- Constructive engagement with stakeholders,
- Improving cooperation and communication with the academic community and society as a whole.



The discussion of the elaborations of the Moscow Declaration attracted great interest of the participants in the Congress. 45 delegations took the floor in order to support the document, including representatives from the SAIs of Afghanistan, Angola, Argentina, Bahamas, Bolivia, Brazil, Cameroon, China, Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, El Salvador, Finland, Honduras, India, Italy, Jordan, Kazakhstan, Kenya, Morocco, Nepal, Nigeria, Oman, Palestine, Portugal, Saudi Arabia, Senegal, Serbia, Somalia, South Africa, South Korea, Sudan, the UAE, the UK, the USA, Tunisia, Uganda, Yemen, and others.

The Moscow Declaration was supported by 98.9% of the heads of national delegations who took part in the voting after the discussions.

INCOSAI Side Events

Discussion Formats

XXIII INCOSAI focused on the development of discussion formats. The traditional Congress program was complemented by three new events:

- Discussion panels with participation of external experts;
- Open discussions on INTOSAI issues;
- Theme Plenary Sessions with interactive voting.

Discussion Panels with Participation of External Experts

PANEL 1. «Macroaudit: strategic challenges to the global economy and international development»

Experts:

Aleksei Kudrin, Chairman of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation;

Ksenia Yudaeva, First Deputy Chairman of the Central Bank of the Russian Federation;

Kenneth Rogoff, Professor of Economics, Harvard University;

Vinay Patrick Saldana, Regional Director of the Joint United Nations Program on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS) in Eastern Europe and Central Asia.

Key points

- The term «macroaudit» was proposed by the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation in order to take a broader look at global problems, global economy, global challenges, conduct an express audit of the main trends and risks in cooperation with experts (Aleksei Kudrin);
- The global economy is undergoing major changes, over the next 5-10 years, the growth rate will remain at a fairly low level throughout the world (Aleksei Kudrin);
- What is happening now is part of a cycle that is not over yet, and now every country needs structural reforms (Kenneth Rogoff);
- A key challenge in the modern world is income inequality. Also, the list of challenges includes education and the fourth industrial revolution. We

need an assessment of the effectiveness of efforts, primarily those of the state, which must be constantly carried out (Aleksei Kudrin);

- Time is another factor to consider. Here, high technology will help us, for example in financial audit (Ksenia Yudaeva);
- Plans of the Accounts Chamber for the INTOSAI Chairmanship include strengthening the role of analytics, data analysis, evidence-based audit methods for data analysis and comparison, outcomes and the role of the recommendations of auditors to their governments (Aleksei Kudrin).

PANEL 2. «Sustainable development in the age of Great Disruption: what solutions can technology and public management tools provide the governments with»

Experts:

Herman Gref, CEO, Chairman of the Executive Board of Sberbank;

Sergey Sobyenin, Mayor of Moscow;

Philippe Roger, Vice-President of Microsoft (Central and Eastern Europe);

Augusto Lopez-Claros, Director of the Department of Global Indicators and Analysis of the World Bank (2011–2017), former Chief Economist at the World Economic Forum, Chairman of the Global Governance Forum.

Participants tried to answer questions about what the Disrupt era is and how to ensure effective operations when existing standards are fading into the background and new ones have not yet been developed.

Key points

- Political courage and breaking stereotypes is one of the main principles of governance in the age of Great Disruption. The winner in the competitive world struggle is the one who makes decisions faster, adapts to the modern world, and introduces modern technologies (Sergey Sobyenin);
- With all four industrial revolutions, the government remains the same; there is too much routine and regulation. We are on the verge of the first revolution in government administration. It is necessary to introduce innovations;

- «Run – Agile – Disrupt (in equal proportions)» is the slogan of the first revolution in public administration (Herman Gref);
- The world has changed over the past 75 years, but management principles have not. We must be proactive. It is necessary to prevent crises and not to respond to them (Augusto Lopez-Carlos);
- Another major principle of the new era is the development of information technologies. It is necessary to develop digital literacy, the ethics of using information technologies. Our task is to show that technology is for the benefit of people (Philippe Roger).

Open Discussions on INTOSAI Issues

The discussions were hosted by the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation. The discussions were held in English in the format of strategic sessions. The participants were divided into small groups for discussing given topics and identifying development highlights in the indicated areas. The sessions were attended by over 200 people from 50 countries. The following questions were selected for discussion.

1. How can we make INTOSAI more visible and influential?
2. Digital challenges and opportunities: how to integrate breakthrough technologies into the everyday work of SAIs?
3. How should SAIs transform their everyday work to increase their relevance in a changing world?
4. What is the role of SAIs in guarding and raising the level of trust?

Based on the discussion of each topic, the short summaries were compiled. Based on the analysis and those summaries, a final document was prepared; the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation intends to use its key aspects in the concept of its INTOSAI chairmanship during the next three years.

Outcomes of Open discussions on INTOSAI issues

When discussing the issue of increasing the efficiency of INTOSAI, the participants arrived at the conclusion that the supreme audit institutions need to protect and strengthen their independence, increase the relevance of INTOSAI beyond the competence of the institutions involved in it, improve the communication system, be result-oriented, and involve stakeholders in the interaction.



Responding to the digital challenges facing the audit community, the participants focused on such aspects as improving professional skills, creating digital technologies structure and tools and seeking funding, improving data quality. However, the participants underscored the fact that the audit work cannot be fully replaced by digital technologies or IT specialists. Proper balance of the skills of practicing auditors with audit digitalization is needed.

When asked questions on improving the daily work of supreme audit institutions, participants focused on financial independence, openness, and transparency of their bodies, attitude towards employees, the need to keep up with the times, get involved in the digital transformation process, and support personal growth.

The outcome of the discussion on building citizens' trust in supreme audit institutions and state authorities was the need to strengthen confidence in the entire system of public authorities. At the same time, each individual body should improve public confidence on its own. They highlighted the importance of «opening the doors» of their SAIs to citizens, publishing reports based on carefully selected information, using various communication channels (media, parliament, etc.), as well as showing problems, solutions and outcomes of the work done.



Other Side Events

Auditing the Implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals

The meeting was held on September 27, 2019 and was attended by about 90 people. The INTOSAI General Secretariat moderated the event.

The key speakers at the event were from the SAIs of Russia, Austria, South Africa, Costa Rica, and the INTOSAI Development Initiative.

Supreme Audit Institution Role concerning the Fight against Corruption

The event was held on September 27, 2019, and was hosted by the SAI of the United Arab Emirates. The total number of participants was 60. The main speakers were the chairpersons of the SAIs of the United Arab Emirates, China, Peru, Egypt, Russia, a representative of the UN Office on Drugs and Crime. The working language of the event was English.

During the meeting, the speakers shared their experience in applying corruption prevention measures. A discussion was held on the assessment of audit reports, how much they can be used by anti-corruption authorities. Particular attention was paid to best practices, the applicability of potential international and state standards, and risk assessment (for example, the technological impact on the corruption landscape of procurement). Several collaborative training initiatives have been introduced.

At the end of the meeting, the parties agreed to participate in a meeting of the Conference of the States Parties to the UN Convention against Corruption on December 14-15, 2019, created with a view to develop a mechanism for interaction and cooperation between anti-corruption authorities and SAIs to maximize the benefits that can be obtained from such cooperation.

Gender Equality Discussion

The discussion was held on September 27, 2019, under the leadership of the INTOSAI Development Initiative, with the roundtable participation of the SAIs of the Philippines, South Africa and the OLACEFS (Organization of Latin American and Caribbean SAIs).

About 40 people participated in the event. The meeting involved an exchange of views on the most important aspects of gender equality.

It was noted that gender equality as one of the most important human rights plays a key role in the full realization of human potential through sustainable development. The involvement of women in society, including in the audit area, contributes to economic growth, openness, and transparency of supreme audit institutions.

The hosts shared their experience in ensuring gender equality in the activities of their SAIs and in organizing audits. At the end of the meeting, the parties came to the following conclusions:

- It is essential to develop a behavioral and role model of a SAI with a working mechanism of gender equality and a system for compliance monitoring;
- An additional number of jobs should be created for women in SAIs;
- The idea was put forward to incorporate gender equality in the new strategic plan of INTOSAI;
- It was proposed to create a community of women auditors of INTOSAI to conduct audits for compliance with the principles of gender equality.

SAIs with Jurisdictional Functions

A roundtable meeting was held on 26 September 2019. The meeting was attended by some 50 delegates participating in the XXIII INCOSAI.

During the meeting the participants adopted a report on the work plan of the Forum of SAIs with Jurisdictional Functions for the past period and discussed INTOSAI-P 50 (Principles of Jurisdictional Activities of SAIs). Furthermore, they raised the issue of increasing the scope of their activities and adopted the work plan of the Forum for the upcoming year.

Moscow Declaration

Introduction

In line with the INTOSAI mission of continuous progress of government auditing and capacity development of Supreme Audit Institutions (SAIs), the XXIII INCOSAI develops the previous INCOSAI discussions and aims at ensuring the continued relevance of SAIs as institutions of great value to society.

XXIII INCOSAI was devoted to the discussion of how each SAI on a national level could relate to the public sector auditing developments and technological advancements to remain relevant, respond to the needs of stakeholders and add value by providing independent external oversight on the achievement of nationally agreed goals including those linked to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

The Declaration highlights the main conclusions of XXIII INCOSAI and the key areas where progress can be made in INTOSAI.

To ensure value and benefits, SAIs and INTOSAI need to be able to apply new approaches and take advantage of opportunities to meet emerging challenges. SAIs need to respond to a changing world of governance and, in doing so, respond to emerging national and global challenges.

The fundamental changes in public auditing and public policy worldwide have created a new environment and new expectations for SAIs. These recent changes in the environment for SAIs include: (a) adoption of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (2030 Agenda) and the SDGs by all member countries of the United Nations; (b) the data revolution; (c) the adoption of the INTOSAI Framework of Professional Pronouncements (IFPP), and (d) expectations and obligations arising from ISSAI-P 12: *Value and Benefits of SAIs - making a difference to the life of citizens*. Modern circumstances call for a quality of audit work, new audit approaches and require SAIs to further rethink their role in the governmental accountability processes.

While SAIs differ in terms of their capacities, contexts, and mandates, they all face similar challenges. How to respond to the public demand for the effective and efficient management of public resources? How to cope with the complexity of government needed to achieve national goals, objectives of programs, policies and strategies? How can SAIs and INTOSAI handle changes brought on by data revolution and digitalization?

The constantly accelerating accumulation of data and rapidly changing developments in technology and communication serve both as challenges and opportunities to improve the quality of public audit, develop its efficiency, foster its strategic direction, and thus increase the value of SAIs to their stakeholders and enhancing trust in public institutions worldwide.

There is no common recipe to follow for SAIs to be agile, effective, relevant and independent institutions of great value. SAIs will continue pursuing financial, compliance, and performance audits consistent with their official mandates. SAIs conduct audit activities which are consistent with their official mandate and the expectations of SAI stakeholders. Nonetheless, the possible directions SAIs might focus on, consistent with their relevant contexts and mandates, can be supported by INTOSAI.

INTOSAI has well-established working bodies and initiatives that enable INTOSAI to address emerging challenges and opportunities. These work streams will constitute an integral part of the INTOSAI tasks, priorities and plans in the future.

Members of the International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI), having met in Moscow from 25 to 27 September 2019,

- recognizing the 2030 Development Agenda adopted by the General Assembly of the United Nations on 25 September 2015, and the Resolution of the General Assembly of the United Nations A/RES/69/228 «Promoting and fostering the efficiency, accountability, effectiveness and transparency in public administration by strengthening Supreme Audit Institutions»,
- reaffirming the commitment to make a meaningful independent audit contribution to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development as set forth by the Abu Dhabi Declaration,
- acknowledging SAI independence as a fundamental precondition for an effective contribution to accountability, transparency, good governance, the sound use of public funds, and, ultimately, SAI value and benefits in line with ISSAI-P 12 and the INTOSAI 2017-2022 Strategic Plan,
- applying the INTOSAI Framework for Professional Pronouncements,

proclaimed that the future directions for public auditing depend on the SAIs' and INTOSAI's strong commitment to:

- I. providing independent external oversight on the achievement of nationally agreed targets including those linked to the SDGs,
- II. responding effectively to opportunities brought by technological advancement,
- III. enhancing the impact that SAIs make on public management accountability and transparency,

1. Elaborations on the future directions of public auditing are included as an Annex to the Moscow Declaration

agreed on the following¹.

Providing independent external oversight on the achievement of nationally agreed targets including those linked to the SDGs

1. SAIs are encouraged to contribute to more effective, transparent and informative accountability for outcomes, keeping in mind the complexity of government efforts needed to support the achievement of national priorities and the SDGs.
2. SAIs are encouraged to develop a strategic approach to public auditing to support the achievement of national priorities and the SDGs.
3. SAIs can enhance the value of public auditing by extending the provision of audit-based advice on important and strategic issues of parliament, government and public administration.

Responding effectively to opportunities brought by technological advancement

4. SAIs could promote the principle of availability and openness of data, source code and algorithms.
5. SAIs could aim to make better use of data analytics in audits, including adaptation strategies, such as planning for such audits, developing experienced teams for data analytics, and introducing new techniques into the practice of public audit.

Enhancing SAIs' impact

6. SAIs can foster an experimental mindset to enhance innovation and development.
7. SAIs may extend the focus on (a) identifying risk areas of national and international interest and raising awareness of risks; (b) the need for managing systemic risks in the government, in addition to operational, enterprise and other risks of a single entity.
8. SAIs are encouraged to nurture the auditors of the future who can employ data analytics, artificial intelligence tools, and advanced qualitative methods, enhance innovation; and act as strategic players, knowledge exchangers, and producers of foresight.
9. SAIs should consider finding more ways to address inclusiveness when conducting audits as a key point of the 2030 Agenda with its principle of leaving no one behind and other development agendas.
10. SAIs can increase their positive impact by establishing productive interaction with the auditee, and enhancing cooperation and communication with the academic community and

public in general.

Achieving this vision requires commitments by each individual SAI as well as collaborative support for SAIs from all INTOSAI bodies, such as the Goal Committees, the Working Bodies, the Regional Organizations, the IDI, the International Journal of Government Auditing, and the General Secretariat. Multilateral and bilateral cooperation among SAIs will continue to play an especially important role in helping SAIs remain relevant.

Annex

Elaborations on the future directions of public auditing

Providing independent external oversight on the achievement of nationally agreed targets including those linked to the SDGs

1. SAIs are encouraged to contribute to more effective, transparent and informative accountability for outcomes, keeping in mind the complexity of government efforts needed to support the achievement of national priorities and the SDGs.

Key statements

- New global and national goals require employment of performance-based and results-oriented public management to hold governments accountable to parliament and the public.
- SAIs are encouraged to promote accountability based on professional responsibility, trust, and a balanced approach to performance assessment. Outcome-oriented accountability is harder to capture, and many public managers are still acquiring the skills of performance-based budgeting and setting of non-financial performance objectives and outcomes.
- SAIs may need to pay particular attention to linking performance measures to complex outcomes.
- When relevant, SAIs may focus on assessment of complex outcomes and impacts when auditing individual programs or public entities.
- In line with a whole-of-government approach to auditing, SAIs may help bring light to efforts at different levels of government so that these efforts are aligned with key indicators (local, regional, and national indicators that are related to the SDGs).

2. SAIs are encouraged to develop a strategic approach to public auditing to support the achievement of national priorities and the SDGs.

Key statements

- INTOSAI aims to support SAIs in making a decisive contribution to the success of the 2030 Agenda, and thereby help make a difference in the lives of citizens in accordance with ISSAI-P 12.

- Both national goals and the SDGs can hardly be achieved without joint efforts across public entities, different levels of government, and society.
- SAIs are encouraged to consider a role as a strategic contributor to the governance while retaining their independence. Their independence, unique view on the budget cycle, and accumulated knowledge can contribute to achieving long-run national goals.
- All SAIs, within their mandates, could contribute to the achievement of national goals by fostering further a strategic approach to auditing, which implies among others: (1) conducting audits in a coordinated manner and linked to the assessment of government's ability to achieve its goals; (2) assessment of the systems' maturity that pinpoints strategic governance - setting objectives, aligning strategies to national goals, and providing feedback and proper controls.
- SAIs could assess coordination across different levels of government to evaluate synergies among public programs, policies, and strategies. If legal mandate and context allows, SAIs are well-positioned to assess policy coherence and concentrate on cross-cutting issues and approaches, and a whole-of-government perspective.

3. SAIs can enhance the value of public auditing by extending the provision of audit-based advice on important and strategic issues of parliament, government and public administration.

Key statements

- Through their audit recommendations, SAIs may fulfill their advisory role without compromising their independence, i.e. without becoming engaged in the management or operations of an audited entity.
- SAI's advisory activities could be delivered in a way that heeds the call of the Beijing Declaration while exemplifying and promoting the principles of the Lima and Mexico Declarations (ISSAI-P 1, ISSAI-P 10).
- SAIs must protect their independence and position by avoiding interference in the decision- and policy-making process, and management functions of the government but can add value in addressing strategic, complex and sensitive topics through providing recommendations.
- The provision of advice should be based on evidence and audit recommendations, grounded in SAIs' independent institutional positions, unique accumulated knowledge and professional judgement.
- Non-audit products of SAIs could increase the value of SAIs in promoting good

governance through the dissemination of expertise and best practices.

II. Responding effectively to opportunities brought by technological advancement

4. SAIs could promote the principle of availability and openness of data, source code and algorithms.

Key statements

- More and more data generated by public administrations is being made available in open formats. This creates a new information environment for everyone, and can contribute to greater transparency as well as support government accountability.
- SAIs could play an important role in informing and guiding governments regarding the benefits of public data openness. SAIs could promote the principle of availability and openness of data produced by the government if it is not ruled out by confidentiality laws or privacy concerns.
- SAIs could promote openness of automated decision-making systems used by government under principles of open source code and open data.
- SAIs should facilitate a discussion about the publication of SAIs' results in an open data format, when appropriate.

5. SAIs could aim to make better use of data analytics in audits, including adaptation strategies, such as planning for such audits, developing experienced teams for data analytics, and introducing new techniques into the practice of public audit.

Key statements

- Use of data analytics in SAIs is a necessary innovation that makes data a resource for promotion of the efficiency, accountability, effectiveness and transparency of public administration.
- The unique position of SAIs within the public sector enables them to collect large amounts of data from audited entities. Employment of Big Data analysis techniques through the auditing process, enables SAIs:
 - to synthesize data obtained from different departments, fields, government levels and regions, which enables the synthesis of obtained data to find solutions to whole-of-government problems;
 - to combine on-site, off-site and mixed data collection approaches to provide regular data updates and enable real-time monitoring of overarching issues and major risk areas.
- SAIs could benefit from conducting Big Data analytical research at the preliminary stage of audits. It will shorten field work time and allow for regular monitoring of follow-up.

- SAIs could benefit from extending research studies and enhancing their in-house methodological work to apply sound and appropriate research methods. SAIs could also engage academic institutions to conduct cooperative research.
- By strengthening cooperation among SAIs and relevant international organizations, INTOSAI can summarize Big Data audit experience and knowledge, develop relevant guidelines and research reports, and encourage SAIs to build up their Big Data audit capabilities.

III. Enhancing SAIs' impact

6. SAIs can foster an experimental mindset to enhance innovation and development.

Key statements

- To lead by example, SAIs could enhance their innovative and experimental capacities, i.e. include learning, testing and evaluating phases in some parts of their work. Experimental approaches in SAIs could accelerate learning and build capacities by systematically establishing and testing assumptions, and identifying knowledge gaps.
- SAIs could support more efficient use of experiment-based knowledge in society and more thorough incorporation of experimentation into government programs, strategies and policies.
- Experimentation in public policy aims to find innovative ways to deliver results. To tackle complex issues and deliver better results, SAIs can support experimental approaches. Finding out what works and what does not work in public policy informs understanding the effectiveness of interventions.

7. SAIs may extend the focus on (a) identifying risk areas of national and international interest and raising awareness of risks; (b) the need for managing systemic risks in the government, in addition to operational, enterprise and other risks of a single entity.

Key statements

- SAIs are encouraged to take a high-level view of their government's goals, identify significant and systemic risks to the delivery of results, and provide recommendations on how these risks can be mitigated.
- SAIs might consider establishing foresight groups and begin to provide products with a foresight perspective to bring together analysis of audit and non-audit activities.
- SAIs should continue to ground their decisions on risk management programs designed

to anticipate audit risks and avoid ruling out relevant subjects that should be included in the audit plans.

- Risk management should become a regular management practice of SAIs.

8. SAIs are encouraged to nurture the auditors of the future who can employ data analytics, artificial intelligence tools, and advanced qualitative methods, enhance innovation; and act as strategic players, knowledge exchangers, and producers of foresight.

Key statements

- To ensure professionalization of their staff is a key objective. Competencies and skills of auditors are SAIs' main asset.
- Changes in the audit environment and stakeholder expectations shape new and existing requirements for the skill sets of SAI's auditors:
 - strategic thinking - feasibility analysis, hypothesis-driven thinking, identifying causal relationships, goal orientation, foresight, strategic planning, systems thinking, prioritization;
 - data analytics skills - working with datasets and databases, data visualization, and the presentation of complex data;
 - soft skills - effective communication, emotional intelligence, building and maintaining trust based on professionalism, leadership, abilities to build consensus.
- To strengthen analytical potential, SAIs may establish analytical units to address particular problems (e.g., understanding of risks and risk-management, program evaluation etc.).

9. SAIs should consider finding more ways to address inclusiveness when conducting audits as a key point of the 2030 Agenda with its principle of leaving no one behind and other development agendas.

Key statements

- SAIs could benefit from their crosscutting expertise and contribute to good governance and policies' inclusiveness in socially important SDG-related areas (environment, education, healthcare, gender equality, etc).
- SAIs can contribute to the principle of 'leave no one behind' by auditing gender equality and inclusiveness topics. In auditing gender and inclusiveness, it is critical to agree on its meaning in national contexts and clarify its implications for implementation of 2030 Agenda and the SDGs.
- SAIs could assess preparedness of national statistical systems to monitor national targets and SDG implementation by conducting audit of related performance information.

- SAIs could consider assessing inclusion as they examine preparedness of national implementation mechanisms, government goals, performance information, and the implementation of specific SDGs and nationally agreed targets, etc.

10. SAIs can increase their positive impact by establishing productive interaction with the auditee, and enhancing cooperation and communication with the academic community and public in general.

Key statements

- Interaction with the auditee is crucial to explain and clarify SAIs' recommendations and facilitate their implementation.
- SAIs can benefit from effective communication between the SAI and its stakeholders that enhances the SAI's ability to identify and analyze matters of national interest for informed decision-making on a program, project or activity.
- SAIs could enhance their communication with expert and academic communities – a valuable source of relevant information and evidence-based analysis. SAIs should continuously strive to develop further their methodological approaches and techniques.
- SAIs can also benefit from engaging citizens through crowdsourcing, data science meetups and contests etc. Public engagement tools catalyze inspiration in the public, increase public trust, enable concentration of mutual efforts, and encourage innovative solutions to public challenges.



Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation
2, Zubovskaya street, Moscow