



Issue Date: 15 September 2010

Case No.: **2007-SOX-00090**

In the Matter of:

ANTHONY HALL,

Complainant,

v.

CIBA VISION CORP. /

NOVARTIS, A. G.,

Respondents.

DECISION AND ORDER APPROVING SETTLEMENT and DISMISSING COMPLAINT

This matter arises under the employee protection provisions of Section 806 of the Corporate and Criminal Fraud Accountability Act of 2002, Title VIII of the Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002, (Public Law 107-204), 18 U. S. C. §1514A (“Act” or “SOX”) as implemented by 29 C.F.R. Part 1980. This statutory provision, in part, prohibits an employer with a class of securities registered under Section 12 of the Securities Exchange Act of 1934 and companies required to file reports under Section 15(d) of the Securities Exchange Act of 1934 from discharging, or otherwise discriminating against any employee with respect to compensation, terms, conditions, or privileges of employment because the employee provided the employer or Federal Government information relating to alleged violations of 18 U.S.C. §§ 1341 (mail fraud and swindle), 1343 (fraud by wire, radio, or television), 1344 (bank fraud), 1348 (security fraud), any rule or regulation of the Securities and Exchange Commission (“SEC”), or any provision of federal law relating to fraud against shareholders.

On September 15, 2010, the parties filed a Confidential Settlement Agreement and Release seeking approval of the agreement and the dismissal of the complaint. The SOX regulations address settlements. Specifically, 29 C.F.R. §1980.11 1(d)(2) states:

At any time after the filing of objections to the Assistant Secretary’s findings and/or order, the case may be settled if the participating parties agree to a settlement and the settlement is approved by the administrative law judge if the case is before the judge... A copy of the settlement will be filed with the administrative law judge...

A settlement approved by the administrative law judge shall constitute the final order of the Secretary and may be enforced pursuant to Section 1980.113 (Federal District Court). 29 C.F.R. § 1980.111(e).

I note that the Agreement encompasses settlement of matters under laws other than the Sarbanes-Oxley Act. My authority to approve settlements is limited to the SOX matter that is

within my jurisdiction as specifically provided under that statute. Therefore, I approve only the terms of the agreement pertaining to the Complainant's SOX claim. Poulos v. Ambassador Fuel Oil Co., Inc., 86-CAA-1, slip op. at 2 (Sec'y Nov. 2, 1987).

The Complainant and Respondents were ably represented by counsel. The Complainant represents his understanding of the Confidential Settlement Agreement's provisions and voluntarily accepts the settlement. Having reviewed the agreement, I find the provisions are fair, adequate and not contrary to the public interest. Further, the settlement supports a finding that the complaint be dismissed with prejudice. Accordingly, approval of the agreement is appropriate. Upon my approval, the parties shall implement their settlement as specifically stated in the agreement. This Decision and Order shall have the same force and effect as one made after a full hearings on the merits.

The parties have agreed to keep the specific terms of the agreement confidential, subject to applicable laws, and request that the Settlement Agreement be sealed and remain confidential pursuant to 29 C.F.R. § 70.26. To effectuate such confidentiality, I have sealed the Settlement Agreement. However, notwithstanding the parties' agreement, the parties' submission, including the Settlement Agreement, become part of the record of the case and are subject to the Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA"), 5 U.S.C. § 552(a). If a FOIA request is made for the Settlement Agreement, the U.S. Department of Labor will have to respond and decide whether to exercise its discretion to claim any applicable exemption. The parties are entitled to pre-disclosure notifications rights under 29 C.F.R. § 70.26.

ORDER

Wherefore, it is ordered that:

1. The Settlement Agreement is APPROVED;
2. The complaint is DISMISSED WITH PREJUDICE; and
3. The Settlement Agreement is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL COMMERCIAL INFORMATION", under 20 C.F.R. § 70.26, and shall be afforded the protections thereunder.

A

DANIEL A. SARNO, JR.
Administrative Law Judge

DAS/ccb
Newport News, Virginia