

# The Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers

6 June 2016

# TRANSMITTED VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL, FACSIMILE, AND COURIER

Arindom Hazarika Bharti Airtel Limited (airtel) **Bharti Crescent** 1 Nelson Mandela Road, Vasant Kunj, Phase II New Delhi, Delhi 110070 IN

Email: arindom.hazarika@bharti.in

Fax: +911141666139

#### RE: NOTICE OF BREACH OF REGISTRY AGREEMENT

Dear Arindom Hazarika,

Please be advised that as of 6 June 2016, Bharti Airtel Limited ("Bharti Airtel") is in breach of its Registry Agreement with the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers ("ICANN") dated 24 October 2014 ("RA"). These breaches result from:

- 1. Bharti Airtel's failure to provide a link on the primary website for the TLD airtel to a webpage designated by ICANN containing Whois policy and educational materials, as required by Section 1.11 of Specification 4 of the RA;
- 2. Bharti Airtel's failure to publish on its website the DNSSEC Practice Statements (DPS) describing critical security controls and procedures for key material storage, access and usage for its own keys and secure acceptance of registrants' public-key material, as required by Section 1.3 of Specification 6 of the RA;
- 3. Bharti Airtel's failure to publish on its website abuse contact details, including a valid email and mailing address and primary contact for handling inquiries related to malicious conduct in the TLD airtel, as required by Section 4.1 of Specification 6 of the RA; and

Singapore

USA



4. Bharti Airtel's failure to timely pay past due fees, as required by Article 6 of the RA.

Please refer to the attachment for details regarding these breaches.

# **Additional Concerns**

ICANN notes that Bharti Airtel exhibits a pattern of non-response to ICANN Contractual Compliance matters and, when responses are provided to ICANN, they are often untimely and incomplete.

ICANN requests that Bharti Airtel cure these breaches by 6 July 2016, 30 calendar days from the date of this letter, by taking the following actions:

- 1. Provide a link on the primary website for the TLD airtel to a webpage designated by ICANN containing Whois policy and educational materials;
- 2. Publish on Bharti Airtel's website the DNSSEC Practice Statements following the format described in RFC 6841;
- 3. Publish on Bharti Airtel's website its accurate contact details including a valid email and mailing address as well as a primary contact for handling inquiries related to malicious conduct in the TLD airtel;
- 4. Provide ICANN with the corrective and preventative action(s) that Bharti Airtel will take, with implementation date(s), to address its pattern of untimely, incomplete and non-response to ICANN Contractual Compliance matters; and
- 5. Pay all past due fees.

If Bharti Airtel fails to timely cure the breaches and provide the information requested by 6 July 2016, ICANN may commence the RA termination process.



If you have questions or require assistance, please contact Jennifer Scott at <a href="mailto:jennifer.scott@icann.org">jennifer.scott@icann.org</a>.

Sincerely,

Maguy Serad Vice President

**Contractual Compliance** 

Cc: John O. Jeffrey, General Counsel and Secretary



#### **ATTACHMENT**

# Failure to provide a link to Whois policy and educational materials on website

Section 1.11 of Specification 4 of the RA requires registry operators to provide a link on the primary website for the TLD (i.e., the website provided to ICANN for publishing on the ICANN website) to a webpage designated by ICANN containing Whois policy and educational materials. Bharti Airtel's failure to provide a link on the primary website for the TLD airtel to a webpage designated by ICANN containing Whois policy and educational materials is a breach of Section 1.11 of Specification 4 of the RA.

# Failure to publish DNSSEC Practice Statement on website

Section 1.3 of Specification 6 of the RA requires registry operators to, among other things, publish on its website the DNSSEC Practice Statements (DPS) describing critical security controls and procedures for key material storage, access and usage for its own keys and secure acceptance of registrants' public-key material following the format described in RFC 6841. Bharti Airtel's failure to publish DPS on its website is a breach of Section 1.3 of Specification 6 of the RA.

### Failure to publish abuse contact information on website

Section 4.1 of Specification 6 of the RA requires registry operators to provide to ICANN and publish on its website its accurate contact details including a valid email and mailing address as well as a primary contact for handling inquiries related to malicious conduct in the TLD, and provide ICANN with prompt notice of any changes to such contact details. Bharti Airtel's failure to publish abuse contact details on its website for TLD airtel is a breach of Section 4.1 of Specification 6 of the RA.

### Failure to pay fees

Article 6 of the RA requires registry operators to pay Registry-Level Fees on a quarterly basis within 30 calendar days following the date of the invoice provided by ICANN. Bharti Airtel owes ICANN past due fees in breach of Article 6 of the RA.



# Chronology:

Date of Notice	Deadline for Response	Details
8-Feb-2016 7-Mar-2016 1-Apr-2016	N/A	ICANN Accounting sent detailed customer accounting statement to Registry Operator regarding past due fees.
19-Feb-2016	26-Feb-2016	ICANN sent 1st compliance inquiry via email to domains.admin@bharti.in.
25-Feb-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (domains.admin@bharti.in) requesting a one week extension to respond and insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
26-Feb-2016	4-Mar-2016	ICANN resent 1st compliance inquiry via email to domains.admin@bharti.in with extended due date.
3-Mar-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (domains.admin@bharti.in) requesting an additional extension to respond and insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
3-Mar-2016	10-Mar-2016	ICANN resent 1st compliance inquiry via email to domains.admin@bharti.in with extended due date.
10-Mar-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (domains.admin@bharti.in) requesting an additional extension to respond and insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
14-Mar-2016	21-Mar-2016	ICANN sent 2nd compliance inquiry via email to domains.admin@bharti.in and manpreetk@airtel.com. No response received from Registry Operator.
18-Mar-2016	N/A	ICANN called Compliance Contact at +911244222222. No answer and no ability to leave a message. ICANN called Compliance Contact at mobile number [NUMBER REDACTED] and provided inquiry details.
22-Mar-2016	29-Mar-2016	ICANN sent 3rd compliance inquiry via email to domains.admin@bharti.in, manpreetk@airtel.com and akshay.kanade@airtel.com.
22-Mar-2016	N/A	ICANN sent 3rd compliance inquiry via fax to +911141666139. Fax successful.
23-Mar-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (manpreetk@airtel.com) insufficient to demonstrate compliance.



Date of Notice	Deadline for Response	Details
	•	Email from Registry Operator
23-Mar-2016	N/A	(ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com) insufficient to demonstrate
		compliance.
23-Mar-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (arindom.hazarika@bharti.in)
		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
		ICANN sent follow-up compliance inquiry via email to
23-Mar-2016	20.142016	domains.admin@bharti.in, manpreetk@airtel.com,
23-Mar-2016	29-Mar-2016	akshay.kanade@airtel.com, ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com
		and arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
		Email from Registry Operator (domains.admin@bharti.in)
28-Mar-2016	N/A	requesting an additional extension to respond and
		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
		ICANN sent follow-up compliance inquiry via email to
28-Mar-2016	29-Mar-2016	domains.admin@bharti.in, manpreetk@airtel.com,
20-IVId1-2010	29-Mar-2016	akshay.kanade@airtel.com, ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com
		and arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
		Email from Registry Operator (arindom.hazarika@bharti.in)
28-Mar-2016	N/A	requesting an additional extension to respond and
		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
		ICANN sent follow-up compliance inquiry via email to
28-Mar-2016	29-Mar-2016	domains.admin@bharti.in, manpreetk@airtel.com,
20-10101-2010	29-Mar-2016	akshay.kanade@airtel.com, ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com
		and arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
		ICANN called and spoke with Registry Operator
29-Mar-2016	N/A	representative at mobile number [NUMBER REDACTED] and
		provided inquiry details.
		Email from Registry Operator (arindom.hazarika@bharti.in)
29-Mar-2016	N/A	requesting an additional extension to respond and
		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
	6-Apr-2016	ICANN sent escalated compliance notice via email to
30-Mar-2016		domains.admin@bharti.in, manpreetk@airtel.com,
		akshay.kanade@airtel.com, ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com
		and arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
30-Mar-2016	N/A	ICANN sent escalated compliance notice via fax to
20 2010	,,.	+911141666139. Fax successful.



Date of Notice	Deadline for Response	Details
	-	ICANN called and spoke with Registry Operator
31-Mar-2016	N/A	representative at mobile number [NUMBER REDACTED] and
		provided notice details.
		Email from Registry Operator (domains.admin@bharti.in)
1-Apr-2016	N/A	requesting an additional extension to respond and
		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
		ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email to
1-Apr-2016	6-Apr-2016	domains.admin@bharti.in, manpreetk@airtel.com,
1-Apr-2016	0-Apr-2010	akshay.kanade@airtel.com, ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com
		and arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
		ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email and
		requested a conference call on 5 April 2016 to
4-Apr-2016	6-Apr-2016	domains.admin@bharti.in, manpreetk@airtel.com,
		akshay.kanade@airtel.com, ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com
		and arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
		ICANN called and spoke with Compliance Contact at mobile
5-Apr-2016	N/A	number [NUMBER REDACTED] who requested ICANN speak
		with other Registry Operator representatives.
	N/A	ICANN called Primary and Legal Contacts at the following
		numbers with no answer and no ability to leave a message:
		+911244222222 and mobile number [NUMBER REDACTED].
5-Apr-2016		ICANN called Legal Contact at mobile number [NUMBER
5-Apr-2016		REDACTED] and was told it was a wrong number. ICANN
		called Registry Operator representative at mobile number
		[NUMBER REDACTED]. No answer and no ability to leave a
		message.
5-Apr-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
3 / (p) 2010		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
5-Apr-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (arindom.hazarika@bharti.in)
3 / (p) 2010		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
7-Apr-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.



Date of Notice	Deadline for Response	Details
8-Apr-2016		ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email and
	11-Apr-2016	requested a conference call on 11 April 2016 to
		domains.admin@bharti.in, manpreetk@airtel.com,
		akshay.kanade@airtel.com, ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com
		and arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
8-Apr-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
8-Apr-2010		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
		ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email to
9-Apr-2016	11 Apr 2016	domains.admin@bharti.in, manpreetk@airtel.com,
9-Api-2010	11-Apr-2016	akshay.kanade@airtel.com, ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com
		and arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
11-Apr-2016	N/A	ICANN conducted conference call with Primary Contact at
11-Apr-2016	IN/A	mobile number [NUMBER REDACTED].
11-Apr-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
11-Apr-2016	IN/A	insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
		ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email to
12-Apr-2016	10 Apr 2016	domains.admin@bharti.in, manpreetk@airtel.com,
12-Apr-2016	19-Apr-2016	akshay.kanade@airtel.com, ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com
		and arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
10 Apr 2016	NI/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
19-Apr-2016	N/A	insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
		ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email to
19-Apr-2016	20-Apr-2016	manpreetk@airtel.com, akshay.kanade@airtel.com
19-Apr-2010		ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com and
		arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
20-Apr-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
20-Apr-2016	IN/A	insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
20 Apr 2016	NI/A	ICANN requested updated accounting information be
20-Apr-2016	N/A	provided to Registry Operator regarding past due fees.
	23-Apr-2016	ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email to
22-Apr-2016		manpreetk@airtel.com, akshay.kanade@airtel.com
		ravinder.bhardwaj@airtel.com and
		arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
25-Apr-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.



Date of Notice	Deadline for Response	Details
25-Apr-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator's Registry Service Provider
		(jhooper@verisign.com) requesting clarification.
		ICANN responded to Registry Operator's Registry Service
27-Apr-2016	N/A	Provider via email to <a href="mailto:jhooper@verisign.com">jhooper@verisign.com</a> ,
		manpreetk@airtel.com and domains.admin@bharti.in.
27-Apr-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator's Registry Service Provider
27-Apr-2010		(jhooper@verisign.com) with follow up question.
		ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email to
27-Apr-2016	31-May-2016	manpreetk@airtel.com, akshay.kanade@airtel.com and
27 Apr 2010	31 Way 2010	arindom.hazarika@bharti.in with a one month remediation
		period. No response received from Registry Operator.
		ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email to
2-May-2016	3-May-2016	manpreetk@airtel.com, akshay.kanade@airtel.com and
		arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
3-May-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
3 Way 2010	14/71	insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
4-May-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
4 Way 2010	IN/A	insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
		ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email to
6-May-2016	9-May-2016	manpreetk@airtel.com, akshay.kanade@airtel.com,
0 11147 2020	5ay 2010	arindom.hazarika@bharti.in and
		rahul.patranabish@airtel.com.
9-May-2016	N/A	ICANN responded to Registry Operator's Registry Service
3 may 2020	,/	Provider via email to <u>jhooper@verisign.com</u> .
10-May-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
10 1114 2010	IN/A	insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
16-May-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
10 1114 2010	IN/ A	insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
	31-May-2016	ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email to
19-May-2016		manpreetk@airtel.com, akshay.kanade@airtel.com and
		arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.
31-May-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com)
32, 2020		insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
31-May-2016	31-May-2016	ICANN sent follow up compliance notice via email to
		manpreetk@airtel.com, akshay.kanade@airtel.com and
		arindom.hazarika@bharti.in.



Date of Notice	Deadline for Response	Details
1-Jun-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (manpreetk@airtel.com) insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
6-Jun-2016	N/A	Email from Registry Operator (akshay.kanade@airtel.com) insufficient to demonstrate compliance.
6-Jun-2016	N/A	ICANN conducted compliance check to determine other areas of noncompliance.
6-Jun-2016	N/A	To date, Registry Operator has not provided ICANN the requested information and the issues remain unresolved.