THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL'S RESPONSE TO THE FISCAL 2023 PRELIMINARY BUDGET AND FISCAL 2022 PRELIMINARY MAYOR'S MANAGEMENT REPORT

As required under Sections 247(b) and 12(e) of the New York City Charter

Hon. Adrienne E. Adams
Speaker

Hon. Justin Brannan
Chair, Finance Committee

Tanisha S. Edwards, Esq.
Chief Financial Officer and Deputy Chief of Staff to the Speaker

April 1, 2022

Finance Division

Budget Unit

Nathan Toth, Deputy Director
Eisha Wright, Deputy Director
Dohini Sompura, Assistant Director
Aliya Ali, Unit Head
Crilhien Francisco, Unit Head
Chima Obichere, Unit Head
John Russell, Unit Head
Sebastian Bacchi, Principal Financial Analyst
John Basile, Principal Financial Analyst
Chelsea Baytemur, Senior Financial Analyst
Julia Haramis, Senior Financial Analyst
Lauren Hunt, Financial Analyst
Florentine Kabore, Financial Analyst
Jack Kern, Senior Financial Analyst
Daniel Kroop, Senior Financial Analyst
Michele Peregrin, Senior Financial Analyst
Masis Sarkissian, Senior Financial Analyst
Jonathan Seltzer, Senior Financial Analyst
Nevin Singh, Senior Financial Analyst
Jack Storey, Senior Financial Analyst

Administrative Support Unit

Nicole Anderson, Senior Legislative Coordinator
Maria Pagan, Senior Legislative Coordinator
Courtneigh Summerrise, Administrative Assistant

Discretionary Funding and Data Support Unit

Paul Scimone, Deputy Director
James Reyes, Unit Head
Savanna Chou, Senior Financial Analyst

Legal Unit

Noah Brick, Assistant Counsel
Stephanie Ruiz, Assistant Counsel

Revenue and Economics Unit

Raymond Majewski, Deputy Director, Chief Economist
Emre Edev, Assistant Director
Paul Sturm, Supervising Economist
Hector German, Financial Analyst
William Kyeremateng, Principal Economist
Nashia Roman, Economist
Andrew Wilber, Senior Financial Analyst

Table of Contents

Executive Summary: A Road to Recovery: Equitable Investment in NYC Communities

The New York City Council presents its response to the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Budget and the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report. This is the first Budget Response under the new leadership of Speaker Adrienne Adams and Committee on Finance Chair Justin Brannan. It provides the Council's vision for increased accountability in the budget process, while at the same time emphasizes the importance of investing in our communities and local economy in order to secure a strong, fair and equitable recovery for New York City.

On February 16, 2022, Mayor Eric Adams presented a $98.5 billion Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Budget. On March 2, 2022, the Committee on Finance held the Council's first oversight hearing on the Preliminary Budget and laid out the framework by which the Council was going to analyze the Fiscal 2023 budget – transparency, performance, efficiency, equity, and fiscal prudence. Throughout the remainder of the month, an additional 28 committees explored these themes and held hearings on the budgets of the agencies within their jurisdiction. It is within the context of this in-depth review, critical analysis and consideration of public input that the Council submits this Response to the Preliminary Budget.

In examining the Mayor's Preliminary Budget, the Council has observed a gradual growth in spending over the past fiscal year. Since Fiscal 2022, the City's budget has increased by approximately eight percent and the Preliminary Financial Plan projects the City's budget to reach $104.6 billion by Fiscal 2026. New spending in the current fiscal year is attributed to newly identified revenue resources, coupled with the Administration's austere Citywide Savings Program, which instituted a Program to Eliminate the Gap (PEG). As presented in the Financial Plan, the PEG program would introduce a mix of efficiency savings, cost and revenue re-estimates, vacancy reductions, and debt service savings that would amount to $5.3 billion, representing a three percent target in savings across Fiscal 2022 and Fiscal 2023, and the outyears. The Council takes serious issue with implementing a PEG program without understanding the full impact it will have on the City's ability to retain and hire staff, and the impact it will have on an agency's ability to deliver key services. Therefore, the spending measures we propose in this Response are focused and are offset by identified revenue sources, savings, and agency reductions.

In addition to monitoring the City's spending, and the proposed savings program, the Council is approaching this year's Preliminary Budget and Response with the understanding that the City faces impending budgetary shortfalls with the expiration of COVID-19 federal funding. The current Fiscal 2022 budget of $106.5 billion consists of $18 billion in federal funding, which sharply declines to $9.4 billion in Fiscal 2023 and $6.9 billion by Fiscal 2025. The decline in COVID-related funding could have a significant impact on the City's ability to deliver critical services by providing less-than-anticipated funding to key programs, particularly in the areas of education, health and public safety. In recognition of these fiscal risks, the Council strongly urges the

Administration to clearly outline and take the necessary steps to ensure that the City's budget can account for these looming shortfalls.

We have now entered the third year of the pandemic, which has exposed many of the fault-lines in our City and exacerbated historical inequity in investment for certain neighborhoods, especially in our Black and Brown communities. Addressing these gaps is key to the health and safety of our entire City. Whether it is the current mental health crisis, the disparities in access to quality health care, the lack of affordable housing, educational and economic opportunity, transportation, or investments in our youth and older adults, if ignored, these issues can have a long-lasting impact on the City's residents, businesses, and institutions. The strength and well-being of our City's communities is intrinsically linked to our investments in key programs and services. By investing in New Yorkers as the engine of our City, with a focus on equity, we can ensure communities are strong and secure our recovery in a holistic manner.

The Council's Budget Response calls for investing in specific programs and priorities that will help ensure that we remain on our path to recovery for all New Yorkers:

- **Bolstering Agency Operations for Greater Efficiency** – In order to address the shortfalls that detrimentally impact various City agencies' ability to provide services effectively and efficiently, the Administration should add $1.5 million to help support small business e-commerce, $2.3 million to strength the Department of Investigation by adding to its headcount, and $50 million to support Cultural Institution Group (CIGs). The Council also calls on the Administration to take the necessary steps to achieve EMS pay parity.

- **Creating a Path to Success for Our City's Children & Youth** – While the pandemic may have paused opportunities for our City's youngest residents, now is the time to begin rebuilding and investing in programs that will create a path to success for our children and youth. The Administration should add $59 million to support citywide expansion of restorative justice, $57.1 million to expand on youth employment programs, $30 million to provide pay parity for special education Pre-K providers, $14 million to expand on mental health, career counseling, and guidance counselors, and $12 million for English language learners as well as for DOE community coordinators.

- **Improving Access to Health, Mental Health, and Safety** – The need to address disparities in the City's health and mental health services became apparent during the height of the pandemic and continues to be an issue in our most vulnerable communities. The Council urges the Administration to add $61 million for the Behavioral Health Emergency Assistance Response Division (B-HEARD) program, $45 million to create a Hospital Fund, $11.5 million to increase mental health support and outreach services for unhoused individuals, $8.7 million to expand geriatric mental health capacity, $5 million to support the expansion of the Saturday Night Lights program, and $8.4 million to create the State's first Trauma Recovery Centers.

- **Increasing Equitable Access to Benefit Programs for ALL New Yorkers** – Human services vendors and their employees are a vital arm of the City's government and deliver some of the most essential public services to New Yorkers. To ensure equitable access to public benefits, and better support the City's frontline workers, the City should add $60 million to provide wage equity for Human Services providers, $21 million to extend pay parity to Day Care Directors, $30 million to fund Seamless Meal Transition for Older Adults, $13.5 million to double baseline funding for Adult Literacy, $11.2 million increase Emergency Food Assistance Program's (EFAP) baseline, $7.5 million to improve IT education for older adults, $5 million to expand language access at City agencies, $23 million for CUNY Reconnect.

- **Investing in a Cleaner & Greener NYC** – The maintenance and investment in the City's public spaces are necessary and not only increase the quality of life for New Yorkers, but also make the City more welcoming as tourism begins to flourish again. The Council calls on the Administration to add $22 million to corner basket pick-up, $52 million for Parks' maintenance and summer workforce, $47.8 million for Sanitation funding restoration, which includes $18.2 million to restore composting, $4.9 million in rat mitigation, and $3.1 million in zero-waste school education.

- **Protecting Housing Opportunities for New Yorkers & Investing in Homeless Services** – Protecting housing opportunities for all New Yorkers is essential on our City's road to recovery. Housing instability undermines the ability of education, public health, and workforce investments to have meaningful impacts. Therefore, the City's budget should make strategic investments to not only maintain housing stability for those who currently have it, but also expand housing access so that the recovery can be successful for all New Yorkers. The City calls on the Administration to provide a $90 million property tax rebate to homeowners, $40.5 million to baseline prevailing wages for security guards, $47.9 million to fully fund HASA SROs, $114.9 million to expand funding for drop-in centers, safe haven beds & stabilization beds, $49.4 million to convert hotels to housing for the homeless, $41.6 million to increase domestic violence shelter capacity, $6 million for more runaway homeless youth beds, and $28.4 million for supportive housing for justice involved people.

- **Supporting Fairness and Equity in the Justice System** – While the criminal justice system in the City continues to evolve and undergo changes, much more work needs to be done to address issues of mass incarceration and racial disparities. To ensure fairness and accountability for all stakeholders involved, the Administration should provide $34.3 million to support District Attorneys, $10 million to fund Fair Futures up to age 26 and for justice-involved youth, $12.3 million to provide adequate resources to the Board of Correction, and $2.5 million to allow CCRB to hire up to full staffing capacity.

- **Strengthening the City's Infrastructure** – It is critical that the facilities where the City provides services are safe and in a state of good repair. Projects ranging from affordable housing to our libraries, parks, hospitals and the roads and transportation methods that connect them all are a vital part of the City's well-being. The Council calls on the Administration to add $4 billion to increase investments in affordable, supportive, and public housing, $3.1 billion to enhance the City's Streets Plan; $250 million to fund comfort stations in parks in all five boroughs, $250 million to establish new H+H neighborhood health ambulatory care centers and $163 million to fund the gap in the library systems infrastructure needs.

The Council also continues to press the Administration to present a budget that is more transparent, accurate, and accountable to New Yorkers. The Administration must re-examine the structure of both the expense and capital budgets in light of the standards set forth in the New York City Charter regarding the level of detail and information that is required to be provided. With respect to the expense budget, the Administration must discontinue the longstanding practice of using vague and overbroad units of appropriation in favor of the smaller, programmatic units of appropriation envisioned in the law. While such a shift would restrict the Mayor's ability to transfer funds between programs without oversight and to avoid seeking budget modification approval from the Council, it is necessary to facilitate the Council's and the public's understanding of agency spending and performance and to more transparently track the Administration's and the Council's priorities.

Making greater use of the City's relatively new Rainy-Day Fund would bring greater transparency to the amount of fiscal reserves the City has available to address any economic downturn. This should be done by reducing reliance on the practice of rolling surplus revenues into future years by prepaying those expenses. While it served a useful purpose when the City had no Rainy-Day Fund, continued reliance on this practice makes the overall budget structure more opaque and difficult to track.

Another opportunity to advance transparency and accountability would be improving the Mayor's Management Report. Specifically, the Council calls on the Administration to establish clear targets for all performance indicators and to explain significant indicator variances when they occur.

The Council welcomes the opportunity to work with the Administration to implement the priorities contained in this document. Together we can provide meaningful and impactful support to all New Yorkers throughout the five boroughs.

Fiscal 2023 Financial Plan

Council Financial Plan Overview: Reducing the Structural Deficit

The Council's Financial Plan begins with the Administration's Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Budget, modifies it with additional savings and higher tax revenues, adjusts for new needs, and focuses on priorities identified by the Council through its budget hearings. It dramatically reduces the need to use the prior year resources that the Administration uses to balance the Preliminary Budget.

The Preliminary Budget totaled $106.5 billion in Fiscal 2022 and $98.5 billion in Fiscal 2023. The Council's Financial Plan increases the size of the budget by $1.6 billion or 1.5 percent in Fiscal 2022, and adds $2.8 billion or 2.8 percent in Fiscal 2023. The Council's increase in Fiscal 2022 is used to finance additional prepayments into Fiscal 2023. The bulk of the Council's increase in Fiscal 2023 is used to finance additions to the Rainy-Day Fund and the Retirees Health Benefit Trust (RHBT). Excluding the Rainy-Day Fund and the RHBT, the Council's Financial Plan includes approximately $1.2 billion in spending and $90 million in tax reductions not found in the Preliminary Financial Plan in Fiscal 2023.

February 2022 Financial Plan Summary
Dollars in Millions

	FY22	FY23	FY24	FY25	FY26	Average Annual Change
REVENUES						
Taxes	$64,030	$65,872	$67,774	$69,642	$70,735	2.5%
Miscellaneous Revenues	7,250	6,980	7,036	7,065	7,092	(0.5%)
Unrestricted Intergovernmental Aid	1044					
Less: Intra-City and Disallowances	(2,168)	(1,865)	(1,863)	(1,853)	(1,853)	(3.7%)
Subtotal, City Funds	**$70,156**	**$70,987**	**$72,947**	**$74,854**	**$75,974**	**2.0%**
State Aid	16,490	16,417	16,642	16,888	16,943	0.7%
Federal Aid	18,014	9,385	8,644	7,928	6,902	(19.3%)
Other Categorical Grants	1,149	1,013	1,006	1,005	1,001	(3.3%)
Inter-Fund Revenues	730	734	732	731	731	0.0%
TOTAL REVENUES	**$106,539**	**$98,536**	**$99,971**	**$101,406**	**$101,551**	**(1.1%)**
EXPENDITURES						
Personal Services	$53,465	$52,907	$53,453	$53,739	$54,156	0.3%
Other Than Personal Services (OTPS)	50,088	41,964	41,572	41,686	41,395	(4.4%)
Debt Service	6,764	7,942	8,265	8,803	9,597	9.3%
General Reserve	250	1,055	1,000	1,000	1,000	79.2%
Capital Stabilization Reserve		250	250	250	250	
Deposit to Rainy-Day Fund	500					
Less: Intra-City Expenses	(2,153)	(1,850)	(1,848)	(1,838)	(1,838)	3.7%
Spending Before Adjustments	**$108,914**	**$102,268**	**$102,692**	**$103,640**	**$104,560**	**(1.0%)**
Surplus Roll Adjustment (Net)	(2,375)	(3,732)				
TOTAL EXPENDITURES	**$106,539**	**$98,536**	**$102,692**	**$103,640**	**$104,560**	**(0.4%)**
Gap to be Closed	**-**	**-**	**($2,721)**	**($2,234)**	**($3,009)**	

In the table above, when comparing Spending Before Adjustment to Total Revenue for each year of the plan, spending exceeds total revenue. In Fiscal 2022, spending is $108.9 billion while revenue is $106.5 billion, a difference of around $2.4 billion. Yet the budget is balanced by the City's strict Generally Accepted Accounting Principles (GAAP) budgeting rules. It is similar for Fiscal 2023, where spending exceeds revenue by $3.7 billion. This is possible because while GAAP rules forbid the City to use borrowed money to balance the budget, they permit the City to use funds accumulated in the past to pay off certain costs. These funds show up in the Surplus Roll Adjustment line above. Without the use of prior year funds, the Financial Plan has a structural deficit of $2.4 billion and $3.7 billion in Fiscal 2022 and Fiscal 2023, respectively. It is like a family whose expenses exceed incomes and who are drawing down their savings account to pay the bills. In the outyears, where that line is blank and no prior year funds are available, there are remaining gaps of between $2.2 billion and $3 billion. Some of the expenses in the budget such as the General Reserve, Capital Stabilization Reserve and Rainy-Day Fund are in the expense budget but represent funds that there is no intention to spend on anything specific. The Preliminary Fiscal 2023 Budget plans to spend about $4 billion of prior year funds by cleaning out these accounts.

The Council's tax revenue forecast is significantly more optimistic than OMB's. The reason for this is explained in Appendix B below. The main point to highlight is that the Council's tax revenue forecast provides additional tax revenue of around $1.6 billion in Fiscal 2022 and $2.8 billion in Fiscal 2023 for a total of $4.4 billion. By Council calculations, instead of a structural deficit for Fiscal 2022 and Fiscal 2023 there is a small surplus.

The Council Response Financial Plan focuses on meeting the Council's ambition of a 'Road to Recovery through Equitable Investments in NYC Communities.' It aims to do so responsibly, through well-considered and effective programs and through preserving existing prior year resources. Budgeting is precarious now, with economic risks such as from the Ukrainian-Russian war and budgetary risks including the need to negotiate new labor contracts. Having prior year funds available is good insurance against these risks. The plan does so by adding $3 billion to the RHBT and Rainy Day Fund and having slightly under $600 million left over at the end of Fiscal 2023 to roll into Fiscal 2024. Prior year funds are used to balance Fiscal 2022 and Fiscal 2023 but the amount is closer to $600 million than $4 billion. Appendix C below compares reserves under the Council Response Financial Plan and the Administration's Preliminary Budget.

Council Response Financial Plan ***Dollars in Millions***		
	FY22	**FY23**
Gap as of Preliminary Budget Financial Plan	**$0**	**$0**
RESOURCES (+) adds resources		
Council Tax Revenue Forecast	$1,583	$2,823
Unused General Reserve	250	
Council Re-Estimates	49	187
SUBTOTAL	**$1,882**	**$3,010**
Preliminary Budget Response Proposals		
Agencies Spending & Revenue Reductions		$1,300
Rainy-Day Fund and RHBT		3,000
SUBTOTAL	**$0**	**$4,300**
TOTAL: Resources and Use of Funds	**$1,882**	**($1,290)**
Offset by increase of FY22 Prepayments to FY23	(1,882)	1,882
Surplus in Council Preliminary Budget Response	**$0**	**$592**

In this plan, the Council is proposing to make additions to the Rainy-Day Fund and the RHBT. Current practice is for OMB to start the year using prior year resources to balance the budget. Over the course of the year, additional revenues, expense budget savings and unused funds in the General Reserve and Capital Stabilization Reserve are moved into the Budget Stabilization Account, which are then used to prepay expenses in the next year. This practice, which evolved over the last 40 years, made sense when the City was not allowed to have a true multiyear Rainy-Day Fund. This fund is much more transparent than the current practice. Now that we have the Fund, the City should use it and phase out the current practice. The RHBT is designed to partially offset the City's unfunded post-employment health insurance liability. It is a good practice to build it up, when resources are available.

Council Re-estimates

Administration Tax Program

The Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan included two proposals intended to help address childcare deserts and childcare issues faced by workers in the City. The first proposal, the Childcare Property Tax Abatement, will provide an abatement to property owners who make improvements to create or expand childcare spaces. The other proposal, the Childcare Business Tax Credit will provide a refundable credit on the City's business taxes to employers who create a new childcare program or expand an existing one to accommodate the childcare needs of their workers.

The Preliminary Plan baselines $25 million for each of the two programs beginning in Fiscal 2023. However, recently released details show that the abatement and credit will not be available to taxpayers until Fiscal 2024, given the application deadlines in the language of the state legislation. Hence, the Finance Division is including the $50 million budgeted for the two programs in Fiscal 2023 as additional savings.

Debt Service

The debt service budget serves as a routine source of savings for the City. Among the sources of these savings are the customary overestimation of the cost of variable rate debt. In OMB's Financial Plan the assumed interest rate of 4.25 percent on this debt is not based on an analysis of economic conditions. It is a convention, which is gradually adjusted downward over the course of the year to reflect economic reality. The Finance Division believes there is $48.5 million in Fiscal 2022 and $137.1 million in Fiscal 2023 in debt service savings, for a total of $185.6 million over two years. This is based on IHS Markit's forecast of short-term interest rates, which average 1.65 percent during this period. The outlook for interest rates has changed considerably recently, and is likely to change in the future. In making these estimates, Finance Division has erred on the side of caution.

Budget Risks

Economic Risks

The primary risk to the economy remains COVID-19, as cases in parts of Asia continue to rise from the BA2 sub-variant of Omicron, prompting renewed regulations. As of March 2022, the Center for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) reported that only about 65.4 percent of the total U.S. population was fully vaccinated.[4] The economy may well continue to be fragile until the vaccination rate hits much higher levels, making people more comfortable in fully returning to their pre-pandemic lifestyles, and helping to prevent future surges in infection rates. There are uncertainties surrounding the anticipated pace of unwinding supply bottlenecks. In addition, there are risks associated with Federal Reserve interest rate hikes achieving a 'soft landing,' without weakening the U.S. economy into a recession. Finally, there are risks associated with the conflict between Russia and Ukraine. Escalations in the conflict have the potential to disrupt energy, commodity and financial markets. Depending on the scale of the disruptions, this is a major downside risk.

Expense Budget Risks

There are two major expense budget risks that are important for the outyears of the Financial Plan.

The first of these risks is collective bargaining. The City has reached a settlement with almost all unions, with the notable exception of the Patrolman's Benevolent Association, for the 2017 to 2021 round of bargaining. For the next round, 2022 to 2025, the Plan assumes raises and other enhancements funded by productivity savings for the first two years and annual one percent raises for the subsequent two years funded by the labor reserve.[1] With inflation increasing the cost of living for City employees, it is unlikely that the City's unions will settle for a pattern like this.

[1] Office of Management and Budget, "February 2022 Financial Plan Detail", 52.

The second risk is the "fiscal cliff" related to federal COVID relief. The bulk of COVID money, over $10 billion, was received in Fiscal 2022. Smaller amounts of funding are expected through Fiscal 2025. Most of this is either for general budget relief or for programs closely related to the COVID emergency. The Plan accounts for a COVID-19 spending budget of only $2.3 billion in Fiscal 2023, with a further drop off in the outyears. It is highly likely that the programs and infrastructure developed to manage and respond to the COVID-19 pandemic will continue to operate well into Fiscal 2023 and onwards, and that as a result, more funding will be needed. The additional risk is that certain programs, such as the expansion of 3-K in the Department of Education, are funded by COVID relief and treated in the Financial Plan as if the program terminates with that funding.[2] This seems unlikely and poses a risk which is most significant in the last years of the Financial Plan. Thus, the Council calls on the Administration to do a thorough evaluation of programs and services currently financed with federal COVID-19 stimulus funding and ensure that those programs are funded in the outyears once federal stimulus funding expires.

[2] Office of the New York State Comptroller, "Review of the Financial Plan of the City of New York," Report 19-2022, 15-18.

Improve Transparency

According to the New York City Charter, each unit of appropriation (U/A) is permitted to encompass only "the amount requested…for a particular program, purpose, activity or institution." Although U/As are intended to provide highly descriptive information in order to ensure the Council's and the public's understanding of agency spending and performance, the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Budget prepared by the Administration falls short of this level of transparency. Across the agencies, the U/As included in the expense budget are overly broad and wide-ranging, violating the Charter's requirements and limiting the Council's ability to set and maintain budget priorities. Creating more focused U/As aligned with agency programs would give the Council greater ability to conduct better and more thorough oversight of agencies and allow the budget to be adopted on a program basis. Narrower U/As would also clearly demonstrate the Mayor's priorities and permit the Council to exercise its existing legal authority to adjust program funding levels as it sees fit. Lack of proper alignment of agency programmatic functions in U/As, as currently exists, creates a clouded representation of the City's priorities.

As part of its Charter-mandated responsibility to adopt the budget, the Council is also tasked with approving significant midyear changes to the expense budget through the budget modification process. The use of overly broad U/As allows the Administration to bypass this process and move money between programs without Council input or authorization. Thus, for years the Council has called upon OMB to overhaul the City's expense budget structure to create and reorganize the U/As in the budget to correspond to actual programs that mirror the Budget Function Analysis document (BFA). More than a decade ago, at the request of the Council, OMB produced the BFA for 15 City agencies, which provides details on the expense budget by major functional areas. The BFA is a supplementary report released with the Preliminary, Executive, and Adopted Budgets, that provides headcount, expenditures, and appropriations by functional area for both personal services and other than personal services.

The Council did negotiate a handful of new U/As into the Fiscal 2020 and Fiscal 2021 budgets, however, more can and should be done to add further transparency in the City's budget. Therefore, the Council calls for an overhaul of the City's expense budget structure to create and reorganize the U/As in the budget so that they correspond to actual programs. Appendix A includes the list of recommendations from the Council that the administration should consider.

Bolstering Agency Operations for Greater Efficiency

In response to the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary budget, the Council has identified several agency shortfalls that detrimentally impact various City agencies' ability to provide services effectively and with greater efficiency. Agencies such as the Department of Investigation, Department of Buildings, Landmarks Preservation Commission, the Equal Employment Practices Commission, and the Office of Building Energy and Emissions Performance need additional staff in order to carry out their work; while the cultural community and small businesses need an influx of support in the wake of the pandemic as these sectors begin to build back. Finally, it is important to recognize that pay parity for our Emergency Medical Services workers is still a priority of this Council; EMS salaries must be competitive with other first responders so that these frontline worker positions can be retained.

Additional Support for the Cultural Community

The Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan does not adequately fund the City's cultural organizations as they recover from the economic impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic. The cultural community is not only an economic driver but is also the foundation for much of what makes New York City vibrant, healthy, and alive. The Council calls on the Administration to support cultural organizations by adding an additional $50 million in the Fiscal 2023 Executive Expense Budget for the Department of Cultural Affairs to support Cultural Institution Group (CIGs), provide across-the-board grant increases for all Cultural Development Fund recipients and support the City's artists.

E-Commerce/Online Small Business Support

Small businesses are the backbone of the economy and what makes New York City neighborhoods unique and vibrant. The COVID-19 pandemic had a devastating impact on New York City's small businesses. The once prosperous small business community has experienced a sharp decline in revenue and many continue to struggle to keep their doors open. The Council calls upon the Administration to invest $1.5 million to help businesses launch online storefronts and to innovate and adapt to meet the changing needs of the current and future economy. Many small businesses do not have the bandwidth, resources or tools for selling goods and services over the internet and need the City's support.

Enhance DOI Investigative Staff to Combat Corruption

The Department of Investigation strives to fight fraud, waste, and abuse. Following staff reductions as a result of COVID-19 savings, the agency is seeking to strengthen its operations by adding 18 investigative employees for $1.6 million. Twelve would be assigned to various squads, while six would be responsible for investigating capital projects. The requests would also add $709,000 for compliance with secure storage of sensitive city information in accordance with Executive Order 86. The Administration previously denied these requests. The Council calls on the Administration to fund the DOI request of $2.3 million.

Enhance Office of Building Energy and Emissions Performance (OBEEP)

Presently in Fiscal 2022, the Office of Building Energy and Emissions Performance (OBEEP) within the Department of Buildings has only six staff dedicated to assist with the implementation of the City's Local Law 97 of 2019, which limits building emissions. To ensure Local Law 97 is fully implemented as mandated, the Council calls on the Administration to include baseline funding of $450,000 in the Fiscal 2023 Executive Budget for six additional positions within OBEEP to assist with Local Law 97 implementation.

Restore Funding for Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) Headcount

The Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan includes baseline savings of $323,000 beginning in Fiscal 2023 related to a reduction of six LPC staff positions that are currently vacant. The Council calls upon the Administration to restore and baseline $323,000 in the Fiscal 2023 Executive Budget for these positions.

Restore Funding for the Department of Buildings (DOB) Headcount

The Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan includes savings of $6.5 million in Fiscal 2023 and $6.2 million in Fiscal 2024 and in the outyears related to a reduction of 81 DOB staff positions that were vacant. This reduction is being made at a time when the need for construction sites inspections and enforcement are on the rise. As such, the Council calls on the Administration to restore and baseline $6.5 million in the Executive Budget for the 81 positions removed from DOB's budget in the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan.

Increase Staff to Support Equitable Employment

The Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC) is entrusted with auditing, reviewing, and monitoring the equal employment practices of New York City. The EEPC is also one of the City's smallest entities, with only 14 budgeted staff. With vacancies, attrition, and extra obligations as a result of Local Law 13 of 2019, the EEPC has workers undertaking a variety of additional job responsibilities. By increasing the budgeted headcount to 17 by adding three positions, the EEPC staff would improve its specialized workforce, and better perform its function of reviewing the employment practices in New York. The Council calls on the Administration to add $295,000 for three additional staff lines.

Small Business Residence Fund

Minority- and Women-Owned Business Enterprises (MWBEs) continue to face unprecedented challenges as they navigate COVID-19 pandemic. The Council calls upon the Administration to establish a $75,000 grant program for MWBEs to help them find relief, assist them in competing against others in their industry and to encourage hiring from surrounding communities.

Workforce Development Centers

It is important to invest in the City's human capital infrastructure. Now more than ever post-pandemic workers who have shouldered job losses and struggled with employment during the economic downturn need the City's investment. The Council calls upon the Administration to expand the network of Workforce1 Career Centers and include additional training programs that provide workers with the skills to stay competitive in a global marketplace.

Permits to Operate Beachfront Kiosks

In order to make the City beaches more competitive with other tourist destinations in the region, as well as to create additional jobs and to raise revenue for the City, the Council calls on the Administration to issue permits that would allow businesses to operate beachfront kiosks. These kiosks would be able to rent or sell beach amenities and equipment during the summer beach season.

Emergency Medical Services (EMS) Pay Parity

EMS members are the lowest paid first responders in New York City, and the Council has consistently advocated for wage equity. We urge the Administration to raise EMS salaries to be competitive with other first responders. Prior to his election, Mayor Adams stated that EMS personnel required parity. The Council requests that the Administration include wage parity in future contract discussions with EMS members. The Administration should also conduct an analysis to assess the cost of phasing in a salary increase for EMS personnel, as well as modifying the Fire Department's (FDNY) wage scales for emergency medical technicians and paramedics to be more in line with other higher paid emergency medical responders. The approximately 4,600 members of EMS, including EMTs and paramedics, earn much less than other emergency responders in New York City and other EMS services across the country. Following negotiations in the summer of 2021, the EMS union stated "the City categorically refused to provide pay parity or anything that approximated pay parity for EMS First Responders in the FDNY".

Creating a Path to Success for Our City's Children & Youth

While the pandemic may have paused opportunities for our City's youngest residents, now is the time to begin rebuilding and investing in programs that will create a path to success for our children and youth. Beginning with our youngest children, resources are needed to bring pay parity to early education child care workers, including special education pre-kindergarten (Pre-K) teachers and child care directors and assistant directors. By investing in the early childhood education workforce, these centers will not only be able to retain quality staff, but also provide the ability for families to return to in-person work by having child care centers adequately staffed.

Continued investments in schools are also imperative for this coming fiscal year. While the influx of federal stimulus funding allowed the Department of Education to fund programs to address learning loss during the pandemic, additional supports are needed in schools for historically underserved students, including students in foster care and temporary housing, special education students, and English Language Learners. Additionally, the City should continue to provide opportunities for students that seek to succeed in alternative pathways after high school by investing in more Career and Technical Education, thus helping students build on the skills they need to enter the workforce.

Our City's youth also need programming outside of school that provides work experience and can be used as the first step towards long-term workforce development. The Council calls upon the Administration to continue to build on employment opportunities for our youth through an expansion of year-round youth employment programs that matches the recent expansion of the Summer Youth Employment Program (SYEP), and expand the Work, Learn, Grow program that strengthens work readiness skills and allows youth to explore career possibilities.

Lastly, we cannot forget the over 700,000 working-age New Yorkers that have earned some college credits, but did not earn a degree from the City University of New York (CUNY). We need to re-engage these individuals and provide the necessary support to allow them to finish their degrees and advance their careers.

Apprenticeship Expansion

The Council urges the Administration to restore the $1.5 million for the ApprenticeNYC program, which provides participants with limited or no prior experience, with paid, full-time apprenticeships to learn skills needed to meet employer demands. By funding ApprenticeNYC, the City ensures that New Yorkers have the tools they need to fill in-demand jobs such as those in the growing technology industry.

Pay Parity for Special Education Pre-K Providers

In November 2021, DOE posted a regional need memo that demonstrated a need for more than 900 additional special education pre-school seats in order to meet the City's legal obligation to provide a seat to every child with an Individualized Education Program (IEP) that requires one. The Council estimates that this need will continue to grow as enrollment increases and aligns to pre-pandemic figures. In order to better support CBO providers who continue to face closure and staff shortages at special education Pre-K centers, the Administration must address the salary disparities that exist between these CBO staff and DOE operated sites. A $30 million baselined investment would allow preschool special education programs to address recruitment and retention challenges, in addition to stabilizing special education Pre-K programs.

Hire Additional Mental Health, Career Counseling, and Guidance Counselors
The Council has demonstrated its commitment in the previous budget cycles to ensure all of our students have access to social and emotional support programs, including social workers and guidance counselors. Research shows that taking a holistic approach for students, not only improve their health and well-being, but also has a positive impact on academic success. The Council will continue to advocate for social and emotional support programs. District 79 schools work with some of our most vulnerable student populations, including, but not limited to, education for 17-21 year-olds, adult education, young adult borough centers, Pathways to Graduation, and court involved youth. With over 422 programs in District 79, the Council believes it is of the utmost importance for DOE to have dedicated social workers and guidance counselors at these schools. In line with these priorities, the Council calls on the Administration to invest $14.1 million to hire social workers and guidance counselors at 100 schools in Fiscal 2023, with a plan to reach all District 79 schools by Fiscal 2026. Additionally, the Council calls on DOE to expand career counseling within these programs to ensure graduation and job placement.

Citywide Expansion of Restorative Justice
The mental health and overall wellbeing of our students continues to be a priority for the Council, who recognizes the impact of the pandemic on our youth's mental health. With a school population that mirrors the rich diversity of New York City, we must dismantle the school to prison pipeline and ensure our students receive holistic services and support they need to succeed in their academic careers into post-graduation. Restorative justice practices have demonstrated success in schools across New York City and around the country. Research shows improvement of academic outcomes, a shift in school climate, and overall positive impact on school staff. For this reason, the Council calls on the Administration to expand restorative justice practicum in 250 schools in Fiscal 2023, growing to 500 schools by Fiscal 2024. The Council calls for a $59 million investment in restorative justice coordinators in 250 schools next fiscal year, as well as funding restorative justice training for all staff and school community members.

Hire Additional DOE Community Coordinators
In the 2020-2021 school year, more than 101,000 city students experienced homelessness, of which 28,000 spent time in shelters. Of these students, only 52 percent graduated on time, and 60 percent were chronically absent. Advocates, community members, and other school stakeholders have emphasized the importance of DOE hiring dedicated staff to work with this student population and their families in shelters. Community coordinators are necessary in connecting these students and their families to essential resources, providing guidance in navigating the school system, addressing attendance barriers, and providing holistic support. The Council calls on the Administration to add $12 million to the Executive Budget to hire 100 shelter-based DOE Community Coordinators to help students who are unhoused get to school every day

and receive educational support and hire 10 regional managers and two regional support directors to oversee this coordination.

Fund One Additional Staff for the Office of Foster Care Students

In Fall 2021, after years of advocacy, DOE committed to hiring the first-ever team to focus on the educational needs of students in foster care; students who have the lowest graduation rate of any student group at only 34 percent. Unfortunately, only three of the seven positions in this team have been posted on DOE's website, with the other four positions held up due to the hiring freeze. We call on the Administration to lift the hiring freeze and use existing resources to post for the remaining four positions.

Provide Additional Supports to English Language Learners

English Language Learners mirror the rich diversity of New York City, and many of the identities the Council itself represents, and it remains a Council priority to provide ELLs with the appropriate support they need to succeed academically. It is concerning that in 2019, only nine percent of ELLs were proficient in reading and 19 percent of ELLs were proficient in math. We urge the Administration to invest $12 million in Fiscal 2023 to support the hiring of 120 ELL Instructional Specialists at DOE schools with high ELL populations.

Expand Career and Technical Education

Career and Technical Education (CTE) has proven to be an effective method to prepare students with the necessary skills for successful careers post-graduation. Currently, DOE allocates $10.3 million for CTE programming to high schools across the City. This funding in Fiscal 2022 supported 83 schools, and the Council proposes to double the current investment and add another $10.3 million in CTE programs for Fiscal 2023 to make CTE programming available in over 160 schools.

Fund Arts and Music Education

Arts and music instruction are vital components of educational programming and help students develop motor skills, language, and social skills, and tap into creative outlets, in addition to being mandated by the State to be provided at schools. Rather than giving schools a suggested per capita arts allocation, DOE should require schools to dedicate arts funding to the arts with a minimum of $100 per student for core arts instruction and programming. The Council calls on DOE to dedicate a portion of the $1.3 billion in federal stimulus American Rescue Plan (ARP) funding in Fiscal 2023 to support a minimum of $100 per student for core arts instruction and programming, which currently stands at $79 per student.

Expand Youth Employment Programs

Each day, hundreds of thousands of parents and caregivers depend upon programs offered by New York City to ensure the safety and grow the potential of their children while they work to support their families. The City's most vulnerable and at-risk youth must be given the tools that can help them transcend their difficult circumstances and become independent, successful adults. Over the past few years, the Council has been a strong advocate for youth opportunity, securing additional slots for the Summer Youth Employment Program (SYEP) and making the program the largest it has ever been. However, the proposed budget for Fiscal 2023 leaves programs for youth underfunded. The Council calls upon the Administration to invest an additional $43.2 million to expand core youth employment programs such as Work Learn Grow (WLG) and Advance & Learn to more closely match SYEP slots. WLG helps participants build work skills and aptitude by launching them into the diverse work opportunities available through direct exposure and access to paid workforce programs. WLG should be funded to cover an additional 9,800 slots for Fiscal 2023 above the baseline of 2,200 slots, and going forward, WLG should be ultimately funded to support approximately 30 percent of SYEP participants. Additional funding of $13.9 million for Advance & Earn will assist approximately 1,000 disconnected young adults who are currently not working nor in school to find year-round jobs. Investing in these services now will have long-term benefits not only for individuals, but for the City as a whole. Additionally, the Administration should be closely tracking the success of post-SYEP hiring of participants by companies, so we can monitor the progress and know where additional efforts are needed.

Expand Summer Rising

Summer Rising is a program that blends academic support and school-based enrichment with opportunities to play, create, and explore on a daily basis, igniting a sense of wonder, joy, and a lifelong love of learning. The Council is pleased to learn that the Mayor intends to expand the Summer Rising program for Summer 2022 to accommodate 110,000 slots, which will be welcomed by the community.

We are aware that there is the possibility of an increase in the price per participant reimbursement rate for Summer Rising, and we support this idea wholeheartedly. However, we have concerns regarding the price per participant reimbursement rate for other DYCD contracts. Under the current agreements, two summer programs at the same organization could be receiving vastly different funding rates based not on program quality or deliverables but because of the undervaluing of this work and a delayed contracting process. Hence, the Council calls upon the Administration to increase the price for participant rate for Beacons, Cornerstones, Community Centers, COMPASS, and other program contracts at DYCD to guarantee equity between different youth-serving programs. The Council also urges the Administration to work with providers to ensure capacity, proper reimbursement and address the issues and concerns of providers that existed before this expansion.

Improving Access to Health, Mental Health, and Safety

The pandemic shed light on the glaring disparities in the City's health services, which still need to be addressed as our communities begin to recover. As we enter our third year of the pandemic, we have seen the impact of the inequities in investments for certain neighborhoods, especially communities of color. That is why the Council supports the Adams Administration's inclusion of $30 million to address maternal and child health. These new programs include home visiting programs and increased access to doulas and midwives. However, the Council urges the Administration to focus the funding in Black and Brown communities, where it is most needed. Black and Brown women are 8 to 12 times as likely to die from pregnancy related complications when compared with white women. The $30 million investment is just a start to address this gross injustice. Below we outline additional steps to address some of the most pressing needs facing New Yorkers.

Our hospitals also need more support, and through the creation of a pilot stabilization fund for our public hospitals and hospitals in geographically isolated communities, a lifeline can be extended to these hospitals that are struggling financially. Investments in more mental health services are also needed, especially for our City's older adult population as well as deploying social workers with first responders for non-violent emergency calls. Finally, the Council calls for the creation of the State's first Trauma Recovery Centers, which is an innovative model to provide health, recovery, and stability to communities that experience disproportionate amounts of violent activities.

Hospital Fund

The COVID-19 pandemic has had a devastating impact on the health care system, but especially hospitals. Many of New York City's small hospitals are struggling to fund the upfront costs to pay for the increase in services incurred during this pandemic. The City, with the help of Goldman Sachs created a $45 million Hospital Stabilization Fund to grant hospitals some relief to buy supplies and to pay their workforce. However, this amount of funding is not enough to assist all the hospitals in New York City. The Council calls on the Administration to include an additional $45 million to create a fund that supports hospitals in geographically isolated communities and for Health + Hospitals (H+H) facilities with high patient volumes.

Expand B-HEARD

The Behavioral Health Emergency Assistance Response Division (B-HEARD) program responds to mental health emergencies with emergency medical technicians and social workers instead of police. The program has been operated by NYC Health + Hospitals and the Fire Department of New York (FDNY) since June 2021, as a pilot program in North Manhattan, with expansions from five precincts to 11 in November 2021 and March 2022, including areas of North Manhattan and the South Bronx. The Fiscal 2022 budget for the program originally totaled $112 million and was reduced by $61.6 million to $50.4 million in the November 2021 Plan from a technical adjustment that used City funding instead of federal funding. The program is only funded in the current fiscal year, and the Council calls on the Administration to fund the program in Fiscal 2023 and expand the program by $10 million to $61 million. The increase would allow the program to expand to between 3 and 5 new precincts, recruit the social workers needed, and evolve to be responsive to a higher portion of mental –health-related calls within its catchment areas. The Administration should also perform an analysis to show the impact the program is having on the precincts where it currently operates, including comparisons to other jurisdictions and areas for improvement, and the cost to continue expansion around the City.

Create New York State's First Trauma Recovery Centers (TRCs)
Trauma recovery centers (TRCs) are an innovative model of victim services that reach underserved victims and communities to provide health, recovery, and stability to heal communities and interrupt cycles of violence. TRCs provide trauma-informed clinical case management, evidence-based individual/group/family therapy, crisis intervention. They also provide legal advocacy and assistance in filing police reports and accessing victim services to survivors in communities that experience the most violence. These survivors often never access or are even aware of victim services, which are available at no cost to the patient. The Administration should include $8.4 million in funding to create a TRC in each borough with two in the Bronx and two in Brooklyn.

24-Hour Overdose Prevention in Every Borough
NYC launched the first two Overdose Prevention Centers (OPCs) in the Country in December 2021. The OPCs prevent and reverse overdoses, saving lives. In addition, they reduce and remove drug paraphernalia and waste from public spaces. The OPCs also act as a hub for other necessary services, such as mental health evaluations and referrals, group counseling, syringe exchange and other amenities. The Administration should build off this success through a $10 million investment of City or private funding to expand overdose prevention efforts in every borough.

Diabetes Prevention
More than 700,000 adult New Yorkers have diabetes, a disease that can damage blood vessels and lead to heart disease and stroke, as well as nerve damage, kidney disease, and other health problems. An estimated 1.3 million adult New Yorkers have prediabetes, or higher-than-normal blood glucose levels, but many are unaware they have the condition. Diabetes disproportionately affects New York City's low-income and working-class communities, leading to an undue burden of mass illness, amputation, blindness, and kidney failure. The Council calls on the Administration to allocate $500,000 in funds to increase diabetes prevention activities in neighborhoods with high rates of obesity and chronic disease in New York City. This funding would be used to support the Diabetes Self-Management Program (DSMP), a program to improve nutrition and exercise to reduce blood sugar and educate communities about the risks of getting diabetes.

Expand Mental Health Care to Communities Hardest Hit by COVID-19
The pandemic and the resulting economic distress have negatively affected many New Yorkers' mental health and created new barriers for the efforts of COVID-19 response and recovery. In fact, communities from the hardest hit areas by COVID-19 continue to struggle with mental and emotional distress. The Council urges the Administration to include $3 million to expand direct mental health services within the 33 communities hardest hit by COVID-19. To better serve these

communities, the Council recommends that the program be available mainly in places of worship, community centers and public spaces.

Geriatric Mental Health throughout the Older Adult Network

DFTA's Geriatric Mental Health Program (DGMH) embeds mental health clinicians in community-based older adult centers. The Council calls for $8.7 million in funding to expand clinicians into all 108 Older Adult Centers that are currently able to support clinicians and double the supply of hours so that more older adults can access counseling. Asian-American elders have suffered due to the rise in hate crimes, and BIPOC and LGBTQIA+ elders also have important mental health needs that can be addressed by a broader DGMH network.

Support Eye Care Pilot Program

The Council calls on the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to include $1.4 million to start a pilot program that would create a vision exam mobile bus that would travel around the five boroughs and provide free eye exams and glasses for low-income New Yorkers. This mobile bus would provide free eye exams and glasses to any individual whose income doesn't exceed more than 250 percent of the Federal Poverty Level. Many New Yorkers live with uncorrected vision and do not have the means to afford glasses or even to take the exam.

Restore and Increase Funding for Animal Care Center

A $3.4 million investment should be included in Fiscal 2023 to support expanded services for Animal Care Centers (ACC). Specifically, there should be $1.5 million to increase medical services intended to save animal lives, $300,000 for site security, $700,000 for community pet outreach, and $500,000 for mobile adoption programs. In addition, $350,000 should be used to address attrition problems at ACC, as employees have not received a COLA in recent years.

Invest in Preventative Services

New York City is still feeling the impacts of COVID-19, but the amount of federal funding and state funding is decreasing. To support public health and prevent comorbidities that lead to more severe cases of COVID-19, the City has launched the Public Health Corps, funded at only $50 million. The Public Health Corps focuses on expanding the public health workforce, strengthening community health infrastructure, and promoting health equity for the communities hit hardest by the COVID-19 pandemic. The Administration should use federal funding and double this funding to $100 million to ensure that all the communities hardest hit by COVID-19 have adequate support services.

Support Communities Affected by Hate Crimes

The Council passed Local Law 46 in 2019, establishing the Mayor's Office for the Prevention of Hate Crimes (OPHC), which was funded at $730,000. The plague of hate crimes has persisted in the City, disproportionately impacting the Jewish and Asian communities. The Council allocated resources for these groups through its Hate Crime Prevention and Asian American Pacific Islander Community Support initiatives. The Council urges additional action to enhance the prevention and response to hate crimes, as well as increased participation and support for affected communities. To demonstrate our unity and to protect our City's invaluable diversity, the Council calls on the Administration to invest additional resources of $5 million to support the work of community organizations.

Create Community-Based Solutions for Violence Interruption

The City has been beset by tragedies stemming from increased violence which is part of a trend in cities across the nation. While the Administration and the Council have increased funding for the Crisis Management System (CMS) and the Domestic Violence and Empowerment Initiative, more attention must be given to organizations operating outside of CMS that are doing critical youth intervention work in neighborhoods impacted by violence to improve safety. An investment of $3 million would support community organizations that work alongside precincts across the City and supplement CMS in targeted Council Districts with the highest rates of violence, providing services for longer term solutions and more direct community engagement.

Expansion of Saturday Night Lights Program

The Fiscal 2022 budget included an investment of $7 million that expanded the Saturday Night Lights (SNL) program. DYCD in partnership with multiple City agencies and community-based organizations provide free, recreational programming to youth in communities that are disproportionately impacted by the criminal justice system. Programming includes organized sports, dancing, music, and special guest lectures that typically occur during out-of-school hours to keep youth engaged in constructive activities. Services are provided in all five boroughs on Saturday nights for youth ages 11-18. The goal of the program is to offer engaging activities in safe spaces during the hours when risk of youth-involved violence is at its highest, while also creating opportunities for law enforcement and young people to build trusting relationships through the program. The Council urges the administration to further the investment with additional funding of $5 million annually to support the program.

Increase Mental Health Supports and Outreach Services for Unhoused Individuals

The Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Budget includes $11.5 million in funding for the Street Health Outreach and Wellness (SHOW) units for Fiscal 2022. The Council calls on the Administration to baseline $11.5 million for SHOW services for unsheltered individuals. The Council calls for H+H to continue building on the success of the program. Considering recent incidents involving unsheltered homeless individuals, there should be an increased investment in SHOW to provide mental health services, physical health services, and housing outreach services for unsheltered individuals. There are currently six vans in operation and three more are being on-boarded. The Council also urges the Administration to expand services to include health services for unhoused LGBTQIA+ individuals, such as Pre-Exposure Prophylaxis (PrEP), post-exposure prophylaxis (PEP), and condom distribution, as well as referrals to H+H's LGBTQIA+ outreach workers.

Increasing Equitable Access to Benefit Programs for ALL New Yorkers

Human services vendors and their employees are a vital arm of the City's government, as many City agencies rely on their non-profit partners to deliver their core public services. Contracted nonprofit providers work with approximately 2.5 million New Yorkers each year. Department for Homeless Services (DHS), Department for the Aging (DFTA), and Department of Youth and Community Development (DYCD), for example, contract out almost all their programs to non-profit human service providers. These providers deliver some of the most essential public services to New Yorkers including foster care, homeless shelters, after-school programs, and social adult day care among others. Additionally, these services are predominantly provided by not only women, but women of color. Before any additional investments in the public services sectors can be called for, equity in wages needs to be addressed.

Equitable access to public benefits remains a challenge for many populations across the City. There needs to be increased coordination among City agencies that provide public benefits and Community-Based Organization (CBO) partners so that individuals and families that qualify for benefits are enrolled. Additionally, City agencies that administer public assistance, rental vouchers, homeless intake, legal services, and supportive housing must not only have the necessary staffing to review applications in a timely manner but also have systems in place that make the application process less burdensome on the individual. All these services should be provided in a culturally competent manner that meets the needs of our City's immigrant and LGBTQIA+ populations.

The pandemic also exacerbated food insecurity, and many New Yorkers continue to rely on food pantries, soup kitchens, and older adult meal programs. Nearly 1.5 million New Yorkers now experience food insecurity, including one in four children and, according to Feeding America, food insecurity surged 36 percent during the pandemic and 46 percent among children across the City. The Administration must make additional investments in the Emergency Food Assistance Program, expand the home-delivered meal programs for older adults, and continue to fund meal programs that were set up during the pandemic and serve populations that may not qualify for long-standing City meal programs.

The City also must continue to address the needs of our older adult population by ensuring that they are not placed on a waitlist for essential services and have access to virtual programming , as many still may not be able to participate in older adult center programming in-person.

Fund Cost of Living Adjustments for Human Service Providers

The City's human services workforce are among the lowest paid workers in the City and have not received a Cost of Living Adjustment (COLA) since Fiscal 2020, leaving frontline workers without a COLA in the middle of a pandemic. As a first step toward the goal of wage equity, the Council calls on the Administration to baseline a four percent COLA, or $60 million increase for human service workers. Anticipating regular wage increases to keep up with cost-of-living increases in the budget is standard practice for City workers, the City should do the same for its contracted public sector workforce.

Extend Pay Parity to Day Care Directors

In Fiscal 2020, the Council and the Administration secured a historic win that addressed the pay disparity that existed between early childhood education teachers at community-based organizations with that of their DOE site counterparts. Yet despite these efforts, the issue of pay disparity within the realm of early childhood education still exists. A workforce that is predominantly led by women of color, non-DOE early childhood education directors and assistant directors currently have a maximum salary of $60,000. Early childhood education staff were vital to the City's pandemic response and will continue to be essential as we move towards recovery. An investment of $21 million will bring early childhood directors and assistant directors to parity with their DOE counterparts.

CUNY Reconnect

The pursuit of a higher education is one of many possible paths to success for our young people, but the road to acquiring a degree is not always clear. The Council calls upon the Administration to make a concerted Citywide effort to invest $23 million to fund a program to re-engage 700,000 working-age New Yorkers with some college credits but no degree to complete their college degrees, advance their careers and boost their incomes. This will power the City's economic recovery from the pandemic and increase equity. The City must recognize the unique challenges that returning adult students face, and invest in reforms such as financial aid, scholarships, child-care services, pre-enrollment counseling and flexible scheduling options that make returning to college more convenient.

Client Services Staffing and Systems Upgrades for Benefits and Housing Assistance

The Council calls on the Administration to ensure HRA has adequate staffing for the timely review and processing of public assistance benefits, rental vouchers, and supportive housing. Clients seeking public assistance, placements in supportive housing, and approval of rental vouchers should not be delayed due to staffing constraints. HRA should also explore improvements to the technology and systems that are currently used to improve turnaround times and increase efficiency and accuracy to ensure that clients receive assistance in a time-conscious manner so that clients do not lose out on benefits or housing placements due to processing delays.

Increase Access to Public Benefits

There are many City residents who are eligible for public benefit programs that are not currently enrolled, which has become even more problematic since the onset of the pandemic and the ensuing increased need for assistance. The City should increase access to public benefits such as Supplemental Nutrition Assistance (SNAP), cash assistance, Medicaid, and tax credit programs by adding $10 million to HRA's budget to engage community-based organizations to do outreach and education, to increase staff at HRA to process applications and assist clients, to improve inter-agency coordination, and to streamline the benefits application process.

Ensure Baseline Funding for the Right to Counsel Initiative is Adequate

Given the end of the eviction moratoria and the economic impact of the pandemic in the City, there may be an increased demand for housing-related legal services for low-income City residents. The Council calls on the Administration to ensure the Right to Counsel program, contracted under HRA's Office of Civil Justice (OCJ), is adequately resourced to address the current need and that it will add additional funding if needed.

Restore Source of Income Unit Staff and Funding

The City Commission on Human Rights (CCHR) began investigating and responding to claims of source (SOI) discrimination in housing in 2018. Discrimination based on SOI undermines housing voucher programs that aid New Yorkers in finding housing. CCHR's SOI Unit responds to claims and intervenes to prevent discriminatory practices. The Human Resources Administration (HRA) also investigates SOI matters, and in the November 2021 Plan, the HRA SOI Unit was transferred to CCHR and staffing increased from five positions to 24 positions. In the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan, 18 of the 19 positions were eliminated, with savings of $486,000. Recognizing the need for New Yorkers to find stable housing, the Council calls on the Administration to restore the 18 positions and $486,000 that was reduced in the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan.

Increase HRA's EFAP Baseline Budget

The Emergency Food Assistance Program (EFAP) has historically provided shelf-stable and limited frozen food items to emergency food providers across the City. The Council has called on the Administration to incorporate fresh foods into the program for many years and in February, HRA announced that EFAP will soon expand its food offerings to include fresh foods, but the baseline budget did not increase and remains at $23.8 million. Fresh food costs more to procure than shelf-stable foods, and providers would not have as much purchasing power for food without an appropriate baseline adjustment to EFAP. The Council proposes HRA add $11.2 million to the EFAP baseline budget to bring it to $35 million.

Seamless Meal Transition for Older Adults Using GetFood Recovery Meals

Supporting older adults with nutritious meals has been critical during the pandemic. The GetFood Recovery Meals program expires in Fiscal 2022, which serves approximately 10,000 older adults. While DFTA estimates that about 3,000 older adults currently receiving a recovery meal could transition over to DFTA's Home-Delivered Meals (HDM) program, the remaining 7,000 older adults are still in need of meal services. The Administration should add $30 million in funding to ensure every older adult who needs a meal next year has one. These meals must be culturally responsive, and include vegetarian, halal, kosher, Latin and pan-Asian meals.

Fund HDM Expansion and Weekend & Holiday Meals for Older Adults

Additional funding is needed in DFTA's budget to combat hunger for older adults. The Council calls for a $9.7 million investment that would address the continued growth in demand for the home-delivered meal (HDM) program for older adults, while $3 million would provide weekend and holiday home-delivered meals, which are not included in current contracts. These meals must be culturally responsive, and include vegetarian, halal, kosher, Latin and pan-Asian meals.

Clear the Homecare and Case Management Waitlists

As the diverse older adult population and their needs grow, DFTA continues to struggle with limited capacity for core services like case management and homecare. There are approximately 400 people on the homecare waitlist and 1,200 on the case management waitlist. The Council calls for $7 million to clear these waitlists and provide services to those in need, as older adults should not be placed on waitlists to receive essential services.

IT Education for Older Adults

The Council proposes to expand DFTA's virtual programming accessibility, through an online database, devices and connectivity, as well as technology support provided by community-based organizations. A $7.5 million investment would allow for one-part time staff at DFTA Older Adult Centers and Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities to train older adults in technology.

Conduct Community Resource Disparity Study

The COVID-19 pandemic has further exposed and brought to the forefront the disparities in services across the City. To begin to address these disparities, the Council calls upon the Administration to conduct a comprehensive Citywide Disparity Study to assess and identify significant gaps in services across the City. Using community profile data, census data and other available information, this study should focus on community access to healthcare, education, affordable housing, transportation, and public Safety and should be disaggregated by Council District. The study should result in a public report which highlights the communities with the greatest needs and be used to develop plans to rectify these inequities.

Expedite Universal Broadband

With over 29 percent of New York City households lacking access to broadband at home, the Administration should expedite the plan to achieve universal broadband across the City. Internet connectivity has become a necessity, and the pandemic has highlighted the increased dependency on internet access for all. Many of the communities hardest hit by COVID-19 have experienced health and socioeconomic inequities, including a lack of access to an affordable and reliable home and mobile broadband. Universal Broadband is a means to bridge the digital divide in New York City. Ensuring all students have internet access and providing internet access to New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) residents should be an immediate focus. The Administration should also consider developing a voucher program for low-income households including those in the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP). Furthermore, because many of the City's resources are exclusively online, the City should develop a Digital Literacy curriculum and program to educate New Yorkers on how to access those resources.

Expand Language Access

New York City is home to the most linguistic diversity of any city in the world, and there are limited resources available to serve the 1.8 million New Yorkers with limited English proficiency. City agencies woefully lack the staff needed to communicate in the multiple languages spoken in the New York metro area. The pandemic has exposed how crucial language access remains for COVID-19 response and recovery. Accessibility to City services and benefits and doing business in the city remain a challenge due to a lack of appropriate language translation and interpretation. As the immigrant population continues to rise, so does the need for access to skilled language professionals. The Council calls on the Administration to include $5 million to expand language access in three ways: increasing access to language services in City agencies; improving the quality of translation by creating a Community Interpreter Bank; and providing employment and business opportunities for immigrant communities by developing worker-owned cooperatives.

Support Our City, Our Vote

With the passage of Intro 1867, New York City has an opportunity to encourage greater civic engagement and mobilize our communities to advocate for good public policies that invest in and enhance our city. By December 2022, the law might go into effect and eligible non-citizens will be able to register to vote in City elections starting in 2023. To effectively implement this legislation, the Council recommends a $25 million investment by the Administration to support community-based outreach to all New York City eligible voters, regardless of their citizenship status. The community-based outreach includes voter education, registration assistance, and get-out-the-vote activities. In addition, this funding would provide language access, interpretation and translation to support those that are English Language Limited.

Double Baseline Funding for Adult Literacy Programs

The City's Adult Literacy Programs have provided immigrants with the tools to achieve higher levels of literacy – which are associated with greater health knowledge, use of healthcare services, and the ability to manage chronic health conditions and communicate with healthcare providers. Currently, there are more than 2.2 million adults in New York City without English language proficiency or a high school diploma. The Council calls on the Administration to include $13.5 million to increase the baselined funding to $27 million. This will allow the City to double the level of investment per student in the upcoming DYCD RFP.

Enhance the Adult Literacy Pilot Project

The Pilot Project provides support services and funds digital literacy, professional development, and contextualized curriculum and instruction. The Council calls on the Administration to extend the Adult Literacy Pilot Project for a second year and expand it to $5 million to continue to support the 20 programs currently funded as well as to include another 20 programs to address the wider need for additional student supports, services and resources.

Investing in a Cleaner & Greener NYC

Public spaces continue to be a haven for our residents as the pandemic begins to recede. Maintaining and investing in the City's sanitation and park services not only increases the quality of life for our residents, but also makes the City more welcoming as tourism begins to flourish again. While sanitation and park services have been operating at reduced levels since the start of the pandemic due to budgetary constraints, now is the time to make the City's Department of Sanitation (DSNY) and Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) budgets reflect the increased need in services. Funding is needed for a variety of sanitation and park programs and staffing to provide these services including corner basket pick-up, rat mitigation, graffiti removal, parks clean-up and maintenance, and new public waste containers. Additionally, to ensure that our City becomes more environmentally sustainable, composting and organics programs need to be ramped up, in addition to educational programs around waste reduction.

Parks Department Maintenance and Summer Workforce

The Department of Parks and Recreation's (DPR) maintenance and summer workforce employees are vital components of the Department's core program. These maintenance workers pick up litter, maintain gardens, wipe away graffiti, maintain parks and playgrounds, and offer a fixed-post presence in parks citywide. However, the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan does not include the more than $42 million funding for up to 3,500 seasonal workers for DPR's City Cleanup Corps (CCC) program previously made possible by federal stimulus funding in Fiscal 2022 to help keep City parks clean or the $10 million in funding needed for 150 park maintenance workers funded in the Fiscal 2022 Adopted Budget. As such, the Council calls on the Administration to include $52 million in the Fiscal 2023 Executive Budget for the Parks Maintenance program to ensure that DPR has adequate workforce to keep the City's greenspaces clean and safe.

Restore Sanitation's Fiscal 2023 Budget Cuts

Over the past several fiscal years, the City's Department of Sanitation (DSNY) has received steep cuts to the programs and services it provides. In addition to prior year cuts, the Fiscal 2023 budget proposes further reductions to DSNY's budget by $47.8 million in Fiscal 2023, growing to $51.7 million in the outyears mainly for uniform headcount cuts, civilian vacancy cuts, and programmatic reductions that would otherwise expand the curbside organics collection program. The Council urges the Administration to restore and baseline headcount reductions for garage utility/splinter group personnel and civilian vacancies, as well as restore and baseline $18.2 million in headcount and programmatic reductions which halted expansion of curbside organics collection program.

Restore & Baseline Prior-Year Sanitation Cuts

To address prior year cuts to the Department of Sanitation's budget, the Council calls upon the Administration to restore and baseline the following items to ensure the Department can respond adequately to collection and cleaning needs citywide.

- E-Waste Collection: $3.6 million to restore 38 uniform personnel for DSNY's curbside E-Waste collection program.

- Enforcement: $3.4 million to hire 50 uniform personnel for DSNY's illegal dumping enforcement operations.
- Lot Cleaning: $2.2 million to restore 37 uniform personnel for DSNY's lot cleaning operations.
- Street Sweeping: $2 million to restore 41 uniform personnel for DSNY's street sweeping operations.
- Highway Ramp Cleaning: $864,000 for DSNY's highway ramp cleaning program.

Litter Basket Service

Overflowing litter baskets continue to be a quality-of-life issue affecting New Yorkers citywide. To address overflowing litter baskets, the Council calls upon the Administration to baseline an additional $22 million in Fiscal 2023 and in the outyears to increase litter basket service in each district throughout the five boroughs to twice a day/six-day service.

Organic Drop-off Sites

Organic drop-off sites play an important role in diverting organic material from landfills, as well as composting the material for other uses. For Fiscal 2023, organic drop-off site funding reduces to $3.5 million from $7 million in Fiscal 2022. The Council calls upon the Administration to restore and baseline an additional $3.5 million in Fiscal 2023 for organic drop-off sites citywide.

Zero Waste Schools Educational Program & Stop'N'Swap Program

DSNY's Fiscal 2023 Budget does not restore funding for the Zero Waste school educational programs, as well as Stop'N'Swap sites citywide. These two programs play an important role in providing environmental education for our schools and diverting waste from landfills. The Council calls upon the Administration to baseline $3.1 million for these two important programs.

Rat Mitigation Program

The Department of Sanitation needs a robust rat mitigation budget to address rat issues within our City. The Council calls upon the Administration to baseline $4.8 million for rat mitigation programs to curtail infestation issues.

Public Waste Container Pilot

The Council calls on the Administration to include $935,000 in Fiscal 2023 to restore the waste containerization pilot.

Enhance the School Organics Collection Program

Schools play an important role in organic waste diversion; however, the Department plans to maintain current school service levels to 694 buildings moving into Fiscal 2023. The Council calls on the Administration to include an additional $793,000 in Fiscal 2023 and in the outyears to expand the school organics collection program.

Support a Save-As-You-Throw Study

With diversion rates hovering around 20 percent, the City needs to be bold and find innovative ways to divert waste from landfills. One idea is to conduct a "Save-As-You-Throw" study that would explore financial incentives for New Yorkers to divert more of their waste. The Council calls upon the Administration to include $1 million for a Save-As-You-Throw study on how New Yorkers can adopt this program and the effective education and outreach required to successfully implement it.

Protecting Housing Opportunities for New Yorkers & Investing in Homeless Services

Protecting housing opportunities for all New Yorkers is essential on our City's road to recovery. Housing instability undermines the ability of education, public health, and workforce investments to have meaningful impacts. Therefore, the City's budget should make strategic investments to not only maintain housing stability for those who currently have it, but also expand housing access so that all New Yorkers are able to take full advantage of the City's recovery.

For years, the City's middle- and working-class homeowners have faced rising tax bills driven by increased property values. While these higher values on paper are good news for those who view their property as an investment, the higher taxes make holding on to one's home more difficult. A property tax rebate targeted to these homeowners will provide some stability in a year when the State's foreclosure moratorium is ending.

Investing in permanent housing is far more economical and tied to improved outcomes compared to transitional housing. The City needs to create more supportive housing, especially for those involved in the foster care and justice system, as well as domestic violence survivors, in addition to seeking out creative ways to increase our affordable housing stock, so that individuals and families can use the City and State rental voucher program to move out of shelters to permanent housing. Additionally, the Administration needs to provide adequate funding for these rental assistance vouchers, as well as emergency assistance grants or "one-shots" that allow families to remain housed and not diverted to the shelter system.

Addressing street homelessness remains a challenge for our City and more needs to be done in terms of outreach and mental health supports for the unsheltered homeless and providing a safe place for these individuals to reside while receiving necessary wraparound supports. The City's homeless shelter system also needs to increase capacity, especially for runaway youth and survivors of domestic violence, so that these vulnerable populations are not turned away when seeking temporary housing options.

Supportive Housing for Justice Involved People

The City's supportive housing initiative, NYC 15/15, is reserved for individuals and families with certain disabilities who have been living in shelter or on the street for a year or more. People leaving jail, prison, or long-term hospital stays are excluded because they do not meet this "chronic homelessness" definition. In 2019, the Council negotiated a Points of Agreement to Close Rikers Island that included funding to expand the Justice Impacted Supportive Housing (JISH) program to 500 slots. The Executive Budget should include approximately $28.4 million to expand this program with an additional 1,000 beds that will provide holistic wraparound services in a supportive housing setting to justice impacted individuals citywide.

Supportive Housing for Foster Care Youth Aging Out

Youth aging out of foster care have a range of critical needs, including housing. These youth are overwhelmingly Black, Indigenous, and People of Color (BIPOC) and disproportionately

LGBTQIA+. ACS and HRA have a pilot program underway to distribute housing vouchers to certain foster youth, and others are connected to NYCHA or other housing placements. In addition to bolstering these efforts, and in conjunction with substantial new capital commitments for housing, the Council calls on the Administration to expand supportive housing development beyond its current 15/15 target of 15,000 units over 15 years and make supportive housing easily accessible for all former foster youth who need it.

Expand Eligibility for HPD Homeless Set-Asides and Supportive Housing to Homeless Survivors of Domestic Violence

The City should make homeless domestic violence (DV) survivors a priority population for permanent housing programs by expanding eligibility to include them for HPD's homeless set-asides and supportive housing placements under the NY 15/15 plan.

Restore Funding for the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) Headcount

It is imperative that the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) be allowed to maintain its current headcount for positions involved in executing financing and acquisition of properties, tenant protection enforcement, and supportive housing programming. These positions are vital to HPD's core mission and must be exempted from the citywide PEG savings plan. As such, the Council calls on the Administration to restore and baseline $1 million funding in the Executive Budget for 28 full-time positions removed from HPD's budget in the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan.

Expand Funding for Drop-in Centers, Safe Haven Beds, and Stabilization Beds

The Mayor released a Subway Safety Plan on February 18, 2022, in response to the recent increase in violent incidents in the subway system by homeless individuals, which called for 140 new Safe Haven Beds, 350 new Stabilization Beds, and new Drop-In Centers. Additionally, the Administration has started to clear homeless encampments, and very few individuals have transitioned over to the shelter system. No funding was added to the Preliminary Budget to fund these additional Safe Haven and Stabilization Beds, nor the additional Drop-In Centers. The Council believes that the Administration needs to go beyond the increase in beds outlined in the Subway Safety Plan, and calls on the Administration to add $114.9 million in funding to match the need for these types of beds that align with the number of unsheltered homeless individuals reported in the PMMR for Fiscal 2021. The Administration should add $104.9 million for 2,376 new Safe Haven and Stabilization Beds, inclusive of the 490 beds outlined in the Mayor's Plan that were already in the pipeline. The new beds should be equitably distributed across the City. Additionally, the Administration should add $9.9 million to fund the three new Drop-In Centers that are currently in the pipeline. The Coalition for the Homeless[1] reports that there are currently 1,000 Stabilization Beds and 1,500 Safe Haven Beds online – after the addition of 2,376 new beds the total would be 4,876 beds. There are currently seven open Drop-In Centers, and after the addition of the three new ones the total would be 10.

Fully Fund Rental Assistance Programs and the CityFHEPS Voucher Rate Increase

For the past several fiscal years, actual spending on rental assistance voucher programs has been considerably higher than the baseline budget. After Adoption, the agency has been adding funding throughout the fiscal year to meet the need. Pursuant to a local law passed by the Council, starting in the fall of 2021, CityFHEPS voucher rates were increased to match Section 8 levels but funding for the increase was only added for Fiscal 2022. The baseline budget should be increased to a level that more accurately reflects the full need and fully funds the voucher rate increase.

Improve and Streamline the PATH Intake Process

Recent news articles have shed light on the difficulties experienced by families with children during the DHS Prevention Assistance and Temporary Housing (PATH) intake process. The City news website reported three out of four applications were rejected in 2021 and that families and shelter providers are subjected to an arduous eligibility review process that became even more challenging during the pandemic.[2] DHS should re-evaluate and streamline the process for PATH intake and shelter application review so that it is more manageable for families and so they do not have to reapply multiple times. DHS should ensure there is adequate staffing and explore technology and systems upgrades to improve efficiency.

Convert Hotels to Permanently House the Homeless

The Preliminary Plan decreases DHS' baseline budget by $49.4 million beginning in Fiscal 2023 because the agency ended the practice of placing families with children in hotel shelters at the end of 2021. The Council proposes that the City should convert these hotels into permanent, affordable housing for homeless families, where rental vouchers can be used, and light touch wrap-around services are provided. As a starting point, the $49.4 million in savings should be used to start the conversion process for the next fiscal year.

Increase HRA's Domestic Violence Shelter Capacity

The current domestic violence (DV) shelter system, operated by HRA, does not have enough capacity to fully meet the demand. Currently, there are 2,451 beds in HRA's emergency DV shelter system, where stays are limited by State regulations to 180 days, and 447 units in the Tier II DV shelter system. Many individuals who would benefit from the specialized services available in DV facilities end up in the DHS shelter system, where DV-specific support services are not available. The City should expand its DV shelter capacity to align with demand more closely by adding $41.6 million to HRA's baseline budget to fund 200 new DV emergency shelter beds, and 600 new DV Tier II units. Additionally, when determining the location of new DV shelters HRA should ensure there are adequate options for LGBTQIA+, transgender, and gender non-conforming individuals and families.

Baseline the Prevailing Wage Increase for Shelter Security Guards

In the Fiscal 2022 Adopted Plan, $40.5 million was added to DHS' budget, pursuant to an agreement with the Council, to provide an $18 per hour prevailing wage for shelter security guards at DHS run shelters, as well as benefits, such as family healthcare. The funding impacted approximately 4,000 security guards beginning on October 1, 2021. Funding was only added for

Fiscal 2022, and the Council calls on the Administration to add $40.5 million to DHS' baseline budget in line with the agreement made with the Council.

Increase the Number of Runaway and Homeless Youth (RHY) Beds

The City Council has pushed the previous Administration to expand shelter services and capacity for young people experiencing homelessness and despite the increase in beds for young people experiencing homelessness, there is still a significant need for age-appropriate shelter in New York City. Many young people experience homelessness without seeking shelter from City agencies like DYCD or DHS, and as a result, they suffer in silence while never seeking help. The Council calls upon the Administration to invest $6 million to fund 120 additional RHY shelter beds to fill the need. RHY populations still require a great deal of support and guidance in order to successfully transition into permanent housing and self-sufficiency. Both the investment and expansion are needed to turn the tide on homelessness of some of New York's most vulnerable population.

Better Coordination to Keep Older Adults Housed

Older adults are the fastest growing population in the City, and it is important that the City provides the necessary support to allow older adults to age safely in place. This includes protecting older adults from eviction proceedings and outreach services to educate them as to what programs and services are available across all City agencies to keep them housed. There needs to be better coordination across City agencies that administer housing-related services including, but not limited to, HRA, HPD, DFTA, and DHS. This is to ensure that older adults know all the City funded programs that allow them to remain housed before it is too late or other affordable housing options if eviction is imminent and unavoidable. Further, the City should develop and share with the Council its strategy on how it will strengthen eviction protection programs and outreach for older adults, including identifying potential new initiatives and any funding shortfalls.

Ensure Baseline Funding is Adequate for Emergency Assistance Grants

Given the end of the eviction moratorium, the City could see an increase in demand for emergency assistance grants, also referred to as one-shots. It is unclear what the fiscal impact may be, but the Council would like a commitment from the Administration to increase funding for emergency grants if the need arises.

Fully Fund the Baseline Budget for HASA SROs

For the past several fiscal years, actual spending on HIV and AIDS Services Administration (HASA) single room occupancy (SROs) emergency shelter units has been around $60 million, which is considerably higher than the baseline budget of $16.6 million. After the budget is adopted each fiscal year, the agency has been adding funding throughout the year to meet the actual need. In Fiscal 2022 only, HRA added $47.9 million. The Council calls on the Administration to add $47.9 million to HRA's baseline budget for HASA SROs to reflect the full need more accurately.

Provide a Property Tax Rebate for Homeowners in Need

The City should seek State authorization to provide a property tax rebate to all households receiving the basic and enhanced STAR tax breaks and earn less than $250,000 per year. Over the last 10 years, property tax bills for the City's homeowners grew faster than household incomes, meaning homeowners commit a growing proportion of their incomes to property taxes each year. While some may argue the higher book value of the home presents a windfall for homeowners, the reality is that many homeowners have no way to easily access that paper wealth to pay for their day-to-day needs. Rather, it makes meeting those needs more difficult as property taxes take an increasing cut of their incomes. Providing property tax relief to homeowners will help alleviate some of the pressure caused by increased property values.

The Governor, and both houses in Albany have indicated strong support that will provide rebates to homeowners Statewide, including in the City. This State rebate will provide at least $293 in relief to NYC homeowners. The City should take this opportunity to piggy-back on the State's program to provide expanded tax relief with a City-funded rebate. A City-funded rebate of $150 per household, together with the State's rebate, would provide anywhere from $440 to over $800 to NYC households. The Council estimates the rebate would cost the City $90 million in Fiscal 2023.

Supporting Fairness and Equity in the Justice System

While the criminal justice system in the City continues to evolve and undergo changes, much more work needs to be done to address issues of mass incarceration and racial disparities. W can make the justice system be a positive force in strengthening communities and building trust, through actions such as increasing accountability and transparency of new policing strategies and improving conditions at Rikers for both staff and incarcerated individuals.

In addition, agencies like the Board of Correction and the Civilian Complaint Review Board have Charter mandated oversight roles that require sufficient resources to effectively conduct their crucial missions. Support should also be directed to the District Attorneys and the City's contracted legal services providers, ensuring that all stakeholders can retain the dedicated public servants that the City entrusts with administering justice and shoring up public safety.

Funding must also be provided for community-based programs as they are an effective tool in assisting victims of crime and helping to heal from trauma. Finally, juvenile justice facilities create a path to success for the youth in their care by providing wrap-around services so that these youth are seen and heard. By prioritizing the equity and accountability of our justice system, we can help communities across the City build a foundation for a healthy recovery.

Responding Responsibly to the Crisis on Rikers Island

Although the conditions in the City's jail system deteriorated significantly under prior Administrations, it is this Administration's responsibility to address the myriad problems facing the Department of Correction and the City's jails. The Council calls on the Administration to take concrete steps to address the unacceptably high levels of violence, use of force, and staff absenteeism that, compounded with deeply entrenched mismanagement, undermine the safety and security of the nearly 5,600 New Yorkers in custody and the nearly 10,000 employees of the City of New York who work for the Department. The Department's longstanding inefficiencies, mismanagement, and lack of transparency are exemplified by the fact that the Department's headcount is higher than people in custody, yet staff are not deployed to key posts where they can respond to crises or escort people to necessary medical appointments.

The Department does not need additional resources and must adjust its practices responsibly within its current budget in order to improve conditions on Rikers Island for both staff and people incarcerated alike. Initial steps the Administration should take are ensuring that the Department's disciplinary and accountability measures are adequately staffed and funded; addressing the structural causes of staff absenteeism; consolidating operations by closing facilities and eliminating inefficiencies; shifting resources to support programs and services that reduce violence and recidivism; and ensuring that the appropriate staff and resources are in place to implement the Risk Management Assessment System.

Ensure Accountability for New Policing Strategies

The Administration released a Blueprint to End Gun Violence, which includes the creation of NYPD Neighborhood Safety Teams, a specialized unit dispatched to areas with high incidents of gun violence. These teams receive an extra seven days of training, undergo consistent reviews of body camera footage, and are subject to the same disciplinary rules as all other uniform members of service. The Mayor and the NYPD should regularly evaluate the success of these teams, scrutinize all disciplinary infractions closely, and adopt a zero-tolerance policy towards any adverse effects on communities of color. As the City works towards reducing increasing rates of gun violence, it is necessary to ensure full accountability and consistent reviews of the signature policing effort of this Administration.

Support the District Attorneys and Public Defenders

The District Attorneys (DAs) and the seven indigent defense providers are a critical component of the City's criminal justice system and the Fiscal 2023 Budget should include the appropriate amount of funding to ensure they have the capacity to fulfill their duties.

The City's prosecutors have developed a number of innovative criminal justice related initiatives and programs to reduce crime. In order to continue these initiatives and support their core operations, the five DAs and the OSNP have each made budget requests that collectively total $34.3 million. These include funding for programmatic expansion, salary parity for DA legal staff, and additional funding to comply with statutory mandates. During Fiscal 2020 Budget negotiations, the Council successfully fought for pay parity across many public sectors, including for indigent defense providers. A first step in achieving pay parity between criminal defense and civil legal service providers was taken during the previous administration, when the salaries of attorneys with less than five years of experience were brought in line with those of their counterparts at the Law Department.

The City intended to implement a second phase of pay parity for more experienced legal staff, but it was derailed by COVID-19. Since that time, those earlier career pay rates have dropped below those of the Law Department who recently received a three percent salary increase.

The City reengaged with the legal services providers to restart discussions about the promised expansion of Pay Parity for attorneys beyond five years of service and the Council is calling on the new Administration to undertake a comprehensive review of pay rates and funding levels of its criminal defense and civil legal service providers and commit to finally eliminating the pay inequity between government and non-profit providers in the Fiscal 2023 Adopted Budget.

Provide Adequate Resources to the Board of Correction

The need for oversight of the City's jails is critical and the Board should have additional resources to conduct its charter-mandated mission and support its staff. The Executive Budget should establish BOC's budget as one percent of the Department of Correction's budget, following the model of the Civilian Complaint Review Board and the Police Department. An additional $12.3 million will allow the Board to increase salaries for investigative field staff commensurate with experience as well as expand its headcount to support critical functions, like a Medical Examiner, comprehensively investigating deaths in the City's jails and carefully monitoring DOC's operations.

Provide Adequate Resources to the Civilian Complaint Review Board

The Civilian Complaint Review Board (CCRB) is required by the City Charter to have a headcount equivalent to at least .65 percent of the Police Department's uniform headcount. In recent years, the City Council has helped increase headcount to meet this requirement and to account for changes that have increased the CCRB investigatory jurisdiction. However, CCRB has encountered roadblocks to reaching their full capacity as a result of a hiring freeze and an inadequate Personal Services budget, and as of March, was not in compliance with the Charter headcount requirement. The Office of Management and Budget should right-size the CCRB budget to support hiring for all vacancies at the necessary salary levels. The Council calls on the Administration to fund $2 million to CCRB's Personal Services budget and to allow hiring for all vacant positions.

Fair Futures Up to Age 26 and for Justice-Involved Youth

Fair Futures is a nation-leading comprehensive support system for foster youth, which includes wrap-around support and life coaches. Adding $10 million in funding for Fair Futures, lifting the total to $35 million, will ensure that all foster youth up to age 26 receive wrap-around supports and life coaches – and expand the program into ACS' juvenile justice continuum. Together, these investments will help achieve the Mayor's goals of reducing youth gun crime and recidivism.

Empower Youth Held in Juvenile Justice Facilities

Innovative, skill-building programming is lacking in secure detention facilities. New investments will help make youth heard and see the impact they can make in the community. An additional $5 million would allow youth to receive structured, facilitated guidance on how to engage their peers, neighbors, local police precincts, and/or schools, plan discussions and organize meetings, and lead change on issues that matter most to the youth themselves.

Strengthening the City's Infrastructure

The City's infrastructure plays a vital role in the lives of all New York City residents as well as the many commuters and tourists who visit the City daily. From affordable housing to our libraries, parks, hospitals and the roads and transportation choices that connect them all, the City's infrastructure is in perpetual use and constantly under construction. It is critical that the facilities where the City provides services are safe and in a state of good repair. The ability to get to these facilities safely and reliably is just as important.

Mayor Adams released his first Preliminary Capital Commitment Plan on February 16, 2022, and that plan focused mainly on adjusting the timelines and costs of existing capital projects. The Council appreciates an accurate Capital Commitment Plan and would expect Mayor Adams to assess where the City's plan currently stands in his first months in office is to be expected. With re-estimated timelines and costs complete, the Council would like to see the following priorities addressed in the Mayor's Executive Capital Commitment Plan.

Increase the City's Investment in Affordable, Supportive, and Public Housing

Mayor Adams signed a campaign pledge to commit $4 billion per year in capital funding for housing preservation, new affordable and supportive housing construction, and public housing developments. These projects should include deeper levels of affordability and focus on older adults (including LGBTQIA+ elders), those experiencing homelessness, survivors of domestic violence, and other vulnerable populations. The Council urges the Mayor to abide by his campaign promise and advance the urgent needs of New Yorkers and New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) residents in the Executive Budget. The Administration should increase the annual capital commitment plans of the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) and NYCHA to $2.5 billion and $1.5 billion, respectively.

Enhance the City's Street Plan

In October 2019, the Council passed the Transportation Master Plan, or Streets Plan. Legislated to take effect in Fiscal 2022, the first five-year phase of the plan calls for the installation of at least 250 protected bike lanes and 150 protected bus lanes. The second five-year phase, set to take effect in Fiscal 2026, calls for the completion of a connected bicycle network, with a bicycle network lane coverage index of 100 percent and installation of protected bus lanes on all bus routes where such improvements can be installed. The Council calls on Administration to add $3.1 billion to further enhance the Streets Plan and provide funding for at least 500 lane miles of new protected bus-only lanes, so that every New Yorker lives within a quarter mile of a protected bus lane, and to include funding for 40 lane miles of car-free busways. This funding would also expand the Streets Plan to require at least 500 lane miles of protected bike lanes and dedicate 38 million square feet of open pedestrian space, so that every New Yorker lives within a quarter mile of a protected bike lane.

Establish New H+H Neighborhood Health/Ambulatory Care Centers

The Council calls upon the Administration to establish five new Health + Hospitals (H+H) neighborhood health/ambulatory care centers in communities with poor health outcomes and lacking sufficient access to healthcare facilities. In addition to the planned center for Far Rockaway and the recently opened H+H full-service ambulatory care centers in East Tremont, Jackson Heights, and Bushwick, the Council calls for the addition of $250 million for new centers in: Jamaica/St. Albans; Hunts Point/Soundview; Brownsville/East New York; Canarsie, and Staten Island.

Funding for Parks Comfort Stations in all 5 Boroughs

The City's parks have a noticeable lack of comfort stations, especially in smaller parks in the outer boroughs. Due to the high average cost of construction for a new comfort station, it is not feasible for the City Council to fund these projects without a partnership with the Administration. The Council requests an addition of $250 million in capital funding in the Executive Budget to provide $50 million per borough for comfort stations.

Fund the Gap in the Library System's Infrastructure Needs

The Council urges the Administration to add $163 million in capital dollars in Fiscal 2023 for library repair and maintenance to bridge the current gap in capital funding for the system's ongoing infrastructure needs. Public libraries are helping New Yorkers rebuild their lives and reconnect to their communities as we come out of the pandemic and need to have fully functioning infrastructure to do so.

Increase Street Resurfacing to Prior Goal of 1,300 Lane Miles Resurfaced Annually

The Department of Transportation (DOT) previously had a goal to repave 1,300 lane miles annually, which was reduced to 1,100 lane miles per year in Fiscal 2020 and Fiscal 2021. This reduced paving level was acceptable at the time because of a mild winter and reduction in traffic at the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic, which caused less wear and tear on the City's streets. However, the winter of 2021-2022 has resulted in significantly more snowfall compared to the five inches of snow the City received in the 2019-2020 season when funding for street repaving was decreased. The City Council urges the Administration to increase baseline funding for street resurfacing by $45.1 million in the Fiscal 2023 Executive Budget to allow DOT to repave 1,300 lane miles annually.

Finish Full-Service Animal Shelter in Queens

The Council is calling upon the Administration to finish the construction of the full-service Animal Shelter in Queens. The Council calls for the Administration to invest $5 million for the completion of this project.

Enhance DOE's Electrical Upgrade Program

Updates to schools through the addition of science labs and technology sometimes trigger a need for electrical work at schools which can delay project implementation. Many of these projects are funded by Council Members and Borough Presidents at the request of parents, principals, and school communities. This proposal calls for $2.5 million in funding for the School Construction Authority's Five-Year Plan to address this need as it arises at schools to prevent delays or waiting an additional fiscal year to request funds again from an elected official. Costs vary for electrification projects; however, it is estimated this funding would cover electrification needs at 50 schools.

Additional Staff to Assist DDC's Non-Profit Capital Program

The Department of Design and Construction (DDC) currently manages a substantial portion of capital projects funded by Council Members and the Borough Presidents to support the work of non-profits. These projects range from hospital equipment, vehicles to transport New Yorkers to services, outfitting of public facing spaces, technology, and various other projects. The wide range of projects, varying capacity at non-profits, additional projects funded annually, the capital freeze from COVID, and past staff departures have contributed to a growing backlog of projects to execute. The Council calls on the Administration to provide $1.2 million in capital funding to provide DDC with 10 additional staff to manage this portfolio and help deliver capital improvements and assets to non-profits providing services across the city. These employees would be working exclusively on capital projects and would therefore qualify for Inter-Fund Agreement (IFA) capital funding.

New Organics Processing Facility

The Council calls upon the Administration to include $1 million to construct a new City organic processing facility sizable enough to support an expansion of organic processing capacity. Construction of this facility will help the City divert organics from being sent to a landfill and achieve its goal of zero waste by 2030.

Re-envision the Kingsbridge Armory

The Council calls upon the Administration to invest in the expedited revitalization of the decommissioned Kingsbridge Armory and to secure the proper funding to develop the space and move the project forward in a tangible way. Over the years, various proposals to redevelop the Armory have failed and the property remains entangled in legal and operational challenges leaving the land vacant. After all the setbacks, it is pertinent that the Administration prioritizes efforts to plan restoration and transformation of this underutilized but very valuable City property.

Expand the NYC Ferry System

The Council calls upon the Administration to increase the resiliency of NYC's transportation network by expanding the ferry system in the outer boroughs. This will provide affordable and convenient transit for communities with limited transportation options. Additional routes and landings must be explored to address transit deserts, along with stabilizing the current system as ridership recovers from COVID-19 pandemic.

Expand Citywide Maritime Freight Infrastructure

The Council calls upon the Administration to establish a sustainable freight network and invest in rail and maritime infrastructure. The City currently depends on heavily aging highway infrastructure to move goods around the City in trucks. Investment in freight programs will overhaul our aging freight system by creating thousands of jobs, modernizing infrastructure, and reducing shipping costs.

Comprehensive Study and Plan to Address NYC Transit Deserts

While New York City has one of the most expansive public transportation systems in the world, many of the City's 8.4 million residents live in inaccessible transit deserts, outside of our transportation system's services. This lack of accessibility has created an inequitable system and adversely affects people's economic mobility and health. The Council calls on the Administration to commission a study and create a comprehensive plan to address New York City's transit deserts, so that the City can move towards a system that is fair and equitable to all New Yorkers.

Install Solar Array and Energy Storage at Riker's Island

The Council calls upon the Administration to install a large-scale solar array and energy storage on the land that has already been transferred to DCAS on Riker's Island.

Renewable Energy Investments Citywide

The Council calls upon the Administration to invest in and accelerate the installation of renewable energy sources, including solar panels, wind farms, and hydro power to help meet NYC's carbon emission reduction goals.

Purchase of Vehicles for the B-Heard/End Gun Violence Program

The Council has called for the expansion of the B-Heard/End Gun Violence Program to additional areas across the City. The purchase of specialty vehicles to accommodate this increase is necessary to provide the services as intended.

Improve the MMR and PMMR

The Mayor's Management Report (MMR) and the Preliminary Mayor's Management Report (PMMR) are critical tools for tracking and evaluating the City government's performance and operations. However, after conducting a though review of the structure and content of the Fiscal 2022 PMMR, the Council has identified several areas for improvement. These indicators aid in connecting budget analysis with the impact of core agency programs. Broad recommendations and agency specific recommendations for the forthcoming MMR are listed below:

General MMR Recommendations:

- **Establish Clear Targets for all Performance Indicators.** Several performance indicators within the PMMR do not include targets and/or include targets that are below actual historical performance. Performance indicators should include a specified target where applicable and should be updated and evaluated annually in order to better reflect the specific agency's work over the past few fiscal years.
- **Explain Significant Indicator Variances.** There are multiple instances in the PMMR where significant variances in performance metrics were noted, but not thoroughly explained. The Council recommends that all performance indicators that deviate from the norm have a proper explanation that highlights any issues that were noted in that period.

Agency Specific Recommendations:

Law Department

- **Agency-by-Agency Judgement and Claims Payouts.** The Judgement and Claims payouts over the past few fiscal years have averaged approximately $700 million. The PMMR currently includes the total amount of Judgement and Claims payouts made by fiscal year but does not provide information on an agency-by-agency payout basis. The Council recommends that the Administration include a new performance indicator that highlights Judgement and Claims payouts for the top 10 agencies, along with explanations provided for large deviations from the norm.

Human Resources Administration (HRA)

- **Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP).** The PMMR does not include adequate information regarding SNAP. The indicators should be expanded to include information on how quickly, on average, SNAP users exhaust their monthly benefits, as well as a breakdown of the number of recipients receiving the minimum, maximum, or some other benefit level. Additional indicators should include the total number of SNAP applications submitted, broken down by new applications and renewals, with an acceptance rate for each type and the top reasons for denial.

- **Medicaid Recipients**. An indicator should be added in the MMR to provide a count of HRA-administered Medicaid recipients who are non-Modified Gross Adjusted Income qualified (MAGI), MAGI renewals, and any other categories.
- **Medicaid Homecare Services**. An indicator should be included in the MMR to provide a count of the Medicaid-eligible clients who apply for homecare services and are denied, care outcomes, cost avoidance, and types of quality of service.
- **Emergency Food Assistance Program (EFAP).** The PMMR does not include any information regarding EFAP. New indicators should be added and include information on the number of EFAP applications received, a count of active EFAP providers broken out by type, the number of EFAP providers that have closed, the number of EFAP deliveries made to community-based providers each month, the amount of food delivered, and the number of clients served by EFAP providers.
- **Domestic Violence Shelter.** Indicators should be added to the MMR to show the total number of available domestic violence Tier II units, along with the vacancy rates, and average length of stay for each type of domestic violence shelter.

Department of Homeless Services (DHS)

- **Shelter Cost by Type of Shelter.** An indicator should be added to the MMR on the cost of shelter by facility type. Currently, it only reports the average cost of shelter per day by household type. Given the varying cost of shelter facilities, additional indicators should be added in the MMR.
- **Street Homeless Shelter and Services.** Indicators should be added to the MMR listing each operational Drop-In Center with its borough of location, the total number of unduplicated clients served, and the average number of all clients served. Additionally, indicators should be added listing the total capacity of Safe Haven beds, the total capacity of Stabilization Beds, and the vacancy rates and average lengths of stay for each.

Department of Transportation (DOT)

- **Open Restaurants Program.** The MMR should include indicators on the number of restaurants that have applied to and are participating in the Open Restaurant Program.
- **Open Streets Program.** An indicator should be added to the MMR to provide information on the total number of miles of streets included in the Open Streets Program.
- **Differentiating Cyclist and Pedestrian Fatalities**. DOT's PMMR currently groups Pedestrian and Cyclist fatalities together. As a result of the significant increase in cycling, as well as the City's investment in expanding bike lanes in New York, it would be meaningful for the Agency to differentiate these fatalities.

Taxi and Limousine Commission (TLC)

- **Medallion Relief Program**. The Medallion Relief Program (MRP), formerly known as the Taxi Medallion Relief Fund (TMRF), was announced by former Mayor Bill de Blasio in early March 2021 and will provide medallion owners with $20,000 in grants to help restructure loan principals and set lower monthly payments, as well as up to $9,000 for monthly debt relief payments. It would be meaningful if the Commission included in the MMR the number of drivers enrolled in the Medallion Relief Program, the total amount of loans restructured under the program, and the total amount of debt relief payments paid to drivers under the program.

New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA)

- **Permanent Affordability Commitment Together Conversions.** The MMR should include indicators that track the status of the 62,000 apartments undergoing a public-private partnership conversion as part of the Permanent Affordability Commitment Together (PACT) initiative. Indicators should show the number of units in the various stages of conversion, including those with a letter of intent, in the resident engagement process, with a developer selected, currently being renovated, and those where conversions have been completed.

New York Police Department (NYPD)

- **Training Hours Completed.** The NYPD already reports on counterterrorism training hours completed. The MMR should add to this reporting by adding indicators for training hours completed for implicit bias, FETI, and crisis intervention training.
- **Traffic Fatalities.** The MMR should include an indicator to separate the total number of fatalities for bicyclists and pedestrians.
- **Police Commissioner Deviation.** The MMR should include indicators that show the number of times the Police Commissioner deviates from the Civilian Complaint Review Board's (CCRB) recommendation, as well as provide the number of days it takes for the NYPD to issue the written explanation for the deviation.
- **Hate Crimes.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show hate crime statistics.

Fire Department (FDNY)

- **Serious fires reaching second alarm or higher (percentage and total number)**. The FDNY previously reported on the percentage but stopped in the Fiscal 2021 MMR. Adding and including the total number would increase transparency about the number of fires that reach a serious threshold.

City Commission on Human Rights (CCHR)

- **Source of Income (SOI) Inquiries.** CCHR does not include any information in the PMMR about Source of Income related matters. The information included shows general total inquires, matters initiated, resolutions, etc. A sub-section with indicators about the SOI unit including inquiries received, matters initiated, pre-complaint resolutions, the timeframe in which inquiries are resolved, open matters, and average caseload would give insight and increase transparency on the Unit.

- **Commission-Initiated Investigations.** An indicator should be added to the MMR to show the total number of investigations initiated by CCHR.

Housing Preservation and Development (HPD)

- **Average Time from TCO to Occupancy.** The MMR should add an indicator showing how long, on average, it takes to place a tenant in a lottery unit, broken out by AMI affordability band, after the Temporary Certificate of Occupancy (TCO) has been granted.

Office of the Chief Medical Examiner (OCME)

- **Unclaimed Decedents.** An indicator should be added to the MMR to show trends and year-to-year information on descendants who are not claimed at OCME.

- **Decedents Buried in Public Burial.** An indicator should be added to the MMR to monitor how many bodies are buried on public burial grounds per fiscal year.

- **Average Decedents Storage Capacity.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to track OCME's storage capacity.

- **Suspected Overdose Deaths.** The MMR should report on the number of suspected overdose deaths each fiscal year.

Department of Health and Mental Hygiene (DOHMH)

- **Adults with Physical Checkup.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show the total number of adults, aged 25 and above, who have had a physical checkup in the past 12 months, since primary care physical checkups have proven to reduce healthcare cost.

- **Adults with Serious Mental Illness Diagnosis.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to provide information on adults that live with a serious mental illness. Currently, the PMMR only provides information on adults in Assistance Outpatient Treatment.

- **NYC Well Mobile Crisis Teams.** An indicator should be added to the MMR that tracks the deployment of each mobile crisis team by type.

- **Adults with Diabetes.** An indicator should be added to the MMR that tracks the number of adults with type-2 diabetes and the number of adults with type-2 diabetes who have controlled blood glucose levels.

Department of Youth and Community Development (DYCD)

- **Summer Youth Employment Program (SYEP) Applications and Participation.** The MMR should report on the number of SYEP applications, and participation in all program components. The MMR should also report stipends and wages paid to participants in each program.

- **Runaway Homeless Youth.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to separate services for Runaway Homeless Youth ages 16 though 20 and Homeless Youth Adults ages 21 through 24.

- **COMPASS/SONYC/Beacon/Cornerstone Programs.** Indicators should be added in the MMR to include the number of participants by school and summer program.

Department of Investigation (DOI)

- **Open Docket of Investigations.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show the number of DOI investigations that are currently active and closed by fiscal year.

Department of Sanitation (DSNY)

- **Litter Basket Routes.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to track daily litter basket collection routes.

Department of Correction (DOC)

- **Marginal Cost of Incarceration.** An indicator should be added to the MMR to show the cost for each new person incarcerated, for a more direct analysis of policies and initiatives to reduce jail population.

Department of Cultural Affairs (DCLA)

- **CIG Diversity, Inclusion, and Equity Plans.** Indicators should be added in the MMR to track the implementation of Cultural Institutions Groups (CIGs) diversity, equity, and inclusion plans.

Department of City Planning (DCP)

- **Housing Creation.** The MMR should report the total number of affordable housing units created by fiscal year.

Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC)

- **Landmark Designation Disaggregated by Borough.** The MMR should show the total number of landmark designations, disaggregated by borough.

Department of Buildings (DOB)

- **Enforce Building and Zoning Laws.** Indicators should be added in the MMR to show the total number of stop-work orders issued, the number of sites which resumed work following a stop-work order, the number of sites which have received more than one violation over the life of the project, and the number of stop-work orders issued due to noncompliance with COVID-19 safety guidelines.
- **Review Initial Construction Plans.** The MMR should report the average plan review time disaggregated by borough office.

Department for the Aging (DFTA)

- **Older Adult Employment.** The MMR should add an indicator showing the number of older adults employed through Title V funding.
- **Virtual Services.** The MMR should add an indicator showing how many older adults are accessing virtual older adult activities and programming.

Administration for Children's Services (ACS)

- **Family Enrichment Centers.** The MMR should add an indicator that shows how many people have availed themselves of services, called "offerings", at Family Enrichment Centers (FECs) operated by ACS, as well as how many hours of "offerings" were coordinated.
- **CARES Track Diversions.** The MMR should add an indicator showing how many child welfare investigations have been avoided through the diversion of eligible neglect cases through ACS' Collaborative Assessment Response, Engagement and Support (CARES) track, and what percentage of eligible cases were diverted in this manner.
- **Secure Detention Paid Absence Rate.** The MMR should add an indicator to the Paid Absence Rate table to break out the rate in secure detention facilities operated by ACS from the total for all ACS staff.

Department of Education (DOE)

- **Pupil Transportation.** Currently, the PMMR includes no information related to student transportation. Indicators should be added to the MMR to report on the number of special education and general education bus routes, counts of student riders, measures of timeliness, reliability and cost. The MMR should also track the energy efficiency of buses.
- **Support Children with Special Needs.** The MMR should report on the number of students enrolled in contract schools, as well as the average cost per student. Additionally, the MMR should include indicators for the number of students waiting to be placed in special education services, including the average placement time. The MMR should also include

the number of Carter cases settled each year by DOE, the average settlement cost and the percentage of students by disability type associated with these settlements. Finally, the MMR should report on the yearly average spending on related special needs services per student.

- **Early Childhood Education.** The MMR should report on the number of 3-K and pre-K students enrolled in the program by type of setting and cost per pupil. This data should be compared to data of children ages three and four residing in the City. The MMR should also break out enrollment by type of program, including Head Start/Early Head Start and identify extended day and extended year seats.
- **Meals Served.** The MMR should report on the cost of each meal served at public schools.
- **Teachers.** The MMR should report on the number of teachers and other staff in the Absent Teacher Reserve pool.
- **Rigorous Courses.** The MMR should report on the percentage of students who completed rigorous courses. It should also report on the percentage of students who completed rigorous courses in the subject areas of Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math.

Appendix A – U/A

#	Agency #	Agency	Current Program Area (BFA) or U/A	Proposal	Issue
1	002	MOCJ	Criminal Justice Programs	Create office to Prevent Gun Violence U/A pair	
2	002	Mayoralty	none	Create Office of Special Enforcement U/A pair	
3	025	Law	U/A 001 and U/A 002	U/A pair for Tort Division	Law Department has 23 divisions but only 2 U/A's, PS and OTPS. We request that the Tort Division (the Agency's largest) be separated from the rest of the Agency, and a PS and OTPS U/A be created for the Tort Division on its own. We have asked the Law Department to break out its budget further in previous years, and they are vehemently against this due to the issue of them regularly transferring resources across divisions (many of which are very small). We believe that pulling out the Tort Division on its own, which is by far the Department's largest division, would be a reasonable compromise. The Tort Division's FY23 Preliminary Budget totals $50.7 million.
4	040	DOE	481 and 482 - Categorical programs	Eliminate	This UA pair co-mingles several distinct programs and obscures where state and federal grants are supporting budgets. Budgets should be shifted to appropriate programmatic area.
5	042	CUNY	Borough of Manhattan Community College	Borough of Manhattan Community College - U/A Pair	Funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
6	042	CUNY	Bronx Community College	Bronx Community College - U/A Pair	Funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
7	042	CUNY	Guttman Community College	Guttman Community College - U/A Pair	Funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
8	042	CUNY	Hostos Community College	Hostos Community College - U/A Pair	Funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
9	042	CUNY	Kingsborough Community College	Kingsborough Community College - U/A Pair	Funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
10	042	CUNY	LaGuardia Community College	LaGuardia Community College - U/A Pair	Funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
11	042	CUNY	Queensborough Community College	Queensborough Community College - U/A Pair	Funding is consolidated within two units of appropriation that capture spending for all community colleges as well as CUNY's Central Administration.
12	056	NYPD	Administration	Administration - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
13	056	NYPD	Chief of Department	Chief of Department - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
14	056	NYPD	Citywide Operations	Citywide Operations - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
15	056	NYPD	Communications	Communications - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
16	056	NYPD	Community Affairs	Community Affairs - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA

#	Agency #	Agency	Current Program Area (BFA) or U/A	Proposal	Issue
17	056	NYPD	Criminal Justice Bureau	Criminal Justice Bureau - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
18	056	NYPD	Detective Bureau	Detective Bureau - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
19	056	NYPD	Housing Bureau	Housing Bureau - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
20	056	NYPD	Intelligence and Counterterrorism	Intelligence and Counterterrorism - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
21	056	NYPD	Internal Affairs	Internal Affairs - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
22	056	NYPD	Patrol	Patrol - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
23	056	NYPD	Reimbursable Overtime	Reimbursable Overtime - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
24	056	NYPD	School Safety	School Safety - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
25	056	NYPD	Security/Counter-Terrorism Grants	Security/Counter-Terrorism Grants - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
26	056	NYPD	Support Services	Support Services - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
27	056	NYPD	Training	Training - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
28	056	NYPD	Transit	Transit - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
29	056	NYPD	Transportation	Transportation - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
30	068	ACS	Juvenile Justice: Secure Detention, Non-Secure Detention, and Juvenile Justice Support	Juvenile Justice - OTPS U/A	The program areas that fall under Juvenile Justice are split between two large U/As, for PS and OTPS. For transparency, each of these program areas should have their own U/A. The Fiscal 2023 budget is $46.9 million for Secure Detention, $16 million for Juvenile Justice Support, and $18.4 million for Non-Secure Detention.
31	068	ACS	Preventive Services	Preventive Services - U/A Pair	These program areas are split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS, each of these program areas should have their own U/A (PS and OTPS) to better track funding. The Fiscal 2023 budget is $328.3 million for Preventive Services and $29.7 million for Preventive Homemaking Services.
32	068	ACS	Foster Care Support	Foster Care Support	These program areas are split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS, each of these program areas should have their own U/A (PS and OTPS) to better track funding. The Fiscal 2023 budget for Foster Care Support is $51.7 million.
33	068	ACS	Foster Care Services	Foster Care Services	These program areas are split between two large U/As - one that is PS and the other that is OTPS, each of these program areas should have their own U/A (PS and OTPS) to better track funding. The Fiscal 2023 budget for Foster Care Services is $637.3 million.
34	069	HRA	Legal Services	Legal Services - Align U/As fully with BFA program areas	Program is split across two OTPS U/As, one of which is shared with several other programs. The Legal Services headcount is in U/A 207 which is not aligned with the Legal Services BFA program area, instead it is in the General Administration program area. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.

#	Agency #	Agency	Current Program Area (BFA) or U/A	Proposal	Issue
35	069	HRA	Homeless Prevention	Homeless Prevention - OTPS U/A	Program is in an OTPS U/A that is shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
36	069	HRA	Rental Assistance	Rental Assistance - Create a BFA program area and a fully aligned U/A pair	Program is in an OTPS U/A that is shared with several other programs. There are 12 different budget codes reflecting the different rental assistance programs however upon the administration's own admission the budget codes do not accurately reflect the allocation for each program because the funding is flexible between the different programs. More clarity is needed on how much funding is going into each rental assistance program though its own fully aligned U/A and BFA program area. Additionally, the headcount related to rental assistance programs is combined with other program areas, it is not clear which, and should be aligned with the new Rental Assistance BFA and a unique PS U/A.
37	069	HRA	Adult Protective Services	Adult Protective Services - U/A Pair	Program is split across a PS and OTPS U/A that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
38	069	HRA	CEO Evaluation	CEO Evaluation - U/A Pair	Program is split across a PS and OTPS U/A that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
39	069	HRA	Domestic Violence Services	Domestic Violence Services - U/A Pair	Program is split across a PS and OTPS U/A that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
40	069	HRA	Employment Services Administration	Employment Services Administration - U/A Pair	Program is split across two PS and two OTPS U/As that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
41	069	HRA	Employment Services Contracts	Employment Services Contracts - OTPS U/A	Program is in an OTPS U/A that is shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
42	069	HRA	Food Assistance Programs	Food Assistance Programs - Align OTPS U/A fully with the BFA program area and create a PS U/A in the BFA program area	Program is split across a PS and two OTPS U/As, two of which areshared with several other programs. Headcount for the main Food Assistance program, EFAP, is budgeted within the Domestic Violence Services U/A and BFA. A new PS U/A should be created within the BFA program area encompassing all of the program's headcount. Additionally, the program U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program area to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
43	069	HRA	Food Stamp Operations	Food Stamp Operations - U/A Pair	Program is split across one OTPS and three PS U/As that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
44	069	HRA	General Administration	General Administration - U/A Pair	Program is split across eight PS and OTPS U/As that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.

#	Agency #	Agency	Current Program Area (BFA) or U/A	Proposal	Issue
45	069	HRA	HIV and AIDS Services	HIV and AIDS Services - U/A Pair	Program is split across one OTPS and two PS U/As that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
46	069	HRA	Home Energy Assistance	Home Energy Assistance - Transfer all PS expenses to the program area's unique U/A	Program is split across one OTPS and two PS U/As, one of which is shared with several other programs. A new U/A pair was created recently for this program area (108/208) but U/A 201 is still being used for some PS expenses, all funding should be moved to the program area's PS U/A 208. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
47	069	HRA	Information Technology Services	Information Technology Services - U/A Pair	Program is split across a PS and OTPS U/A that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
48	069	HRA	Investigations and Revenue Admin	Investigations and Revenue Admin - U/A Pair	Program is split across a PS and OTPS U/A that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
49	069	HRA	Medicaid Eligibility and Admin	Medicaid Eligibility and Admin - U/A Pair	Program is split across one OTPS and three PS U/As that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
50	069	HRA	Medicaid and Homecare	Medicaid and Homecare - U/A Pair	Program is split across a PS and an OTPS U/A that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
51	069	HRA	Office of Child Support Enforcement	Office of Child Support Enforcement - Fully align BFA program area with its U/A Pair	Program is split across two PS and three OTPS U/As some of which are each shared with several other programs. A new U/A pair was recently created for the program area (109/209) but all funding in the BFA program area has not been transferred to them and other U/As are still used. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
52	069	HRA	Public Assistance and Employment Admin	Public Assistance and Employment Admin - U/A Pair	Program is split across a PS and two OTPS U/As that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
53	069	HRA	Public Assistance Grants	Public Assistance Grants - OTPS U/A	Program is in one OTPS U/A that is shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
54	069	HRA	Public Assistance Support Grants	Public Assistance Support Grants - OTPS U/A	Program is in one OTPS U/A that is shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
55	069	HRA	Subsidized Employment and Job-Related Training	Subsidized Employment and Job-Related Training - OTPS U/A	Program is in one OTPS U/A that is shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.

#	Agency #	Agency	Current Program Area (BFA) or U/A	Proposal	Issue
56	069	HRA	Substance Abuse Services	Substance Abuse Services - OTPS U/A	Program is in one OTPS U/A that is shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
57	069	HRA	Medicaid and Homecare	Medicaid and Homecare - Create separate BFA program areas for each with their own U/A pairs	Medicaid accounts for about 60 percent of HRA's budget, but there is no transparency for the Medicaid budget because it is lumped together with Homecare. Two new and separate BFA program areas, each with a fully aligned unique U/A pair, should be created for each Medicaid and Homecare.
58	069	HRA	Holding Codes	Remove Holding Codes from HRA's Budget - Transfer funding to the appropriate BFA program areas, U/As, and budget codes	The excessive use of holding codes limits transparency and makes it hard to track program budgets.
59	069	HRA	Budgeting of Headcount	Budget Headcount with Accurate BFA Program Area	In several instances the headcount associated with a particular program area is budgeted within a different program area and is not transparent. Align all budgeted headcount with the correct BFA program and respective PS U/A.
60	071	DHS	Adult Shelter Administration and Support	Adult Shelter Administration and Support - U/A Pair	Program is in one OTPS and two PS U/As that are shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
61	071	DHS	Adult Shelter Intake and Placement	Adult Shelter Intake and Placement - PS U/A	Program is in one PS that is shared with several other programs. U/A should be fully aligned with BFA program area to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
62	071	DHS	Adult Shelter Operations	Adult Shelter Operations - U/A Pair	Program is in one PS and two OTPS U/As that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
63	071	DHS	Family Shelter Administration and Support	Family Shelter Administration and Support - U/A Pair	Program is in one PS and one OTPS U/A that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
64	071	DHS	Family Shelter Intake and Placement	Family Shelter Intake and Placement - PS U/A	Program is in one PS U/A that is shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
65	071	DHS	Family Shelter Operations	Family Shelter Operations - U/A Pair	Program is in one OTPS and two PS U/As that are shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.

#	Agency #	Agency	Current Program Area (BFA) or U/A	Proposal	Issue
66	071	DHS	General Administration	General Administration - U/A Pair	Program is in two PS and three OTPS U/As that are shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
67	071	DHS	Outreach, Drop-in, and Reception Services	Outreach, Drop-in, and Reception Services - U/A Pair	Program is in two OTPS and two PS U/As that are shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
68	071	DHS	Prevention and Aftercare	Prevention and Aftercare - Transfer remaining funds and close out	These services were transferred to HRA's budget several years ago. A very small amount continues to appear in the budget for this program area. It should be transferred to the correct agency, BFA program area, and U/A and then this BFA program area should be closed out and removed.
69	071	DHS	Rental Assistance and Housing Placement	Rental Assistance and Housing Placement - U/A Pair	Program is in one PS and one OTPS U/A that are each shared with several other programs. U/As should be fully aligned with BFA program areas to provide better transparency on each program area budget and so that spending can be more accurately tracked.
70	071	DHS	Adult Shelter Operations	Adult Shelter Operations - For hotel shelters create new BFA program area with a U/A pair	There is no transparency on hotel shelter spending because it is lumped together with the other adult shelter expenses. A new and separate BFA program area should be created for hotel shelters with a a fully aligned unique U/A pair.
71	071	DHS	Holding Codes	Remove Holding Codes from DHS' Budget - Transfer funding to the appropriate BFA program areas, U/As, and budget codes	The use of holding codes limits transparency and makes it hard to track program budgets.
72	072	DOC	Jail Operations	Jail Operations - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
73	072	DOC	Admin-Management & Administration	Admin-Management & Administration - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
74	072	DOC	Health and Programs	Health and Programs - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
75	072	DOC	Operations-Infrastructure & Environmental Health	Operations-Infrastructure & Environmental Health - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
76	072	DOC	Admin-Academy and Training	Admin-Academy and Training - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
77	072	DOC	Operations-Rikers Security & Operations	Operations-Rikers Security & Operations - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
78	125	DFTA	Administration and Contract Agency Support	Administration and Contract Agency Support - U/A Pair	This program area is split between all four DFTA's U/As. The Fiscal 2023 budget for Administration and Contract Agency Support is $40.7 million.

#	Agency #	Agency	Current Program Area (BFA) or U/A	Proposal	Issue
79	125	DFTA	Case Management	Case Management - U/A Pair	This program area is split between two large U/As. The Fiscal 2023 budget for Case Management is $39.6 million.
80	125	DFTA	Senior Centers and Meals	Senior Centers and Meals - U/A Pair	This program area is split between two large U/As. This Fiscal 2023 budget for Senior Centers and Meals is $225 million.
81	125	DFTA	Senior Employment and Benefits	Senior Employment and Benefits - U/A Pair	This program area is split between three large U/As. The Fiscal 2023 budget for Senior Employments and Benefits is $8.8 million.
82	125	DFTA	Senior Services	Senior Services - U/A Pair	This program area is split between three large U/As. The Fiscal 2023 budget for Senior Services is $111.2 million
83	260	DYCD	Adult Literacy Services	Adult Literacy Services - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
84	260	DYCD	Beacon Community Centers	Beacon Community Centers - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
85	260	DYCD	Community Development	Community Development - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
86	260	DYCD	General Administration	General Administration - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
87	260	DYCD	In-School Youth	In-School Youth - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
88	260	DYCD	Other Youth Programs	Other Youth Programs - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
89	260	DYCD	Out-of-School Time	Out-of-School Time - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
90	260	DYCD	Out-of-School Youth	Out-of-School Youth - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
91	260	DYCD	Runaway and Homeless Youth	Runaway and Homeless Youth - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
92	260	DYCD	Summer Youth Employment Program	Summer Youth Employment Program - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
93	781	DOP	Probation Services	Probation Services - Adult Supervision - U/A Pair	Break up into Adult and Juvenile to reflect different programs
94	781	DOP	Probation Services	Probation Services - Juvenile Supervision - U/A Pair	Break up into Adult and Juvenile to reflect different programs
95	901	DANY	Each DA has just one UA pair currently	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
96	902	DABX	Each DA has just one UA pair currently	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS

#	Agency #	Agency	Current Program Area (BFA) or U/A	Proposal	Issue
97	903	CKDA	Each DA has just one UA pair currently	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
98	904	QCDA	Each DA has just one UA pair currently	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
99	905	RCDA	Each DA has just one UA pair currently	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
100	906	OSNP	Each DA has just one UA pair currently	Executive Management 001 and 002 Operations 003 and 004	Break out line staff from executive and administrative staff and associated OTPS
101	806	HPD	Administration	Administration - U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
102	806	HPD	Administration Program	Administration Program- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
103	806	HPD	Development	Development- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
104	806	HPD	Housing Operations - Section 8 Programs	Housing Operations - Section 8 Programs- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
105	806	HPD	Housing Operations- Emergency Housing	Housing Operations- Emergency Housing- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
106	806	HPD	Housing Operations- Mgmt & Disposition	Housing Operations- Mgmt & Disposition- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
107	806	HPD	Preservation - Anti-Abandonment	Preservation - Anti-Abandonment- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
108	806	HPD	Preservation - Code Enforcement	Preservation - Code Enforcement- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
109	806	HPD	Preservation - Emergency Repair	Preservation - Emergency Repair- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA

#	Agency #	Agency	Current Program Area (BFA) or U/A	Proposal	Issue
110	806	HPD	Preservation - Lead Paint	Preservation - Lead Paint- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
111	806	HPD	Preservation - Other Agency Services	Preservation - Other Agency Services- U/A Pair	create U/As to match Program Areas in the BFA
112	810	DOB	Divide U/A 001	Personal Services (001)	The Department of Buildings only has two U/As, Personal Services (PS) and Other Than Personal Services (OTPS). About 81 percent of the agency's budget, $148.7 million out of a total expense budget of $183 million in Fiscal 2019, is reflected in its PS U/A. The recommendation is that the agency's PS U/A be divided to reflect its two main functions as an agency, including enforcement and inspections.
113	040	DOE	438 - Student Transportation	Extend Budget Codes	Move all OTPS costs related to student transportation from Central to this new U/A
114	040	DOE	437 - Student Transportation (PS)	New	Move all PS costs related to student transportation from Central to this new U/A
115	040	DOE	425 and 425 School Health and Wellness	New	Move all costs related to school health, mental health and nurses to this new U/A. All non-special education health services should be budgeted with these U/As

Appendix B – Summary of Council Tax Revenue Forecast

The New York City Council released its economy and tax revenue forecast on March 2 in "Report to the Committee on Finance Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan: Engineering a Soft Landing," which is available on the Council's website.[3] Below is a summary of that forecast, adjusted for the changes in City employment numbers for 2020 and 2021 announced by the New York State Department of Labor in mid-March. The tax revenue forecast is unchanged. Those with an interest in the logic and details of the Council forecast should consult the full document.

National Economy

National economic growth accelerated in the fourth quarter of 2021 by a 6.9 percent annualized rate, an increase from 2.3 percent the previous quarter[4], as the economy continued to recover from the effects of the COVID-19 pandemic. Fourth quarter GDP was entirely accounted for by increased inventory investment and consumer service spending. On the other hand, the annual inflation rate in the U.S. accelerated to 7.9 percent in March of 2022, the highest since February of 1982. The number one cause of today's high inflation is COVID-inflicted shortages and high-energy prices.

U.S. employment growth increased sharply by 678,000 jobs in February, a big improvement from prior employment growth.[3] As of February 2022, payroll employment was still shy by 2.1 million, or 1.4 percent of the pre-pandemic level in February 2020 (seasonally adjusted). The unemployment rate has fallen to 3.8 percent as of February 2022 from 6.2 percent in February 2021. Additionally, the labor force participation rate was 62.3 percent in February, up only slightly from 61.4 percent a year before.

U.S. Economic Indicators (CY2022-2026)

	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026
GDP %	3.3	2.8	2.8	2.8	2.5
Unemployment Rate %	3.6	3.5	3.7	3.7	3.7
CPI (yr/yr) %	6.2	2.6	2.1	2.1	2.2

Source: IHS Markit

City Economy

The City's economy added more jobs last year than previously reported. The New York State Department of Labor upwardly benchmarked the City's payroll employment, moving from samples to population counts. The recent benchmarking upwardly-revised monthly employment between July 2020 and December 2021, adding an average of 50,000 jobs per month. The additional jobs increased each month, reaching 100,000 jobs by December 2021. Overall, the revised numbers show that private sector employment grew by 270,000 positions throughout

[3] https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2022/03/Engineering-a-Soft-Landing-Revenue-Report-1.pdf also see: https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2022/03/Revenue-and-Economics-Forecast-Fact-Sheet.pdf

[4] U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis, Real Gross Domestic Product, Fourth Quarter 2021, Third Estimate.

2021 rather than the initial estimate of 240,000 positions. While employment in the City has made tremendous headway, job recovery has lagged behind the rest of the Country. As of February 2022, total employment in the City remained 6.4 percent or 300,000 positions below its pre-pandemic level in February 2020 (seasonally adjusted). In contrast, total U.S. employment was only 1.8 percent shy of its pre-pandemic level. The City's slower pace of recovery is a consequence of its cautious approach to re-opening, given its history as the epicenter of COVID infections and population density. The mix of employment in the City has also affected its slower pace of recovery as it relies heavily on services industries that entail face-to-face interaction.

The City's unemployment rate has fallen to 7.0 percent as of February 2020, down from 7.6 percent in January, and 12.5 percent in February 2021. The City's labor force participation rate was 59.2 percent in February, up from 56.7 percent a year ago.

As of the release of March's benchmarked numbers, the Finance Division re-estimated private sector employment as growing by 5.0 percent or 184,000 positions in 2022 and decelerating to 1.7 percent or 70,000 positions by 2026. OMB forecasted total employment growth at only 4.6 percent in 2022, weakening to 1.5 percent by 2026. The benchmarking of the employment numbers will likely upwardly revise OMB's forecast for the Executive Budget – at least for 2022 and 2023.

New York City Economic Indicators (CY2022-2026)

	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026
Private Employment Growth (1,000)	184.3	114.9	66.8	65.3	70
Unemployment Rate %	5.7	4.5	4.5	4.5	4.4

Source: employment: Finance Division; unemployment rate: IHS Markit

Tax Revenue

In the Preliminary Budget, the Finance Division forecasts tax revenue growth slowing sharply to 0.1 percent in Fiscal 2022 from 3.9 percent in 2021. The main contributors to growth are the Sales Tax, the two Real Estate Transaction Taxes, and the Hotel Tax. Offsetting this growth are reduced collections from the Real Property Tax, Personal Income Tax and Business Corporate Tax. In Fiscal 2023, revenue growth is expected to rebound by 4.7 percent. Decent revenue growth will return to the Real Property Tax and the Personal Income Tax. Collections from the Sales Tax and the two Real Estate Transaction Taxes, will still be strong, though less sensational than the previous year. Business tax collections will still be weak, due to the impact from a higher interest rate regime. Revenues will continue to grow in the outyears, though more slowly, averaging 3.3 percent annual growth.

OMB's Preliminary Budget forecasts a much weaker stream of tax collections, projecting a 2.3 percent decline in Fiscal 2022, followed by a more subdued 2.9 percent rebound in 2023. Consequently, the Finance Division's tax forecast is $1.6 billion above OMB's for Fiscal 2022 and $2.8 billion above for Fiscal 2023.

The Finance Division believes that OMB regularly underestimates tax revenues, especially in the Preliminary Budget, to allow for an additional safety buffer against unanticipated revenue shortfalls, recognizing additional revenues further on in the budget process. As of the Preliminary Budget, year-to-date tax collections were $1.5 billion higher for Fiscal 2022 than projected in the November Plan. OMB only recognized $1.6 billion more in the Preliminary Budget for the entire Fiscal 2022, anticipating only $100 million more for the remaining months of the year. They also only recognized $735 million more in Fiscal 2023. OMB barely projected the realized higher-than-expected collections trajectory to the rest of 2022 and into 2023. The following paragraphs on individual taxes analyze why the Finance Division's tax forecast is higher than OMB's.

The Finance Division's Real Property Tax (RPT) forecast exceeds OMB's forecast by $264 million in Fiscal 2022 and by $489 million in Fiscal 2023, reflecting differing assumptions regarding delinquency payments and assessment decreases expected in the Fiscal 2023 Final Roll. Over the course of the pandemic, delinquent payments increased only marginally, a strong indication that property owners will continue to make scheduled property tax payments through the end of Fiscal 2022, and that OMB's estimate was overly pessimistic. In Fiscal 2023 the Finance Division expects less of a reduction in assessments between the Tentative and Final Roll. In each of the last 20 years, total assessed value decreased by only 1 to 1.5 percent between the Tentative and Final Rolls, reflecting Tax Commission actions, DOF change by notices, and exemption processing. OMB's forecast assumes these actions will reduce Total Assessed Value by $8.3 billion, or 3 percent, more than double its historical track record.

The Finance Division's Personal Income Tax (PIT) forecast for Fiscal 2022 is approximately $300 million higher than OMB's. The Finance Division is more optimistic about withholdings and installment payments, projecting that larger employment growth, Wall Street bonuses and vibrant financial markets will boost collections. The gap between the two forecasts widens in Fiscal 2023, reflecting the Finance Division's projection of stronger employment and average wage growth.

Business tax collections for Fiscal 2022 and 2023 are expected to exceed OMB's estimates by $290 million and $319 million respectively. The Finance Division's stronger forecast is attributed to its projection of stronger growth in corporate profits, which are forecasted by IHS Markit. While the Finance Division agrees with OMB that higher interest rates will apply the brakes on business expansion, this is expected to be less abrupt.

The Finance Division's Sales Tax forecast exceeds OMB's forecast by $442 million in Fiscal 2022 and by $561 million in Fiscal 2023. Fiscal 2022 collections have been stronger than previously anticipated, growing by 27 percent year-to-date, buoyed by strong consumer confidence. Vibrant growth is expected to carry over into Fiscal 2023, as consumers increasingly return to pre-COVID lifestyles.

The Finance Division's Real Estate Transaction Taxes forecast exceeds OMB's by $244 million in Fiscal 2022, and by $705 million in Fiscal 2023. With five months still remaining in Fiscal 2022, collections for the Transaction Taxes already total $1.8 billion, almost three-quarters of OMB's

Fiscal 2022 projections. The Finance Division expects final bursts of pent-up real estate demand to materialize through the end of the fiscal year. In Fiscal 2023, OMB projected a 9.4 percent decrease in collections compared to the Finance Division's 8.4 percent projected *increase.* Although the Finance Division recognizes forthcoming adverse impacts on real estate transactions from rising interest rates and slowing real estate demand, it does not expect the City's real estate market to feel the impact in a single year. Rather, it expects growth in transactions and collections to decelerate gradually throughout the forecast period.

Tax Revenue Forecast: Finance Division's Difference From OMB (million $)

FY22	FY23	FY24	FY25	FY26
$1,583	$2,823	$3,329	$3,485	$4,993

Tax Revenue Forecast: Growth Rates

	FY22	FY23	FY24	FY25	FY26
Finance Division %	0.1	4.7	3.5	2.8	3.6
OMB %	(2.3)	2.9	2.9	2.8	1.6

Appendix C – Reserves

The Council's Financial Plan contains extra resources that it uses to meet the Council's ambition of a 'Road to Recovery through Equitable Investments in NYC Communities' while reducing the need to use prior year resources to balance the budget. This has the effect of increasing City reserves compared to the January 2022 Financial Plan.

Council Financial Plan		
Reserve Components ($ in billions)	**Fiscal 2022**	**Fiscal 2023**
Roll/ Budget Stabilization Account	**$5.33**	**$0.59**
RHBT / Rainy-Day Fund	**$4.80**	**$7.80**
General Reserve	**$0.25**	**$1.10**
Capital Stabilization Reserve	**$-**	**$0.250**
Total Reserves	**$10.38**	**$9.74**

In the Council's Financial Plan the City would end the year with slightly over $10 billion in Fiscal 2022 and a bit under $10 billion in Fiscal 2023 in reserves.
In contrast the Preliminary Budget ends Fiscal 2022 with slightly under $9 billion and a bit over $6 billion in Fiscal 2023.

Preliminary Budget		
Reserve Components ($ in billions)	**Fiscal 2022**	**Fiscal 2023**
Roll/ Budget Stabilization Account	**$3.70**	**$-**
RHBT / Rainy-Day Fund	**$4.80**	**$4.80**
General Reserve	**$0.25**	**$1.10**
Capital Stabilization Reserve	**$-**	**$0.250**
Total Reserves	**$8.75**	**$6.15**

The difference is the Council has a higher Roll/BSA at the end of Fiscal 2022 and Fiscal 2023 and it adds $3 billion to the RHBT/Rainy-Day Fund.