

---

# ICANN Specific Reviews – Third Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATRTR3)

## Recommendation 5 - Implementation Documentation

*Published on 12 February 2024*

ATRTR3 Final Report

<https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/atrr3-report-executive-summary-29may20-en.pdf>

Board resolution on ATRTR3 Final Report

<https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2020-11-30-en#1.a>

- Recommendation submitted: May 2020
- Recommendation approved: November 2020
- Implementation completed: January 2024

See <https://community.icann.org/display/atrr/Implementation> for more information on ATRTR3 implementation.

### **ATRTR3 Recommendation 5**

ATRTR3 recommends the following guidance for ICANN org in the creation of a community-led entity tasked with operating a prioritization process for recommendations made by review teams, cross-community groups, or any other community-related budgetary elements the Board or ICANN org feels appropriate:

The Board and ICANN org shall use the following guidance for the creation of a community-led entity tasked with operating a prioritization process. All SO/ACs shall have the option of participating or not in this process. Those SO/ACs wishing to participate in the prioritization process shall have one member per SO/AC. Additionally, the Board and the org shall also each have a member. The Board and ICANN org shall also take into account the following highlevel guidance for the prioritization process:

- Shall operate by consensus of the individual SO/ACs, Board, and org members that are participating in the prioritization process.
- Shall consider WS2 Recommendations, which are required to complete the IANA transition and are subject to prioritization but must not be retired unless this is decided by the Board. - Must be conducted in an open, accountable, and transparent fashion and decisions justified and documented.
- Shall integrate into the standard operating and financial plan processes.
- Can prioritize multiyear implementations but these will be subject to annual re-evaluation to ensure they still meet their implementation objectives and the needs of the community.
- Shall consider the following elements when prioritizing recommendations:
  - Relevance to ICANN's mission, commitments, core values, and strategic objectives.
  - Value and impact of implementation.
  - Cost of implementation and budget availability.
  - Complexity and time to implement. - Prerequisites and dependencies with other recommendations.

- 
- Relevant information from implementation shepherds (or equivalents).

## Board Action on ATRT3 Recommendation 5

The Board approves this recommendation and directs ICANN org to proceed to implementation. The Board acknowledges that the implementation of this recommendation is dependent upon the need to prioritize all of ICANN’s work through the annual planning cycle, and the need for the development of a framework in collaboration with the community and ICANN org.

The Board directs ICANN org to develop a framework of prioritization taking into account community groupings, mechanisms, and processes. The Board expects this prioritization process to utilize standard practices for consideration of inputs, such as the use of ICANN Public Comment proceedings. The Board also confirms that all prioritization efforts must be aligned and supported within the budget approved by the ICANN Board through the appropriate Bylaws processes (and therefore encourages the use of existing processes to the greatest extent possible) as the community prioritization effort cannot replace the Board or ICANN org officers’ fiduciary responsibility in confirming that ICANN’s work is properly managed across resource and budgetary limitations.

The Board directs ICANN org to facilitate efforts to develop a framework toward achieving an agreed upon definition of what it would mean for the prioritization process to “operate by consensus of the individual SO/ACs, Board, and org members that are participating in the prioritization process.”

## Final Implementation Report

Recommendation 5 is two-fold as it calls for the establishment of a prioritization process as well as a process to retire recommendations which are considered no longer relevant or will never be a priority.

### Prioritization

The ATRT3’s Recommendation 5, in part, echoed a conversation<sup>1</sup> started in 2019 between the ICANN Board and leadership of all Specific Review Teams on the need to enhance the effectiveness of review recommendations and their implementation, with a focus on resourcing and prioritization of community recommendations.

To address the need for prioritization, ICANN org launched the Planning Prioritization Framework project to serve as a guide for the step of prioritization during the annual planning process. As part of this project, ICANN org held a total of 17 webinars and consultations with the community from April 2021 through January 2022, and released a [Draft Planning Prioritization Framework Version 1](#) in February 2022 as a suggested tool to use in the planning process.

To test the processes and methodologies developed in the draft framework and identify gaps for further improvement, ICANN org organized a [pilot](#) prioritization exercise with selected community members in April–May 2022. A set of Board approved Specific Reviews

---

<sup>1</sup> This dialogue, at the time, had led to a draft proposal titled [Resourcing and Prioritization of Community Recommendations](#), which was shared with the community in October 2019.

---

recommendations were chosen for prioritization during the pilot. Given the timing of the pilot, its output was used by ICANN org as input for the FY23 operating planning process.

The [FY23 Pilot Prioritization](#) consisted of a series of sessions facilitated by ICANN org’s Planning team. The community group was invited to focus on recommendations eligible for prioritization<sup>2</sup> and to rate them using the “Urgency-Importance Matrix” technique. To assist the group, the list of recommendations for prioritization included ICANN org guidance (proposed level with an associated rationale). ICANN org received the results of the [FY23 Pilot Prioritization](#) in the format of a [list](#).

Following the conclusion of the pilot in early May 2022, ICANN org’s Planning team released the [Planning Prioritization Framework Version 2](#) in August 2022 that included feedback and lessons learned from the pilot.

The Planning Prioritization Framework was used during the prioritization effort in October–November 2022 to inform the [FY24 Operating Plan and Budget cycle](#). Lessons learned from this cycle were reflected in [version 3](#) of the Planning Prioritization Framework which the org released in March 2023. A [FY25 Planning Prioritization](#) effort subsequently took place in May-June 2023.

#### Process for Retiring Non-Policy Recommendations:

To ensure a thorough understanding of the ATRT3’s recommendation part relating to the retirement of non-policy recommendations, ICANN org reached out to the ATRT3 Implementation Shepherds<sup>3</sup> in [December 2022](#) to clarify certain scenarios that may trigger the retirement of a recommendation. A session was held on [11 January 2023](#) to discuss the request for clarification (see [meeting summary](#) for full reference).

ICANN org subsequently formed an internal team of subject matter experts to draft a process for retiring non-policy recommendations emerging from reviews or cross-community working groups.

The Board’s Organizational Effectiveness Committee (OEC) was consulted on the suggested process on [24 July 2023](#). The process was also shared with the Board’s Strategic Planning Committee for information in August 2023.

ICANN org discussed the [draft process](#) to retire non-policy recommendations with SO/AC leaders on 29 September 2023. A [consultation](#) on the [draft process](#) was opened on 13 October 2023. Its initial deadline of 30 November 2023 was pushed to 7 December 2023 to provide community groups with additional time to share feedback.

---

<sup>2</sup> The prioritization effort did not include recommendations considered complete or tied to a dependency.

<sup>3</sup> Per the [Operating Standards](#), the role of the implementation shepherd is to be the first contact for any questions or clarifications the ICANN organization is seeking once the implementation is underway. The implementation shepherd may provide information and clarification via publicly archived emails or recorded calls on:

- Intent of recommendations.
- Rationale for recommendations.
- Facts that led the review team to certain conclusions.
- The envisioned implementation timeline.
- Metrics related to the measure of implementation success.

---

The process was refined to address areas for improvement identified by the [GNSO Council](#), and the [ccNSO Council and its Guideline Review Committee Council](#).

The [final process](#) was then circulated to and endorsed by the OEC at their meeting 14 December 2023.

With the full Board officially notified of the [final process](#), SO/AC leaders received documentation of how the input they provided on the draft process was reflected in the final process, along with a copy of the final process on 17 January 2024.

The [final process](#) will be documented in version 4 of the Planning Prioritization Framework as well as in relevant documentation such as Operating Standards for Specific Reviews.

## Rationale

Prioritization has effectively become an integrated component of the annual planning process and is being conducted through a community planning prioritization group on a set cadence.

The process to retire non-policy recommendations involves multiple checkpoints with the community, including gathering feedback from SO/ACs, obtaining input from the Community Planning Prioritization Group, and a public comment period.

Processes set up to address ATRT3 Recommendation 5 reflect community input and may be updated as needed in the future, in consultation with the community.

## Timeline

Expected implementation date: December 2023

Final implementation date: January 2024

## Milestones

### Prioritization:

- April 2021-January 2022: consultation with the ICANN community to inform planning prioritization process
- February 2022: release of the [Draft Planning Prioritization Framework Version 1](#)
- April-May 2022: [FY23 Pilot Prioritization](#)
- August 2022: release of the [Planning Prioritization Framework Version 2](#)
- March 2023: release of [Planning Prioritization Framework version 3](#)

### Retirement process:

- December 2022-January 2023: discussion with ATRT3 implementation shepherds
- July 2023: OEC consideration of draft process
- September 2023: SO/AC leaders consideration of [draft process](#)
- October-December 2023: community [consultation](#) on [draft process](#)

- 
- December 2023: OEC endorsement of [final process](#)
  - January 2024: Board received copy of final process
  - January 2024: SO/AC leaders informed of final process
  - January 2024: release of final process