

**STATE OF FLORIDA
FLORIDA HOUSING FINANCE CORPORATION**

FHFC CASE NO.: 2022-028VW
APPLICATION NO.: 2020-390S

COUNTRY CLUB MAGNOLIA FAMILY, LP,

Petitioner,

vs.

FLORIDA HOUSING FINANCE
CORPORATION,

Respondent.

RECEIVED

APR 11 2022 1:56 PM

FLORIDA HOUSING
FINANCE CORPORATION

PETITION FOR WAIVER OF RULE 67-48.002(94), RULE 67-48.0075(8), RULE 67-21.002(86), RULE 67-21.0025(7), FLORIDA ADMINISTRATIVE CODE AND SECTION FOUR A.3.c.(3) OF RFA 2019-116

Country Club Magnolia Family, LP, a Florida limited partnership (the “Petitioner”), by and through its undersigned counsel, hereby petitions the Florida Housing Finance Corporation (the “Corporation”) for a waiver of, or variance from, Rule 67-48.002(94), Florida Administrative Code (July 11, 2019), Rule 67-21.002(86), Florida Administrative Code (July 11, 2019), (the “Rules”), and Section Four A.3.c.(3) of RFA 2019-116, to allow for an estate to act in the capacity as a Principal and to allow the Petitioner to disclose the executor of the estate, a natural person, on the fourth principal disclosure level in the Applicant’s Principal Disclosure Form. This Petition is filed pursuant to Section 120.542, Florida Statutes, and Chapter 28-104, Florida Administrative Code. In connection with this request for waiver or variance, Petitioner also requests that the Corporation’s Board of Directors (the “Board”) approve changes in the Petitioner’s ownership and developer structure (as more fully described below) pursuant to Rules 67-48.004(3)(b) F.A.C.

(July 11, 2019), 67-21.003(8)(b) F.A.C. (July 11, 2019), and Section Four A.3.c.(3) of RFA 2019-116. In support, the Petitioner states as follows:

A. THE PETITIONER

1. The mailing address, telephone number and email of the Petitioner is as follows:

Country Club Magnolia Family, LP
Attn: James S. Grauley
1718 Peachtree Street, Suite 684
Atlanta, Georgia 30309
Telephone: (404) 419-1432
Email: jgrauley@columbiare.com

2. The mailing address, telephone number and email of the Petitioner's legal counsel is as follows:

Nicholas W. Heckman, Esq.
Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP
390 N. Orange Ave., Suite 1400
Orlando, Florida 32801
Telephone: (407) 839-4241
Email: nick.heckman@nelsonmullins.com

3. On December 30, 2019, the Petitioner timely submitted an application in response to RFA 2019-116 for SAIL Financing of Affordable Multifamily Housing Developments to be Used in Conjunction with Tax-Exempt Bond Financing and Non-Competitive Housing Credits (the "RFA") (the "Application") to finance the construction of a multifamily apartment complex to be known as Magnolia Family in Tallahassee, Florida (the "Project"), which will serve low-income families in Leon County. The Petitioner requested a preliminary award for \$5,611,577 in State Apartment Incentive Loan ("SAIL") funding and \$600,000 in Extremely Low Income ("ELI") funding (collectively, the "Loans") from the Corporation. Additionally, the Petitioner

requested non-competitive housing credits in the amount of \$937,747 (annually) (“Credits”). On July 22, 2020, Petitioner accepted and acknowledged its invitation to credit underwriting.

4. The general partners of the Petitioner are Columbia Magnolia Family Partners, LLC, a Florida limited liability company (“Columbia”) and THA Magnolia Family, LLC, a Florida limited liability company (“THA”). THA is wholly owned by the Tallahassee Housing Authority. As a part of the Application, Petitioner submitted its Principal Disclosures for Applicant (“Current Applicant Disclosure”) and for Developer (i.e., New Affordable Housing Partners, LLC (“NAHP”) and Tallahassee Housing Economic Corporation (“THEC”), and collectively with NAHP are referred to herein as the “Developer”) (the “Current Developer Disclosure” and collectively with the Current Applicant Disclosure referred to herein as the “Current Disclosure”). The Current Disclosure is attached hereto as **Exhibit A**. The Current Applicant Disclosure lists on its first principal disclosure level Columbia and THA as General Partners and also lists Columbia as the Investor LP. The second principal disclosure level of the Current Applicant Disclosure lists New Columbia Residential, LLC (“NCR”), as the Manager and Member of Columbia and Tallahassee Housing Authority as the Managing Member of THA. The third principal disclosure level of the Current Applicant Disclosure lists many individuals, or natural persons, as Members and Managers of NCR and Tallahassee Housing Authority. One of these individuals is Noel F. Khalil (“Khalil”), who is listed as a Manager and Member of NCR. Further, the Current Developer Disclosure lists on its first principal disclosure level, James S. Grauley and Khalil, as the Members and Managers of NAHP.

5. Unfortunately, and with the utmost sincerity, Khalil recently passed away. Khalil’s property and equitable interests, including Khalil’s interest as Manager and Member of NCR and NAHP passed to The Estate of Noel F. Khalil, which is not a trust at this time (the “Estate”).

Although the loss of Khalil is extremely unfortunate, NCR and NAHP have procedures in place for such an event. All of the NCR's and NAHP's assets and corporate governance remain intact and are still being managed and operated by the NCR's and NAHP's management teams. At this time, the Petitioner needs to update its Current Disclosure to reflect the new ownership structure of the Petitioner and NAHP. Petitioner therefore is requesting waiver of the Rules and Section Four A.3.c.(3) of RFA to allow the Estate to act in the capacity as a Principal in the Petitioner's and NAHP's current ownership structure; and to allow the Petitioner to disclose the executor of the estate, a natural person, on the fourth principal disclosure level in the Applicant's Principal Disclosure Form. Under the proposed Principal Disclosure Form for Applicant, the Estate will replace Khalil as a Member and Manager of NCR on the third principal disclosure level and Petitioner will then add a fourth principal disclosure level listing Mr. Anwar Khalil, a natural person, as the executor of the Estate. Further, under the proposed Principal Disclosure Form for Developer, the Estate will replace Khalil as Manager and Member of NAHP on the first principal disclosure level and will add Mr. Anwar Khalil, a natural person, as the executor of the Estate on the second principal disclosure level. The proposed Principal Disclosure Forms for Applicant and Developer are attached hereto as **Exhibit B**.

B. THE RULES FROM WHICH WAIVER IS SOUGHT

6. The Petitioner requests a waiver of, or variance from, Rule 67-48.002(94), Florida Administrative Code (effective July 11, 2019), which provides in part:

Rule 67-48.002 – Definitions.

“(94) “Principal” means:

- (a) For a corporation, each officer, director, executive director, and shareholder of the corporation.
- (b) For a limited partnership, each general partner and each limited partner of the limited partnership.

- (c) For a limited liability company, each manager and each member of the limited liability company.
- (d) For a trust, each trustee of the trust and all beneficiaries of majority age (i.e.; 18 years of age) as of Application deadline.
- (e) For a Public Housing Authority, each officer, director, commissioner, and executive director of the Authority.”

7. The Petitioner requests a waiver of, or variance from, Rule 67-48.0075(8), Florida Administrative Code (July 11, 2019), which provides in part:

Rule 67-48.0075 – Miscellaneous Criteria.

“(8) Unless otherwise stated in a competitive solicitation, disclosure of the Principals of the Applicant must comply with the following:

- (a) The Applicant must disclose all of the Principals of the Applicant (first principal disclosure level). For Applicants seeking Housing Credits, the Housing Credit Syndicator/Housing Credit investor need only be disclosed at the first principal disclosure level and no other disclosure is required;
- (b) The Applicant must disclose all of the Principals of all the entities identified in paragraph (a) above (second principal disclosure level);
- (c) The Applicant must disclose all of the Principals of all of the entities identified in paragraph (b) above (third principal disclosure level). Unless the entity is a trust, all of the Principals must be natural persons; and
- (d) If any of the entities identified in (c) above are a trust, the Applicant must disclose all of the Principals of the trust (fourth principal disclosure level), all of whom must be natural persons.”

8. The Petitioner requests a waiver of, or variance from, Rule 67-21.002(86), Florida Administrative Code (effective July 11, 2019) , which provides in part:

67-21.002(86) – Definitions.

“(86) “Principal” means:

- (a) For a corporation, each officer, director, executive director, and shareholder of the corporation.
- (b) For a limited partnership, each general partner and each limited partner of the limited partnership.
- (c) For a limited liability company, each manager and each member of the limited liability company.

- (d) For a trust, each trustee of the trust and all beneficiaries of majority age (i.e.; 18 years of age) as of Application deadline.
- (e) For a Public Housing Authority, each officer, director, commissioner, and executive director of the Authority.”

9. The Petitioner requests a waiver of, or variance from, Rule 67-21.0025(7), Florida Administrative Code (effective July 11, 2019) , which provides in part:

Rule 67-21.0025 – Miscellaneous Criteria.

“(7) Disclosure of the Principals of the Applicant must comply with the following:

- (a) The Applicant must disclose all of the Principals of the Applicant (first principal disclosure level). For Applicants seeking Housing Credits, the Housing Credit Syndicator/Housing Credit investor need only be disclosed at the first principal disclosure level and no other disclosure is required;
- (b) The Applicant must disclose all of the Principals of all the entities identified in paragraph (a) above (second principal disclosure level);
- (c) The Applicant must disclose all of the Principals of all of the entities identified in paragraph (b) above (third principal disclosure level). Unless the entity is a trust, all of the Principals must be natural persons; and
- (d) If any of the entities identified in paragraph (c) above are a trust, the Applicant must disclose all of the Principals of the trust (fourth principal disclosure level), all of whom must be natural persons.”

10. Petitioner requests a waiver of, or variance from, Section Four A.3.c.(3) of RFA 2019-116 in order to make the changes to the Applicant entity and the Developer. Section Four A.3.c.(3) of RFA 2019-116, provides in relevant part:

“For purposes of the following, a material change shall mean 33.3 percent or more of the Applicant, a general partner of the Applicant, or a non-investor member of the Applicant, and a non-material change shall mean less than 33.3 percent of the Applicant, a general partner of the Applicant, or a non-investor member of the Applicant...”

The Applicant entity shall be the recipient of the Housing Credits, and the borrowing entity for the SAIL loan(s) and, if applicable, the MMRB loan, and cannot be changed in any way (materially or non-materially) until

after closing of the loan(s)...Changes to the Applicant entity (material or non-material) prior to the loan closing...may result in disqualification from receiving funding and may be deemed a material misrepresentation.

The Principals of each Developer identified in the Application, including all co-Developers, may be changed only by written request of an Applicant to Corporation staff and approval of the Board after the Applicant has been invited to enter credit underwriting.”

11. Although Petitioner does not need a formal waiver of Rule 67-48.004(3)(b) or Rule 67-21.003(8)(b), to change the principals of Developer, Petitioner does need to make a request to the Corporation’s Staff and does need the approval of the Board to make such change. Therefore, Petitioner respectfully requests the Board’s approval to change the Principals of NAHP pursuant to Rule 67-48.004(3)(b) F.A.C. (Effective July 11, 2019) and Rule 67-21.003(8)(b) (effective July, 11, 2019), which provide in relevant part:

Rule 67-48.004(3)(b):

“(3) For the SAIL, HOME and Housing Credit Programs, notwithstanding any other provision of these rules, the following items as identified by the Applicant in the Application must be maintained and cannot be changed by the Applicant after the applicable submission, unless provided otherwise below:

(b) Principals of each Developer, including all co-Developers; notwithstanding the foregoing, the Principals of the Developer(s) may be changed only by written request of an Applicant to Corporation staff and approval of the Board after the Applicant has been invited to enter credit underwriting. With regard to said approval, the Board shall consider the facts and circumstances of each Applicant’s request, inclusive of validity and consistency of Application documentation;”

Rule 67-21.003(8)(b):

“(8) Notwithstanding any other provision of these rules, there are certain items that must be included in the Application and cannot be revised, corrected or supplemented after the Application is deemed complete. Those items are as follows:

(b) Principals of each Developer, including all co-Developers; notwithstanding the foregoing, the Principals of the Developer(s) may be changed only by written request of an Applicant to Corporation staff and approval of the Board after the Applicant has been invited to enter Credit Underwriting. With regard to said approval, the Board shall consider the facts and circumstances of each Applicant's request, inclusive of validity and consistency of Application documentation;"

C. STATUTES IMPLEMENTED BY THE RULES

12. The Rules are implementing, among other sections of the Florida Housing Finance Corporation Act (the "Act"), the statute that designated the Corporation to the SAIL Program. See Fla. Stat. § 420.5087.

D. JUSTIFICATION FOR PETITIONER'S REQUESTED WAIVER

13. Under Section 120.542(1), Fla. Stat., and Chapter 28-104, F.A.C., the Corporation has the power and authority to grant waivers to its rule requirements when strict application of the rules would lead to unreasonable, unfair and unintended consequences in particular instances. A waiver shall be granted when the person who is subject to the rule demonstrates that the application of the rule would: (1) create a substantial hardship¹ or violate principles of fairness, and (2) the purpose of the underlying statute has been or will be achieved by other means by the person. See § 120.542(2), Fla. Stat.

14. Strict adherence to Rules and Section Four A.3.c.(3) of the RFA would impose a substantial hardship on Petitioner and would violate the principles of fairness, as the unfortunate event of Khalil's death was outside of any person's fathomable control. Further, the passage of

¹ "Substantial hardship" means a demonstrated economic, technological, legal or other type of hardship to the person requesting the variance or waiver. Further, "principles of fairness" are violated when the literal application of a rule affects a particular person in a manner significantly different from the way it affects other similarly situated persons who are subject to the rule. See Fla. Stat. § 120.542.

Khalil's equitable interests in NCR and NAHP to the Estate was outside of Petitioner's control and such interests have accordingly been left to Khalil's estate. It should be noted that all of NCR's and NAHP's assets and corporate governance have remained intact and, as before, and still currently, are being managed and operated by the NCR's and NAHP's management teams. Without a waiver of, or variance from, the Rules and Section Four A.3.c.(3) of the RFA, to allow the Estate to serve as a Principal in the Petitioner's and Developer's new ownership structure, it would result in Petitioner being disqualified from receiving its funding and Credits under the RFA. By granting the requested waiver of, or variance from, the Rules and Section Four A.3.c.(3) of the RFA, the Project will be able to proceed to reach completion in the near future, which will provide 130 much needed affordable housing units in Leon County, Florida, which will assist the Corporation in fulfilling its statutory mandate to provide safe, sanitary and affordable housing to the citizens of Florida.

15. Further, a waiver of these Rules will serve the underlying purposes of Section 420.5087 and the Act that are implemented by Chapter 67-48 of the Florida Administrative Code, because one of the goals is for the proceeds of Corporation financing to be used to facilitate the availability of decent, safe and sanitary housing in the State of Florida to low-income persons and households. The Act (Section 420.501, et seq.) was passed in order to create inducements and opportunities for private and public investment in rental housing to increase the supply of affordable housing for low-income persons and households. Denial of the waiver would deprive Leon County of essential and affordable housing units. By granting this Petition, the Corporation would recognize the goal of increasing the supply of affordable housing units via the construction of new developments throughout Florida, particularly through Petitioner supplying 130 much needed affordable housing units in Leon County, Florida.

16. The requested waiver will not adversely affect Petitioner, the Project, any other party that applied to receive funding in the RFA, or the Corporation.

E. TYPE OF WAIVER

17. The waiver being sought is permanent in nature.

E. ACTION REQUESTED

18. For the reasons set forth herein, the Petitioner respectfully requests the Corporation (i) grant a waiver of the Rules and Section Four A.3.c.(3) of RFA 2019-116 to allow for an estate to act in the capacity as a Principal and to allow the Petitioner to disclose the executor of the Estate on the fourth principal disclosure level on the Applicant's Principal Disclosure Form, and approve the requested changes to the Petitioner's ownership structure and Developer structure pursuant to Rule 67-48.004(3)(b), 67-21.003(8)(b) F.A.C. (effective July 11, 2019), and Section four A.3.c.(3) of RFA 2019-116; (ii) grant this Petition and all the relief requested herein; and (iii) grant such further relief as it may deem appropriate.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing Petition was filed by electronic delivery to:

Florida Housing Finance Corporation
Attn: Corporation Clerk
227 North Bronough Street, Suite 5000
Tallahassee, Florida 32301
Email: corporationclerk@floridahousing.org

Joint Administrative Procedures Committee
680 Pepper Building
111 W. Madison Street
Tallahassee, Florida 32399
Email: joint.admin.procedures@leg.state.fl.us

This 11th day of April, 2022.

Exhibit A

Principal Disclosures for the Applicant

APPROVED for HOUSING CREDITS
FHFC Advance Review 10.15.19

Select the organizational structure for the Applicant entity:

The Applicant is a: Limited Partnership

Provide the name of the Applicant Limited Partnership:

Country Club Magnolia Family, LP

% Ownership input features will not be made available until invitation to credit underwriting

First Principal Disclosure Level:

[Click here for Assistance with Completing the Entries for the First Level Principal Disclosure for the Applicant](#)

First Level Entity #	Select Type of Principal of Applicant	Enter Name of First Level Principal	Select organizational structure of First Level Principal identified	% Ownership of Applicant
1.	General Partner	Columbia Magnolia Family Partners, LLC	Limited Liability Company	0.0051%
2.	General Partner	THA Magnolia Family, LLC	Limited Liability Company	0.0049%
3.	Investor LP	Columbia Magnolia Family Partners, LLC	Limited Liability Company	99.9900%

Second Principal Disclosure Level:

Country Club Magnolia Family, LP

[Click here for Assistance with Completing the Entries for the Second Level Principal Disclosure for the Applicant](#)

Select the corresponding First Level Principal Entity # from above for which the Second Level Principal is being identified

Second Level Entity #	Select the type of Principal being associated with the corresponding First Level Principal Entity	Enter Name of Second Level Principal	Select organizational structure of Second Level Principal identified	Second Level Principal % Ownership of First Level Principal
1.A. (Columbia Magnolia Family Part)	Manager	New Columbia Residential, LLC	Limited Liability Company	100.0000%
1. (Columbia Magnolia Family Part)	Member	New Columbia Residential, LLC	Limited Liability Company	100.0000%
2. (THA Magnolia Family, LLC)	Managing Member	Tallahassee Housing Authority	Public Housing Authority	100.0000%

Third Principal Disclosure Level:

Country Club Magnolia Family, LP

[Click here for Assistance with Completing the Entries for the Third Level Principal Disclosure for the Applicant](#)

Select the corresponding Second Level Principal Entity # from above for which the Third Level Principal is being identified

Third Level Entity #	Select the type of Principal being associated with the corresponding Second Level Principal Entity	Enter Name of Third Level Principal who must be either a Natural Person or a Trust	The organizational structure of Third Level Principal identified Must be either a Natural Person or a Trust	3rd Level Principal % Ownership of 2nd Level Principal
1.A. (New Columbia Residential, LLC)	Manager	Grauley, James S.	Natural Person	50.0000%
1.A. (New Columbia Residential, LLC)	Manager	Khalil, Noel F.	Natural Person	50.0000%
1.A. (New Columbia Residential, LLC)	Member	Grauley, James S.	Natural Person	50.0000%
1.A. (New Columbia Residential, LLC)	Member	Khalil, Noel F.	Natural Person	50.0000%
1.B. (New Columbia Residential, LLC)	Manager	Grauley, James S.	Natural Person	50.0000%
1.B. (New Columbia Residential, LLC)	Manager	Khalil, Noel F.	Natural Person	50.0000%
1.B. (New Columbia Residential, LLC)	Member	Grauley, James S.	Natural Person	50.0000%
1.B. (New Columbia Residential, LLC)	Member	Khalil, Noel F.	Natural Person	50.0000%
2.A. (Tallahassee Housing Authority)	Executive Director	Williams, Brenda	Natural Person	0.0000%
2.A. (Tallahassee Housing Authority)	Officer/Director	Williams, Brenda	Natural Person	0.0000%
2.A. (Tallahassee Housing Authority)	Commissioner	Jones, Kendall	Natural Person	0.0000%
2.A. (Tallahassee Housing Authority)	Commissioner	Moran, James	Natural Person	0.0000%
2.A. (Tallahassee Housing Authority)	Commissioner	Atkins, Courtney	Natural Person	0.0000%
2.A. (Tallahassee Housing Authority)	Commissioner	Brown, Cassandra	Natural Person	0.0000%
2.A. (Tallahassee Housing Authority)	Commissioner	Kelly, Walter	Natural Person	0.0000%
2.A. (Tallahassee Housing Authority)	Commissioner	McAllister, Julius	Natural Person	0.0000%
<Select a #>	<Select an option>	*Tallahassee Housing Authority does not have directors, but	<Select an option>	
<Select a #>	<Select an option>	only Commissioners that serve the same roles.	<Select an option>	

Principal Disclosures for the two Developers

APPROVED for HOUSING CREDITS
FHFC Advance Review 10.15.19

How many Developers are part of this Application structure? (Please complete the Principal Disclosures for each of the two Co-Developers below.)

2

Select the organizational structure for the first Co-Developer entity:

The first Co-Developer is a: Limited Liability Company

Provide the name of the Developer Limited Liability Company:

New Affordable Housing Partners, LLC

First Principal Disclosure Level:

New Affordable Housing Partners, LLC

[Click here for Assistance with Completing the Entries for the First Level Principal Disclosure for a Developer](#)

<u>First Level Entity #</u>	<u>Select Type of Principal of Developer</u>	<u>Enter Name of First Level Principal</u>	<u>Select organizational structure of First Level Principal identified</u>
1.	<u>Manager</u>	<u>Grauley, James S.</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>
2.	<u>Manager</u>	<u>Khalil, Noel F.</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>
3.	<u>Member</u>	<u>Grauley, James S.</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>
4.	<u>Member</u>	<u>Khalil, Noel F.</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>

Principal Disclosures for the two Developers

APPROVED for HOUSING CREDITS
FHFC Advance Review 10.15.19

Select the organizational structure for the second Co-Developer entity:

The second Co-Developer is a: Non-Profit Corporation

Provide the name of the Developer Non-Profit Corporation:

Tallahassee Housing Economic Corporation

First Principal Disclosure Level:

Tallahassee Housing Economic Corporation

[Click here for Assistance with Completing the Entries for the First Level Principal Disclosure for a Developer](#)

<u>First Level Entity #</u>	<u>Select Type of Principal of Developer</u>	<u>Enter Name of First Level Principal</u>	<u>Select organizational structure of First Level Principal identified</u>
1.	<u>Executive Director</u>	<u>Williams, Brenda</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>
2.	<u>Officer/Director</u>	<u>Williams, Brenda</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>
3.	<u>Officer/Director</u>	<u>Jones, Kendall</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>
4.	<u>Officer/Director</u>	<u>Moran, James</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>
5.	<u>Officer/Director</u>	<u>Atkins, Courtney</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>
6.	<u>Officer/Director</u>	<u>Brown, Cassandra</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>
7.	<u>Officer/Director</u>	<u>Kelly, Walter</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>
8.	<u>Officer/Director</u>	<u>McAllister, Julius</u>	<u>Natural Person</u>

Exhibit B

