



**STATE CORONER'S COURT
OF NEW SOUTH WALES**

Inquest:	Inquest into the death of
Hearing dates:	10-14 February 2020
Date of findings:	20 May 2020
Place of findings:	Coroners Court, Lidcombe
Findings of:	Deputy State Coroner Magistrate Truscott
Catchwords:	CORONIAL LAW –suicide-catfishing-domestic violence- s61 Certificate-
File number:	13/333799
Representation:	Ms S. Harding, Coronial Advocate Assisting the Coroner M B. Longeville, instructed by Ms V. Henson of Eid Lawyers representing Ms C Zeiden
Publication order:	I make an order under 75(5) permitting these findings be published.

<p>Findings:</p>	<p>The identity of the deceased The person who died was Renae Marsden</p> <p>Date of death Renae Marsden died on 5 August 2013</p> <p>Place of death The place Renae died is The Gap. Jacob's Ladder Reserve, Watsons Bay Sydney NSW 2030</p> <p>Cause of death Renae Marsden died of Fatal Fall Injuries</p> <p>Manner of death Renae Marsden deliberately slipped from the clifftop with the intent to end her life after the termination of a relationship with a person whose identity and intent were, unbeknown to her, a fabrication created and perpetrated for the purposes of exercising coercion and control over her by a known person, who engaged in conduct known as "Catfishing".</p>
<p>Recommendations:</p>	<p>That the Domestic Violence Death Review Team undertake an in-depth review and provide that review to the Department of Community and Justice to inform any action taken to progress Recommendation 9 of the DVRT 2017/19 Report.</p>

Introduction

1. Renae Marsden died shortly before 6 pm on 5 August 2013. Renae took her own life by deliberately falling from the cliff known as "The Gap" at Jacobs Ladder Reserve Watsons Bay in Sydney NSW. Her body was swept out to sea and has never been recovered. The circumstances of what led to this were the subject of this inquest.
2. The inquest is held pursuant to s 27(1) (c) and (d) *Coroners Act 2009* ("the Act") so that findings under s81 can be made in relation to the fact that Renae has died, the date and place of her death and identifying the manner and cause or circumstances of her death.
3. Renae was born on 15 October 1992 in Fairfield Hospital. She was the biological daughter of Teresa Marsden and Jamie Deathe. When Renae was about 2 years old her parents separated and when Renae was about 5 years of age Teresa met Mark Marsden. A year later Renae and her mother commenced living together with Mark. In 2000 Teresa and Mark married. They have 3 children Luke, Jake and Monique. When Renae was 18 years of age Renae adopted Mark's surname by deed poll.
4. At the time of her death Renae was living at home, working full-time and looking forward to her 21st birthday. Renae had close and loving relationships with friends and family and had been talking about moving out to share an apartment with her cousin Stephanie. Renae was in a relationship with Brayden Spiteri. Although Brayden was in prison, he and Renae had been making plans to marry some time after her birthday and Renae had made an appointment for 30 November 2013 to speak with a wedding photographer.
5. On the day Renae died, Renae expected to receive news about the outcome of Brayden's court case and was hopeful that he was being released. Instead, Brayden terminated their relationship which from all accounts left Renae devastated. That early evening she drove to The Gap and communicated by text messages to Brayden. Then he stopped replying and after waiting a short time she then sent three people a text message from the clifftop. The last was to Brayden, the next was to her mother and the first was to her friend Camila who she had known since high school.
6. Renae then threw her phone over the cliff and shortly thereafter herself. Then Brayden sent two messages but of course that was some minutes after Renae's death. In February 2012 Renae had received a Valentines Card and flowers from Brayden. She had the card with her when she drove from her home to The Gap. Using her finger Renae had also written on the windows of her car that she loved Brayden.

Summary of Background

7. In late 2011 Renae had told her mother Teresa that Camila had introduced her to a boy she quite liked called Brayden. He was serving a sentence of imprisonment for a driving offence in which his best friend Richie had died. She told her mother that Brayden was a prisoner in Goulburn jail, NSW and that she was unable to visit him because he had chosen to forfeit his visitation rights to serve a shorter sentence. She said that Camila had contacted Brayden's lawyer and arranged for Brayden to receive a mobile phone to use whilst he was in prison. With the use of the phone Brayden and Renae communicated most days via text messages and Facebook. He even contacted Teresa in December 2011 to introduce himself and reassure Teresa that he and Renae would see how things went when he was released from prison. In early 2012 Renae told her mother she was in love with Brayden.
8. Sometimes Renae would orally speak to Brayden and he would reply by text messages because, as he explained to her, he wasn't permitted to possess a mobile telephone in prison and if someone heard him speaking on the phone he would get into trouble.
9. In January 2012 Renae and Camila attended Bondi Ink together, where Renae received a tattoo of the name "*B Spiteri*" on the right side of her chest. The relationship between Renae and Brayden was emotionally intense and difficult. Brayden would express jealousies to Renae about people she was spending time with. This intensity is demonstrated by the fact that over the period from March 2013 to 19 June 2013 there were over 11 thousand text messages¹ between them and that does not include the Facebook communications of which there were many.
10. The content of most communications are not known but it is evident that Brayden had a Facebook page in February 2012 but abandoned it after about a month. During that time he sent messages to Camila and other friends of Renae including Angus. Facebook messages up until early April 2012 are tendered into evidence.
11. In May 2012 Teresa told Renae that she thought that Brayden was rude and arrogant and felt that it was not a good relationship to be in. Renae said that she would not continue the relationship but that she would remain friends with him to give him support. However, the relationship likely continued with Renae expecting that Brayden would be released in August 2012 so that she and Brayden could continue their relationship in the physical sense. In September 2012, Renae took an overdose of medication. Three days later she told Teresa what she had done and that she was vomiting and unable to eat and drink.
12. Teresa drove Renae to hospital where she was attended to in the Emergency Department and discharged. The notes record that "*boyfriend spent a year in gaol and was out on parole. Boyfriend had a fight with his father after being out of gaol,*

¹ Ex 2 Vol 1 and 2 Phone Records Extraction Reports ("Extraction Reports")
By way of example Sunday 2 June 2013 - 114 texts : 06.53 - 23:04
Monday 3 June 2013-160 texts : 06.37 - 23.05
Tuesday 4 June 2013- 170 texts: 06.05– 22.44

father pressed charges and boyfriend is back in gaol for 2 years, in Goulburn prison. Patient is "upset" as she doesn't have any contact with boyfriend. Feels has not been "mentally stable". Says work is a "stress" "Boss" told me few days ago he loves me". Feels confused. She reported her mood as 4/10 but denied self-harm ideas". The notes also indicate that Renae regretted the episode, that she was "happy to be alive with no serious fatal consequences".²

13. It appears that Renae and Brayden's relationship ended to the extent that Renae became involved with her work colleague Ian. However, Renae kept in contact with Brayden and he appeared to know she was seeing Ian as he would send Ian threatening text messages.
14. Ian and Renae became engaged in January 2013 but the communications between Renae and Brayden continued and by March 2013 Ian gave Renae an ultimatum to choose to be with him or to be with Brayden.
15. Renae chose Brayden. Renae had left her employment and started another job and her new work colleagues were all familiar with her relationship with Brayden. Renae and Brayden remained together from this point on. Renae did not become involved with anyone else and Brayden remained in Goulburn Prison. In July 2013 there was a month long period where they did not communicate. Brayden had a court case, the outcome of which Renae hoped would result in Brayden being released from prison.
16. Despite the fact that Brayden could not communicate to Renae during this month she maintained sending him numerous daily texts and she told work colleagues how difficult it was for her not being able to have contact with Brayden.
17. On 5 August 2013 Brayden finally replied to a text message Renae sent and they started communicating. Shortly after midday Renae commented to a work colleague Joseph that Brayden was being blunt. At about 1 pm, while Renae and Joseph were walking to a café for lunch Renae started crying and shaking. She showed Joseph one of the text messages Brayden had sent which said "*I think I need a break and so do you*".
18. Other than that one text message Joseph read on Renae's telephone, the content of all the other 91 text messages between Renae and Brayden have not been recovered by police³.

² Ex 1 Vol 3 Tab 1 Westmead Hospital Mental Health Assessment 16 September 2012.

³ There were a total of 24 exchanges involving 92 text messages involving 16 exchanges between 11.53 am – 14:39 pm (Renae's 22 and Brayden's 21 messages) and then 8 exchanges involving Renae's 39 and Brayden's 10). See Call Charge Records ("CCR") Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab 2 (Renae) and Tab 4 (Brayden). A single text is limited to a certain number of characters. When a text is longer than this limit it is recorded as 2 or more texts depending on the length of the message which is reflected in the CCR, the difference in time between texts on the CCR can assist, in the absence of an extraction report message, whether single or multiple messages were likely sent. Accordingly, the expression "up to" the number of text messages is used to encompass the possibility that a longer message may involve multiple texts. The number of exchanges may be a more accurate representation.

19. Renae spent the lunchtime crying and café staff provided her with tissues. She told Joseph she wanted to go home. They returned to the office and Renae left work early telling Joseph she was going to telephone Goulburn prison to speak to Brayden.
20. Renae left work in her car. The telephone records show that at 2.44 pm Renae made a 90 second telephone call to Goulburn prison. There is no evidence of what she was told by the prison but it is known that she did not speak with Brayden.
21. After her call to Goulburn prison Renae had two more exchanges probably related to her call to the prison
22. Renae had arrived home early from work and Teresa could see that she was upset. She asked her what was wrong and Renae told her *"Nothing is wrong mum"*. Renae went to her room to remove her makeup and change out of her work clothes which was her usual routine. Renae sent up to nine text messages to Brayden. He did not reply but shortly after receiving the last text Brayden texted Teresa *"Sort your daughter out threatening to kill herself"*. He then texted Renae. When Teresa texted Brayden asking why Renae would do that he replied *"Ask her yourself"* which could suggest he knew that Renae was home with Teresa. Brayden again texted Renae and she replied.
23. Teresa went to Renae's room and asked her if this was true and she said *"Don't be stupid I would never do that"*. Teresa showed Renae the text from Brayden and Renae told her *"Mum you don't have to worry about him anymore I finally found out what he is all about"*. Teresa asked what she meant by that and Renae replied *"Don't worry mum it's all over"*. Brayden sent some more texts to Teresa the last being that Renae loved him and he then sent Renae a text and she replied. This was about 3.30 pm.
24. Teresa had left to pick up her three younger children from the bus stop and they returned home. Teresa saw that Renae was getting dressed and applying her makeup. Renae told Teresa she was going out to dinner with friends. Teresa then took two of the children to swimming lessons and asked Renae to take the youngest child to their grandmother who lived in a flat on their property. Renae told her she wouldn't be late.⁴
25. Call Charge Records ("CCR") suggest that Renae's phone⁵ was using internet between 3.47 – 4.30 pm. It is likely that she was using Facebook. Renae left the house taking her little sister to her grandmother's home and drove to Watsons Bay arriving at about 5.20pm.
26. Whilst Teresa was at the swimming pool she received text messages from Renae at 5.49 pm. Teresa returned home, picked up her youngest child and took her to

⁴ Ex 1 Vol 1, Tab 9 para 67. Statement 1 of Teresa Marsden,

⁵ Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab 2

confirmation class and then went to a friends' house. She showed her friend Renae's messages and she suggested Teresa call the police.

27. The police attended at about 7.50 pm and after they left, Teresa texted Camila at 8:18 pm "*Hi have you heard from Renae?*"⁶ Camila texted back "*She messaged me a while ago why is everything ok?*"⁷ Camila then called Renae's phone but it was switched off.⁸ Camila sent another text to Teresa "*I can come and we can go look for her?*"⁹ Camila later told Teresa that she had received a text from Renae at 5.47 pm in which Renae said that she loved her and was sorry.
28. Camila drove with her mother to the Marsden home and collected Teresa. They drove to places where Camila suggested Renae might be including Dural McDonalds and a house in Glenhaven which Camila identified as where Brayden's sister lived. They could not locate Renae.
29. The police made inquiries with Renae's mobile phone service provider and learned that Renae's mobile was switched off at 5.58 pm in the vicinity of Old South Head Road Vaucluse. Local police were tasked to conduct a patrol of the area known as The Gap to look for Renae and her car.
30. At about 8.45 pm that night the police located Renae's car on Military Road, Watson's Bay about 150 metres from the steps at The Gap. A land and air search was conducted but the police could not locate any signs of Renae. The police search continued the following morning with Mark and Teresa in attendance. Teresa located Renae's shoes left neatly near an old gun turret which is on a path from Military Road to Jacob's ladder Reserve. Another aerial search was conducted without success.
31. Three divers searched the sea bottom near the rock foreshore opposite Jacobs Ladder Reserve. They noted that there was a swirling current flowing seaward. They did not locate anything. Another dive search was conducted the following day including further out to sea and a Water Police vessel carried out sea surface searches without success.
32. Renae's car was towed to a police holding yard. Also located in the vehicle was the Valentine's card and Renae's wallet inside which was a photograph montage of Brayden and Renae and the words "*I love you baby*" which bore on the reverse side and indicated that it had been printed in June 2012. The police also located an iPhone contained in a pink cover. This was not the telephone Renae had been using recently or that day but did contain communications between herself and Brayden throughout their relationship.¹⁰

⁶ Ex 2A Extraction Report page 237 message 3908 8:18 pm

⁷ Ex 2A Extraction Report page 237 message 3907 8:19 pm ; and Ex 1 Tab 1 CCR

⁸ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 3 Leading Senior Constable Georgina Robinson's statement paragraph 20, according to CCR at Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab1 CCR this was at 8,25 pm

⁹ Ex 2A Extraction Report page 237 message 3906 8:27 pm

¹⁰ Teresa reported that when she later drove the car home she saw in the moisture on the windscreen the words "*B loves R*" and "*Brayden Loves Renae*".

33. Teresa wanted to speak with Brayden. She sent him a text message on 7 August *"Where r u? I want to speak to u. I want answers now"*. A few hours later she sent another *"Answer me please. You can't do this"*. Brayden never replied. Camila visited Teresa and told her that she shouldn't blame Brayden. She said that he had spoken to her on the Monday night (when Renae died) and he was upset that people were blaming him.

The Initial Police Investigation

34. The police commenced an investigation which initially concentrated on locating Renae and then quickly focussed on Renae's relationship with Brayden. After obtaining telephone records and speaking with Renae's family and friends the police determined that Brayden Spiteri did not exist at all.
35. Camila Zeidan had assumed the identity of Brayden Spiteri and by using SMS she texted on a mobile phone and via communications on Facebook she engaged Renae in an intimate relationship spanning nearly two years.
36. Leading Senior Constable Georgina Robinson spoke with Camila and made an appointment to speak with her. She asked Camila to make notes about her friendship with Renae, her knowledge of Brayden and the text messages and communications she had with Renae in the weeks leading up to her disappearance.¹¹
37. On 25 August 2013 Camila attended the police station for a pre-arranged meeting. She provided a 2 page handwritten statement to the LSC Robinson. It started with *"Renae msged me 5.47 – I'm sorry for everything you will always be my bestfriend I hope one day you can forgive me I love you xoxo"*¹²
38. Camila's notes did not make mention of Brayden or any communications he had with Renae. During her meeting with Leading Senior Constable Robinson, Camila described Brayden's appearance and told her Renae never spoke about her relationships and that Renae's parents didn't let Renae be friends with her.
39. At the end of the meeting Leading Senior Constable Robinson said to Camila *"I want you to be honest with me, the telephone call logs that I have here in front of me suggest to me that you are Brayden, are you?"*. Camila replied, *"No, I know that lot of people think I am, everyone is against me, I wish I was where Renae is now, wherever she is, I just want to have the peace she is feeling now, we could be together, do you think she is really gone?"*
40. The following day, 26 August 2013 Camila was admitted into hospital as her family were highly concerned that she was at risk of serious self-harm. The hospital records form part of the evidence and in notes of the consultations with Camila there is no reference whatsoever to Brayden. Camila was discharged on 30 August 2013.

¹¹ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 3 Statement of Leading Senior Constable Georgina Robinson's para 30

¹² Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 3 Statement of Leading Senior Constable Georgina Robinson's attachment pg 12

41. On 23 September 2013 the police executed a search warrant to locate the mobile telephone Camila had used solely for the purpose of Brayden. The police did not locate the phone or the sim card though they did seize other items including letters Renae had written to Camila when they were at school and a letter Rene had written to Brayden in an envelope which had been had been ripped up and deposited in a rubbish bin.¹³ They also found a photograph of Brayden with Camila on Camila's mobile telephone.
42. On 23 September 2013 at the conclusion of the search of Camila's bedroom she was sitting on the couch and Senior Constable Walker-Lear introduced herself and said to Camila: *"Is there anything you want to talk to me about? I am happy to listen"*. Camila said *"I was sending the text messages to Renae before I left for America in March... Renae asked me to. She wanted me to pretend that I was Brayden"*. Senior Constable Walker-Lear asked *"Why would Renae want you to pretend to be Brayden?"* and Camila replied *"I don't know. I just did it because she wanted me to. I didn't do anything else. What's going to happen to me?"* Senior Constable Walker-Lear replied *"At this stage Camila we are just interested in finding out what has happened to Renae"*.¹⁴
43. Camila failed to tell Senior Constable Walker-Lear that she had sent texts as Brayden after she returned home from her holiday, specifically on the day that Renae died.
44. The police attempted to speak further with Camila but she declined to be interviewed. Camila had disposed of the phone and sim card used by Brayden and without it the police were unable to obtain evidence of the content of text messages as at that time in 2013 the telephone service providers' data expired after 7 days.
45. The police had seized three of Camila's phones and attempted to subject them to Cellbrite examination to download the contents¹⁵. One telephone a *blackberry* could not be accessed and was destroyed in the process, an *iPhone 4* which Camila had taken on her trip overseas and a *Samsung* which is the phone she used for herself before and after her holiday.
46. The examination of these telephone records provides limited information as Camila had already deleted many messages from the *Samsung* relating to 5 August 2013 including the last message Renae had sent her at 5.47 pm. None of the phones located by the police were used by Brayden; the phone for that purpose was a *blackberry bold touch*.¹⁶
47. Renae's mobile telephone located in her car contained data up until 19 June 2013. The telephone was locked and when a family friend used a program from the internet to download the contents, the information became "scrambled".¹⁷ It was not until

¹³ Camila had been the person to pass messages for Brayden as at some early stage she claimed access to the lawyer

¹⁴ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 2 Statement of Senior Constable Sarah Walker-Lear dated 9 November 2013 para 9

¹⁵ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 1 Statement of Detective Senior Constable Brent Bell 8 February 2020 para 6

¹⁶ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 1 Statement of Detective Senior Constable Brent Bell 8 February 2020 para 7

¹⁷ Ex 1 Vol 3 Tab 11 Statement of Ben Wilson, para 8 and 13

2019, due to advances in technology that the contents of Renae and Brayden's text messages was able to be accessed. The communications between Renae and Brayden and Camila at least up until June 2013 reveals the nature and progress of the relationship and contradicts Camila's claim that Renae knew that Brayden was not a real person.

The Coroners Role

48. On 10 September 2013, the Officer in Charge, Detective Brent Bell submitted a P79B report to the Coroner that Renae was a missing person suspected deceased. The Coroner directed that a brief of evidence be prepared.
49. The Coroners jurisdiction is not an adversarial one. The Coroners role under s81 is to make findings about a person's death. The Coroner, on behalf of the community, seeks to determine what happened to cause a person's death and to learn from it. The coroner does not seek to find negligence or blame but rather the truth about the cause of a death in an attempt to prevent deaths from occurring where they can be prevented.
50. Pursuant to section 82(2) *Coroners Act 2009*, a coroner is empowered to make recommendations in relation to any matter connected with the death with which an inquest is concerned. Recommendations usually relate to matters such as public health and safety or asking a person or body to review a matter.
51. Renae's family pressed for an inquest with the hope of learning the truth about what had happened to Renae and particularly about what was said between her and Brayden on 5 August 2013. Given that only Camila Zeidan would be able to tell them the answers to the many questions they had they were most anxious for her to give evidence.
52. Renae's family believe that Renae's death was due to having been "catfished" which is a term used to describe a deceptive activity where a person creates a fake identity on a social network account usually targeting a specific victim for abuse, deception or fraud including romance scams, whether it is for financial gain, to compromise a victim in some way or simply as a form of a wish fulfilment.¹⁸
53. There is no specific offence in NSW for this conduct other than where the conduct falls within an already defined offence such as conduct such as financial fraud or deception or stalking and harassment or extortion. Where 'catfishing' is without threat or intimidation or is not for monetary gain, then the conduct appears to be committed with the intent to coerce and control someone for the purpose of a wish fulfilment or some other gratification. Though such conduct may cause the recipient mental and or physical harm because it is not conduct committed with the necessary intent it falls outside the parameters of a known State criminal offence. Given the mental harm and anguish occasioned to Renae, her family press for such behaviour to be criminalised.

¹⁸ en.m.wikipedia.org

54. There is an offence whereby the use of a telephone service (known as a carriage service) in a way (be it method or content or both) that reasonable persons would regard as being, in all the circumstances, menacing, harassing or offensive. This is found at *s474.17 Criminal Code Act 1995* (Cth) which carries a penalty of 3 years imprisonment. It is unclear whether a Catfish situation such as this would be captured by this legislation.
55. If Renae discovered that her relationship with Brayden was but a fiction and she took her own life as a consequence, the community might consider that Catfishing is an act with should be prohibited. Even if Renae did not discover that Camila had committed the deception and was simply heartbroken because Brayden had ended the relationship, she has taken her life about a person who does not exist. That consequence is of such gravity that the community would expect to be sanctioned.

Evidence at Inquest

56. The Police Brief comprises numerous statements from Renae's friends and family and work colleagues and the police officers involved in the investigation. It also contained copies of Facebook messages from October 2011 to April 2012, telephone call records and text messages (SMS- Short Message Service) from Renae's old phone to June 2013, Call Charge Records (CCR) relating from 1 July on numbers used by Brayden, Camila and Renae, CCTV footage and hospital and police documents. There are also extracts of text messages from Camila Zeidan's mobile from 3 August 2013 -10 October 2013. **N.B**¹⁹
57. The police brief in addition to other records obtained during the hearing were tendered into evidence. I heard evidence from three persons: Officer in Charge Detective Brent Bell, Camila Zeidan and her friend Melanie Dagher.
58. Ms Zeidan ("Camila") willingly gave her evidence under the protection of s 61 of the Act.²⁰ Camila said that the reason she and Renae created Brayden Spiteri was so that she and Renae could be together. She said that due to their respective family's

¹⁹ Ex 2 Telephone Extraction Reports Renae Marsden's phone from 5 March – 19 June 2013
 Volume 1 and 2 Tab 1 – Renae's communications with Brayden (name of Francweena Ryan)
 Volume 2 Tab 2 - Renae's communications with Camila Zeidan (name of "Diana")
 Volume 2 Tab 3 Renae's communicaitons with Camila Zeidan (name of "Dad")
 Volume 2 Tab 4 Renae's communications with Camila Zeidan ("Unkonwn466")
 Volume 2 Tab 5 Renae's commuicaitons with Ian Satur ("Ian")
 Volume 2 Tab 6 Condensed version of Ex 2B prepared by Officer in Charge
 Volume 2 Tab 7 Photographs located on Renae Marsden's phone

Ex 2A Telephone Extraction Reports from Camilla Zeidan's phone 3 August 2013- 10 October 2013
 Ex 2B Telephone Extraction Reports Renae Marsden's phone from 5 March – 19 June 2013, encompassing Ex 1 Volume 1 and 2 Tab 1, Volume 2, Tabs 2,3,4,5

In the examination of Camila Zeidan during Inquest referrals and references to Ex 2 Volumes 1 and 2 Tab 1 are to be read as references to Ex 2B.

²⁰ Camila was represented whilst she gave evidence. Her representatives sought and were given leave to be excused from further involvement in the proceedings.

opposition to them having an intimate relationship this was the only way that they could be together.

59. Camila said that she and Renae together created the character Brayden Spiteri and that on 7 November 2011 they had both attended a Vodaphone shop and purchased the sim card and whilst together at Camila's home Camila registered the sim card in her name and activated the telephone account. She said that they decided together that Brayden would be in prison to explain why Renae's family could not meet him.
60. If that was the case then Renae had not been a victim of Catfishing at all but rather involved in an arrangement whereby she would masquerade to her family, friends and work colleagues that she was in a heterosexual relationship whilst being in a secret lesbian relationship with Camila.
61. Much of Camila's examination was directed at this claim and tracts of Telephone Extraction Report evidence which suggested otherwise were put to her yet she adhered to her version that Renae knew from beginning to end that Camila was Brayden.²¹ The examination also, without success, attempted to elicit from her the content of Renae and Brayden's communications on 5 August 2013 and an explanation of her actions such as why she deleted the text messages from that day.

Why would Camila Catfish Renae

62. The evidence demonstrates that Camila's motive was likely not so that she could harass or intimidate Renae but rather so that Camila could keep Renae for herself to the exclusion of all others. The evidence contained in the brief establishes that Renae preferred being in relationships with men, that she did not want to be in a relationship with Camila but wanted to be her best friend.
63. Camila was unable to tolerate Renae having an intimate relationship. She would become jealous, possessive and abusive²². She complained to Renae that she did not like being "second-best"²³. She would abuse Renae's partners and urge Renae to break up with them²⁴. This behaviour not only had an adverse impact on Renae's relationships but also on her friendship with Camila causing Renae to withdraw from Camila. In response Camila would follow her, send her multitudes of text messages and pressure Renae to spend more time with her.
64. Renae did not want to be in a relationship with Camila regardless of what their respective families thought. Renae considered Camila to have been her best friend, albeit a difficult one, and had made it clear in September 2011 that there would

²¹ Much of the evidence contained in the Telephone Extraction Reports were not put to her as it became clear after some time that her position was not going to change and I determined that the evidence would speak for itself.

²² Though Camila denied this in evidence, there was no challenge to the tender of any witness statements without being called for cross-examination. Camila stepped back from saying those witness statements were not truthful. In any event, the carriage service communications establish that Camila had poor emotional regulation and was manipulative and abusive.

²³ Ex 3 Facebook p145, pp136-145 and pp153-154 of 198- 5-7 September 2011

²⁴ Ex 1 Vol 1 See Tab 13 Statement of Angus Young and Tab 14 Statement of Ian Satur

always be a man with whom Renae would be with which didn't mean that she couldn't also see Camila.²⁵ That is not to say that Renae did not herself have jealous feelings and make complaints to Camila.

65. By Catfishing Renae, Camila could have some kind of intimate relationship she wanted with Renae as well as an ongoing friendship with her. Renae was sexually intimate with Brayden including phone sex, sending him videos and photographs. Text messages Renae sent to Brayden demonstrate her frustration and disappointment that Brayden would not send her videos and photographs of him.²⁶
66. The content of many Facebook and text messages demonstrate that Renae believed Brayden to be real and that she was not "together" with Camila. Indeed Renae believed that Camila had been going out with Brayden in 2011 and in May 2012 Renae was Facebook messaging a man called Martin who she was supporting whilst he was trying to date Camila.²⁷
67. Renae and Camila's friendship was difficult and Camila used Brayden to counsel and advise Renae how to deal with Camila so as not to make her angry, to repay Camila money, or to negotiate an argument²⁸. Finally, there is evidence that throughout their friendship since at least 2008 Renae experienced abuse, including physical abuse, from Camila and in July 2013 Renae ended their friendship and she wrote to Brayden telling him how much better she felt having done so²⁹.
68. To add to the disturbing features of this case after Renae had separated from Ian to be with Brayden, Camila was maintaining and escalating the Brayden relationship with Renae leading her to believe that they would marry when he was released from gaol. Whilst doing this, Camila herself became involved with a man called Michael who she later married.
69. Despite the evidence clearly contradicting Camila's position she would not concede at any time during her testimony that the creation and perpetuation of Brayden was done without the knowledge of Renae. Though she said they created Brayden together so she and Renae could be together there is absolutely no evidence that they were ever intimately involved during the period of Brayden. Camila did not claim that there were any specific occasions where she was with Renae to be intimate but just said they were. Renae's communications with Brayden demonstrate quite clearly that this is untrue and indeed Renae did not see Camila particularly often, at least in 2013.
70. The evidence demonstrates that by having Renae in a relationship with Brayden, Camila freed herself from experiencing the jealousy and possessiveness she would

²⁵ Ex 3 Tab 4 Facebook p145, pp136-145 of 198 - 6 September 2011 at 4:24 pm

²⁶ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Report Texts p 251 text 4474 – 10 May 2013, p 227 text 4044 -16 May 2013, Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extracted Texts 2288-2295 - 1 June 2013; text 1008 -12 June 2013; pp 634-632 texts 11278-11251; pp 631 texts 11221-11217 - 6- 7 March 2013,; texts 9958-9954 - 19 March 2013

²⁷ Ex 3 Facebook Tab1 pp 7-1 of 7

²⁸ Ex 2 Vol 1 Extraction Reports pp 108-103 Text 1927-1838, pp105-107, Texts 1895- 1857 and pp 99-98 1752-1738 - 4 June 2013

²⁹ Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab 23: Letter dated 22 July 2013 located in Renae's room

feel whenever Renae was in a relationship with a man. By being Brayden, Camila experienced being in an intimate relationship with Renae despite Renae being unaware that this was occurring. Renae spent more time as a friend with Camila because Camila's behaviour had improved as she no longer needed to compete against one of Renae's boyfriends and she did not need to break them up. From Renae's perspective, Camila had finally been able to accept that Renae was in love with someone else so she could retain some kind of friendship with her, though it was marked by a degree of instability and abuse. Ultimately, if Camila was Catfishing Renae she was doing so to exercise coercion and control in both aspects of Renae's life – as Brayden's girlfriend and as Camila's best friend.

The Background to Renae and Camila's Friendship

71. Renae commenced High School at Mount St Benedict's College in 2005. In 2007 when she was in year 9 Renae went out with a boy for most of the year but broke up with him near the end. Renae told her cousin Stephanie Herreen³⁰ that Camila did not like him. Stephanie noted that by this time Renae had started jiggling school with Camila, smoking cigarettes and her grades dropped dramatically. Her attitude had changed from outspoken and outgoing to being withdrawn. Renae complained to Stephanie that Camila would push and punch her and cause bruises. Despite Stephanie telling Renae to stop contact she continued to see Camila.
72. Throughout 2008 Renae and Camila would be in constant contact but had a short falling out when Renae had a crush on Camila's brother. In the middle of the year Renae told Stephanie that Camila had tried to kiss her a few times and that sometimes she was violent to her and then really nice or tried to seduce her. Stephanie broke Renae's confidence which resulted in Teresa learning about the relationship and confronting Renae. Renae admitted that it was true and that she was afraid of Camila.
73. Around this time Teresa located a number of "love letters" written by Camila to Renae in Renae's bedroom.³¹ Teresa and Mark were of the view that Renae's poor school performance and attitude was due to Camila's influence. They were not supportive of the relationship and initiated meetings with the school and Camila's parents in an attempt to end it.
74. Despite the family efforts Camila and Renae continued seeing each other. Camila simply thwarted Teresa's threat of not paying for Rene's phone bill by providing Renae with a new mobile phone for her to use exclusively to contact her.³²
75. However, in 2009 Renae was transitioning to TAFE to study hairdressing and was not seeing Camila very much but that changed by mid-2009 when Camila started training as a hairdresser at the same TAFE as Renae. Within a couple of months

³⁰ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 12, para 9, Statement of Stephanie Herreen

³¹ Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab 26 Camila's MacBook contained emails between them from early to mid-July 2008 (116 pages) During the execution of the search warrant on 23 September 2013, the police also located a number of very intense letters written by Renae in 2007 and 2009 to Camila Vol 3, Tab 7.

³² Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 12, para 14, Statement of Stephanie Herreen

Renae told Stephanie that Camila had chased her down the hall and pulled her hair and she was beginning to become scared of her again. Renae met a young man Angus while working at a salon and Camila started following Renae on the train to work.

76. By April 2010 Renae and Angus were in an intimate relationship³³. Angus described Renae as a very happy and bubbly person, who would always look on the 'bright side of life' and was a "glass-half-full" type of person.
77. As the relationship between Angus and Renae developed, the relationship between Renae and Camila deteriorated. Camila would constantly call and text Renae, and wait outside the Marsden residence and would turn up at Renae's workplace uninvited to 'speak' with Renae.
78. Teresa said that Renae complained to her about being "followed" by Camila, appearing 'coincidentally' at locations where Renae was frequenting. On one occasion, when Renae and Teresa were at a library, Camila appeared and cornered Renae saying, "*As long as you refuse to answer my phone calls, I will continue to follow you*".³⁴ Renae did not make any complaint to the police that she was being stalked by Camila, however in an attempt to avoid Camila she ultimately ceased her studies at TAFE.
79. Renae instigated a meeting at a local Café, with Camila and their respective mothers. Renae told Camila that she didn't want the friendship to continue. Camila protested and became angry. Renae left the Café and Camila followed and grabbed hold of her arm pleading, "*You don't mean it, you don't mean it*". Teresa intervened and escorted Renae to her car. Camila continued to prevent Renae leaving and Teresa again had to physically intervene so that Renae could leave.³⁵
80. After this meeting, Camila would continue to phone Renae some of which she answered but most she did not. Camila would be derogatory about Angus who she would call "Ken" an apparent snide about his physique and appearance.
81. Facebook communications between Camila and Renae from late August to early October 2011 indicate that there may have been sporadic sexual contact between Camila and Renae some of it suggestive of Renae trying to appease Camila. Camila complained about her difficulties with Renae being in a relationship with Angus, choosing to spend her time with him over her and that Camila is second-best despite her and Renae having been in a relationship for 4 years. She complained that she is Renae's "*something on the side*" and persisted with asking Renae to make a choice. Renae told Camila that there will always be another person, whether it is Angus or someone else.³⁶

³³ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 13, para 3, Statement of Angus Young

³⁴ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 9, para 12, Statement of Teresa Marsden

³⁵ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 9, para 11, Statement of Teresa Marsden

³⁶ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 pp136-145 of 198 - 5-7 September 2011

82. It appears that at this time Camila is friends with a woman (“T”). Renae queries whether Camila buys her things.³⁷ There appears to be a situation where Renae is accustomed to asking for Camila to buy things for her, such as lingerie and swimwear and Camila uses that arrangement as leverage to see Renae.³⁸
83. After Renae broke off her engagement with Angus, Camila said she wanted to have a tattoo. On 25 November 2011 Renae designed Camila a tattoo “R 17.12.07”. However, this should not necessarily be taken to indicate that Renae had decided to be with Camila because two days later Camila engaged in the creation of a communication on Renae’s Facebook between herself and Brayden apparently so that Renae would be assured that Camila doesn’t have a problem with Renae going out with her ex-boyfriend Brayden and Brayden doesn’t have a problem with Camila being Renae’s best friend.

Camila embeds Brayden into her friendship with Renae

84. On 27 November 2011 at 10:49am

BR³⁹: *Hi cdawg its Brayden*

C: *Lol hi btown why you on fb*

BR *Occupy buddy I miss Nae☺*

C *I bet you do I miss her to lol how have you been?*

BR *I’ve been good thank you I’m really happy with how things are going on the positive side I’m happy you and Nae are going well she is a beautiful girl I love her more than anything*

C *That’s good to hear bray I’m happy for you and her and yes I agree she is so beautiful I love her so much she is the best bestfriend ever.*

85. An hour later Renae messaged Camila: “His (sic) a pathological flirt.”⁴⁰

86. Late January 2012 Renae was with her family on a cruise and on 29 January Camila invokes a communique with Brayden in an apparent effort to have Renae reply to a Facebook message she had sent earlier.

C: *Matey how’s the p&O miss u”*⁴¹

BR: *“Camila she wont reply to me I’ve called her I’ve msged her I no she is on a cruise but she promised she would contact me”.*⁴²

C : *“It’s okay relax she will contact you”*

The following day Camila tries to access Renae citing Brayden:

³⁷ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 pp142-144 of 198- 6 September 2011

³⁸ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 pp130-126 - 8 September 2011. There is no suggestion that the Facebook messages are complete. Renae shared with Camila passwords and there are times that Camila used Renae’s Facebook so it is unclear what are genuinely Renae or some other user. Further, Brayden would use Renae’s Facebook to contact people.

³⁹ BR = Brayden communicating via Renae’s Facebook page

⁴⁰ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 pp 95-94, 10:49- 11:58am

⁴¹ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 p69 - 29 January 2012 - 5:43 am.

⁴² Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 p68 – 29 January 2012 8.44 pm

C: *"come back miss you hows the trip"*⁴³
*"Brayden is having heart attacks about you"*⁴⁴
R: *"Baby I miss you so much I cant talk till a couple days no k"*
*"its really nice on here im so sick though and I feel like shit man so badly"...*⁴⁵
C: *"Braydens giving me a headache"*
R *"y babe"*
C: *"He crys n stuff because he couldn't talk to u! Oh fuck are h (sic) having fun I miss u heaps"*⁴⁶

87. Camilla then tells Renae that Angus called her yesterday saying *"That I'm the cause of everything and your mum hates me and he apparently told me"*⁴⁷ he told Brayden *you said you will make things work when u get back with him and he wont contact you again"*.⁴⁸

88. The following day Renae tells Camila she will be home in a couple of days and Camila replies *"Yeah hurry braydens taken it so bad that your missing lol"*.⁴⁹ Renae says *"Council (sic) my man for me lol"* *"Love you"* and Camila replies *"wtf I try its so hard he crys he wont go to class he is being a idiot he crys all day"* *"I try"* and Renae responds *"I no my poor baby he needs hi girl lol."*⁵⁰

89. Before the chat finished Camila said *"I went on a date"* *"You will be proud"*. Renae responded *"omg tell me all about it whn im back abe"* and Camila asks *"have you found me a husband yet"* and when Renae replies yes and she would tell her later Camila replied *"lol I have found my own but it's to (sic) much trouble"*⁵¹

90. Camila created a Facebook account for Brayden but by mid-February 2012 it had created much discord with Renae because of the way he was sending material to her friends. Camila closed or stopped using the page by end of February 2012. It is difficult to gauge what was happening with Renae and Camila but after Valentines' Day Renae and Brayden were not getting on then improved in March.

91. When Camila went on holiday it was difficult for her to maintain the Brayden Renae relationship so Brayden would become indisposed. In April 2012 while Camila was away Brayden apparently was required to have surgery thus would not be able to contact Renae. However, his lawyer did.

92. On 9 April 2012 whilst Camila was away she sent a message to Renae *"Hey how r u? Miss u how's Brayden and everthing?"* R: *"Good we were crying all night lol"*.⁵²

⁴³ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 p68 – 29 January 2012 Ibid, 8.33 am

⁴⁴ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 p68 – 29 January 2012 8.37 am

⁴⁵ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 p68 – 29 January 2012 4:51 pm

⁴⁶ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 p 66 4.55 pm

⁴⁷ A "Freudian slip"?

⁴⁸ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 pp 66-65.

⁴⁹ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 p 62.

⁵⁰ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 pp60-59

⁵¹ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 pp58-56

⁵² Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 pp52, 9 April 2012, 7:47am.

Renae then explained that Brayden's lawyer Patrick messaged her to let her know that Brayden's operation went well.

93. Renae said she wouldn't be hearing from him until 26th but that he messaged her saying "*is this my wife*" (apparently in response to seeing a photograph of the tattoo of his name on Renae's chest) and Renae queried if it was him he replied "*yeah its my number isnt it*". Camilla responds "*Whattt isn't he in recovery?*" Camilla asked if he was being nice and that at least she had heard from him.⁵³
94. It is unclear whether Camilla had sent the Brayden text messages herself or whether she had orchestrated someone else to do so in her absence. It is unclear how much time Renae and Camilla were spending together but it appears from the Facebook messages that Camilla would monitor and maintain her friendship with Renae by referencing Brayden.
95. On 10 April 2012 Camilla again messaged Renae asking "*how's b town*" to which Renae replied "*his knocked out and sore windging like a girl lol*".⁵⁴ After a short conversation Renae joked about going to rehab and said "*I'll put myself in for depression from not talking to my best friend and boyfriend lmao*" and Camilla asked if she had spoken to him and Renae said no.⁵⁵
96. It is also unclear whether Camilla had a boyfriend in 2012 or whether she became enmeshed with the Brayden identity that when Renae became involved with Ian in October 2012 Camilla's mental health deteriorated. The brief of evidence contains a letter from a psychologist to Camilla's G.P dated 27 May 2013 stating :

*"Further, two weeks prior to Christmas she separated from her Italian boyfriend of six months. This has caused significant stress in her family's life, whereby she experienced physical and psychological abuse. The separation caused ongoing 'stalking' which had led to police complaints. She was unable to obtain an Apprehended Violence Order against him and continues to experience fear of safety in her life".*⁵⁶

97. Renae would stay overnight with Ian 1 or 2 nights a week at his place and they would go out together during the weekends and at night. Ian said that Renae changed her phone number in late 2012/early 2013 so she would not be harassed by Camilla. The incident which had precipitated Renae changing telephone numbers occurred when she and Camilla were with a group of friends at the Casino and Camilla pushed and hit Renae. Renae called Ian who then picked her up from Darling Harbour.⁵⁷ Renae changed her phone number around 20 October 2012⁵⁸.

⁵³ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 pp 52-47

⁵⁴ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 p 41

⁵⁵ Ex 3 Facebook Tab 4 p 39

⁵⁶ Ex 1 Vol 3 Tab 3

⁵⁷ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 14 Statement of Ian Satur Brief of Evidence (BoE)

⁵⁸ Ex 4 Statement of Senior Constable Brett Bell 8 February 2020 – Renae's old phone number xx54044 sim card was used in Camilla's *iPhone 4* from 8 March 2012 -20 October 2012

98. After Renae left Ian to be in a relationship with Brayden in March 2013 she and Ian maintained a friendly communication and shortly after they separated Ian saw Renae and Camila dining together whilst he was at the same restaurant. They did not speak but after she left Renae sent a text to Ian inviting him to catch up at a nearby hotel. He did so but Camila became very upset so she and Renae left shortly afterwards. Renae later told Ian that on the drive home Camila hit Renae on the back of the head and pulled her hair. This occurred on 16 March 2013 and Renae's narrative to Brayden is this:

"I think now camila and I are done for good"

"Ian was there and he came and said hello when we were drinking right so we got up and left then we were dancing and went pockies they walked through and stopped and started playing next to us and we finished and got up and walked out and he was calling me and I ignored him and kept walking and goes if you fucking turn around I'll tell Brayden. Out of everything I was so upset she said something like after she knows everything we've been through so she goes lets go and we were walking then she starts abusing me in the car I ruined everything and the rest of the shit and hit me in the nose and was screaming the whole way home because I typed mar into Facebook and she goes and says Melanie's such a better friend she would never do that. It's at the point I don't feel safe around her. I hate going out with her and I can't do it anymore I said the last time she hits me again I'm done. All she kept saying was your dead I'm going to fucking kill you and gets knocking my head I can't put up with the violence anymore".⁵⁹

99. Renae's relationship with Camila was fraught evidenced by the few telephone extraction reports from Renae's telephone but a letter sent by Renae to Camila for her birthday on 28 March 2013 expresses her gratitude to Camila accepting Renae's relationship with Brayden and Renae hoping that Camila will find someone with equal measure..⁶⁰ In part Renae wrote :

"..there are two things that I am absolutely grateful for and I would always be thank full and grateful for the rest of my life, and that is allowing me and Brayden to start a relationship together, you don't understand babe how much it truly means to me and if it wasn't because of you I wouldn't have met the one person that means more than the world itself to me, and secondly for always being there no matter what happens. I only want the best for you and I hope one day you find your everything and your someone that will mean more than life itself and more than anyone or anything in the world, I'd kill anyone that would hurt you, learn from your mistakes babe especially the last few months but you have pushed you (sic) showing how strong you truly are and I admire you for that...I'll do anything I can to make sure I can give you what I found and make

⁵⁹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 584 text 10390-10389 16 March 2013

⁶⁰ Located in Camila's bedroom during execution of search warrant 23.9.2013

sure that person is your all, it's my life mission to see you happy and my life wont fully be complete until I see the day you have everything you have ever dreamt of...".

100. The telephone records for 23 April 2013 show that they have had (yet another argument) and Camila texts that they need to have a more accepting outlook and understanding of each other's lives and Renae agrees and suggests that they should make a day, a week or every 2 weeks.⁶¹ This situation certainly shows that they were not in a relationship as Camila told the inquest.
101. On 26 April 2013, Camila advises Renae not to do anything to lose Brayden, such as if she didn't know what was going on not to push it, to believe him have some faith in him and if it is too hard to walk away if she loves him and when he is out (of gaol) he will come and get her and for her not to go looking for him as things can go wrong and get worse. Camila warns Renae *"See anything you do can wreck his whole entire case so just leave it for him to work out and shit"*.⁶²
102. Renae was trying to introduce Camila to Jordan in late April early May⁶³. When Jordan didn't work out Brayden told Renae he didn't like him⁶⁴. At the end of May Camila wanted to be introduced to her work colleague Joseph⁶⁵. Renae must have made a comment on Facebook next to a photo saying that he was cute which sparked a tirade by Brayden that she was cheating on him. Renae said she was waiting for Camila to give her a photo to show Joseph.⁶⁶
103. On 17 May 2013 Camila texted Renae *"Mmmmmm your boyfriend's birthday tomorrow how does it feel"* and Renae replied *"Oh yeah goooooood even though I have to give him a kiss through the phone lol"*.
104. On 18 May 2013 Camila sent Renae a text telling her *"when you change the attitude I'll talk to u"* and when she didn't receive a reply a few hours later sent another *"What's your problem your so rude fucken hell"* and the same text again 15 minutes later and Renae replied *"I don't have a problem honestly fkn stop with this shit"*. A couple of hours later Renae sent Camila a text that she couldn't watch soccer because she was going to her siblings' awards but they could go out later^{67, 68}.

⁶¹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 3 Extraction reports p 9 texts 143-141 23 April 2013

Note that it is accepted that due to the phone "scramble" the extract reports at the following tabs are Camila :Tab 2 (5 -26 May 2013 (266 texts)) as "Dianaab 3 (22 April 2013-5 May 2013 (163 texts)) cites the correspondent as "Dad" Tab 4 (5-17 June 2013 (153) texts)) "Unknown 466"

⁶² Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 3 Extraction Reports p 6 texts 100-91 26 April 2013

⁶³ Ex 2 Vol 2 Extraction Reports Tab 3 pp 4-2 texts 54-31 26 April 2013,

Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 300-299 texts 5346-5341 - 1 May 2013; p295 texts 5267-5263 - 2 May 2013 p254 texts 4527-4523 - 9 May 2013,

Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 2 Extraction Reports pp 15-16 text 256-248, 5 May 2013, p12 texts 212-209 13 May 2013, p7 texts 118-105 - 23 May 2013

⁶⁴ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p277 text 4930 - 5 May 2013

⁶⁵ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 2 Extraction Reports p 5-4 text 78- 54 24 May 2013

⁶⁶ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p176 texts 3135-3126 25 May 2013

⁶⁷ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 2 Extraction Reports pp 8-9 text 163-156 17 - 18 May 2013

⁶⁸ Relates to Footnote 132 -18 May was Brayden's birthday

105. On 19 May 2013 Renae and Camila must have gone out because the following morning Renae sent a text to Camila *"Omg my lips is split in two places because of you"* Camila replied later that morning *"Hows work and your fat lip"* which seemed a friendly interchange because Renae replied *"Good thanks sluz how are you"*.⁶⁹ They went out for a quick dinner on 23 May 2013.⁷⁰
106. On 25 May 2013 Renae called Camila and asked to borrow some money and then Camila followed that conversation up with a text *"Can you call me asap please I can loan u 200 but I need it back by next Friday"* and Renae replied *"Stay out of my life for good now don't fukn speak to me like a dog like that"*. Camila replied *"U speak to me so fucken moody and depressed u only call me for money"*. *"Your only nice when u want money I have to say my friends are coming to soccer like I need permission off u"* and Renae told her *"Right that a new one cause I call you all the time when I want money fuk off my life"*. Camila phoned her and when Renae didn't answer she threatened *"Answer or this is going to your parents"* apparently referring to a compromising image.⁷¹ Renae answered the phone and things seemed sorted and the following day Renae took Camila to her soccer game.
107. On 5 June 2013 there must have been another argument because Renae sent Camila a text saying that it was best for both of them at the point where it's going nowhere and wished Camila the best holiday. Camila replied that she would like to see Renae before she went and that Renae could come to soccer and wanted Renae to have time and not be uptight and they had a lot of issues between them. Renae agreed and said she would come to soccer sometimes and she would see Camila before she left.⁷² They didn't give each other much time because there is continuing dialogue over the next couple of days which degraded into more arguing when Camila texted *"How would u feel if I mentioned Brayden in everything"* to which Renae replied *"Camila you always do"*.⁷³ The hurt and angst was about priorities and best friends⁷⁴.
108. On 10 June 2013 Brayden texted Renae *"Remember on 1st of july I wont have my phone for 4 weeks buba"*.⁷⁵ Things calmed down over the ensuing days and Renae agreed to go to soccer on 16 June 2013 and things at soccer went asunder.
109. On 16 June 2013 Melanie Dagher and Renae were at soccer watching Camila play but it appears that they missed seeing Camila score a goal because they were chatting. Camila was extremely hurt and upset and there was a big argument following from which she wouldn't drive Renae home and Renae thought she drove Melanie home. Camila sent Renae a couple of texts *"get fucked u cunt im not even talking to her your both dogs its simple use can get fucked"* *"use can get fucked your*

⁶⁹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 2 Extraction Reports p 9 text 147-145 - 20 May 2013

⁷⁰ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 2 Extraction Reports p text 81-79 -23 May 2013

⁷¹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 2 Extraction Reports p 3 text 48-41- 25 May 2013

⁷² Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 4 Extraction Reports p 3 text 146-141 - 5 June 2013

⁷³ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 4 Extraction Reports, p 5 text 100-94 - 10 June 2013

⁷⁴ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 2 Extraction Reports p 6 text 101 - 9 June 2013

⁷⁵ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab1 Extractraction Reports p 65 text 1140 – 10 June 2013

both cunts "don't come and fuck of the both of use I walked to the car told her to get taxi".⁷⁶

110. Ten minutes later Camila starting texting as Brayden to manipulate and monitor Renae. Brayden had also being playing soccer in gaol⁷⁷:

B *How are u baby*
R *hey boo boo how was soccer how'd you go*
B *Good bub how was your soccer*
R *Good they won 4-1*
R *I got in a horrible argument with the goaly there a horrible team*
B *When did you argue with her from what I can see u and melanie had one with c*
R *I'm here every single game and one game I walked away and talked to Melanie she doesn't talk to me goes home without taking me speaks to me like shit in front of everyone calls Melanie but not me so I'm over it I'm not coming anymore I don't want a friend like that*
B *Renae I can see she tried calling use both 4 times it went through once u no she loves soccer use both do*
R *She called Melanie once Brayden she never called me so don't say she did*
B *I can see it.*
R *Look she wants to treat me like a dog she can get fukd I want nothing to do with her I'm there fukn every game sitting on the side line watching her and one game I don't I get abused so I don't want anything to do with her. Melanie came twice and both times she never watched yet she can take her home and to her so whatever*
B *She didn't she dropped her at meadowbank station I'm reading the msgs so fix it now I'm sick of it*
R *She's a compulsive liar I don't care
What she say to Melanie
Why you looking at her msgs anyway*
B *I was on yours and then hers your all a bunch of liars*
R *wtf
How the fuk am I a liar Brayden fukn how
How tell me how Brayden*
B *Well I can see the calls been made but it didn't go through how's that lying*
R *No I'm a liar Brayden so what did I lie about
I got no calls you want to start saying shit then piss off too I did nothing fukn wrong I get told off then have you telling me I'm a liar*
B *K cya*
R *Nice to see you taking her side again go be with her while your there
There's no need for you to read her msgs unless its for something so have fun*

⁷⁶ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 2 Extraction reports p 3 texts 49-46 13:40-13:42 16 June 2013

⁷⁷ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 34 - 32 text 603 at 13:51 -560 at 20:24 16 June 2013

B *your fucked renae I saw a fight after I fucken told u to let the friendship go you ignored it and look but I can see why she is angry renae you always blame everyone else but yet again u*
R *k*
B *sook*
R *if there was a rude finger if stick it up at you*

2 hours later

R *What are you doing annoying thing
Why do you look at Camila's phone*

1.5 hours later

B *I don't at all I saw use fight and before I got involved I looked
Trust me I don't care what she does*
R *ok then
I love you why do you fight with me*
B *I love you and I don't u take everything wrong*
R *I don't I was upset and you always look at my phone its like you don't trust me at all*
B *I do trust you baby u no I do*
R *promise
I would never hurt you you know that*
B *I no baby I wouldn't ever hurt you how was your day boo*

111. On 17 June 2013 Camila has Brayden counselling Renae some more about Camila.⁷⁸

B *Your the best thing that ever happen to me*
R *no baby were the best think that has ever happened to each other
We define true love we haven't met we haven't held each other we have done anything together yet we love each other more then anything we have a family and were have our life planned*
B *I love u my girl so much*
R *I love you so much my baby boo*
B *Do you like melanie yet? What did use talk about have u fixed things with c?*
R *yeah we have a lot in common actually its good. She was telling me she has a tattoo or her bf and I laughed.
Yeah she is good now*
B *That's good bub c u talk before u judge just take it slow keep our life separate bub*
R *I will don't worry*
B *What's wrong
Anyway why did you go back talking to c*
R *Nothing boo sorry my manager was near me*

⁷⁸ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 31 - 29 text 536 – 505 17 June 2013

She said sorry

B *I know but babe don't rush into it ok please its not stable don't rush or push it I can see a abusive blow up fight*

R *ok ok ok I won't little one*

B *I need to talk to u about life propley babe lol*

R *yeah bub go*
what about

B *U need to start understanding people instead of getting mad and angry*

R *I do I try*
Is that all lol

B *No*

R *ok go*

B *Like u need to have more friends apart from c babe u have to break away from just her*

R *I no have*
Babe

B *I don't want u getting hurt*

R *I won't my boo*

B *How do u no babe she is a loose headed kid*

R *I no I just have to Trudy (typo) her*
I need to trust she wont hurt me

112. On 18 June 2013 Renae tells Brayden she is going to start to break away from Camila and Brayden tells her that he is sick of Renae being upset over Camila and he needs her to make a choice.⁷⁹ This likely marks the beginning of the end of Renae's relationship with Camila but little does she know that it also marks the beginning of the end of her relationship with Brayden. Renae changed to a new phone on 19 June 2013⁸⁰ and the contents of her communications with Camila and Brayden from this point are unknown.

Brayden Spiteri aka Camila Zeidan

113. Around April 2011 Renae told Angus that Camila had a new boyfriend called Brayden. Renae told her mother that Brayden had been Camila's boyfriend and she had introduced Renae to him in a nightclub. Renae told her cousin Stephanie that she had first met Brayden around September 2011. At that time Camila was working in a hair salon where a co-worker had a boyfriend with the surname of Spiteri but his first name was not Brayden.
114. Camila told LSC Robinson that she had met Brayden from a distance in a nightclub called 'The Brewery'. A photograph located in Camila's phone shows Camila with her head on a man's shoulder and they are both smiling at the camera. It was probably taken in a night club. Camila said she did not know who the man was but said Renae

⁷⁹ Ex 2 Vol 1 Extraction Reports p 20 texts 348-340 18 June 2013

⁸⁰ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports, p 19, text 322

chose the photo, edited Camila out of the photograph and sent it to herself as part of the pretence. She also said that Renae had made the collage of photographs found in Renae's car. I do not accept that Renae selected the photo and edited it and sent it to herself. She may have made the collage of photographs but if she did so she has made it from photographs that Brayden sent her or posted on Facebook. Camila's phone contains both the edited and unedited photo⁸¹. Camila was unable to say how the name Brayden Spiteri came about.

115. A Facebook page post of Darren Spiteri was on Camila's *MacBook* and *iPhone 4*⁸². Camila denied knowing who it was and then later said he was the boyfriend of a work colleague at the hair salon she used to work at⁸³. She said that he wasn't related to Brayden.
116. The police have obtained a statement from a man who was located as a result of media coverage of the Inquest. He has identified himself as the person known as Brayden Spiteri. His name is not Brayden Spitiri and he does not know either Camila Zeidan or Renae Marsden. He said that at the time the photograph was taken he used to frequent, amongst other places, the venue known as "The Brewery".⁸⁴
117. Brayden was from a wealthy family and had gone to Kings School.⁸⁵ He claimed to be a builder in high-rise buildings.⁸⁶ By the time Renae became involved with Brayden he was in Goulburn prison being responsible for the death of his friend Richie in a motorcycle accident.
118. Renae told Ian that Brayden had a stepmother who had died, his father lived in Mosman, and he had a brother Michael and a sister. Renae had told Ian that she had met all the family and that she understood Brayden to be very powerful having taken over his father's construction business. Ian thought it difficult to believe but says that Renae was convinced that Brayden existed.⁸⁷ It is unknown whether Renae had told Ian that she had met Brayden's family to deflect criticism of her belief or whether Camila had introduced her to or put forward a family she said that was Brayden's family. This is possible given that on the night Renae died Camila took Teresa to a house which she claimed to be where Brayden's sister lived.
119. Brayden had access to Renae's Facebook and phone passwords⁸⁸ so used her Facebook page. On 28 November 2011 Brayden had a Facebook dialogue with Teresa where he told her that he and Renae had talked about his situation (of being in prison) and they were not going to be together or anything until he is out⁸⁹.

⁸¹ Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab 14 Images 82 and 118.

⁸² Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab 23 (p 24 SEEB)

⁸³ Transcript 12 Feb 20 T47

⁸⁴ Ex 11 Statement of Cameron Lang 18 May 2020

⁸⁵ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 12 Statement of Stephanie Herreen para 26.

⁸⁶ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 12 Statement of Stephanie Herreen attachment of Facebook pages 27/11/12 11:47 am.

⁸⁷ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 14 Statement of Ian Satur para 18

⁸⁸ Vol 1 Extraction Reports p133, Text 2366 Renae gave Brayden her username and passwords to Facebook, Instagram, Also Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction reports p 318 text 5674 -27 April 2013 also on 31.5.13, 9.5.13

⁸⁹ Ex 3 Tab 3 Facebook p10 of 11

120. On 7 December 2011 Teresa wanted to speak with Brayden but Renae was upset and he messaged *“Teresa, its Brayden she is upset cause everyone keeps telling her the obvious that im in jail and it will never work. She had told me what has happened between her and angus and what he did and said to her recently she is everything to me and the last thing I want is to hold her down”*.⁹⁰ *She chose to go through this with me after everything that happened she became my best friend and I have fallen for her and she tells me she feels the same. Teresa I’m a good guy I would never disrespect her, cheat or lie to her she is everything to me and I could make her more than happy”*. Brayden then went on to criticise Angus and reassure Teresa.⁹¹
121. Brayden again used Renae’s Facebook to communicate with Teresa on 26 December 2011 where he was saying that he had heard that Teresa was unhappy with him having a relationship with Renae and wanted to know because a few weeks previously things seemed like they were good and now it’s different.
122. On New Year’ Eve Renae sent Brayden a photograph of her in a red dress she was wearing to go out. He texted back that she should cover up as the dress was too revealing and she better not cheat on him. Throughout the night Renae was bombarded by text messages from Brayden and then Camila sent texts telling Renae that she was upsetting Brayden and she better not cheat on him.⁹² Angus sent Renae a Happy New year message and Renae told Camila. The next morning Brayden texted Renae saying that the relationship was over because she had cheated on him with Angus.⁹³ That night there were Facebook communications with Brayden Renae and Stephanie in which Brayden, amongst other things, lamented about being in jail.
123. Sometimes Angus sent posts to Brayden asking him questions about himself which Brayden answered in vague terms. Angus noted that Brayden’s profile was similar to Camila in that they liked the same hobbies and had the same interests. Brayden’s Facebook was closed after about a month and Brayden would send messages to Angus using Renae’s account.
124. Angus compared the messages he had seen Camila send to Renae with the messages that Brayden was sending him. He says it was immediately obvious to him that they had the same spelling mistakes and the same use of punctuation and grammar. Renae denied any suggestion that Camila was Brayden and would become extremely upset.
125. Angus was well aware that Camila could construct social media communications to misrepresent reality – for example she forwarded messages she claimed she had received from a cousin that had been written by Angus claiming that he was using Renae for sex.⁹⁴ The messages had not been written by Angus and Jamie had not received them nor had she sent them to Camila.⁹⁵

⁹⁰ Ex 3 Tab 3 Facebook p 5-7 of 11

⁹¹ Ibid Tab 3 p 5-1 of 11

⁹² Statement of Stephanie Herreen Vol Tab 12 para 33

⁹³ Statement of Stephanie Herreen Vol Tab 12 para 33

⁹⁴ Statement of Angus Young Vol Tab 13 para 17

⁹⁵ It would appear that Camila had constructed false messages to drive a wedge between Renae and Angus.

126. In February 2012 Brayden sent a photograph of his naked body⁹⁶ to his Facebook friends who were mainly Renae's friends which caused Renae much distress and they argued and Brayden offered to close his Facebook.⁹⁷
127. Like Camila, Brayden would seek to resolve problems by enticing Renae with gifts. On 16 February 2012, after Renae and Brayden had the argument about sending his naked body photograph Renae said that she needed a break. Brayden then sent her a photograph of an expensive watch he wanted to give to Renae. He then suggested she *"show camila tonight and then I'll order it I need to see what one it is and try it on"*.⁹⁸ Renae told him she didn't want a present and he persisted and asked her to go to the shop to look at the watch saying *"im making camila meet you at the castle hill shops"*.⁹⁹ Another time he promised an audi vehicle.
128. Brayden often resorted to using Camila to assist him with Renae which is more apparent in the telephone text messages. In this February conversation he even suggested that Renae have sex with Camila. After the conversation about the photograph Renae commented that she needed to get her anger out and that's (sex) is the best way. Brayden then says *"not with a guy"* and Renae replies *"oh yes with a guy otherwise its pointless"*. Brayden again suggests sex because she is grumpy and Renae says she is hurt not grumpy and Brayden suggest *"Do it with c (Camila)"* and Renae says *"NO"* and then teases him that she will do it with a hot guy and suggests his brother and wants his number and Brayden says he will send it to her when he gets to his cell.¹⁰⁰
129. These communications indicate that Renae was very much of the view that Brayden was not only real but was certainly not Camila.¹⁰¹
130. In April 2012, whilst using Facebook, Teresa 'liked' a post generated by Angus. A short time later, Renae called Teresa in an extremely upset manner stating that Brayden was abusing her because Teresa was still communicating with Angus. Teresa then received a text message from Brayden stating she was *an "unfit mother liking her daughter's ex-boyfriends' posts"* and other derogatory comments.
131. In May 2012, Teresa spoke with Renae stating she did not like Brayden, describing him as rude and arrogant. Renae agreed to end the relationship; however she told her mother that she wanted to remain friends with him.
132. In May 2012 Stephanie Herreen told Renae that she was being stupid not realising that Camila was Brayden. Renae would not accept this. Brayden started sending Stephanie many texts and said that Renae had given him her phone number.¹⁰²

⁹⁶ Cameron Lang was shown a collage of photographs of Brayden found in her car – Mr Lang says the body photographs are not his body and he does not have tattoos.

⁹⁷ Facebook Messages Tab 2 p 66-63

⁹⁸ Facebook Messages Tab 2 p 57-56

⁹⁹ Facebook Messages Tab 2 p 54

¹⁰⁰ Facebook Messages Tab 2 p 48-46

¹⁰¹ As does heterosexual activity such as Facebook Messages Tab 2 p 9 which is however, of itself, not determinative

133. In June 2012 Renae told Stephanie that Brayden might be out of gaol soon and Stephanie told her that he was not real but Renae insisted that he was. In August Renae had also told their cousin that Brayden was out and she had had coffee with him. When Stephanie asked Renae about this Renae told her that he was still in prison and she had just said that so that when he was actually released she could say that she had been with him in person for a longer time to reassure her parents.¹⁰³
134. In October 2012 Renae and Ian went to an awards night and Renae took a photograph of herself in their hotel room wearing a new dress. She posted it on Facebook and Brayden noticed Ian's shoes in the photo. He sent her abusive messages accusing Renae of cheating on him.¹⁰⁴ Prior to that event he had sent abusive messages to Ian to "*stay the fuck away from Renae*".¹⁰⁵ While Ian and Renae were at a staff Christmas function from which they planned to go to the Casino Ian received a text message from Brayden "*You better be careful, I'll be at the casino tonight watching you*".¹⁰⁶
135. Though Renae left Ian to be with Brayden in March 2013, text messages indicate that it was far from easy. The first week or so in March they argued because Brayden was communicating with Stephanie about Angus which antagonised Renae, then there is a loving period until an argument over Brayden deciding he didn't want to run his own business when he was released from prison and when Renae was angry at that he abused her as money grabbing and greedy. Usually the resolutions arrive with Renae being apologetic and soothing.
136. On 15 March 2013 Renae showed Brayden some paint work she had done and he responded sarcastically. They had an argument which involved her telling him off for not being supportive and then on 16 March things were fine and he asked her if she was going out and she said she was going out with Camila and she asked him if it was alright if they went to the Albion Hotel because he had said he didn't like her going there. He said it was fine and wanted her to have fun.¹⁰⁷ That night was when Ian was at the same venue and Renae told Brayden that Camila had been violent. Brayden's reaction was to tell Renae:

*"Now listen don't bad mouth anyone renae don't u dare talk to martin at all even if u see him around don't u dare don't contact ian and your not to see camila at all anymore"*¹⁰⁸. Brayden told renae to still wish Camila a happy birthday "*but don't go at all on that night renae I don't trust her anger*". He continued "*look babe I understand because I'm not having her one day just snap and if use do fight at her birthday I can see u getting beyond hurt I don't want u around that at all anymore ok but u do have to wish her a happy*

¹⁰² Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 12 Statement of Stephanie Herreen para 38

¹⁰³ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 12 Statement of Stephanie Herreen para 39

¹⁰⁴ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 12 Statement of Stephanie Herreen para 44.

¹⁰⁵ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 14 Statement of Ian Satur para 16

¹⁰⁶ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 14 Statement of Ian Satur para 17

¹⁰⁷ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 592-587 texts 10528-10442 -15-16 March 2013

¹⁰⁸ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction reports p 584-583 text 10390-10371 16 March 2013

birthday on her birthday at least and dont go talking to martin and tell me now has ian msged u?"

Renaë replied

*"That's what I'm scared of I've been at the end of her fist before I'm not going through it again. I will wish her a happy birthday don't worry I have the respect of that. He hasn't msged me he wouldn't baby I will tell you ok babe"*¹⁰⁹

137. The following day Brayden started blaming Ian and being concerned that Renaë's friendship with Camila had ended because of Ian and Renaë responded not to worry because the friendship had been rocky for years.¹¹⁰ Then the conversation collapsed into Brayden saying he hated Ian. Then Brayden counselled Renaë that she should take Camila out for dinner for her birthday and she is young and a good kid and then suggested Renaë not tell her mother about the incident.¹¹¹ On 22 March after Renaë told Brayden about the presents she bought Camila for her birthday they had phone sex. On 30 March Renaë went out to Camila's birthday party and was counselled by Brayden how to behave.¹¹²

138. On 23 March 2013 Brayden told Renaë he would know when court was in a few weeks. Three days later he tells her he has a meeting to talk about the options and that she had to support him when he chooses the option.¹¹³

*"Umm yeah like 1 is I can move cells and ill have nothing til I'm out or I can do have no phone for all of july and get it back after a month move cells and come back and then a few month and be out? Which one".*¹¹⁴ Renaë asks Brayden *"While youre in the meeting with your lawyer now can you ask him if he can ring me while youre there and explain the options you have please because I don't understand".* Brayden says he will explain it and says *"If I give my phone to the lawyer for a month ill be out sooner or I give my phone and move cells for a while and I don't no when I get out get it".*

139. Renaë tells him whatever option gets him home the sooner and then he reminds her that he has still got his court case and it's not until then so he is selecting that.¹¹⁵

140. Camila had to manage difficulties that would arise such as Renaë wanting to send a gift to Brayden for his birthday¹¹⁶. Brayden told Renaë to save the present until he

¹⁰⁹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 582 text 10350-10349 17 March 2013

¹¹⁰ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 577-576 text 10259-10245 17 March 2013

¹¹¹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 573 text 10203-10188- 18 March 2013

¹¹² Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 481 texts 8555-8481 30-31 March 2013

¹¹³ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 512 text 90904-9046 - 26 March 2013;p 498 texts 8847-8843 -27 March 2013

¹¹⁴ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 493 texts 8754 28 March 2013

¹¹⁵ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 493- 488 texts 8753-8672 28-29 March 2013

¹¹⁶ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p560-559 texts 9953-9946 19 March 2013

was released. Renae told him it was something he could use in there but he said he warned her that he would say no especially now that he would be going back to court soon.¹¹⁷

141. On 4 April 2013 they were fighting again centring around Camila and her ignoring Renae, texting Melanie after Renae posted a like on Talei's Facebook page. Brayden counselled Renae about not being jealous. There was more counselling on 7 April which involved Brayden supporting Camila and not Renae which led to an argument and when he suggested that she fight to save Camila's friendship she said that she no longer had the strength and would rather let it go and move on.¹¹⁸ The very next day the friendship is back on track because Camila has apologised.¹¹⁹
142. On 5 April Brayden tells Renae he is going to see his surgeon in the following week. The message seemed to go unnoticed.
143. Brayden referred to being in prison as part of his routine texts, for example *"Training is tonight and then on sat and we have lock down on Sunday again"*. He explained that the lockdown was due to someone being caught. Renae responded it was important that he didn't talk on the phone in case he got caught.¹²⁰
144. When Renae was away in mid-April during another argument he told her *"your so tied up on my past and exs I don't even no what I want anymore with u this way everything is about what I done with them I was fucken out of jail renae I'm in jail now u chose to wait so get over for fucks sake"*. Renae wrote very long texts and Brayden would try and placate her by saying things like *"I love you"* and *"I need time just you and me"*.¹²¹ The arguing continued for 5 continuous days until on 18 April 2013 when Renae said that *"I can't do anything anymore I have never left in me to keep being in a relationship with you"* *"I'm sick of you swearing at me I'm sick of it your just an arrogant asshole I cant take it anymore"* and then there must have been a Facebook interaction which put it back on track¹²².
145. On 16 April Brayden complained that the relationship wasn't the same because Renae cheated on him (with Ian).¹²³ Renae told him that she should have left the week before and she said she was not running back anymore but he should remember what she had done for him *"yeah I cheated on you but who fkn stayed throughout this shit with you who has waited hours on end for you none of your fukn family or friends I did I fukn waited for you who ran for your fkn credit"*¹²⁴
146. Brayden must have asked Renae to marry him because after he said *"I do want every the same (as he wants) but its just the way it is like I just feel we need to focus on us and I before we go back to everything"* and Renae replied *"Then don't fukn ask"*

¹¹⁷ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 557 texts 9908-9893 20 March 2013

¹¹⁸ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 431-438 7 April 2013

¹¹⁹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 436 8 April 2013

¹²⁰ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 640 texts 11386-11374 5 March 2013

¹²¹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 410- text 7274 13- April 2013

¹²² Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 395-378 texts 7029-6751- 16-18 April 2013

¹²³ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 392 text 6984 – 16 April 2013

¹²⁴ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 391 text 6968 – 16 April 2013

a girl to marry you” “You don’t want it Brayden stop kidding yourself you do because you don’t”. Brayden replied “I do want to marry u renae but I’m saying like I think we need us first”¹²⁵

147. Renae tells Brayden how much she has done for him and loves him and it is an insight to how she clearly believes him to be a real person and that he is not a fictitious character she and Camila created so they could be together:

*“I fight for you Brayden through court, through meetings, when they hurt you I stayed by your side talking to you, every situation we’ve been through I’ve been there and not once have I complained. Brayden you will never get it because you’re a male but to a girl finding that perfect someone is everything and I found that with you I truly thought you were everything and I could never let you go I saw my future with you and I was going to do whatever it took to give it to you. Just sit there and imagine this man that was your everything that you’d do anything for ask you to marry him then on top of that he wanted to be the father of your child and you talked about it everyday then you make the worst mistake of your life and fuk up. That I would have taken my life for if you left I hate myself for what I did to you and all you can do is bring it up as your back up. Then after everything he forgives you and you try and try to get the man you love so much to want the same things again and he doesn’t what would you do”.*¹²⁶

148. Renae continues about how Brayden treats her badly and how upset she is and Brayden tells her how much he loves her, that he sees how he can be a dickhead because he gets frustrated at comments she makes but that he wants everything with her. Renae tells him “...You always say you love me but actions speak louder than words brayden. You no sometimes I ask for simple things and its like you don’t want me to have it or know. Its simple things like letting me see your storage to your lawyer calling me I always feel you have an excuse no matter what I ask. I have nothing of you Brayden seeing a car of your would make me feel so much closer to you but I feel like you just hide things from me” “I never have an excuse for your credit or when you needed me to be friends with camila because you needed her for court I did but you just cant let me in when I ask for simple things its not fair”¹²⁷

149. Brayden responded that he would let her (have the key to the storage) but he can’t because he doesn’t have the key and it’s a big process. He can’t explain why and Renae says “Forget it honestly. You have never explained it to me Brayden I only get it’s a big process my lawyer has the keys that it”.¹²⁸

150. Brayden asks why does she care and she explains it would make her feel closer to him and he responds sarcastically and Renae complains “Fuck I’ve spent thousands

¹²⁵ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 391 text 6962-6958 – 16 April 2013

¹²⁶ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 390 text 6951 – 16 April 2013

¹²⁷ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 390 text 6947-6946 – 16 April 2013

¹²⁸ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 389 text 6924 – 16 April 2013

*on your credit bought you a new phone when yours didn't work but it's a problem for you to give me a key isn't it*¹²⁹

151. On 17 April 2013 Brayden tells Renae he is not okay because she had broken his heart and he has broken hers but she keeps attacking him. Renae tells him she isn't attacking him but asking him to make an effort, to see what she has done for him and that she had asked for one simple thing. *"...I asked you for one simple thing a key, not money, not to escape jail, nothing but a key just..."**Brayden I have nothing of you absolutely nothing. I cant even get a photo off you anymore. Its hard for me Brayden ok its killing me. I told you before I don't need anyone with me I want to go by myself just to touch something your have or see? "It would mean more then the world to me just that once to go"*¹³⁰
152. Brayden tells Renae he will take her when he gets out and she persists so then he tells her that he is going to sell it all and she can shut up about it and then he accuses her that she has changed into a *materialistic bitch*¹³¹ which starts another day of arguing with Renae responding that the only thing she would take off him is a ring.¹³²
153. On 18 April 2013 things had calmed down and each declared their love and commitment and on 19 April Renae texted that she wanted to go with Brayden to New York for her birthday and that he would have to fill out a form be interviewed and wait a few weeks and they'll be able to go, he told her that she could go without him but that he would try.¹³³
154. On 22 April 2013 Renae told Brayden that he doesn't say things to make her feel beautiful that his response to photos is "sexy" and that she has tried to change to please him. He commented that she is always complaining and she tells him that she is telling him everything and he just pushes her away. His response is *"Ok that's why u fucked lan"*. The argument resulted in Brayden berating Renae about her jealousies and blaming people particularly Camila and her friends. Renae said the relationship was over and that her mother had arranged for Camila to come over and talk with her after Camila's visit when the communication between Brayden and Renae it was kind and loving again.¹³⁴
155. On 23 April Brayden complained that his phone was no good and Renae offered him her blackberry and she would get his fixed and that she would get him a new sim card. She mentioned that she charged her blackberry and the messages they exchanged when he went for his operation were on there and it was funny to read back on them. She wanted to get Brayden a new sim card because she doesn't want it in Camila's name and when she said she would get it to him or his lawyer Brayden

¹²⁹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 388 text 6906– 16 April 2013

¹³⁰ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 387 text 6893– 6892 17 April 2013

¹³¹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 386 text 6872 - 17 April 2013

¹³² Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 381 text 6805 - 18 April 2013

¹³³ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 369 text 6584-6578 - 20 April 2013

¹³⁴ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 357-351 text 6378 -6270 22 April 2013

told her he doesn't know where the lawyer lives nor where he works from. Renae questioned how that could be because he had been in meetings with the lawyer and another argument ensued when Brayden said *"Wtf you fuck where the fuck r u and who the fuck r u to question what my meetings are about and fucken who with?"* and after Renae said that she had enough he wrote *"I love you renae you changed my life from day 1 I no there has been hard times fucked times and mean times I adore u and your so beautiful in everyway I miss u I love u so much renae without fail everyday"*. Renae told him that she would not be coming back unless he changed.¹³⁵

156. The following day, 25 April 2013, Brayden asked Renae if Michael hated Camila after Sunday, suggested Renae set her up with her cousin Joseph but when Renae told him that he was with someone he then suggested she set Camila up with Jordan.¹³⁶
157. On 26 April 2013, Renae told Brayden about her plans to study medicine at Sydney University and because she needed to make plans again told Brayden that she needed to speak with his lawyer and when he told her to leave it alone she said she wanted to know the truth about everything and that until he gave her the lawyers details she wouldn't speak with him. She wanted to know why he didn't have a date of release. He explained that because of what his lawyer Pat did his case wasn't closed and Brayden used Pat's card because Pat owed his family money and Brayden is not ready to face what is in the storage unit yet and he doesn't have the keys and that the first set (deal) he took was that he wouldn't be seen (visits) until he got out. He wanted her to stop questioning him, to have faith in him and compared to how she hated him questioning her about Ian and so he stopped and had faith and belief in her.¹³⁷
158. Renae asked Brayden if Richie's father spoke to him and Brayden said that Richie's parents hated him and Renae told him that she wanted to get him to a point he could speak about him to anyone and feel comfortable and he would remember good memories and not what happened. Brayden thanked her for her help and that he needed to start with tiny steps. Renae told him she was not abandoning him and promised to do everything she could and she wouldn't break that promise.¹³⁸
159. On 28 April 2013 Renae told Brayden there was a 60 minutes show about prisoners hiding their mobile phones behind tiles and that he should be careful and he told her he kept the phone on him and not to be worry¹³⁹. On 13 May 2013 Brayden told her he might not be able to reply much because *"just got guards all over"*¹⁴⁰
160. In early May Renae was stressed about money and finding a job and on 8 May she secured a position. 15 May 2013 Renae complained to Brayden that he was using too much data on his phone as she had to pay each week to put credit on her sim

¹³⁵ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 345-339 text 6151-6041 - 24 April 2013

¹³⁶ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 345-339 text 6022-5959, pp332 text 5933-5919 - 25 April 2013

¹³⁷ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 327-325 text 5859—5775 – 26 April 2013

¹³⁸ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 322-321 text 5742-5722 26 April 2013

¹³⁹ Ex 2 Vol 2 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 312-313 text 5562-5549,- 28 April 2013

¹⁴⁰ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 241 text 4295

card. She told him that she would get a new sim card and it would be in her name and not Camila's.

161. On 10 May 2013 Renae asked Brayden where his mother's grave was so she could put flowers on it from both of them for mothers' day. He said he didn't know anything about why she didn't have a grave and thanked her but didn't want to speak about his family.¹⁴¹
162. On 18 May 2013 it was Brayden's birthday and after a week of getting on very well Brayden and Renae started arguing on 19 May 2013 after Renae said he was being blunt and distant.¹⁴² By the end of the day Brayden asked if Renae about the messages and videos he sent. He explained that what he said was that his phone reset and he lost *"the videos photos and contacts and everything"*.¹⁴³
163. On 21 May 2013 there was a lot of adoration and Brayden texted *"We will have the best wedding baby I'll make u happy baby I'll do whatever u want just for u and I want u to be mine forever and be mine for the rest of my life I want to be your husband and u be my wife I adore u"*.¹⁴⁴
164. On 23 May 2013 Brayden had been monitoring Renae's Facebook and had seen a communication with a man called Nick and Renae told him that he was just a friend and she has friends both male and female, which resulted in Brayden bringing up Ian. Brayden told her that he was worried they might sweet talk her into something and he doesn't want to lose her because she can see them and talk to them and she might forget him. Renae reassured him that it would not happen but the argument went on all day.¹⁴⁵
165. When Renae talked to Brayden about not being paid for another couple of weeks and owing money he was unsupportive and said *"Renae u say u cant live I've asked u not to talk like that Richie never had a god damn choice" "Think about things u say"* When Renae told him *"Brayden there is nothing you can do its wasn't your fault you need to let him go and stop blaming yourself" "I was upset and needed you but that what you think about"* Brayden replied *"Because I killed someone who never wanted that over stupidity we have a choice how to work life"*.¹⁴⁶
166. Brayden later asked Renae if there was someone else she wanted to be with because she seemed to not care about letting them go all of a sudden. She reassured him that there was not and he replied *"Goodbye I new u had someone"*. An argument began about Brayden's jealousies and control and tracking Renae and not wanting her to go the gym or have male friends ending with Renae telling him that Camila had asked her to set her up with her work colleague Joseph.¹⁴⁷

¹⁴¹ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp252-251 texts 4486-4475 – 10 May 2013

¹⁴² This coincides with Renae having told Camila she was not able to watch soccer –see footnote 62.

¹⁴³ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 209-208 texts 3713-3708 – 20 May 2013

¹⁴⁴ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 200 texts 3559 – 21 May 2013

¹⁴⁵ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p195-192 texts 3459-3415- 23 May 2013; pp187-186 texts 3326-3266- 24 May 2013

¹⁴⁶ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 181-180 texts 3216-3210 – 25 May 2013

¹⁴⁷ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 180 texts 3203-3127 – 25 May 2013

167. Things were good for a couple of days until Renae went to the gym but told Brayden she hadn't and he accused her of lying because he had been tracking her phone and knew she had left the house. He denied tracking the phone but said their relationship was over because she had lied to him. The argument went for 2 days with Brayden accusing Renae and wanting her not to socialise with any work colleagues. Reading the exchange, like most of their hostile exchanges, is a crazy moving landscape of bitter control and manipulation and this one had Renae apologising in appeasement.¹⁴⁸
168. May ended and June began on an even keel with Brayden counselling Renae about giving money back to Camila and knowing that Camila would have her friends at soccer. He told her when she gave her the money to not be rude or give her any reason to get mad. Renae kept in touch with him and told him how it went. Brayden told Renae he didn't want her going to the gym¹⁴⁹
169. Over the following 5 days there were happy loving exchanges and then it reached a new low on 11 June after Renae expressed some disappointment about her hair and having spent quite a bit of money on the hairdresser, but it was mainly related to how she felt after visiting with her biological father. Brayden had told her not to waste her money and Renae said "*go help sima*" which set him off into a tirade of abuse.¹⁵⁰
170. Renae told him that she didn't want to marry him anymore¹⁵¹. On 12 June 2013 Renae sent Brayden a text setting out eight changes she wanted him to make and he replied that the changes he wanted her to make were "*to stop hanging round joe and other guys on your own u need to be loyal u need to understand what I'm saying as well*"¹⁵²
171. The extraction records terminate on 19 June 2013 and the last week is marked by love and respect and only marred by the incident involving 16 June 2013 and the upset when Camila saw that Renae and Melanie were not watching when she scored her goal. The arrangements for the month when Brayden had to hand his phone in or change cells was not further discussed and it is likely that issue was finalised in the text messages on Renae's new phone.
172. Call Charge Records show that Brayden's last texts to Renae were on 1 July and then recommenced on 5 August 2013. Renae kept sending him texts every day and she sent text messages to Camila as well. The last text was in the morning of 4 July when Camila travelled to U.S.A.

Renae ends her relationship with Camila

¹⁴⁸ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports pp 160-147 texts 2847-2604 27-29 May 2013

¹⁴⁹ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 100 text 1750 –1739 5 June 2013

¹⁵⁰ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 60 text 1077 - 11 June 2013

¹⁵¹ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p58 text 1026 - 11 June 2013

¹⁵² Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p57 text 1008 – 1004 12 June 2013

173. Whilst Camila was away Renae told her mother that she messaged Camila that their friendship was “over once and for all”. Renae told Teresa that she had “put up with Camila’s abuse for too long” and that she was “frightened of her” because she was “violent and abusive”. Renae said Camila had “punched her, pulled her hair and had attempted to take the steering wheel off her whilst she was driving on several occasions”. These complaints are consistent with what Renae had told her cousin Stephanie, Angus, Ian and indeed, Brayden..
174. A letter handwritten by Renae to Brayden dated 22 July 2013 was located in Renae’s bedroom in which she told him “...I can tell you, I have finally let Camila go for good and I feel so much better about it now which is even better...”
175. Telephone records show that on 27 July 2013 Renae sent a text message to Camila¹⁵³ the contents of which are unknown and remain unknown as Camila claimed to the inquest that she could not recollect receiving a message. It is likely that the message was consistent with finally letting Camila go given that after Camila returned to Sydney on 29 July 2013 she did not contact Renae and Renae did not contact her.
176. Telephone records show that on 3 August 2013 Brayden’s phone engaged data usage which indicates that Camila probably opened the phone and read all the text messages Renae had sent him since 1 July 2013. Brayden did not send any messages to Renae. Camila had used her *iPhone* whilst in USA. This phone had also been used by Renae in 2012. Camila wiped the *iPhone* and her *Samsung* that or a later day.
177. On the 4 August 2013, Teresa asked Renae whether she would watch her soccer match. Camila played on Teresa’s soccer team and Renae replied she would never go to another game unless her mother made it to the grand final as she did not want to see Camila. Camila played soccer and hurt her knee. It is likely she also hurt her pride when she noticed Renae was not at the soccer game.

The Events of 5 August 2013

178. On 5 August 2013 Renae left home at 7am and went to work. She sent a text to Brayden at 7.34 am.¹⁵⁴ About 10:30 a.m Joseph Abbate, a Star Track employee, attended the reception area. He spoke with Renae who stated that she hadn’t heard from Brayden in just over a month and said that she was going to call Goulburn jail to speak with him. She told Joseph that she had been texting Brayden “everyday” without having received a response. She and Joseph arranged to meet for lunch at 1pm.
179. At 11:36:54 Camila sent Renae a text and Renae replied at 11:37:31. Shortly after Renae asked Joseph for \$30 to put credit on her telephone and at 12:05 pm she sent an email to Joseph Abbate thanking him. It is likely that Camila was telling Renae

¹⁵³ Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab 2 Renae’s Call Charge Records p14 of 19

¹⁵⁴ Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab 2 Renae’s Call Charge Records p14 of 19

that she had been contacted by Brayden and he needed credit to message with Renae. If Renae responded in a dismissive manner this would have reinforced to Camila that Renae was serious about not wanting to be friends.

180. At 11:53:37 Renae sent a text to Brayden and he replied at 11:53:39 and they sent a number of text messages to each other until 12:03:08. At 12:05 pm Renae sent another email to Joseph stating that she was upset because Brayden was being “blunt”.
181. More text messages were sent between Brayden and Renae between 12:28:43 and 13:31:31. Around 1pm, Joseph and Renae met and walked to a coffee shop. During the walk, Renae received a text message. She was upset and crying. Renae was shaking and handed the phone to Joseph who read, “*I think I need a break and so do you*”. Joseph said Renae became even more upset and continued to send text messages between 13:18:47 and 13:31:31. Brayden did not reply.
182. Though what was said between Renae and Brayden on 5 August 2013 is only known by Camila Zeidan, an insight into Camila’s mood and tone at the time is evident in Bradyen’s communication to Renae’s mother Teresa. After Renae had telephoned Goulburn prison she texted Brayden and he replied after which Renae sent up to 9¹⁵⁵ text messages over the next 5 minutes none of which Brayden answered. Rather he messaged Teresa and this is the conversation the first message being at 3.15 pm and the last at 3.27 pm:
- 14:59 B *Sort your daughter out threatening to kill herself*
Brayden texts Renae
T *Please explain to me why a young woman would want to kill herself*
????
- 15:11 B *Ask her yourself*
- 15:12 Brayden texts Renae
- 15:13 B *Maybe explain to me why you never got her help last time*
T *Have you ever thought that you are the problem. Seems like it all*
comes back to your feet. I got her help looks like...
- 15:15 B *I’m the problem am I? Have u ever thought u have neglected her*
when she clearly needs help
T *If there really is a GOD out there he will answer my prayers, time will*
tell
- 15:20 B *he only answers people that are genuine*
T *Clearly that’s why you are there and I am here*
- 15:27 B *Yeah exactly and that’s why he hasn’t answered your prayers*
- 15:28 B *I no I’m not a good person but I must be something if your daughter*
loves me
- 15:29 Brayden texted Renae and she responded but he did not reply..

¹⁵⁵ Could include some lengthy texts rather than nine short texts.

183. At 4.40 pm Renae sent a further text message to Brayden but he did not reply to that either. She then drove to Watsons Bay arriving there at about 5.20 pm.
184. CCTV footage shows Renae at The Gap when she sent a text message to Brayden at 5.22 pm. Renae walked around the area and sat down on the brick wall of the gun turret. She sent Brayden up to five more texts and he sent her a text at 17:46:23. Renae sent up to 3 more texts to Brayden but he did not reply.
185. Renae sent a text to Camila at 17:48:47. Renae sent a loving text to her mother Teresa at 17:48-17:49. At 5:51pm Renae climbed over the fence at Jacob's ladder and looked over the edge. Whilst sitting there Renae received a text from Brayden and responded to it at 17:52. Brayden did not reply. CCTV shows Renae throw her telephone over the cliff at 5:54 pm and she moved further down the cliff and slipped away. The final text Camila sent as Brayden to Renae was at 17:55:45 by which time Renae was gone. Telephone records indicate that Renae's telephone stopped at 5.58 pm.

Camila's lies following Renae's death

186. The pain Renae's death has caused her family is amplified by the suffering of not knowing what was said between Camila as Brayden and Renae. However, Camila Zeidan came to the inquest and lied claiming she could not remember and did not know what the communications were on 5 August 2013. Camila's lack of co-operation and preparedness to assist the inquest has been a further torment to the family's suffering.
187. In her evidence Camila claimed that she could not say when she read the message from Renae. Whether it was while she was texting as Brayden or later. She then said she did not get the message at that time.
188. However, though Camila didn't call Renae, she had sent Renae the text message as Brayden at 17.51.56, Renae replied and Camila again sent a text as Brayden to Renae at 17:55:45 by which time the phone was over the cliff.
189. Brayden sent another text a couple of minutes later at 5.55.46 pm which coincides with CCTV footage of Renae disappearing from the cliff face at 5.56 pm.¹⁵⁶

Camila's Lies

190. Camila lied to Teresa that she hadn't heard from Renae other than "*she messaged me a while ago is everything okay*". She lied that Renae may be at Brayden's sister's house taking Teresa there to see if the car was outside. She lied to Teresa on 6 August that the reasons why Renae took her own life were because she was unhappy at home. Camila told the inquest that after she told Renae that she didn't want to do it anymore (be Brayden) Renae said she didn't know what her purpose

¹⁵⁶ Ex 1 Vol 1, Tab 14 This is the last footage of Renae timed 5.56 pm. Senior Constable Stone viewed the next 13 hours of CCTV footage to establish that Renae did not reappear from that location

was; like “I get let down” she didn’t know where she belonged she just felt like nothing was working for her. If that is true, that it not about her being unhappy at home.

191. Camila lied to Teresa on 7 August 2013 when she said Brayden had spoken with her on the Monday night that Renae died. This lie was whilst Teresa, Mark, Camila and Stephanie were sitting around the kitchen table, Teresa texted Brayden asking if he knew where Renae was and that he needs to talk and give answers to them. Camila said *“It is not Brayden’s fault. He is hurting as well”*. Mark asked Camila how she knew that and she replied that the night Renae went missing Brayden had called her from a private number. She said that he wouldn’t speak to anyone because everyone was blaming him.
192. On 25 August 2013 Camila told Leading Senior Constable Georgina Robinson that in the morning of 5 August she received a phone call from Renae stating that Brayden had no credit and Camila replied “Hey whatever” and hung up¹⁵⁷. In fact, it was Camila who texted Renae to put the credit on.
193. Camila told Leading Senior Constable Robinson that the next time she received a text message was when she received a text from Teresa who stated *“have you heard from Renae?”* and *“Is everything alright?”*¹⁵⁸ Camila did not tell LSC Robinson what she had told Teresa: that Renae had *“she messaged me a while ago...”*. This means that by the time Teresa had called, Camila had seen Renae’s text which shows that she lied to Leading Senior Constable Robinson giving her the impression that it was only Teresa’s text which alerted her to Renae.
194. Camila said in the inquest that she didn’t know that Renae was at Watsons Bay or that she was serious. She said she didn’t know whether she received the 5:47 text when she was still texting as Brayden or whether it was later. Telephone records show that Camila used her phone to speak with Melanie Dagher at 5.30-5.38 pm and sent a text to Fay at 6.03 pm¹⁵⁹ so she had both phones with her and she must have seen Renae’s text at least when she texted Fay which is more consistent with her reply to Teresa *“she messaged me a while ago why is everything ok?”*.
195. In Facebook messages written after Renae’s death Camila posted *“...she messaged me saying id always be her bestfriend and everything and I went to call and her phone was off I want to believe she has taken off and she is ok but im not sure if that’s the truth”*¹⁶⁰. Claiming that she went to call Renae when she received the message is a lie. The only time Camila went to call Renae was 5 minutes after she had replied to Teresa. In the hospital notes it is recorded she said that she received the message but did not understand it to be a goodbye message. This is difficult to accept given the exchanges that had occurred with Renae as Brayden and with her knowledge about how much Brayden meant to Renae.

¹⁵⁷ Telephone records indicate that it was Camila who texted Renae first at 11:36:54 and Renae replied at 11:37:31 which led to Renae borrowing \$30 to place credit on Brayden’s phone.

¹⁵⁸ Ex 1 Vol 1, Tab 3 Statement of Leading Senior Constable Georgina Robinson para 35

¹⁵⁹ Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab 1 Call Charge Records 18:03:17 and Ex 2A Extraction Report text 3927

¹⁶⁰ Ex 1 Vol 1, Tab 3 Statement of Leading Senior Constable Georgina Robinson attachment p 8

196. The only reason I accept that Renae sent the message as Camila claims is not because I believe Camila, but because Renae likely did send a loving message to her friend because she had no idea that Camila was the very person who had Catfished her for 20 months.
197. Camila failed to tell LSC Robinson that she had been communicating with Renae all afternoon as Brayden. She failed to tell her what the conversations were. Likewise she has failed to tell the inquest what those conversations were other than that as far as she could remember Renae was saying that *“she didn’t find a purpose in life”* and that she said that several times before Camila as Brayden texted Teresa to *“sort your daughter out”*. Camila claims to have no recollection of any of the content on what was said by Renae and Brayden after texting Teresa.
198. Camila lied to LSC Robinson by maintaining that Brayden was a real person, providing a description of him and that she had met him the once at the Brewery Club on a date she could not recall.
199. She lied when she said that she only had the one mobile phone and that she didn’t know Brayden’s phone number because it was on the phone which was broken which her dad was getting fixed.
200. She said she never texted Brayden. Camila might not have texted Brayden but she Facebook messaged him to entice Renae into a conversation with her. So the suggestion she barely knew him and had no contact him was a lie.
201. Leading Senior Constable Georgina Robinson asked Camila her if she was Brayden?” and Camila lied to her saying *“No, I know that a lot of people think I am, everyone is against me...”*
202. On 23 September 2013 at the conclusion of the search of Camila’s bedroom she was sitting on the couch and Senior Constable Walker-Lear introduced herself and said to Camila: *“Is there anything you want to talk to me about? I am happy to listen”*. Camila then said to her *“I was sending the text messages to Renae before I left for America in March... Renae asked me to. She wanted me to pretend that I was Brayden”*. Senior Constable Walker-Lear asked her why would Renae want her to pretend to be Brayden and Camila replied *“I don’t know. I just did it because she wanted me to. I didn’t do anything else. What’s going to happen to me”*? Senior Constable Walker-Lear replied *“At this stage Camila we are just interested in finding out what has happened to Renae”*.¹⁶¹
203. Camila’s remarks to Senior Constable Walker-Lear were also lies. She had been Brayden since at least November 2011 and continued after she returned from her trip to America (which was in July not March).

¹⁶¹ Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 2 Statement of Senior Constable Sarah Walker-Lear dated 9 November 2013 para 9

204. It was a lie that Renee had asked her to be Brayden in March or at any time. It was in March that Renae had ended her relationship with Ian having chosen to be with Brayden. As Renae told her friend Ms Ryan she wouldn't have left Ian if she didn't think Brayden was real.
205. Camila's claim to Senior Constable Walker-Lear that all she did was send texts as Brayden is a lie. As Brayden she engaged in Facebook messaging, sent Renae gifts and sent texts to numerous people including Renae's mother, her biological father and other family members as well as threatened numerous people, particularly those involved in romantic relationships with Renae. She received texts from Renae which included sexual images. As Brayden she sent a photo, flowers, cards and other gifts.
206. Camila told the inquest that she and Renae created the character Brayden together so they could be together which is different to her telling LSC Robinson that Renae wanted to buy Brayden a sim card for his mobile phone so he was able to stay in touch with Renae. Camila's explanation that the sim card was registered to her was due to Renae not having identification was also a lie because identification is not required to purchase the prepaid sim card. The true reason why the sim card was in Camila's name was because it was she and she alone who had organised the phone. Renae told Teresa that Camila had organised a phone to be given to Brayden while he was in prison.
207. Renae had well moved on from Camila at High School. Renae did not want to be with Camila. Camila knew that. Camila was always testing Renae's loyalty. Teresa describes in her statement that in November 2012 Renae said that Camila had gone "psycho" at the Marsden home, saying that Renae would spend all her time with Brayden when he got out of prison. Teresa counselled Camila and the argument resolved with Renae reassuring Camila that she would still be her friend when Brayden was released.¹⁶²
208. Camila remained resolute throughout her evidence that Renae was complicit in the character role play from beginning to end. When evidence disproving this claim was put to her she did not change her position. She denied creating the character to hurt Renae and she denied creating the character to control Renae or to ensure that Renae was not in a relationship with anyone else.
209. On 6 August 2013 Camila sent a text message to Teresa;
- "Renae has always been like this its not braydens fault we cant blame one person apparently they didn't fight she said to him that no one accepts him and that they love each other in a situation like this we cant blame anyone she always said she hated being at home before she met Brayden and after she always said she would do this for many different reasons he is hurting as well im sure just like all us all but there is never one person to blame I cant handle this because I cant live without renae we fight but we have always had a love hate relationship we always came out being friends I don't want to no the outcome because I cant cope at all".*

¹⁶² Ex 1 Vol 1 Tab 9 Statement of Teresa Marsden para 34-36.

Teresa asked whether Renae complained to Camila and this was the reply:

“About home yes. Renae promised me she would never do anything like this and yes she always did complain about home she wanted to move out and she always said that mark would abuse the kids or u and she couldn’t handle it truth is it was never about one person it didn’t have anything to do with Brayden I think renae was just a upset person to be honest she did similar to this at school She always felt like everyone was against her from school she pulled herself away from people Brayden begged her to go out all the time and she always had a (sic) excuse he just stopped liking me because she would complain to him about me like she did about everyone else and he was upset for her”¹⁶³

210. All of that is a lie. Camila’s explanation for maintaining the position of Brayden as a real person was because she wasn’t sure if Renae was coming back despite the fact she had told her boyfriend Michael that morning she had suicided at The Gap.
211. Camila told the inquest she had no idea that Renae was at Watsons Bay. She said that Renae was always threatening to kill herself – which was actually another lie – so she didn’t believe her this time. That evidence begs the question then why she would send the blunt text to Teresa *“sort your daughter out threatening to kill herself”* and then engage in taunting Teresa. This is consistent with the tone that Renae complained to Joseph that Brayden was being “blunt”.
212. Camila Zeidan appeared completely unaffected from the beginning to the end of her evidence about the impact her lies had. She showed no warmth, no concern and no regard to any process of the inquest other than to further her own fiction.
213. Camila Zeidan is the only person who could tell the Inquest about what was said between Renae and Brayden that day. She gave evidence to the inquest over 2 days. Her evidence can only be described as disingenuous at best and ultimately nothing but a pack of lies. She demonstrated no regard to Renae’s family who desperately wanted to hear what communications were between Brayden and Renae on her last day and in her last moments.
214. When it was put to her that Renae called Goulburn prison at 2.44 pm to speak to Brayden, Camila replied that she didn’t know that Renae had called the prison. When it was put to her that it demonstrated Renae really believed that Brayden was a real person in prison, she replied that Renae was just being *“in character”*.
215. As part of her preparations to marry Brayden and have a honeymoon, Renae had written to the Greek Consulate General to ascertain whether a person with criminal convictions could obtain a visa to holiday in Greece. When this was put to Camila as being indicative that Renae believed Brayden to be real and not a role play, Camila answered “I never knew she did that”. She was unable to conceptualise these examples as contradictions to her version any further.

¹⁶³ Ex 2A Extraction Reports 3864 3872, 3865 3864 pp 234- 235

216. When it was suggested to her that she deliberately made no mention of Brayden in the handwritten statement she provided to the police she could only answer that she had no recollection of writing the statement. She was unable to engage in the cognitive task of accepting that the police were telling the truth that she had provided a handwritten statement at that time and it contained no mention of Brayden regardless of whether she remembered it or not.
217. Likewise, when it was put to her that she denied to the police that she was Brayden she responded she could not remember talking to the police. She was unable to engage in the process of accepting that the conversation recorded by the police was the conversation that they had because she could not remember having had it. She appeared genuinely cognitively unable to concede that scenario.
218. Much evidence taken from text messages between Renae and Brayden retrieved from Renae's telephone found in her car was put to Camila to challenge her claim that Renae was party to the fabrication of Brayden.
- Renae told people that she and Brayden were going to marry in secret because her parents would not support it.
 - Renae booked an appointment with a wedding photographer
 - Renae wrote to the Greek Consulate
 - Renae sending Brayden bridal and groom wedding photographs
 - Renae counselling and supporting Brayden about his friend Richie who he said he had accidentally killed in the motorbike accident.
 - Renae complained to Brayden about his refusal to give his lawyer's phone number so that she could speak with him or get the key to his storage so she could have a momento -
 - Renae's text message on 1 May 2013 *"Do you ever wonder sometimes how strange it is right that we never met but we have this inseperatable (sic) love for each other"*
 - Renae sending sexual images of herself to Brayden but that whenever she asked Brayden to reciprocate he never did which would upset her
 - Renae telephoned Goulburn prison to speak with Brayden on 5 August 2013.
219. Tracts of texts, including the 16 June 2013 soccer game drama was put to Camila to demonstrate that Brayden presented as a real person rather than fictitious and she adhered to her explanation that she and Renae always spoke that way "just being in character". She provided the same explanation to Renae talking to people about Brayden – just "being in character". She was taken to the evidence that Renae wanted to speak with Brayden's lawyer and she said was "staying in character".
220. Camila's cover for Brayden is so that she and Renae could be together but when she was taken to Renae's Facebook communications in September 2011 telling Camila that there would always be someone else Camila said that Renae always had to have someone else so they (family) wouldn't know she was with her. She said that Renae had an exclusive relationship with Brayden and an independent friendship with Camila so "we wouldn't get caught". She said in her evidence that she decided

she didn't want to do it anymore because it (the lesbian relationship) wouldn't be allowed. At no time did she suggest that when Brayden communicated with Renae on 5 August that she told Renae she wanted to stop the character play because their relationship was doomed to never be accepted. She said that she didn't tell the police on 23 September that both she and Renae had pretended with Brayden so they could be together because she'd be too ashamed because her parents were there.

221. Her evidence was full of lies and she was painting a cover story over why and how Brayden Spiteri was created. The text messages do speak for themselves and the only compelling conclusion is that Renae had no role in the creation of Brayden and she believed that he was a real person.
222. When Camila was shown a printout of a Facebook page the police had located on her laptop containing a post of Daniel Spiteri Camila said she did not know who that person was, she was pressed about that and eventually said that he was going out with Olivia who was her work colleague and that she did not personally know him. She said that he was not associated with Brayden Spiteri and that Renae had sent herself the photograph of the boy at the nightclub to be Brayden. This is contradicted by Renae's text to Brayden on 17 April 2013: "*Brayden I have nothing of you absolutely nothing. I cant even get a photo off you anymore*".¹⁶⁴
223. At the commencement of her evidence Camila was taken to evidence that Angus had seen red marks and bruises on Renae's arms from being grabbed and pushed by Camila in the corridor at TAFE, she was taken to evidence from Angus and Teresa about her following Renae and harassing her and waiting outside their home, turning up at places unexpectedly. She denied ever being physical with Renae and denied that she waited or followed her. At some points she said she could not recall such as going to a meeting and then not allowing Renae to leave in a car.
224. It is not difficult to determine the reason why, after Renae's death, Camila kept her Brayden character, denied being Brayden, destroyed the Brayden phone and sim card and minimised the period during which she was Brayden – was to avoid being revealed as the person who had caused Renae the hurt and heartbreak that led her to take her own life. It is the same reason why she has continued to lie to the inquest maintaining that Renae was party to the pretence.

Explanation of unfolding events on 5 August 2013 - Telephone Records and Melanie Dagher

225. According to the Call Charge Records ("CCR") of Camila's telephone number xx33809¹⁶⁵ there were some 55 text messages from Camila to Melanie Dagher on 5 August 2013. They had all been deleted. The police Cellbrite application recovered 19 of the text messages. Accordingly, incomplete information provides a very

¹⁶⁴Ex 2 Vol 2 Extraction reports Tab 1 pp 387 text 6893– 6892 17 April 2013

¹⁶⁵Vol 2 Tab 1

incomplete picture.¹⁶⁶ Save to say it would appear that Camila has deleted and disposed of communications related to Renae.

226. The incomplete records should be read with significant caution. Matching the CCR record with the correct extraction report text message is difficult because of the number of deleted messages as well as the need to adjust the time recording on the extraction report. The outgoing texts on the extraction report do not have a Network Time only a UTC time and the phone is set to a UTC+10 zone (a USA zone). The Network time does not exactly match the adjusted UTC time¹⁶⁷ so after deducting the 10 hours a further step of adding 56 or 57 seconds is required to obtain an accurate Network time which accords with the CCR time (same Network).¹⁶⁸
227. The CCR indicates that Camila sent seven texts to Melanie Dagher between her text to her sister Sarah at 7:40:11 (extraction report text 3973) and a text about soccer to Teresa at 09:28:26 (extraction 3965). The extraction report only contains the content of 3 of those texts.¹⁶⁹ Likewise between the time Camila texted Teresa about soccer and the time she texted Renae (11:36:54) to put credit on Brayden's phone, the CCR indicates that Camila sent 16 texts to Melanie whereas the extraction report shows just two of those texts.
228. The message Camila sent to Renae in the morning and Renae's response as well as the last text Renae sent to Camila along with all texts Camila sent to Melanie have been deleted, but the texts to Teresa (and a few others) were not. This indicates that at some stage Camila has deliberately and selectively deleted numerous texts.
229. Accordingly, it was anticipated that Melanie Dagher being a very close friend of Camila who had significant contact with Camila on 5 August 2013 including during the time Camila was texting as Brayden to Renae, may be able to shed some light on the recovered extraction report texts and what occurred that day.
230. When Melanie Dagher gave evidence she was taken to two sets of text message exchanges with Camila on 5 August 2013.¹⁷⁰ The first was between 10.50-10.59 (about 50 minutes before Camila texted Renae at 11:36 to tell her Brayden's phone needed credit¹⁷¹).

(up to 5 missing texts)

10:51:21	C	<i>im done</i>
10:51:27	C	<i>time to move on</i>
10:59:36	M	<i>no way just wait maybe there's a reason</i>

(up to eight missing texts)¹⁷²

¹⁶⁶ The CCR shows that between 21.32.23 – 21.33.01 and 21.38.51-21.39.18, Camila sent 4 sms text messages respectively to Renae's phone – they do not appear in the SEEB extraction report.

¹⁶⁷ e.g. extraction report message 3974 time 17:27:31(UTC+10) Network Time 07:28:24+10)

¹⁶⁸ To illustrate the disparity of the documents: Camila texted her sister Sarah at CCR 7:40:11 (extraction 3973 time 17:39:14) and texted Teresa at CCR 09:28:26 (extraction 3965 time 19:27:30).

¹⁶⁹ A single text is limited to a certain number of characters. When a text is longer than this limit it is recorded as 2 or more texts depending on the length of the message which is reflected in the CCR, the difference in time between texts on the CCR can assist, in the absence of an extraction report message, whether single or multiple messages were likely sent.

¹⁷⁰ Transcript 13 February 2020 39-48 at pp42-47

¹⁷¹ Renae had sent a text to Brayden at 7.34 am

¹⁷² The CCR shows Camila sent Melanie up to eight further texts after this exchange and before she texted Renae at 11:36:54– none of those are contained in the extraction report.

231. Camila texted Renae at 11:36:54 then sent two more texts to Teresa about soccer at 11:44:59 and 11:46:50¹⁷³. Camila did not send any texts from her phone from that time until 13:32:36. Between those times Camila as Brayden was exchanging texts with Renae commencing 11:53:39 and ending 13:18:36 at which time Renae was at the café with Joseph, shaking and crying extremely upset that Brayden had ended the relationship¹⁷⁴. Renae then sent three texts the last being 13:31:31.
232. Camila did not reply to those three texts, rather at 13:32:36 she used her phone to text Melanie Dagher. She sent up to 5 texts the last being at 13:37:51 all of which have been deleted and none of which have been recovered.
233. Brayden sent Renae a response 6 minutes after Melanie’s text to Camila “*you deserve better*”.¹⁷⁵ The second exchange of text messages Melanie was taken to is this:

(up to 5 further missing text messages)

13:39:37	C	<i>Its o.v.e.r lover</i>
	M	<i>How longs it been</i>
13.39.49	C	<i>2 hrs</i>
13:40:14	C	<i>Yet his been on Facebook</i>
	M	<i>wtf is that</i>
13:40:53	C	<i>Mmm anyway</i>
	M	<i>U ok?</i>
	M	<i>You deserve better</i>

234. In examination Melanie was taken to this exchange and she said that the conversation was about Michael who Camila was seeing at the time and that the 2 hours was a reference to how long it had been since Camila had spoken to him. She agreed that it indicated that Camila believed that the relationship to be over.¹⁷⁶
235. Melanie was then taken to a text exchange between Camila and Michael at 3.43 pm–3.58 pm where Camila asked Michael if he was excited for the football game and he replied he was and he asked her if she was going to watch it and Camila replied that she was¹⁷⁷. It was put to Melanie on the basis as being inconsistent with the relationship being over.
236. Melanie said that the earlier text hadn’t meant that Camila and Michael had broken up and that she had not said it did.
237. Given that the text “*im done*” was sent before Camila texted Renae and before Brayden texted Renae I think that it is unlikely to relate to Camila ending the Brayden/Renae relationship. Further, I note that the previous night Camila and

¹⁷³ CCR records

¹⁷⁴ Vol 1 Tab 16 Statement of Joseph Abbate

¹⁷⁵ (Volume 2 Tab 16, text 1099, Also in Ex 1 Folder 2A message 3941 see generally pp240(txt3959, 3958, 3956) p 239(txt 395-3949,3947-3944, 3941)

¹⁷⁶ It had been put to her that the 2 hours was consistent to referring the time since Camila had texted Renae at 11.36 am suggestive that Camila was referring to Brayden breaking up with Renae.

¹⁷⁷ Ex1 Folder 2A p 238 (txt 3940,3937, 3934)

Michael made an arrangement to see each other on Wednesday night¹⁷⁸ and later that night had this text exchange¹⁷⁹

2104-2243 C *I'm going to bed goodnight I care so much about you Michael but I feel like it isn't the same for u I try to make it work and see u it always seems hard.*

Mi *babe I no u do and I appreciate it I just got real quart up I wana c u Wednesday goodnight"*

C *I no u get caught up and I don't want u to change your life for me either I just cant figure out what u want because I feel like its just whatever for u like u no id drop anything just to see u*

Mi *I no u don't but I don't want to stop u either id drop wat im doing 4 u to unles im flat out*

238. Camila sent the text to Michael asking him if he was going to watch the game (15:43:19). This was half an hour after she had texted Teresa as Brayden alerting Teresa that Renae was threatening to kill herself and within 20 minutes of texting Teresa that Renae loved Brayden.

239. Renae had sent Brayden three texts which went unanswered. Camila was busy texting Michael, speaking to Melanie on the phone and texting Michael again.

240. At 4 pm Camila texted Fay "*I'm deleting Facebook*". Camila may have posted something as this next exchange of text between Camila and Melanie occurred at 4:28-4.32 pm¹⁸⁰ which was about the time Renae left her home to drive to Watsons Bay.

M *That's not true camila theres no karma to get!! His got something wrong with commitment like whats so hard bout it?*

C *don't worry anyway I'll sort it out with him*

M *you will sort it out don't stress please love you x*

241. While Renae was driving to Watsons Bay (about 4.30-5.20) Camila was busy likely on the internet. After arriving at Watsons Bay Renae sent Brayden six texts between 5.22pm and 5.45pm. Camila called Melanie at 5.30pm (17:31:10) and spoke with her for 7 ½ minutes. Then Camila used her Brayden phone and sent a text to Renae a few minutes later at 17:46:23.

242. She kept the Brayden phone for the next 10 minutes (5.46 pm – 5.55 pm) and then switched back to her other phone and sent a text at 6.03 pm to Fay about not having a hair product.¹⁸¹

¹⁷⁸Ex 1 Folder 2A p242 (txt 4005-4002)

¹⁷⁹ Ex 1 Folder 2A p 241 (txt 3984,3978, 3977,3976)

¹⁸⁰Ex 1 Folder 2A P238 (txt 3930-3928)

¹⁸¹ Ex 1 Vol 2 Tab 1 CCR 18:03:17 and Ex 2A Extraction Report text message 3297

243. If not earlier, this must have been the time Camila saw the goodbye text Renae had sent to her at 5.47 pm.
244. Despite the Brayden and Renae exchange of text messages, Camila was still preoccupied with Michael and may even have been using her other phone to access the internet because after she sent the last Brayden text to Renae, Camila had this text exchange with Melanie at 6.05- 6.11 pm¹⁸²:

C *He messaged¹⁸³ me and said I've got a surprise for u wednesday*
M *wtf r u serious? What do you think?*
C *I said no*
M *I agree cant fix things with gifts! Ps hope its good haha*
C *its not a gift its going somewhere lol*
M *Ooooooooooooo!!!*
M *Maybe his guna ask u to be his wifely trophy!!*
C *Lmao more like his booty call bitch*
M *Nooooo gromm!!*
C *Yes. I will get it tomorrow*

245. Whilst Renae was having the most miserable time of her life Camila was enraptured with the thrill of starting a new relationship with Michael. Renae had left Ian for a person who did not exist. She had dedicated herself to Brayden, supporting him in prison, waiting for him to be released so they could be together. She was loving and appreciative to Camila for bringing them together and wanted Camila to find someone who made her feel the same happiness.
246. It would appear that Camila did find that someone but I don't think that was the cause behind Camila deciding to end Brayden.
247. Camila was not in a relationship with Renae. Camila did not see Renae very often as a friend. As can be seen from the Telephone Extraction Reports Renae spent most of her time texting Brayden and only occasionally went out with Camila and when she did it was often with Camila's friends.
248. Camila did not contact Renae when she came back from overseas which is consistent with Camila not being in a relationship with her and consistent with believing that their friendship was not on track.
249. Camila played soccer on Sunday 4 August and Renae did not go. To Camila that was quite a definitive sign to understand that Renae did not want to be friends with her. There is much evidence in the brief that when Renae did not watch Camila play soccer Camila would feel extremely hurt and angry¹⁸⁴. Camila would have taken Renae keeping away from soccer as showing she was serious in the message she sent her that she no longer wanted to be her friend. The very next day Camila exacted her ultimate revenge by having Brayden break Renae's heart. The Brayden Renae relationship ended as it had started – at Camila's will.

¹⁸² Ex 2A Extraction Reports pp238-239 texts3926-3919

¹⁸³ Referring to Facebook Messenger

¹⁸⁴ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 34 - 32 text 603 at 13:51 -560 at 20:24 16 June 2013

250. In her evidence, Ms Dagher said she had never heard of Brayden until she saw the news on the first day of the inquest¹⁸⁵. If that was true then she did not have very much to do with Renae because everyone who knew Renae knew she was besotted by Brayden. On 16 June 2013 Renae revealed to Brayden that she and Melanie had so much in common – she also had a tattoo of her boyfriend’s name it is unlikely that Ms Dagher had never heard of Brayden.
251. Ms Dagher sought to impress the court that Renae was always threatening to harm herself. If she knew Renae so little as to not have heard about Brayden until the inquest had commenced then she could not possibly know about Renae to make such comments – they were gratuitous and unfounded to assist her friend Camila’s position that she didn’t think Renae was serious about her threats.
252. Ms Dagher said that she did not know that Camila was in a relationship with Renae. The reason I accept that is because Renae was not in a relationship with Camila. Melanie said she did not know that Camila was in a relationship – that is because they weren’t.
253. There were numerous communiques between Renae and Camila about finding Camila a boyfriend so she could be as happy as Renae was with Brayden.
254. There was Martin in March, Jordan in April and Joseph in May 2013. Michael was also seeing Renae before she went to America. Telephone records indicate that Michael, Melanie and Renae wished Camila goodbye on 4 July 2013. Those records also indicate that Camila contacted both Michael and Melanie as soon as she returned from holiday and spent time with them. She did not contact Renae.
255. Camila said in the witness box that she did not know that Renae was at Watsons Bay and that she had no idea that Renae was serious about threatening to suicide. Sadly, the above texts would suggest that is correct, not because “Renae was always threatening suicide” but because Camila was untouched by Renae’s distress and distracted by her communications with Melanie and what was unfolding with Michael. Camila did know that Renae had left messages on Brayden’s phone every day for a month and no doubt those messages were of love support and hope for his release so they could be together. Camila did know that terminating the relationship would leave Renae devastated. That knowledge did not translate to having any care and regard for the consequences of deceiving Renae over the preceding 20 months and the impact that deception was having.
256. Whilst the deletion of all the texts to Melanie and the texts to and from Renae on 5 August 2013 from Camila’s phone and the disposal of the Brayden phone and sim card suggests that Camila has sought to conceal what occurred on 5 August 2013 it remains unclear what their discovery would reveal further than what is known today.
257. I do not think that Camila as Brayden extended any kindness, comfort or support to Renae on 5 August 2013 and despite the disposal of evidence of what was said there is no basis to think that she incited Renae to take her life.

¹⁸⁵ Ex 2 Vol 1 Tab 1 Extraction Reports p 34 - 32 text 603 at 13:51 -560 at 20:24 16 June 2013

Conclusion

258. There is no doubt that Renae Marsden believed that Brayden Spiteri was a real person with whom she had a strong connection and a deep love and was prepared to wait for him to be released from prison to continue her relationship. Despite some people telling her he was not real, Renae believed he was and as she told a work colleague Ms Ryan *"If I didn't think he was real I wouldn't have left Ian"*.
259. I do not think that Renae had been mentally disturbed thinking that a fantasy character that she had made up with Camila had become a real person.
260. There is no doubt that she would have been upset that Brayden was not wanting to continue the relationship after a month's absence and after all of the effort she had put into the relationship, supporting him emotionally dealing with having accidentally killed his best friend, being estranged from his family and needing her.
261. Camila Zeidan said that Renae had texted saying that she didn't know what purpose she had in life. This was likely true it is not true that she does not recollect what else was said throughout the day on 5 August. She did not want to say. On 7 August 2013 Camila received a text message from her friend Josie Moit asking her *"are you feeling ok?"*. Camila told her that she was at the house (Marsden's) and it was very sad. When Josie asked her if they had heard anything Camila *replied "The mum and dad are blaming the bf (boyfriend) which is very hard because its not his fault"*. Josie wrote *"no its not his fault its just a tragedy. Is the bf there?"* Camila replied *"Nah he isn't they ended there (sic) relationship before this"*. This was another lie. Josie replied *"She clearly had issues deep down someone doesn't do something like that just because of a bf there has to be more to it! I'm so sorry I can't even concentrate breaks my heart. But has it been confirmed yet?"* Camila did not reply.
262. There is no evidence what, if anything, Renae learned from her 90 second telephone call to Goulburn Prison. If she asked if she could speak to a prisoner by telephone she would have been told that was not possible. If she asked if she could leave a message she may have been put through to welfare to leave a message but that would likely take more than 90 seconds. If she had asked if they had a prisoner called Brayden Spiteri in the prison she may have been told that no such prisoner was there. If she had asked if he had been released she may have been told that there is no prisoner with such a name. I doubt that she asked those questions. She rang Goulburn Prison to speak with Brayden not find out if he was there because she never suspected for a moment that he was not. What she discovered on that 90 second call, if anything, cannot be answered.
263. I have considered whether Renae learned that Brayden was not real and that she learned she had been Catfished by her best friend Camila Zeidan. I am of the view that Renae likely did not learn of this.
264. Camila did not tell her because she is unable to admit to having engaged in such appalling conduct involving such an extreme betrayal of trust of her friend.

265. Renae's comment to Teresa "*I know what he is all about now*" did not refer to that discovery. If it did I expect that Renae would have been calling Camila's phone and/or texting Camila's phone during the afternoon. She did not. She only texted Camila's phone shortly before texting her mother.
266. Though I do not accept that Camila Zaiden accidentally deleted Renae's last text message to her I do not think that it said anything other than what Camila says. It is consistent with the loving tone of the message Renae wrote to her mother. It is unclear whether Camila knew that Renae was at Watsons Bay. If she as Brayden had been kind to Renae she may have learned that she was there but I doubt very much she was extending much care or concern and kindness to Renae that day.
267. Camila was unable to answer the question of how this was all this going to end. Camila could have returned from America and let Brayden disappear into the thin air from which he came. Camila did not contact Renae and suggest they end their fiction because Renae was not part of the fiction. Camila did not contact Renae because Renae had ended their friendship by text and confirmed it by not attending soccer.
268. After 5 August 2013 Camila displayed a deplorable lack of kindness to Renae's family by the lies she told and continued, seeking to cast blame upon them for Renae's unhappiness. Likewise in her evidence in the inquest Camila did not make any attempt to give them the answers they sought.
269. I can only hope that this inquest has given them some degree of comfort that Renae's experience is documented and understood. Renae had her entire life to look forward to and it ended all too soon in unnecessary emotional turmoil and trauma. I offer Renae's family and friends my sincere condolences.

Findings

270. As a result of considering all of the documentary evidence and the oral evidence given at the inquest, I am able to confirm that the death occurred and make the following findings in relation to it.

The identity of the deceased

The person who died was Renae Marsden

Date of death

Renae Marsden died on 5 August 2013

Place of death

The place Renae died is The Gap. Jacob's ladder Reserve, Watsons Bay Sydney NSW 2030

Cause of death

Renae Marsden died of Fatal Fall Injuries

Manner of death

Renae Marsden deliberately slipped from the clifftop with the intent to end her life after the termination of a relationship with a person whose identity and intent were, unbeknown to her, a fabrication created and perpetrated for the purposes of exercising coercion and control over her by a known person, who engaged in conduct known as “Catfishing”.

Recommendation

271. Renae’s family are seeking to have a discrete and distinct criminalisation of the conduct called Catfishing. I hope these findings provide some support and assistance in that regard; there are complex matters which were not canvassed at the inquest which need to be taken into account before any coronial recommendation involving the introduction of criminal legislation. Accordingly, I do not make such a recommendation.

272. On 24 March 2020 the “Domestic Violence Death Review Report 2017-2019” was tabled in both houses of the NSW Parliament. Recommendation 9 of that Report is

That the Department of Communities and Justice examine the extent to which existing NSW laws (criminal and civil protection orders) respond adequately to non-physical forms of domestic and family violence and to patterns, rather than incidents, of violence. This examination should include:

1. a qualitative review conducted with NSW police about what forms of behaviour are being targeted under the offence of ‘stalking or intimidation’, whether such charges are laid on their own or in combination with other offences, and the relationship context of such offences; and
2. monitoring the progress and implementation of offences of coercive control and domestic abuse in other jurisdictions.

273. The monitoring and progress and implementation of offences of coercive control in other jurisdictions relate to a widening of the definition of domestic (and personal violence) which would capture the conduct Camila engaged in by Catfishing Renae but are laws not currently implemented in NSW though through this recommendation are being considered. Renae’s case should be included and considered to inform the Department of Communities and Justice examination.

274. Accordingly, under s82 of the Act I make the following recommendation:

That the Domestic Violence Death Review Team undertake an in-depth review and provide that review to the Department of Community and Justice to inform any action taken to progress Recommendation 9 of the DVRT 2017/19 Report.

I close this inquest.

E Truscott
Deputy State Coroner
20.05.2020